1	CITY OF KINGSTON
2	RENT GUIDELINES BOARD
3	PUBLIC MEETING
4	
5	Wednesday, September 21, 2022
6	6:37 p.m. until 8:42 p.m.
7	Kingston City Hall
8	420 Broadway
9	Kingston, New York 12401
10	
11	BOARD MEMBERS
12	NOAH KIPPLEY-OGMAN, Chair
13	DIANA LOPEZ MARTINEZ
14	MIE INOUYE
15	ANTHONY R. TAMPONE
16	TARA A. PERRY
17	MICHAEL TIERNEY
18	CAROL SOTO
19	MICHAEL BROWN
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

```
1
               (The meeting commenced at 6:37 p.m.)
 2
               MR. STECKER: Okay. Good evening.
                                                  It's
 3
     six thirty-eight p.m., Wednesday, September 21st,
           We have the first meeting in the Kingston
 4
     2022.
     City Rent Guidelines Board in Kingston City Hall.
 5
     So I guess, you know, at this point, we can turn
 6
     it over to the Chair to call roll, or I can call
 8
     the roll for you if you'd like.
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Why don't you go
 9
10
     ahead and call the roll?
11
               MR. STECKER:
                             Okay. Noah Kippley-Ogman?
12
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Present.
13
               MR. STECKER: Diana Lopez Martinez?
14
               MS. MARTINEZ:
                              Present.
15
               MR. STECKER: Mie Inouye.
16
               MS. INOUYE:
                            Mie, present.
17
               MR. STECKER:
                             Okay. Michael Brown.
                                                     He
     called ahead and said he was going to be absent
18
19
     this evening. Anthony Tampone?
20
               MR. TAMPONE:
                             Present.
21
               MR. STECKER:
                             Tara Perry?
22
               MS. PERRY: Present.
23
               MR. STECKER:
                             Michael Tierney?
24
               MR. TIERNEY: Present.
25
```

```
1
               MR. STECKER: Carol Soto?
 2
               MS. SOTO: Present.
 3
               MR. STECKER: And Charles Sanchis.
     We'll let the record reflect that there is a
 4
 5
              So just to introduce myself to everyone.
     I'm Peter Stecker, I'm an attorney with DHCR so I
 6
     will be part of the team that's assisting the
 8
     board providing the staff support. So all of you
 9
     should have received a notice of public meeting,
10
     which was sent out to the public as well as to the
11
     board members, which has an agenda on there.
12
     so we've already called to order. We called the
13
     roll.
            I think it makes sense for us at this point
14
     to discuss what your immediate responsibilities
     are following Kingston's adoption of ETPA.
15
     what the board needs to do at this point, you
16
     know, moving forward, kind of a -- immediate
17
     responsibilities.
18
19
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                    I -- I would just
20
     like actually to say just a couple of words.
21
               MR. STECKER:
                             Sure.
22
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   I am --.
23
               MS. GRAY-HUERTAS:
                                  Noah, you have to be
24
     very close to the mic because it's being recorded
25
```

1 and they're not going to be able to transcribe. 2 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Is this -- is this 3 I am -- I'm really glad to be here together on? as the first board -- the first Kingston City Rent 4 5 Control Board, the first new rent control board in the state of New York in nine years. This is a --6 7 it's a serious but limited responsibility that we 8 have that -- we will learn more about it over the 9 course of the next presumably twenty minutes. 10 I'm looking forward to working together as a -- as 11 a group to take on the task of making a space 12 where we hear from tenants and we hear from 13 landlords, and we hear from the community. 14 hear also from experts and we hear from the state 15 bringing data and analysis. And we come together with all of that information and we exercise our 16 collective judgment. And this is -- this is a --17 a meaningful task that we've taken up and I'm 18 19 proud of us for being here and I'm proud of our 20 city for being here, and I'm looking forward to getting to work with -- with all of us. 21 22 And I would love if we could do a little 23 bit of introduction for -- for each of us. 24 could each say just who we are or where we're 25

- 1 coming from.
- MS. HUERTAS: Absolutely.
- 3 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right. I -- do
- 4 I have to ask permission? As Chair do I get to
- 5 just say --.
- 6 MS. HUERTAS: You got the Chair for it.
- 7 Feel free.
- 8 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right. Well as
- 9 Chair, I'm taking my prerogative. I would love to
- 10 just say -- can we just say who we are and I don't
- 11 know, something -- something relevant about
- 12 yourself, right, it might be a job or whatever.
- 13 MS. PERRY: I guess I can go first. My
- 14 name is Tara Perry. I represent property owners.
- 15 As far as my experience goes, I actually manage
- 16 apartments in the City of Kingston. I've been a
- 17 property manager for over twenty-four years. I
- 18 work with D.H.C.R. at the property I manage so I -
- 19 I have some familiarity with how things go and
- 20 that's it.
- 21 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Okay.
- MS. INOOYE: My name is Mie Inooye. I
- 23 am one of the public representatives on the board
- 24 and I work as a Professor of Politics at Bard

- 1 College.
- 2 MS. LOPEZ MARTINEZ: My name is Diana
- 3 Lopez from Comanche members area. And I am also
- 4 part of the public and I am a community organizer
- 5 and I work a lot within community members here at
- 6 Kingston. And I've been in Kingston for over
- 7 twenty-five years.
- 8 MS. SOTO: Hi. My name is -- hi. My
- 9 name is Caroline Soto or Carol Soto and I have
- 10 moved here recently. However, I lived in ... in
- 11 the '70s. This region is familiar and I -- often
- 12 visited in the past. So I consider it home. And
- 13 I am also a community organizer. I have worked
- 14 with a lot of different campaigns, mostly around
- 15 Latin America, Central America, Nicaragua, El
- 16 Salvador. And most recently, ten years of
- 17 bringing atomic bomb survivors into the New York
- 18 City school system to tell their personal stories
- 19 in an attempt to stop nuclear arms. So it's --
- 20 that's it.
- 21 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right. April,
- 22 could you --?
- 23 MS. HUERTAS: Sure. My name is April
- 24 Gray-Huertas (phonetic). I'm an attorney with the

- 1 State of New York and I'm hoping to help to
- 2 provide you with some staff assistance as we move
- 3 on.
- 4 MR. STECKER: Yeah. I think I've
- 5 already introduced myself. Peter Stecker. I'm
- 6 also an attorney for the State of New York.
- 7 Hoping to do the same that April is providing
- 8 staff support.
- 9 MR. TAMPONE: My name is Anthony Tampone
- 10 but people call me Jr. I am also a community
- 11 advocate focusing a lot on housing here in the
- 12 City of Kingston and City of Planning. I run ...
- 13 kingston.org among other things. I'm also a
- 14 housing provider so I'm representing property
- 15 owners here at this board.
- 16 MS. TIERNEY: Thanks. Hi everybody. My
- 17 name is Michael Tierney. I'm a tenant
- 18 representative for the board and I live in a rent-
- 19 controlled apartment now. And I've also seen
- 20 firsthand through my work through constituent
- 21 service and government services, the imbalance
- 22 that exists between the rights of tenants and the
- 23 rights of landlords in the state of New York in
- 24 the City of Kingston. So I'm happy to get to

- 1 work. Thank you.
- 2 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And I'm Noah
- 3 Kippley-Ogman. I am an accountant and a homeowner
- 4 here in Kingston. I would love now to move to the
- 5 next item on our agenda.
- 6 MR. STECKER: Okay, Chair.
- 7 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Which is to discuss
- 8 our responsibilities following adoption of the
- 9 Emergency Tenant Protection Act by the City of
- 10 Kingston. And Peter I imagine you've prepared
- 11 something.
- 12 MR. STECKER: Yes. So the first order
- of business is upon adoption of the Emergency
- 14 Tenant Protection Act. This board first had to
- 15 get together with the ... and now the first order
- of business is for this board to adopt two
- 17 separate guidelines. The first is going to be the
- 18 rent guideline that'll be applicable to leases
- 19 from the day of adoption going forward. And the
- 20 second is, if the board chooses, a fair market
- 21 rent appeal quideline which will be used by the
- 22 agency if there is an application by the tenants
- 23 saying, prior to adoption, my lease was renewed at
- 24 a rate higher than it should have been, this board

- 1 has the authority to set the guideline where the
- 2 agency can make a determination as to whether
- 3 there was an excessive rent increase.
- 4 And we could talk through kind of the
- 5 parameters of, you know, what that could be.
- 6 However, it is up to this board to determine what
- 7 an appropriate look-back period is both for the
- 8 timeframe of the look-back period as well as the
- 9 rate of increase that should have been
- 10 appropriate. Similarly, in this board's purview
- 11 to determine what the rent increases should be for
- 12 new and renewal leases that are required by the
- 13 Emergency Tenant Protection Act from the date of
- 14 adoption going forward. Those would be for one
- 15 and two-year leases. Every Emergency Tenant
- 16 Protection Act lease is required to give a tenant
- 17 -- tenant an option for either a one or two-year
- 18 lease. So this board will be setting those two
- 19 separate guidelines. And under the law, the board
- 20 is required to do its homework so to speak. So
- 21 it's supposed to look into a variety of different
- 22 factors that are set up by the law, you know, can
- 23 pull them up. But really the best way for this
- 24 board at this point to, you know, gather relevant

- 1 information is to set at least one public hearing
- 2 to hear from landlords, tenants, other interested
- 3 members of the public in the hopes that, you know,
- 4 an educated guideline can be promulgated and
- 5 agreed to by this board. And there really is no
- 6 set number of meetings that need to be held by
- 7 this board under the law. So it really is up to
- 8 this board, you know, the manner that they go
- 9 about holding the public hearings. However, you
- 10 know, at least one should be held and, you know,
- 11 we'll have to provide appropriate public notice
- 12 beforehand and help with this, you know, to get
- 13 public engagements so that this board can get as
- 14 much information as possible.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you, Peter.
- 16 Does anyone have any questions or points of
- 17 clarification that they'd like to -- to get at
- 18 this moment?
- 19 MR. TAMPONE: I have a question.
- 20 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Yes.
- 21 MR. TAMPONE: Is there a statutory limit
- 22 to the look-back period?
- 23 MR. STECKER: So the Emergency Tenant
- 24 Protection Act does not really have caps. It

- 1 doesn't really have guidance and things like that.
- 2 Again, it's really up to the board to determine
- 3 what the look-back period should be. So, you
- 4 know, that -- that being the caps that you're
- 5 looking for, there's nothing really that I can
- 6 point to.
- 7 MS. HUERTAS: Other than it has to be
- 8 reasonable and something that the Court would also
- 9 consider reasonable if somebody actually filed,
- 10 you know, an article 78 or some other action
- 11 against what the board does.
- MR. STECKER: You know, that's where the
- 13 public hearing becomes critical because, you know,
- 14 you can see members of the public that are coming
- 15 in and talking about rent increases during a
- 16 certain time period. The board may look back and
- 17 may say that the look-back period is appropriate
- 18 to be captured in this timeframe.
- MR. TAMPONE: Uh-huh.
- 20 MR. STECKER: But really it is up to the
- 21 board to determine -- to determine the length, you
- 22 know, as well the guideline for whatever the look-
- 23 back period should be.
- 24 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I'm sorry, Peter.

```
1
     If you could lean much closer.
 2
               MR. STECKER: Sure.
 3
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And if you could all
     follow that advice looking forward, that would be
 4
 5
     -- that would make --.
 6
               MR. TIERNEY: I have a -- I have a
 7
     question.
 8
                                   Closer, please.
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
 9
               MR. TIERNEY: Can --?
               MS. PERRY: Closer.
10
11
               MR. TIERNEY:
                             In -- in determining fair
12
     market rent, can we use A.M.I. broken down by
13
     census tract, or does it have to be countywide?
14
               MR. STECKER: Speak slowly for us.
15
               MS. INOOYE: We can't hear you.
               MR. TIERNEY: Really? You can't hear me
16
17
     from there?
18
               MS. INOOYE: Yeah. We can't.
19
               MR. STECKER:
                             It's very directional.
20
               MR. TIERNEY:
                             Sorry. Is this better?
21
               MS. INOOYE:
                            Yes.
22
               MR. STECKER: Yes.
23
               MR. STECKER:
                             Yes.
24
               MR. TIERNEY: Okay. In determining fair
25
```

```
1
     market rent, can we use A.M.I. broken down by
 2
     census tract or are we limited to countywide?
 3
               MS. HUERTAS: I'm not sure of the
 4
     question. Are you asking if you could set a
 5
     different look back periods for different areas or
     are you just looking at -- asking what information
 6
     you can include in -- in determining the look back
 8
     period?
 9
               MR. TIERNEY:
                             The latter.
                             Under the law, in addition
10
               MS. HUERTAS:
11
     to the public hearings, there's a list of doc --
12
     of information that can be presented including
13
     taxes, water costs, the economics of the
14
     neighborhoods, you know. Actually I -- I don't
     remember off the top of my head. But I'm pretty
15
16
     sure A.M.I. is probably important in one of those
17
     pieces of information because you can use census
                   There's nothing that's going to stop
18
     information.
19
     you. What you do as long as it's really simple.
20
               MR. TIERNEY:
                             Thank you.
21
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Piggybacking on
22
     that, H.C.R. staff is going to provide that
23
     information at our request or?
```

The H.C.R. will provide

MS. HUERTAS:

24

- 1 some of that documentation to the board under
- 2 oath.
- 3 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Excellent.
- 4 MS. HUERTAS: You know, this is kind of
- 5 odd only that it's coming at the time period
- 6 because Kingston is coming in at the time period
- 7 that it's coming in. As a general rule, and you
- 8 know, there are -- before 2019, the only guideline
- 9 boards were either New York City, Westchester,
- 10 Rockland, and Nassau. Rockland and all of those
- 11 boards set the guideline and this is what you will
- 12 do next year is you have to a set of guideline
- 13 before July 1st which is implemented as of October
- 14 1st. And as part of them, yes. We will provide
- 15 the documentations to look for. And we will be
- 16 able to some of that. But it won't be the same
- 17 overall information that we would be able to give
- 18 you at that point or maybe -- one way or the
- 19 other. Obviously, people will be able to present
- 20 information together for the board obviously to
- 21 make that determination.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Okay.
- MS. INOOYE: This is maybe the same or
- 24 just a clarifying question. But -- so the data,

```
1 are we at all responsible for bringing our own
```

- 2 data to these meetings, or are we just presented
- 3 to by you all or experts?
- 4 MS. HUERTAS: We provide -- we provide
- 5 whatever information under the law and any
- 6 additional information asked for. But clearly,
- 7 there's nothing that stops any board member from
- 8 bringing information to the board that -- you're
- 9 board members, that is your job.
- 10 MS. INOOYE: Okay. Yeah.
- 11 MR. TAMPONE: Hi.
- MS. HUERTAS: Yeah. I'm sorry.
- 13 MR. TAMPONE: I have another question on
- 14 just the rules. Do -- is the board only allowed
- 15 to accept information outside of board members and
- 16 attorneys during a public hearing or if a public
- 17 hearing is closed, can we still receive
- 18 information?
- 19 MS. HUERTAS: From where?
- MS. MARTINEZ: I'm sorry.
- 21 MR. TAMPONE: I don't -- I don't know.
- 22 MS. MARTINEZ: Do you mind repeating
- 23 what you just said?
- MS. HUERTAS: I said from where.

1 MS. MARTINEZ: Okay. 2 MS. HUERTAS: You're obviously going to 3 be able to take the information in addition to the 4 public testimony. MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: 5 Closer. MS. HUERTAS: Whatever other information 6 7 you have, you know, I guess if you pick up ... and 8 the day after you find a piece of information in, 9 you're more than welcome and encouraged to use 10 that as part of what you're going to send it back. 11 There's no limitation as to what you're going to 12 do as long as it's reasonable and it's legal. 13 MR. TAMPONE: Okay. 14 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I would love to get some clarity about what specifically this board 15 will produce in the fall-ish is our timeline for 16 the first set of ... DAS. Is that right? 17 18 I'm sorry. You said what MR. STECKER: 19 this board will produce. I'm sorry. 20 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Yeah. What is --21 what is our duty? Our duty is produced two 22 things, right?

That's right.

So we produce the

MR. STECKER:

MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:

23

24

- 1 rent adjustment percentages for leases in -- that
- 2 start between --.
- 3 MR. STECKER: August 1st forward, which
- 4 is the effective date of Kingston's adoption. The
- 5 effective date of Kingston's adoption of the
- 6 E.T.P.A. is August 1st forward. So that would be
- 7 the guideline you, on this board, will set for
- 8 increases from August 1st going forward. So --.
- 9 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And the range of
- 10 allowable changes to rent to is what?
- 11 MR. STECKER: The range of the increases
- 12 is whatever this board sets.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: So -- so negative a
- 14 hundred all the way until positive amount at this
- 15 time?
- 16 MR. STECKER: I'm sorry. Can you repeat
- 17 that?
- 18 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: The -- the range of
- 19 options available to us should we determine it to
- 20 be reasonable is from a rent decrease all the way
- 21 up to, you know, very large numbers of a lot of
- 22 the rent increase. Well, and that's -- that's the
- 23 range of figures that we're going to choose from.
- 24 MR. STECKER: Theoretically, yes.

```
1
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Great.
                                           And we set
 2
     two percentages, right? Is that a percentage for
 3
     a one-year lease and for a two-year lease?
 4
               MR. STECKER:
                             That's correct.
                                   If in the City of
 5
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
     Kingston we learn that there are -- there are
 6
 7
     tenants who are paying for utilities and then
 8
     tenants who are not paying for utilities and we
 9
     think that those deserve a different treatment,
10
     can we set four percentages, one for a one-year
11
     lease with heat and hot water, two-year lease with
12
     heat and hot water. One year lease without heat
13
     and hot water and a two-year period. Is that --
14
               MR. STECKER:
                             Yes.
15
                                   -- familiar?
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
16
               MR. STECKER: Yes.
                                   The Board can set
17
     those different guidelines period.
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Are there other than
18
19
     ways that we can slice and dice, like what type of
20
     units get what type of ... rent adjustments?
21
               MR. STECKER: Can you kind of elaborate
22
     on what exactly are you thinking about?
23
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   I -- I just -- I've
24
     -- I've learned that you can set different numbers
25
```

- 1 for units that have heat and hot water included.
- 2 And that just raises the question for me like
- 3 what's the rule of other things that are
- 4 reasonable.
- 5 MS. HUERTAS: In 20-plus years of doing
- 6 guideline boards as counsel, those were the
- 7 limits. I don't know if you can do something
- 8 else. You can try. There's nothing wrong with
- 9 having your decision challenged and go to court
- 10 because that's probably what would happen. But
- 11 there's no limitation as to what you can do.
- 12 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you.
- MS. HUERTAS: As long as it is
- 14 reasonable and legal.
- 15 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right. That is
- 16 -- those are our ... reasonable and legal, and
- 17 using our deliberative judgment based on
- 18 information we hear from the public and from any
- 19 other sources that we reasonably and lawfully ...
- 20 MS. APRIL: Correct.
- 21 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right. I have a
- 22 set of questions about the -- the setting of
- 23 initial legal rents. Is that the right term for
- 24 the -- but if there are other questions about the

- 1 annual allowable -- the annual guidelines about
- 2 the -- the ...?
- 3 MS. INOOYE: So the guideline that we
- 4 set is from Aug -- it's for one year and then it
- 5 would be reset ...
- 6 MR. STECKER: That's correct. So in
- 7 line with the other boards throughout the state,
- 8 this board would regularly be meeting in May or
- 9 June in each year to set the guideline that would
- 10 commence on October 1st at the end of the year.
- 11 So that would mean in June of 2023 to set a
- 12 guideline that would commence on October 1st of
- 13 2023.
- 14 MR. TAMPONE: So what about the -- so
- 15 we're doing one year from August 1st. So what
- 16 about between August 1st and October 1st of 2023?
- 17 MR. STECKER: Right. I mean the
- 18 guideline that you set now will go until October
- 19 1st, 2023.
- 20 MR. TAMPONE: Okay. Okay. So more than
- 21 a year on the first year.
- MR. STECKER: Yes.
- 23 MR. TAMPONE: All right.
- 24 MS. SOTO: I have a question. If -- is

- 1 it possible for this guideline to affect services
- 2 that are currently in charge separately to be
- 3 included in rents? Or it's since if all of -- if
- 4 all of our tenants are -- asked to pay sewage,
- 5 water, and -- sewage and water to say separately,
- 6 can we ask the -- the landlords to include that in
- 7 the rent rather than with separate charges
- 8 monthly?
- 9 MS. HUERTAS: That's actually not
- 10 something that this board will do. It's something
- 11 that the tenants can ... to the division of
- 12 housing concerning service-related issues and the
- 13 question of what -- you know, if those are
- 14 services that are included in all these,
- 15 obviously, they would be subject to your
- 16 guideline. And without any specific information
- on an individual case, I wouldn't be able to tell
- 18 you ...
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: So we have heard a
- 20 great deal about initial legal rents and the fair
- 21 market rent appeal process. And I hope I've got
- 22 those words right. We've heard -- we've heard
- 23 look back periods. We've heard what other things
- 24 that are -- well, for me it's a bunch of words,

- 1 sort of ... towards ... But it looks like there
- 2 is kind of -- I feel like there's a lot of things
- 3 that I -- that I really have, what's possible,
- 4 what's allowable, what's not allowable, or what
- 5 the statute allows, what the policy allows. And
- 6 I'm curious what you've said -- you've said that
- 7 the world is our oyster as long as we're
- 8 reasonable. What are the -- what are the things
- 9 that other boards have done in outline -- in
- 10 outlining what -- what the initial rent --.
- 11 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: The -- the
- 12 guidelines for fair market rent appeals. Is that
- 13 -- is that a question that maybe we should raise
- 14 as it would be nice to see some examples?
- 15 MR. STECKER: I think you're looking at
- 16 -- I think you're looking for some sort of
- 17 comparative numbers. Is that what you're saying?
- 18 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Just -- just like I
- 19 am trying to figure out what's the world of
- 20 options on which we exercise our judgment for the
- 21 annual guidelines. I -- I would love to know
- 22 what's the world options for how -- how we
- 23 articulate set quidelines for the fair market rent
- 24 appeals for the initial ... rent.

```
1
               MR. STECKER: Well, I think it's -- it
 2
     would be helpful. There was a recent example of
 3
     the initial adoption in Westchester County ...
 4
     and, you know, by way of example that ...
 5
     looked at the data was presented to them, and they
     held public hearings. And the look back that they
 6
 7
     came up was a six months look back and they had
 8
     two separate guidelines. It was at two percent
 9
     for tenants without leases and then four percent
     for tenants with leases.
10
                               So again, I'll stress
11
     very strongly that this board needs to hold the
12
     public hearings. They need to look at the facts
13
     and the data that were actually presented to them
14
     by the public to underscore, you know, what the
     guideline is that's promulgated by this board.
15
     But in the end, that's what it's likely to look
16
17
     like is you'll have a look back period for X time
     period and will set something for tenants with
18
19
     leases and tenants without leases.
20
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   I can't be the only
21
     person here who doesn't understand.
                                          The -- I'm
22
     trying to wrap my head around what does the look-
23
     back period mean?
24
               MR. STECKER: Okay. I think it'd be
25
```

- 1 helpful for me to explain how the look-back period
- 2 is going to be used.
- 3 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Yeah. Perfect.
- 4 MR. STECKER: So the look back period is
- 5 going to be used by DHCR to determine fair market
- 6 rent appeal applications that are submitted by
- 7 tenants. So once this board promulgates the fair
- 8 market rent appeal, a tenant will be able to file
- 9 with DHCR saying I got my initial registered rent
- 10 and my landlord applied a rent increase to me that
- 11 was excessive. And so in determining whether a
- 12 rent increase for a given lookback period was
- 13 excessive, DHCR will take the fair market rent
- 14 appeal guideline promulgated by this guideline
- 15 board and see, all right, was it during this time
- 16 period and did it exceed the amount that the rent
- 17 guidelines board said was appropriate. So that's
- 18 hopefully ... defining the limit of what this
- 19 guideline is going to be used for which is
- 20 different from a guideline that goes from August
- 21 1st forward which is between the landlord and
- 22 tenant. This is what your, you know, this is what
- 23 your rules is going to look like, this is what
- 24 your lease is going to look like with the increase

- 1 by -- you know, that's promulgated by this rent
- 2 guidelines board. Fair market rent appeal is
- 3 something that provides the parameters with DHCR
- 4 to determine these applications that are submitted
- 5 by the tenants.
- 6 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: So the thing that
- 7 this board names is over this period of time in
- 8 the past before the effective date of the law or
- 9 the --.
- 10 MR. STECKER: At the adoption of --.
- 11 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Of the adoption of
- 12 the ETPA, a rent increase over a certain percent
- 13 we think is likely to be -- to be excessive,
- 14 right? So -- so if a tenant's rent was raised by
- 15 fifteen percent over the course of the last three
- 16 years and we think that is a -- like that's about
- 17 like we -- we make a judgment about how much of an
- 18 increase over what length of time was reasonable.
- 19 And then DHCR uses that guideline to determine in
- 20 a specific circumstance whether a rent increase
- 21 was excessive.
- MR. STECKER: That's correct.
- 23 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right.
- 24 MR. TIERNEY: I -- I have a follow-up

- 1 question to that. Does that apply only to
- 2 renewals during the look-back period or can we
- 3 also examine what the old tenant was paying but
- 4 then the landlord raised the rent and a new tenant
- 5 had to come in. Is that considered an increase?
- 6 Because that's considered, you know, a rental-
- 7 based eviction, right?
- 8 MS. HUERTAS: The fair amount ... is
- 9 individual to the tenant, you know, look back is
- 10 for that person's lease, not for that person's
- 11 lease to a different person's lease. We realize
- 12 that ... came in on August 1st, what happened
- 13 before that was free market because they didn't
- 14 have regulation. So in places where they are
- 15 regulations, those things -- the prior tenants
- 16 might -- might make a difference. In this
- 17 situation, that wouldn't be applicable because
- 18 what happened before that was a fair market rent.
- 19 We had this discussion last night, and some of us
- 20 didn't like the term fair market at this point
- 21 because it doesn't mean the same thing here as
- 22 everybody thinks that means. So in this case,
- 23 it's a question of whether or not at the time that
- 24 person signed that lease with the look-back period

- 1 if there was an unreasonable increase in whatever
- 2 time period this board sets as a look-back period
- 3 based on whatever percentage this board also
- 4 decides. So I don't know if that makes sense
- 5 literally but --.
- 6 MS. INOOYE: So the percentage, we just
- 7 decided one percentage and it's for the next year
- 8 but also for the look-back period, no?
- 9 MR. STECKER: No. You're going to be
- 10 setting two separate --.
- 11 MS. INOOYE: Two separate percentage.
- 12 Okay.
- MR. STECKER: So you're going be setting
- 14 fair market rent appeal guidelines. Again, the
- 15 parameters the DHCR is to decide these fair market
- 16 rent applications. And then you're going --
- 17 that's going to be a backward-looking thing.
- 18 MS. INOOYE: Okay.
- 19 MR. STECKER: From prior to adoption.
- 20 And then you're going to set a separate guideline
- 21 which could look somewhat similar numbers-wise
- 22 which will be from August 1st, 2022, going
- 23 forward. So this board will come up with two
- 24 separate quidelines.

```
1
               MS. INOOYE:
                            Okay. And how long do
 2
     tenants have to like to file this --?
 3
               MR. STECKER: The fair market rent?
               MS. INOOYE:
 4
                            Yes.
 5
               MR. STECKER:
                             Right.
                                     And it all -- the
     clock starts ticking on it once they receive a
 6
     copy of the initial registration from the
 8
     landlord. I'm trying to remember exactly the time
 9
     period --.
10
               UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:
                                      Ninety days.
11
               MS. HUERTAS: Ninety days.
12
               MR. STECKER: Yeah.
                                    I believe it's
13
     ninety days.
14
               MS. HUERTAS:
                             Ninety days set forth.
15
               MS. INOOYE:
                            Okay.
16
               MR. STECKER:
                             Set forth that they have
17
     in order to file this application.
18
               MR. TAMPONE: On the look back period,
19
     if a tenant was presented with an unreasonable
     rent increase and then was unable to meet that new
20
21
     rent and therefore was forced out during that look
22
     back period, do they have any recourse?
23
               MR. STECKER:
                             I'm just trying to think
24
     jurisdictionally, they wouldn't be stabilized
25
```

1 tenants as of the date of adoption. So I'm not 2 sure ... 3 MR. TAMPONE: Okay. If I understand the 4 MR. STECKER: 5 question, they were not before Kingston done with 6 7 Yeah, or even during -- I MR. TAMPONE: 8 mean I quess the same could be said for something 9 that happened after August 1st. But I'm saying 10 like yeah if we say on the record it's a year and, 11 you know, we find that, you know, a few dozen 12 people that maybe were not able to pay the 13 doubling of rent that -- that was required by the 14 landlord. And then, therefore, left that -- that rental unit, do they have any recourse? 15 Because if they did come up with the money to pay it and 16 17 then they leave, then -- then would stay in the unit then they would have recourse as -- as we're 18 19 -- as we're discussing now. But yeah, I'm just 20 wondering whether or not they have any right to 21 anything if they couldn't come up with the down. 22 MR. STECKER: It's an interesting 23 hypothetical. I'm not sure that that's -- they're

25

24

reviewing the application right now.

```
1
               MR. TAMPONE:
                             Yeah.
 2
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Other questions
 3
     about making sense of the look-back periods, the -
     - the -- the guidelines for fair market rent
 4
     appeals of initial legal rents? Do we feel like
 5
     we understand our responsibility or the -- the
 6
 7
     like scope of what we're responsible for
 8
     producing?
 9
               MS. INOOYE:
                            Yes.
                                  That's correct.
10
               MR. KIPLEY-OGMAN:
                                  That's correct.
                                                    All
11
            And I think that's Chair then.
     right.
                                              I think
12
     I'm going to move us to the next item of our
13
     agenda which is scheduling dates for public
14
     hearings and public meetings.
                                    I guess my first
     question, and this is I think for us as a board,
15
     is we have an obligation to hold at least one
16
17
     public meeting, one public hearing. What are the
18
     other times that we want to come together as a
19
     board, like how many -- how many meetings do we
20
     need and thinking about like what information do
     we need and what -- what's reasonable about a sort
21
     of timeline and timeframe and number of meetings
22
23
     to deliberate about that commission did, the
24
     governing commission will understand it, and to
25
```

```
1
     ioin?
 2
               MS. INOOYE: Can you remind us the
 3
     deadline for our -- this is -- our findings or --?
                             There is no deadline set
 4
               MR. STECKER:
 5
     forth in the law.
                        However this board should be
     trying to move as quickly as possible knowing that
 6
     ... you know, the effective date was August 1st,
 8
     2022.
           We're now in the middle of September. And,
 9
     you know, we're kind of frozen in time for lack of
10
     a better phrase with cases that are currently
11
     happening now, renewals that are happening now,
12
     vacancies that are happening now. So this board
13
     should act with some urgency to, you know, gather
14
     the data and promulgate that ...
15
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I -- I would -- I
     would like to hear from any of us that are ...
16
17
                          I think that we have to be
               MS. SOTO:
18
     careful in terms of public hearings because a lot
19
     the people for instance in Stony Brook where I
     live did not know anything about the August freeze
20
     and that are -- are not educated on this, do not
21
22
     have access to computers or simply the elderly
23
     community. And so I think that we need a fair
24
     amount of time to give those people that will
25
```

- 1 organize in the building enough leeway to get a
- 2 good understanding of what's going on, like at
- 3 least mid-October or something. That -- that's my
- 4 feeling around Stony Brook.
- 5 MR. TAMPONE: I have a question on --
- 6 and to piggyback on that. What resources are we
- 7 going to have and are we going to do outreach to
- 8 make sure we engage those people to get their
- 9 input during the public hearing, like is there a
- 10 notification requirement for
- 11 --
- 12 MR. STECKER: Yes.
- 13 MR. TAMPONE: -- for all those people?
- 14 Yeah
- MR. STECKER: Yeah. So the -- under the
- 16 -- the New York State law and the open meetings
- 17 law, there's a requirement that notice be
- 18 disseminated prior to any public hearing, public
- 19 meetings by this board. So as the staff support
- 20 DHCR will be handling the sending out of public
- 21 notice. It goes to emails that we have available.
- 22 It goes to the mailing address that we have
- 23 available, disseminated to available news media
- 24 who will send it in to the board. We do our best

- 1 efforts to get the public notice out as quickly as
- 2 it's available to as many people as possible.
- 3 MR. TAMPONE: So theoretically, you
- 4 would have a mailing address to every unit that is
- 5 covered under this -- this control of this board.
- 6 So would every one of those units get a
- 7 notification by mail?
- 8 MS. HUERTAS: We don't actually have
- 9 those addresses at this point. What we do have is
- 10 the list of the properties that the City of
- 11 Kingston believes are subject. We're in the
- 12 process of sending notices to all of those owners.
- 13 Owners who ... are operating any buildings are
- 14 required to register with the agency every year.
- 15 So those notices are being sent out at this point
- 16 in time. And once they are sent, we will have
- 17 some of that information, probably not before your
- 18 next hearing or meeting. So what we would do is
- 19 the same as we've done before. If you have a list
- 20 of people and addresses that you want to send, you
- 21 can give them to us so we will forward it to, you
- 22 know, those folks also. We also send it to
- 23 elected officials, as Peter mentioned, local
- 24 newspapers, news organizations, landlords and

- 1 tenants. We would have at least some -- we have a
- 2 list of the landlords that are the city ... all
- 3 those properties. And so they keep reading the
- 4 record but I'm pretty sure they might be right.
- 5 But, you know, of the -- I believe it's twelve
- 6 hundred regulated apartments ... potentially you
- 7 wouldn't have the twelve hundred contact
- 8 information ...
- 9 MR. TAMPONE: But you would do a direct
- 10 mailing to anyone that you did have an address to?
- 11 MS. HUERTAS: Yeah. You're right.
- 12 That's absolutely correct.
- 13 MR. TAMPONE: Okay. At least they have.
- 14 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Sorry. Speaking of
- 15 collecting people who might be interested here.
- 16 Could you do me a favor and pass around the piece
- 17 of paper to folks in the room who might be
- 18 interested in getting on our list? Should people
- 19 provide their email address, their name, and what
- 20 -- what contact information do you need to get
- 21 them on the list.
- 22 MR. STECKER: I'll set up a sign-in
- 23 sheet and pass it around the room, Chair.
- 24 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you. Okay.

- 1 Go ahead.
- 2 MR. TIERNEY: Yeah. For the public
- 3 hearings, I would be opposed to anything before
- 4 thirty days from now to ensure that we can give
- 5 adequate notice to everybody. And I would not be
- 6 opposed to having more than one on different days
- 7 to ensure that those who have work can attend the
- 8 other one or even, you know, the nightmare for
- 9 everybody, having one on the weekend, if that's
- 10 possible. But I think we should have as many as
- 11 reasonable to ensure as many people who want to
- 12 have the ability to testify.
- MS. SOTO: I -- I agree with that.
- 14 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Sorry. Could you
- 15 say that closer?
- MS. SOTO: I said I agree with that.
- 17 But I -- I said it'd be October but I was thinking
- 18 actually the end of October ...
- 19 MR. TAMPONE: Will there be a way for
- 20 people to comment without coming directly to the
- 21 public hearing either by mail or email or in an
- 22 online forum or some other type of way to?
- 23 MS. HUERTAS: Well, what we can do is
- 24 what we've done in both Rockland and West Chester.

- 1 We'll include the email address and people to
- 2 submit the testimony to -- to the e-mail address
- 3 which would be presented to the board members,
- 4 copies of it would be provided to the board
- 5 members.
- 6 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I have a loose
- 7 proposal or I think we could talk about and figure
- 8 out if whether -- whether I'm anywhere near what
- 9 might make any sense. I -- any we might meet in
- 10 middle -- so in the interest of like moving with
- 11 speed, making sure that we have the capacity to
- 12 hear from -- as -- as many people as -- as we want
- 13 to ... And also move it with speed. I was
- 14 thinking we could have a meeting, not an open
- 15 hearing where we ... public comments but at a
- 16 meeting like this one in mid-October, right, to --
- 17 if that's enough time to prepare information so we
- 18 can start understanding the lay of the land and
- 19 start getting used to what it's like to -- to
- 20 interact with the type of data that will be
- 21 provided and the type of analysis that will be
- 22 provided. Public hearings in early November and a
- 23 -- and a mid-November meeting to make a decision.
- 24 MS. INOOYE: Sorry. I couldn't quite

```
1
     hear you. You said public hearings when, in?
 2
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Early November.
 3
               MS. INOOYE: Yeah, I mean that's good.
                             I think that's adequate
 4
               MR. TIERNEY:
 5
     and that gives people enough time because the
     beginning of November is only a month and a half
 6
 7
     away.
 8
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Well, it's more than
 9
     a week away.
10
               MR. TIERNEY:
11
               MS. HUERTAS: Well ... we're not
12
     available on November 15th. We have a public
13
     hearing and there's something on that day.
14
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Sorry, I --.
15
               MS. HUERTAS: We -- the agency would not
     be available to be here on November 15. We have a
16
17
     public hearing in New York City that day.
18
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Good.
19
               MR. TIERNEY:
                             Exactly.
20
               MS. PERRY: I just have a question.
21
     What currently are the landlords doing? Are they
22
     not raising any rents right now until this is
23
     determined or are they allowed to -- is there any
24
     cap on anything right -- as of right now for the
```

- 1 landlords?2 Ms3 total stored
 - MS. HUERTAS: Based solely on -- and the
 - 3 total stored information that was provided during
- 4 public comments last night in meetings with all
- 5 landlords and tenants. Although they are required
- 6 to not give any ... increases as of August 1st,
- 7 I've heard many various number of guideline
- 8 increases that have been ... since August 1st.
- 9 And I have a ray of information that seems -- the
- 10 owners are either unaware or don't care what the
- 11 ... or that recommendation is now in effect ...
- 12 MS. PERRY: Okay.
- 13 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Should we start
- 14 talking about the dates?
- 15 MR. TIERNEY: Yes.
- 16 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Great. Tonight's a
- 17 Wednesday night. Did Wednesday night like work
- 18 for folks in general?
- 19 MR. TAMPONE: Yes. We're talking about
- 20 just a meeting before this board not a public
- 21 hearing at this point in time. Yeah, Wednesday
- 22 night is fine.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: How about Wednesday,
- 24 October 19, for a meeting of this board, not a

- 1 public hearing, a public -- meeting that is
- 2 comprised of public meeting. I -- I'm -- I'll
- 3 learn ... the meeting eventually. But does 10/19
- 4 at 6:30 p.m. for -- for a meeting at this board to
- 5 -- and what type -- what type of information could
- 6 the State provide on a tight timeline. Do you
- 7 have a sense of like what -- what could we be
- 8 working with as of October 15?
- 9 MR. STECKER: So, you know, I think a
- 10 little clarification would be great for what ...
- 11 the October 19th one we've proposed.
- 12 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I -- I would like to
- 13 -- to have some amount of information, analysis,
- 14 reports brought in from whatever sources we can --
- 15 we can rustle up and whatever the state can
- 16 provide to support us to understanding what's the
- 17 lay of the land here. And I think I would like to
- 18 see -- I would like to have a conversation about
- 19 that data and input from experts as -- as part of
- 20 the process in figuring out what's reasonable. Is
- 21 it -- yeah.
- MR. TAMPONE: I've got a question on how
- 23 do we get information right. Like do -- are -- is
- 24 -- is staff allowed to give us information outside

- 1 of the public board -- board meeting, like can you
- 2 filter us any information that we can discern
- 3 outside of this setting?
- 4 MR. STECKER: So the law recently
- 5 changed about boards and what they're considering
- 6 at a meeting, anything that the boards consider at
- 7 meetings will be posted on the HCRs website in
- 8 advance, right? I think it's forty-eight hours in
- 9 advance. So, you know, from our perspective, I'm
- 10 not 100 percent sure what the research unit at
- 11 this point will be giving to this board. Again,
- 12 as April mentioned previously, usually every year
- 13 there's a survey that's sent out by the HCR
- 14 Research and Analysis Unit where they get
- 15 information from owners about, you know, their
- 16 income and expenses. And that's not something
- 17 that's going to be available obviously to Kingston
- 18 at this point. You know, I don't want there to be
- 19 a sense that, you know, the research unit is going
- 20 to have a bunch of information available for an
- 21 October 19th meeting. My view on that meeting, if
- 22 there's going to be a meeting, the greatest amount
- 23 of input and information this board is going to
- 24 get is going to be the public hearings. So they -

- 1 they move this board to, if they're going to
- 2 have this set of meetings to open them up for
- 3 public comments so that view of Kingston ...
- 4 stakeholders can be heard.
- 5 MR. TAMPONE: Yeah. That's kind of the
- 6 feeling I had as well.
- 7 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Comments.
- 8 MS. MARTINEZ: I was just going to say
- 9 October 19th does not work for me. I'm sorry.
- 10 MR. TAMPONE: Does it make more sense
- 11 for us to try to set some public hearings and
- 12 gather the information that way. If we -- if --
- 13 if, you know, the staff can present the
- 14 information and I guess it's going to be posted on
- 15 the website. But then we can get it and then we
- 16 can meet after collecting that data and being able
- 17 to analyze that -- that data and then I would
- imagine we'd probably have to meet more than once
- 19 before we're going to end up coming up with the
- 20 quideline. But at least we'll have some rough
- 21 bulk information to be able to digest over that
- 22 period of time.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Do you want to share
- 24 an assessment?

```
1
               MS. SOTO:
                          That -- that seems reasonable
 2
     to me however living in such a large complex, I --
 3
     you know, I'd have to say that it would be pretty
 4
     much impossible before the month's end to gather
 5
     enough people and their problems and their
     information. I mean I can see that there should
 6
     be several public hearings. And that's -- that's
 7
 8
     very important but, you know, I don't think we can
 9
     do -- we can move quickly with so many people
10
     affected.
11
                                   Yeah.
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                           So I -- I --
12
     I heard Anthony suggesting that we start with
13
     public hearings in the beginning of November.
14
               MS. SOTO:
                          Okav.
15
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And then have two
     meetings that are not public hearings after those
16
17
     public hearings in route to making a decision.
                                                      Is
18
     that --?
19
               MR. TAMPONE:
                             I mean I feel like that
20
     probably would be reasonable. ... obviously it
21
     was one meeting. But I -- I'm going to just guess
22
     that we're probably going to need more than that,
```

probably three public hearings and possibly in a

And I would -- I would suggest that we have

23

24

- 1 variety of settings and -- and times of the day as
- 2 well. And I really have to get a focus on
- 3 allowing some type of like form or, you know,
- 4 based way for people to -- to, you know, testify
- 5 outside of physically being in the space and kind
- of really push back mechanism because I know it's
- 7 hard. And I don't know whether or not this is
- 8 something we could do. And it would be great if
- 9 how are -- you know, would we -- I imagine that
- 10 these public hearings are probably going to be
- 11 long. There's going to be a lot of people with a
- 12 lot of strong feelings. And if we could ask
- 13 people to -- since we're -- if we're going to have
- 14 multiple public hearings that they testify only
- one time at each -- at one of the three or more,
- 16 just to kind of give other people a chance, so.
- 17 MR. STECKER: Just to give a little
- 18 sense for how the public hearings work in the
- 19 counties, you know, if they're -- in Westchester,
- 20 there's a lot of input every year. And so that
- 21 board has actually set limits on the speakers that
- 22 limit them to three minutes per individual, five
- 23 minutes if they're part of an entity. So, you
- 24 know, that may be something that this board wants

- 1 to implement as well just to kind of keep some
- 2 order into the hearings to make sure that everyone
- 3 gets a chance to be heard.
- 4 MR. TAMPONE: And we should set those
- 5 goals before we set -- recommend, like we're going
- 6 to do that as we set the hearing dates, right? We
- 7 don't want to do that like day of the public
- 8 hearings. We should have that -- whatever those
- 9 rules we're going to have outlined previously.
- 10 MR. STECKER: That would be ...
- 11 MS. INOOYE: Is there any like advantage
- 12 -- like should the public hearings all be in the
- 13 same like week or two, or should we try to like
- 14 spread them out a bit in terms of accessibility?
- 15 MR. TAMPONE: I think we should spread
- 16 them.
- 17 MS. INOOYE: Yeah.
- 18 MR. TAMPONE: I think we should spread
- 19 them out.
- 20 MS. INOOYE: Yeah. So then would we
- 21 basically just do public hearings in November,
- 22 like do like three public hearings or something or
- 23 I don't know?
- 24 MS. PERRY: Maybe we could see how many

- 1 actually come to the first one and then from
- 2 there, we can see if we need others. We may have
- 3 a bunch of people show up to the first one. I
- 4 mean, there's a time constraint here also which I
- 5 think we all need to think about and to keep
- 6 prolonging this. If this was already passed in
- 7 August, we're almost into October. We don't want
- 8 to spread this out too long. And -- and for an
- 9 entire month to have public meetings that may be a
- 10 bit excessive, just a thought.
- 11 MS. MARTINEZ: Yeah. I think too and if
- 12 someone said about a weekend which is a -- like
- 13 more flexible for folks to show up. So I think
- 14 that if we have like a weekday night where folks
- 15 are also out of work. And then like during the
- 16 day on a Saturday would be a good -- but I -- to
- 17 be honest maybe like yeah, just two periods would
- 18 be good.
- 19 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Three hearings seems
- 20 like a lot to me.
- 21 MS. MARTINEZ: Yeah.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: So how about a th
- 23 November 9 which is a Wednesday and November 19
- 24 which is a Saturday? Oh, we're getting close to

- 1 Thanksgiving. How about November 26th which is a
- 2 Saturday?
- 3 MR. TAMPONE: Yeah. I think that doing
- 4 it sooner would probably be better. That might
- 5 allow us to meet before the end of November and
- 6 have our first discussion about what we heard.
- 7 MS. INOOYE: So we would probably -- I
- 8 mean I -- I -- I think realistically once
- 9 Thanksgiving that week, we -- the rest of November
- 10 is probably gone, right?
- 11 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Yeah.
- MS. INCOYE: And then we're close to the
- 13 holidays as well in December. So I -- I'm just
- 14 wondering like I don't -- I definitely want to
- 15 make sure that we have enough time to get the
- 16 notice -- get the word out. But I'm wondering if
- 17 this timeline is too compressed and if -- I don't
- 18 know if we might want to do like the last week of
- 19 October for the first one instead of trying to do
- 20 everything in November. I don't know. I -- I --
- 21 I want to hear if people think if that's enough
- 22 time. But I think there is this time sensitivity
- 23 like we probably want to be done with our work by
- 24 the holidays, right?

- 1 MR. TAMPONE: Oh, God, yes.
- 2 MS. INOOYE: Like, so -- and it's going
- 3 to get crazy in December so it would be great if
- 4 we could, you know, finish this process in
- 5 November, I think.
- 6 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: The last weekend of
- 7 October is Halloween. So it feels like -- which
- 8 is on a Monday this year. So it feels like maybe
- 9 Wednesday the 26th of October.
- MR. TAMPONE: I agree with you.
- 11 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And then Saturday,
- 12 November 5th.
- MS. INOOYE: I just -- I have a conflict
- 14 on the evening of Wednesday the 26th,
- 15 unfortunately.
- 16 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Do you want to ...
- 17 MS. HUERTAS: Is there any other day of
- 18 the week that works for you all?
- 19 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Yeah. Yeah. The
- 20 Tuesday the 25th or Thursday the 27th of October.
- 21 MR. TAMPONE: I'm available for all of
- 22 those.
- MS. MARTINEZ: Me too.
- 24 MR. TAMPONE: Tuesday the 25th is fine.

```
1
                              I can do both.
               MS. MARTINEZ:
                                              Let me
 2
            It works for me either -- I'm fine with
     know.
 3
     either.
 4
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Well -- right.
 5
     have public hearing dates set for Tuesday 10/25
     and Saturday, November 5th.
 6
               MS. INOOYE:
                            And what time?
 8
               MS. HUERTAS:
                             Saturday, what?
 9
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   November 5th.
                                                   We --
10
     we probably need to make motions and set times and
11
     figure out locations and how much of that can we
12
     delegate to the professionals in the room.
13
               MR. STECKER: All of that is left to the
14
     board's purview.
                       That should be made for times
     when you're most likely to get a quorum and when
15
     you most likely get public involvement. You know,
16
17
     it's unusual for the downstate boards to have
     weekend hearings. So I can't really give you a
18
19
     suggested time for that, you know, the usual
     hearings downstate start six thirty or seven, so.
20
21
               MS. HUERTAS: ... point of information,
22
     whatever you're doing that Saturday we'll probably
23
     be doing without DHCR staff people because we're
24
     nine to five. There is a liability issue for us
```

- 1 to be out on the weekend, so. And I have full
- 2 faith that this board will be able to do a public
- 3 hearing.
- 4 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Well I was going to
- 5 ask if that's -- if that changes, what we think
- 6 about a Saturday hearing.
- 7 Mr. TIERNEY: I think it's easier for
- 8 families with kids to come on Saturday rather than
- 9 after school at six thirty.
- 10 MS. INOOYE: Absolutely.
- 11 MR. TAMPONE: I have no problem doing
- 12 the Saturday hearing. I think do it especially
- 13 with ... -- it kind of depends on -- I think it's
- 14 going to depend on where the venue is. I wonder
- 15 about, you know, one thing obviously what we're
- 16 going to try to do here in council chambers.
- 17 We're going to have to, you know, check with the
- 18 city and make sure that it's available at that
- 19 point in time. I do think it might be valuable to
- 20 do one of the hearings outside of city hall. I
- 21 don't know where that venue could be. But maybe
- 22 something that's also easily accessible in -- in
- 23 open. Sometimes city hall is a little bit of a
- 24 daunting place for people come and talk to, so.

- 1 Do we have to set the venue right now?
- 2 MS. HUERTAS: No.
- 3 MR. STECKER: It doesn't have to be set
- 4 right now. One thing to note, you know, about
- 5 different venues ... Westchester county.
- 6 Government buildings are usually easiest. They
- 7 usually don't have fees associated with them. So,
- 8 you know, usually libraries are safe bets too but
- 9 government buildings and libraries is probably
- 10 where I would keep the public hearings just -- and
- 11 setting them up, it's a logistical nightmare to
- 12 try to go beyond that.
- MS. INOOYE: The library.
- MS. PERRY: Yeah. The library is
- 15 accessible.
- 16 MR. TIERNEY: It won't be big enough. I
- 17 think G.W. would be a better one if we want to
- 18 shoot for somewhere in October.
- MS. INOOYE: Oh yeah.
- MS. SOTO: We're -- I'm sorry. I didn't
- 21 hear you.
- 22 MR. TIERNEY: George Washington, Stony
- 23 Run (phonetic spelling), Dutch Hill (phonetic
- 24 spelling) probably make up a significant portion

- 1 of the ... somewhere where they can walk to. Oh,
- 2 what's this data?
- 3 MR. TAMPONE: I mean Edison -- or Edson
- 4 would be the closest elementary school there.
- 5 Obviously, we're going to have to talk to the
- 6 school district and see if that's something that
- 7 ... Yeah, I mean that's the easiest walk. I
- 8 think that's the school district they would be in
- 9 anyway, yeah.
- 10 MR. STECKER: Just there's also A.D.A.
- 11 compliance issues in ... venue and, you know, big
- 12 consideration as well as everyone has sort of
- 13 noticed, there's a court reporter here tonight.
- 14 So, you know, for purposes of keeping the records
- of this board, you know, we arranged for the court
- 16 reporters to show up for the hearings and
- 17 meetings. I'm not sure whether the court
- 18 reporters will be available for the weekends. I
- 19 don't know if the court reporter can speak to me.
- 20 MS. HUERTAS: You would you have to call
- 21 the office.
- MR. STECKER: Okay. Yeah. So that's an
- 23 open question as well before we can -- before we
- 24 can hear. Otherwise, there wouldn't be any use of

- 1 a -- a reporter --.
- 2 MS. INOOYE: Yeah. Can we just record
- 3 it?
- 4 MR. STECKER: To be transcribed, yeah.
- 5 So that would be what needs to be done otherwise.
- 6 But it's obviously nice to have a court reporter
- 7 here and just makes stuff easier that way.
- 8 MR. TAMPONE: But we could just record
- 9 that.
- 10 MR. STECKER: We could.
- 11 MR. TAMPONE: Yeah. Okay. Because we
- 12 can get -- we can borrow the equipment to do that
- 13 pretty easily. It's -- it's successful in the
- 14 community in itself.
- 15 MR. STECKER: Sure. Okay.
- MS. INOOYE: Are we thinking six -- how
- 17 long are those going to be, like -- like two hours
- 18 or an hour and a half or --?
- 19 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I would love the
- 20 advice of -- how long -- how long should public
- 21 hearings be?
- MR. STECKER: Well, I mean, that depends
- 23 on how many members of the public show up.
- MS. INOOYE: Oh, so we just say a start

- 1 time basically, and then --.
- 2 MR. STECKER: Say a start time and I
- 3 mean it -- it's in the best interest of this board
- 4 to hear as many members of the public as possible,
- 5 so.
- 6 MS. INOOYE: Okay.
- 7 MR. STECKER: We should --
- 8 MS. INOOYE: Cool.
- 9 MR. STECKER: -- we ... be careful what
- 10 you wish for, you know, I've had meetings in
- 11 Westchester that have lasted four or five hours,
- 12 so.
- MS. INOOYE: Okay.
- 14 MR. STECKER: And usually we set up
- 15 three public hearings and the last one is when
- 16 most of the people come. So, you know, it's --
- 17 it's hard to say the one. Yeah.
- 18 MS. INOOYE: Okay. So we'd start at
- 19 like six thirty or something on the Wednesday or
- 20 the Tuesday?
- 21 MR. TAMPONE: I don't know maybe at six
- 22 because if people come late, it doesn't really
- 23 matter.
- 24 MS. INOOYE: Six. Yeah.

- 1 And we get, you know, MR. TAMPONE: 2 we're not going to not let people sign up to speak 3 just because they came at six thirty or something. 4 MS. INOOYE: Yeah. 5 MR. TAMPONE: And we'll definitely be there for probably at least two hours, maybe more. 6 7 MS. INOOYE: Uh-huh. 8 MR. TAMPONE: I'm definitely going to 9 miss these chambers with the public hearings did 10 ten o'clock at night ... 11 MS. INOOYE: And then this Saturday, when like noon or --? 12 13 MS. MARTINEZ: Noon sounds like a good 14 time. One thing I did want to ask for these public hearings is that, if possible, we can 15 provide volunteers to do childcare for families 16 that are bringing their children. And also think 17 about like interpretations for folks that English 18
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And what type of
- 21 resources are available for language

is not their common language.

- 22 interpretation and for ASR interpretation?
- MS. HUERTAS: I'd have to research it
- 24 and get back to you. We've never used that and

25

- 1 I've been ... for twenty years. At Westchester
- 2 we've never had an interpreter but we can look
- 3 into it and --.
- 4 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I feel like we won't
- 5 be able to hear from the public if we don't have
- 6 accessible appearances. Thank you, Ma'am.
- 7 MR. TIERNEY: I -- I think we have the
- 8 resources in the community to provide those
- 9 translations. It's just if -- can we accept the
- 10 testimony through an interpreter?
- 11 MS. HUERTAS: And will it come -- yeah,
- 12 and I don't see why not. But -- and you can also
- 13 accept it in writing so, you know, unless somebody
- in the room starts screaming that's a wrong
- interpretation, we'll be good.
- 16 MR. TAMPONE: Yeah. I definitely I
- 17 think it's important that we get at least Spanish
- 18 interpretation in at least one of those hearings.
- 19 It'd be great if we can do both. Yeah.
- 20 MS. HUERTAS: So now you just have two
- 21 public hearings. When do you set the date and to
- 22 set the guideline or do you want to wait to do
- 23 that?
- 24 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Sorry. Come again.

- 1 MS. HUERTAS: So you're going to do two 2 public hearings.
- 3 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Two public hearings.
- 4 MS. HUERTAS: Where all you have to do
- 5 is take testimony, right? People are going to
- 6 tell you their information. They're going to
- 7 submit whatever they have. And subsequent to that
- 8 the board has to meet to set the guideline. So
- 9 you might want to keep that third date before you
- 10 walk out of this room tonight.
- 11 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Well, I only have
- 12 two more dates because I -- I think you're right,
- 13 Anthony that -- is that we will want -- it will --
- 14 it will require more than one conversation to come
- 15 to what we think the guidelines ought to be.
- 16 MR. TAMPONE: If we picked two dates and
- 17 we do come to write the guidelines in a single
- 18 date, can we cancel the other one? If it's -- I
- 19 mean before the like notification by open meetings
- 20 law?
- 21 MS. HUERTAS: What we would do is in the
- 22 notice we would put in parenthesis, which I've
- 23 done in the past, to be a second meeting, if
- 24 necessary.

- 1 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I love it. That
- 2 sounds great. Do you want to Wednesday night in
- 3 November? The --.
- 4 MR. TAMPONE: Do we need to be making
- 5 motions for this?
- 6 MS. HUERTAS: Once we get all together
- 7 and make one motion. Well, need to second the
- 8 motion.
- 9 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you. So, all
- 10 right. So once is in November the 9th, the 16th
- 11 and then it's Thanksgiving week after that. Do
- 12 you want to -- do you want to book the 9th and
- 13 16th of November?
- 14 MS. SOTO: I'm unavailable the 16th of
- 15 November.
- 16 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Can you do other
- 17 days then?
- 18 MS. SOTO: Pardon?
- 19 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Can you do other
- 20 days then?
- MS. SOTO: I didn't understand.
- MS. HUERTAS: Or another date that week.
- MS. SOTO: Oh, any other date that week.
- 24 I have an appointment that has been cancelled

- 1 three times and it was impossible to get another
- 2 one for months.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: What time -- can you
- 4 say it again? How about Tuesday the 15th?
- 5 MS. SOTO: Tuesday, the 15th?
- 6 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: 11/9 and 11/15.
- 7 MR. TIERNEY: That doesn't work for me.
- 8 MR. STECKER: April, yeah.
- 9 MS. PERRY: That's -- that's --.
- 10 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: On the 15th.
- 11 MS. INOOYE: 17th?
- MS. PERRY: A Thursday, November 10th.
- 13 We could try to do this more in the beginning of
- 14 November.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right, two days
- 16 in a row.
- 17 MR. TAMPONE: I have a conflict on the
- 18 10th. I have another board meeting.
- MS. PERRY: Well, we have -- well, we
- 20 have Saturday, November 5th and then November 10th
- 21 would be the --.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Oh, sorry. We -- I
- 23 was proposing the 9th as the first meeting, 11 --
- 24 11/9 as the first meeting after the public

1 hearings. And then scheduling the second meeting in case we need it. MS. PERRY: So if there's already a 3 conflict for November 9th, I believe. 4 MS. INOOYE: 5 No. 6 MR. TAMPONE: It was the 16th. 7 MS. INOOYE: No. She can do the 9th, 8 just not the 16th. 9 MS. PERRY: Okay. Okay. 10 MS. INOOYE: So we need something that 11 third week. 12 MS. PERRY: That week. Okay. 13 MR. TAMPONE: All right. 14 MS. PERRY: 17th, the day after? th MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I can't do the 17. 15 16 MR. STECKER: What about the 14th? 17 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: 14th is fine for me. 18 MS. HUERTAS: Yeah. 19 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Monday, 11/14. MS. PERRY: That works for me. 20 21 MS. HUERTAS: It works for me. MS. PERRY: Yeah. 22 23 MR. TAMPONE: That's fine. MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Yeah, you're looking 24

- 1 for a six there. All right. So we've got two
- 2 meetings, November 9th and November 14th, six
- 3 thirty p.m. We'll figure out where we can hold
- 4 them.
- 5 MR. TAMPONE: Okay. The -- what -- what
- 6 are we agreeing on the -- for the public hearings.
- 7 It's going to be the 26th and the 5th?
- 8 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Tuesday, October
- 9 25th.
- 10 MR. TAMPONE: Okay, 25th. Okay.
- 11 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And Saturday,
- 12 November 5th.
- 13 MR. TAMPONE: Okay.
- 14 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Are we ready for our
- 15 motion? All right. Well, I'm going to make a
- 16 motion. I move that we schedule two public
- 17 hearings, one on Tuesday, October 25th at six p.m.
- 18 and the second public hearing on Saturday,
- 19 November 5th at noon. And two meetings, one at
- 20 six thirty p.m. on November 9th and a second, if
- 21 needed, on November 14th at six thirty p.m.
- MR. TAMPONE: I'll second that.
- MS. PERRY: Second.
- 24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Second.

- 1 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Do you want to do 2 roll call or did you just want to say a voice 3 vote? We're going to do a voice vote. All right, 4 say aye or nay. MS. INOOYE: 5 Aye. 6 MS. SOTO: Aye. MS. PERRY: That -- that's perfect for 8 Thank you. me. 9 MS. MARTINEZ: Aye. 10 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: It's -- it's a 11 turnover.
- MS. INOOYE: Aye.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Good job team.
- 14 MR. STECKER: For the purposes of the
- 15 public notice, the meeting on November 9th, the
- 16 agenda, the vision for that would be -- I think
- 17 you had mentioned to kind of discuss.
- 18 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I would love to
- 19 continue our conversation by asking how we set
- 20 agenda's for meetings and -- and how we assemble
- 21 and disseminate materials in advance of meetings.
- 22 Because we -- we have to set the agendas as a
- 23 board.
- 24 MS. INOOYE: What do you mean how do we

```
1
            Like what -- like should we just talk now
     do it?
 2
     about what should be on the agenda or -- or --?
 3
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   So who sets the
              How far in advance is it disseminated?
 4
     agenda?
 5
     With what input is the agenda set.
                                          I -- I would
     say that like let's have the chair set the agenda
 6
     of the meeting and welcome board members to -- to
 7
 8
     make suggestion of things to improve on the agenda
 9
     including any documents to be discussed.
                                               And, you
10
     know, a week in advance of the meeting and then
11
     the -- the chair will assemble an agenda based on
12
     the input of the board and share that agenda and
13
     any attachments with the state who will post it
14
     publicly at least 48 hours in advance of the
               Is that a reasonable process? How do
15
     meeting.
     other boards set agendas?
16
17
                             So my question is really
               MR. STECKER:
18
     for the November 9th meeting.
                                    I know exactly what
19
     the agenda is going to be for the 25th and the 5th
20
     and 14th, if necessary. You know, the 9th is a
21
     public meeting. And so I was just, you know, it's
22
     really kind of an informal thing as far as you
23
     make a motion.
                     I just wanted to -- I'm going to
24
     be drafting up the public notice once, you know,
25
```

- 1 the ... figured out. And I'd like to as I did
- 2 this notice to figure out what's going to be on
- 3 the agenda for that day. So I was hoping to just
- 4 clarify, you know, your motion of what you
- 5 envision on that day.
- 6 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I would -- I would
- 7 like -- April would like to set the guideline. I
- 8 would like us to review information presented to
- 9 the board by whatever the research team can
- 10 produce by whatever the board members have
- 11 identified as useful inputs. I -- we live in the
- 12 community that has a lot of experts in -- in the
- 13 questions that are relevant to the board. I
- 14 imagine some of them would like to share some of
- 15 their expertise with this board and I -- so I
- 16 figure we could assemble an agenda as we know
- 17 closer to the date what information it will be
- 18 valuable to review in order to best exercise our
- 19 good judgment.
- MR. STECKER: Okay. And you know,
- 21 there's wiggle room to the public notice needs to
- 22 be sent out three days before the day of the
- 23 meeting, so, you know, so long as it's kind of
- 24 crystallized before whenever that is, the first

- 1 week -- first of couple of days of November,
- 2 that's fine in case we need to --.
- 3 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Sorry. You said
- 4 three days.
- 5 MR. STECKER: Three days.
- 6 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Okay. I -- I heard
- 7 thirty days.
- 8 MR. STECKER: No. No.
- 9 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Does that sounds
- 10 reasonable on the process?
- 11 MR. TIERNEY: Yes.
- MS. HUERTAS: We're good.
- 13 MR. TIERNEY: Just for clarity though.
- 14 So at the November monthly meeting, that's when we
- 15 will be setting the two guidelines or does that
- 16 just reflect on the information gathered at the
- 17 public hearing through sources?
- 18 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: We will start the
- 19 process of deliberating. And if we get to a point
- 20 where we're ready to set guidelines, we will set
- 21 guidelines. And if we don't finish that work, we
- 22 will meet on the 14th.
- 23 MR. STECKER: I got you. Thank you.
- 24 MS. INOOYE: Just one other clarifying

- 1 question. So you'll send out a notice three days
- 2 in advance. But will people --.
- 3 MR. STECKER: It will go out a lot
- 4 longer than three days in advance.
- 5 MS. INOOYE: Okay.
- 6 MR. STECKER: It'll go out as soon as
- 7 it's ready probably at least a month in advance
- 8 before the first meeting.
- 9 MS. INOOYE: Okay. So it's just the
- 10 updated agenda that would go out, like has to go
- 11 out three days, okay.
- MR. STECKER: Yeah. The agenda could be
- 13 updated if need be.
- MS. INOOYE: Up to three days before.
- 15 Okay. Great.
- 16 MS. SOTO: But I -- I have a question
- 17 about of the public testifying in -- in any of our
- 18 meetings. Is there a -- a time when we ask for
- 19 comments from people that attend our meetings?
- 20 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Carol, it's like
- 21 you're reading my mind. I -- if we're finished
- 22 with the scheduled dates for the public hearings,
- 23 my -- my ambition for the other business was to
- 24 invite anyone here who may have guidance that they

- 1 want to share with us about what we're working on
- 2 if they -- if they would like to comment. So I --
- 3 I think that we should, as we plan agendas, we
- 4 should identify if the -- if there's a meeting
- 5 where we would like to hear from non-members of
- 6 the board who are present. And we should make
- 7 sure to always include other business because we
- 8 may -- we may need it and we may want to hear from
- 9 other folks in the room. Thank you.
- MS. SOTO: Yes.
- 11 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Is that -- is that
- 12 the right answer?
- MS. SOTO: Nice -- nice answer. Yes.
- 14 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right. Good.
- 15 MR. TAMPONE: I would -- I would like to
- 16 stip -- if we do decide to do that, I'd like to
- 17 stipulate that there's a fixed time for that to
- 18 happen in, that there is a fixed amount of time
- 19 that any person could speak. You know, public
- 20 hearings are designed to be open-ended to -- to
- 21 listen to the public. But if we're trying to
- 22 deliberate and we have, you know, people taking up
- 23 all the air in the room then we may never get
- 24 finished, so.

- 1 Yes. I think we MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: 2 should -- we should exercise judgment about how to 3 hold on to our agendas, you know. Moving on to the other business, if -- if the rest of us are up 4 5 for it, I would love to hear if we have -- I know we have separate elected officials. We have -- we 6 7 have a variety of people who are interested in 8 this process here in the room with us. And I 9 would love to hear anything that they have to say, 10 if they have things to say. And with -- with the 11 permission of the rest of us, I'd like to -- to 12 see if folks have things to say, limiting 13 statements to three minutes. 14 MR. TIERNEY: Does that require a motion 15 as well? 16 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Does that require a 17 motion?
- 18 MR. TIERNEY: To open the meeting to
- 19 public comment?
- MR. STECKER: It's -- I mean, it's up to
- 21 the Board's purview. It's probably a good idea if
- 22 we need to take a motion to opening up the public
- 23 hearing.
- MR. TAMPONE: So moved.

```
1
               MR. TIERNEY: I'll second. I'll second.
 2
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right.
                                               And
 3
     let's go around and -- and vote.
               MS. SOTO: Aye.
 4
               MR. TAMPONE: Don't you need to call the
 5
     roll, chair?
 6
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Oh, Diana?
 8
               MS. LOPEZ-MARTINEZ:
                                    Aye.
 9
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Mie?
10
               MS. INOOYE:
                            Aye.
11
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Anthony.
12
               MR. TAMPONE: Seconded already.
13
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Tara.
14
               MS. PERRY: Aye.
15
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Michael Tierney?
16
               MR. TIERNEY:
                             Aye.
17
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And Carol.
18
               MS. SOTO: Aye.
19
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Aye.
                                         The motion
20
              Are there members of the public who would
     passes.
21
     like to speak?
22
               MR. STECKER: Chair, I believe ... set
23
     the timer for three minutes for public speakers?
24
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Yes, please.
25
```

```
1
               MS. PERRY: You like raise to it a ...
 2
               MR. MCKEE: Good evening. My name is
 3
    Michael McKee.
                     I am the treasurer of the ...
                        I have -- thank you for the
 4
    Action Committee.
 5
     opportunity to testimony -- testify. I can't deny
    there was a written statement which ... I didn't
 6
     like to read but I would like to make some bullet
 7
8
    points.
              I've been doing this work for more than
9
     fifty years.
                   I was involved in the enactment of
10
     the Emergency Tenant Protection Act in 1974.
11
     -- and then had been involved in the
12
     implementation of it. And with the changes in it
13
     ever since. I want to congratulate you.
                                               You are
14
     first new rent guidelines awards since 1974.
     That's forty-eight years. It has been a long time
15
    coming. We have worked for many years to expand
16
17
     the applicability to -- of rent controls statewide
    and finding one out three years ago in the state
18
19
     legislature. Kingston ... the first municipality
20
     that's opted in. We expect there will be many
            I wanted to first of all remind you of that
21
    more.
22
    the law does not talk about rent increases.
23
    Everyone says that your job is to promulgate rent
24
                 The law says your job is to adopt rent
     increases.
25
```

- 1 adjustments, if any. We all get sloppy then we
- 2 all talk about rent increases. But we should
- 3 remember, that is not what the law says. All four
- 4 of the existing rent guidelines boards have frozen
- 5 rents and in the case of Westchester and ...
- 6 several times over the last many years. And you
- 7 have the power to do that. And you have the power
- 8 to go back in this. So please remember it's the
- 9 rent adjustments. And I'd like to concentrate on
- 10 the issue if I might -- sorry, Carol.
- 11 Carol: Please proceed.
- 12 MR. MCKEE: But I want to talk -- I want
- 13 to concentrate on the fair market rent appeal.
- 14 That's the most complicated and obtuse part of
- 15 implementation of ETPA. That's the most
- 16 complicated issue that you're going to be dealing
- 17 with. And I have great concerns about how it's
- 18 going to be implemented in Kingston. A fair
- 19 market rent deal is not an overcharge. And I want
- 20 to compliment April who -- a report us for the
- 21 presentation last night. She understands the
- 22 difference between a rental overcharge in a fair
- 23 market rent appeal. And I'm not sure if everyone
- 24 at the agency does. One of your first acts will

- 1 be to do some research and some analysis. And you
- 2 won't have a lot of hard data. As Peter said,
- 3 most of what you're going to have is testimony.
- 4 In later years, you'll have actual data before you
- 5 that you won't have this first time around. But
- 6 you need to determine what would have been a
- 7 reasonable rent increase from now 2019 forward
- 8 when Kingston first started talking about opting
- 9 into ETPA. If manuals have not been manufactured.
- 10 In other words, what would a real estate, a
- 11 reasonable rent increase have been for a landlord
- 12 to raise the rent. And I'm sure there are some
- 13 landlords in the case that you have been
- 14 reasonable. Oh, I haven't heard about them. And
- 15 once I heard about them quite unreasonable and --
- 16 and what ...
- 17 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you, Michael.
- 18 The board has --.
- 19 MR. MCKEE: I'm sorry.
- 20 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: The -- the board set
- 21 a timer of three minutes unless we would like to -
- 22 -.
- 23 MR. MCKEE: I can't -- I'm sorry, I
- 24 can't understand you, Mr. Chair.

- 1 MS. HUERTAS: The board set three
- 2 minutes.
- MR. MCKEE: Oh, you set three minutes.
- 4 MS. HUERTAS: So a summary.
- 5 MR. MCKEE: I can't possibly summarize
- 6 that. I can't summarize my testimony in three
- 7 minutes. What I will do is I will distribute my
- 8 testimony, a written statement. It has my contact
- 9 information on it. I'm happy to talk to any
- 10 member of the board, if you want to get in touch
- 11 with me about this. These are complicated issues.
- 12 As you can see in my statement --.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Why don't you take
- 14 another two minutes?
- 15 MR. MCKEE: I'm sorry?
- 16 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Why don't you take
- 17 another two minutes? Two -- two -- two more.
- 18 MS. HUERTAS: Can you sum it up in two
- 19 minutes?
- MR. MCKEE: Well, I'm summing it up.
- 21 And that's what I'm doing.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Okay. Good.
- 23 MS. HUERTAS: No. He's saying he'll
- 24 give you two more minutes. So can you sum it up

1 in two minutes? 2 MR. MCKEE: I can try. Okay. Number 3 one, don't limit the look-back period. Don't do what happened in Ossining when the village in 4 5 Ossining they opted in to ETPA in 2018, that the agency of counsels scared Westchester county rent 6 quidelines board with talk of a landlord lawsuit 7 8 if they went back more than six -- six months. 9 You should not do that. Anything less than three 10 years in Kingston would be unfair because that's 11 when the landlord's started jacking up rents when 12 they heard that they're not getting rent control 13 being imposed. This is not about any individual, 14 staff person or any of the good people working at 15 This is about the culture of the the O.R.A. institution and this is about the design of a weak 16 form of rent control, which was designed by the 17 real estate lobbyist itself which I won't go into. 18 19 Secondly, I want to just point out 20 to you that the form there -- the form that DHCR 21 is using for this is totally inappropriate. It's 22 a rent overcharge form, you know. This is not an 23 I think you should insist on a overcharge. 24 separate new form for fair market rent appeals and

- 1 a fact sheet. There's nothing on the DHCR website
- 2 about this issue. I'll write it for them and then
- 3 ... polish it. But this is an important right
- 4 that tenants in Kingston have and we want to see
- 5 every tenant in Kingston exercise that right if
- 6 they choose to do so. We don't want them to be
- 7 arbitrarily denied the right to challenge the
- 8 initial legal regulated rent to you. Thank you
- 9 very much.
- 10 MS. HUERTAS: I'm sorry. Excuse me.
- 11 Michael, do you mind spelling your last name for
- 12 the record?
- MR. MCKEE: M-C capital K-E-E.
- MS. HUERTAS: Thank you.
- 15 MR. MCKEE: I'll ...
- 16 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you, Michael.
- 17 The gentleman ...
- 18 MR. MCKEE: I'll stand around.
- MS. SOTO: Okay.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you very much.
- 21 MR. LILIENTHAL: Yeah, thank you for the
- 22 opportunity to speak. I name is John Lilienthal. I
- 23 am a tenant advocate with the metropolitan counsel
- 24 on housing and I work for a tenant law firm

- 1 Collins, Dobkin & Miller. You know, Mr. McKee is
- 2 the oracle where he comes ... information. I would
- 3 like to yield my time to Michael Mckee.
- 4 I'm sorry. I'm asking to yield my time
- 5 for Michael if -- if they all agree to it.
- 6 MR. MCKEE: We want you to put the mic
- 7 off your mic.
- 8 MR. JOHN: Okay.
- 9 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Oh, thank you.
- 10 MR. JOHN: Just asking to yield my time
- 11 to Michael McKee.
- MR. MCKEE: No, it's okay.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right. It seems
- 14 like he's declining.
- 15 MR. MCKEE: If you'll read my statement,
- 16 I'm perfectly happy to talk to any board member
- 17 individually or in groups as long as it's not more
- 18 than five in a group. Does that apply with the
- 19 ... so. I'll just get in touch. But I will be
- 20 back.
- 21 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right. Thank
- 22 you so much.
- 23 MR. JOHN: It's the terminator.
- 24 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: All right. Margaret

- 1 Hill.
- 2 MS. HILL: Hi everybody. I'm Margaret
- 3 Hill. This is great. I think this is a wonderful
- 4 board that's been set up and I'm really looking to
- 5 the process. I just want to say that it's been
- 6 kind of an educational process. It's going to be
- 7 August going -- you know, implementing this over
- 8 the next few months. I have to say on my ward, of
- 9 the twelve hundred units, there's five hundred.
- 10 So I have a lot of anxious tenants who are in
- 11 probably a few core developments and then I think
- 12 another -- I think all together in wards one and
- 13 two that might be ninety percent of the units. So
- 14 I'm looking forward to help because there's a lot
- of stressed out people. And I think we learned
- 16 last night that people can start putting in some
- 17 paperwork of the ordinance. A lot of this is very
- 18 confusing and I guess, you know, ... this way as
- 19 we're deliberating, let me show you the testimony
- 20 at the public hearings. But, you know, I hope
- 21 there's some processes that we can start, you
- 22 know, correct the forms and correct the FAQ sheets
- 23 to help allay the anxiety of all these tenants
- 24 because this is confusing. But thanks again.

```
1
               MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN:
                                   Thank you so much,
 2
     Margaret.
                The gentleman --
 3
               MR. JARNAN: Good evening. Eric Jarmon,
                   I'm a resident of 21 since December
 4
     J-A-R-M-O-N.
 5
     of 2019, my family and I. And I just want to say
     two things. One with regard to those meeting
 6
 7
     notices, just thirteen days ago on the day of our
 8
     first public hearing at the football field, I
 9
     found out that evening after coming home that the
10
     property manager had ordered the maintenance on
11
     staff to remove notices that on the doors for that
12
     -- that meeting that evening and they were
13
     required to do that. So yes, we are dealing with
14
     the issues in the case of the ... okay, vicious
     agents, and I've never met the owner, only the
15
     agents, so I was sitting at the back. And I would
16
17
     like to make a suggestion if -- if it's possible,
     you know, to the November 9th meeting to help ...
18
19
     looking forward just as Carolyn mentioned we have
20
     a lot of elderly people in our -- in our complex.
21
     I'm sure there are others, if it all, if it's
22
     possible we can make use of notary publics who are
23
     also able to be sworn jurists and, you know, into
24
     that board of records if ... person or persons
25
```

- 1 otherwise cannot make it to that meeting. And I'm
- 2 offering, you know, my services in that
- 3 department.
- 4 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you. ...
- 5 Michelle.
- 6 MS. HIRSCH: Hi. Good evening. My name
- 7 is Michelle Hirsch. I'm the alderwoman of the
- 8 board 9 Kingston here. When I took office on
- 9 January 2020, I had West Chestnut street mansion
- 10 apartments in my ward. We've got about a hundred
- 11 and sixty tenants that were -- they're being
- 12 terrorized by their landlord. Many were already
- 13 receiving exorbitant rent increases. The
- 14 landlords did an illegal lockout on the tenants.
- 15 It is in the newspaper, The Daily Freeman. The
- 16 landlord didn't pay electric bills for the common
- 17 areas and the gas in the apartments. I'm going to
- 18 urge all of you to please do at least a three-year
- 19 look back as when I took office over two years ago
- 20 because all these tenants were already receiving
- 21 extreme rent increases in response to the city
- 22 doing a rental survey back in 2019. Thank you.
- 23 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you so much.
- 24 Anyone else? Does anyone else on the board have

- 1 anything we should talk about?
- 2 MS. SOTO: Okay. I think it's very
- 3 important that we have a fact sheet and I'm
- 4 wondering if the city is going to help us to put
- 5 that out or are we responsible in any way or who's
- 6 going to get the fact sheet together?
- 7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I will say that
- 8 ... fact sheet that the city was supposed to send
- 9 it off.
- 10 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I'm sorry. I think
- 11 that I have a question for the team at DHCR, which
- is in light of the comments we've heard about them
- 13 a -- a ... fair market rent appeals not being
- 14 available and I know there's a judgment that the
- 15 forms were suggesting to use ... fair market rent
- 16 appeals is in ...
- 17 MR. MCKEE: Those were my words.
- 18 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Do you have plans
- 19 for or should we ask you to have plans for a fact
- 20 sheet for tenants who are interested in filing a
- 21 fair market rent appeal. And do plans for
- 22 developing another appropriate reform to do that.
- 23 MS. HUERTAS: I would probably tend to
- 24 disagree with Mr. McKee. I think that the form

- 1 that is used will be fine. It's online. It will
- 2 be available online for the tenants. Once this
- 3 board sets a fair market rent appeal, look back
- 4 period, and guidelines. It clearly states for --
- 5 for it to be Kingston. It is labeled for
- 6 Kingston. It's only going to be available for
- 7 Kingston tenants but as of right now Kingston is
- 8 the only location that can file a -- tenants can
- 9 file a fair market rent appeal. So everything --.
- 10 MR. MCKEE: The form you got attached to
- 11 my testimony is the form as it existed this
- 12 morning.
- MS. HUERTAS: Mr. McKee, I have to say
- 14 one thing. While you spoke, I did not interrupt
- 15 you.
- 16 MR. MCKEE: I know.
- 17 MS. HUERTAS: While you're not a member
- 18 of this board, it was kind enough of the board to
- 19 allow you to speak, but to speak over me is not
- 20 accepted.
- 21 MR. MCKEE: I apologize.
- 22 MS. HUERTAS: If you would like to ask
- 23 the board to give you another three minutes, you
- 24 are welcome to do so. But in the meantime, allow

- 1 me as counsel to complete my statement to the
- 2 board because I allowed you to speak.
- 3 MR. MCKEE: Ms. Gray-Huertas, I
- 4 apologize. I thought you were finished. I'm
- 5 sorry.
- 6 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Okay.
- 7 MR. MCKEE: The acoustics in this room
- 8 are not really good.
- 9 MS. HUERTAS: As to the second part,
- 10 once this board has determined what will be the
- 11 fair market information, that information will be
- 12 obviously put into a public record and will be
- 13 published on our website. It will be available to
- 14 the public. But right now, we can't update that
- 15 because other than to pull up to be determined, we
- 16 wouldn't be able to give any information to the
- 17 tenants or the owners as to what their lock-back
- 18 period will be.
- 19 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Thank you. I would
- 20 like to take a minute for us as a board to look at
- 21 the form that Mr. McKee has so kindly shared with
- 22 us and -- and see what we think about it. So like
- 23 let's take a minute to do that.
- 24 The -- so I'm -- I'm -- I -- I

- 1 welcome any of us to express any judgment during -
- 2 what our experience is in looking at this form.
- 3 But I fill out forms frequently and -- and I am
- 4 noticing that this form is asking for a lot of --
- 5 a lot of documentation. This form is asking for
- 6 attention copies of their leases for the last six
- 7 years. It's asking for cancelled checks for every
- 8 time you paid the rent in the last six years. Its
- 9 asking -- and in the instructions are -- are
- 10 referring to a fact sheet which -- the
- 11 instructions refer to a fact sheet which is not
- 12 the relevant fact sheet for it.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I am also --.
- MS. HUERTAS: I'm told --.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Oh, sorry.
- 16 MS. HUERTAS: Sorry. Until the board
- 17 sets -- until -- sorry. Until the board sets the
- 18 fair market rental appeal. Once it is, the fact
- 19 sheet will be updated and clearly nobody is going
- 20 to have to provide six years' worth of
- 21 documentation but six years ago this was the not a
- 22 ...
- 23 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I haven't seen HCR's
- 24 forms so I have nothing to really compare this to

- 1 at this time. Did we receive that yet? I only
- 2 have the ET --.
- 3 MR. TIERNEY: Oh, it's in the back.
- 4 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Is that the state
- 5 one?
- 6 MS. INOOYE: No. This is the overhead.
- 7 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Oh, I thought that
- 8 was Michael, a spokesperson for Kingston.
- 9 MR. TIERNEY: No. This is the state's
- 10 form.
- 11 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: That's the state's
- 12 form.
- 13 MR. TIERNEY: This is the state's form.
- 14 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Okay. Thank you.
- MS. SOTO: I would have to note that my
- 16 96-year-old neighbor almost had a nervous
- 17 breakdown completing this.
- 18 MS. INOOYE: So this form is the form
- 19 that went out that's in this packet or not?
- 20 MS. HUERTAS: This form is what was the
- 21 one that has made available online right now as an
- 22 outline until -- until this board actually sets
- 23 the fair market rent appeal. So tenants would
- 24 fill out this form and send it in because they

- 1 don't know what the look back period is or what
- 2 the guideline is.
- 3 MS. INOOYE: Okay.
- 4 MS. HUERTAS: So what we have done is we
- 5 have used what in the city and the other
- 6 communities. Westchester ... used as overcharge
- 7 complaints. And as Michael did point out earlier
- 8 they're two different things. So the overcharge
- 9 is not what this is. What fair market rent appeal
- 10 is not the same as an overcharge. An overcharge
- 11 is what you have been charged as of today, as of
- 12 August 1st going forward. What you're going to be
- 13 doing with fair market rent appeal is going
- 14 backward. So that form might actually be amended
- 15 to some degree until we know what the fair market
- 16 rent outline is that is prepared and approved by
- 17 this -- it would actually just -- we would be
- 18 guessing what we were putting in those documents.
- 19 MR. STECKER: I guess to answer that,
- 20 it's not the board's responsibility to tell the
- 21 H.C.R. how to amend these forms or change things
- 22 and all that. So I don't know if the board is
- 23 getting far afield trying to determine whether the
- 24 form is ... rather than it's too complicated. I

- 1 will also note that there is a lot of public
- 2 information and resources that were made known to
- 3 tenants and owners last night. So it's not like
- 4 we pull up this form and there's no one we can
- 5 call. You know, it's worth noting also that the
- 6 H.C.R. has a very robust office of public
- 7 information that is available at all times to help
- 8 anyone who's trying to navigate through all these
- 9 forms realizing that it's complicated.
- 10 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And -- sorry, just
- 11 to be really quick. This -- the fair market rent
- 12 appeal form or whatever process to do fair market
- 13 rent appeal which the draft version of is use this
- 14 form. This is the form that a tenant would need
- 15 to file within ninety days of the landlord
- 16 providing by certified mail, here's the services,
- 17 and raise the rent.
- 18 MS. HUERTAS: Within ninety days of
- 19 being served with registration, yes.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And when can I go to
- 21 start serving that registration?
- MS. HUERTAS: The registrations have to
- 23 be filed by the owners. So once they're filed by
- 24 the owners -- the owner has to file with the

- 1 agency and serve it on the tenant, return receipt
- 2 requested. That's to begin the ... ninety day
- 3 period which is also part of the reason that you
- 4 got varied -- assumes that quicker, you know, a
- 5 quicker period in which we'll do it because if you
- 6 wait until December or January that would kind of
- 7 ... those questions as far as that's concerned.
- 8 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Yeah. I'm getting
- 9 that. This is a draft form that is confusing is
- 10 maybe labeled with the -- I don't know, with the
- 11 title of the format. Isn't the thing that people
- 12 would use this form for at Kingston -- I
- 13 understand it's a draft. But this is the form or
- 14 a fair market rent appeal form is the first form
- 15 that is necessarily and its necessarily in a
- 16 ninety-day conference starting maybe now for some
- 17 tenants. And I -- I guess I'm curious what the
- 18 others on the board think about that.
- 19 MR. TAMPONE: So I have a question. The
- 20 -- if the tenant is served they are noticed that
- 21 they are in a unit that is controlled by the
- 22 E.T.P.A. then their ninety-days starts then even
- 23 though there are no guidelines in which they can
- 24 file an appeal against. Is that correct?

```
1
               MS. HUERTAS:
                             That's pretty accurate.
 2
               MR. TAMPONE:
                             I don't quite understand
 3
     how the mechanics of that is supposed to work.
 4
               MR. STECKER:
                             I mean that's why we urged
 5
     at the beginning of the meeting to act with haste
     in trying to set up meetings and get the
 6
 7
     quidelines promulgated as quickly as you can.
                                                     Ι
 8
     know that the board is balancing is a lot of
 9
     different factors between making sure that the
10
     public is aware of the meetings and able to
11
     collect their thoughts on the issue.
                                           But, you
12
     know, there's a lot that's depending upon this
13
     board acting with some sort of urgency and that's
14
     one of the things. But just for a little bit of
15
     context, the owners are required to file their
     registration by October 31st.
16
17
               MR. TAMPONE:
                             Uh-huh.
18
                             So we're probably looking
               MR. STECKER:
19
     at, you know, say somebody filed -- say there's a
20
     lot of filings on October 31st. The -- you know,
21
     the notice probably goes to the tenants somewhere
22
     first, second week of November. Then the clock
23
     starts to run based on the timeframe that the
24
     board has set up for promulgating their guideline,
25
```

- 1 you know, say you have it on November 9th which
- 2 would be in good shape for, you know, being able
- 3 to attend to this.
- 4 MR. TAMPONE: So to date, no -- no
- 5 property owner has registered with H.C.R.?
- 6 MR. STECKER: I don't know the answer to
- 7 that question.
- 8 MS. HUERTAS: I haven't met with any
- 9 officers for this week is -- ... in Kingston. But
- 10 the last thing that one -- one owner had even
- 11 attempted to file the registration.
- 12 MR. TAMPONE: Will this board know when
- 13 those notifications go out to the -- the tenants
- 14 or will -- will staff be able to notify us? I
- 15 mean I -- I guess the question is is this -- if
- 16 there's -- if a bunch of notices go out and we
- 17 feel the need to act in a greater urgency than
- 18 we've already -- the days that we've lined out,
- 19 then can the chair call a meeting to try to
- 20 accelerate that timeline?
- 21 MS. HUERTAS: The latest that the owners
- 22 can file that over the deadline which doesn't need
- 23 a length because clearly I can file it after that.
- 24 It's October 31st. Based on what your board has

- 1 said, you are not going -- you're going to set the
- 2 guideline, either the first week or the second
- 3 week of November. At that point, you're really
- 4 talking about maybe a week or two difference
- 5 between when the notice is served and -- I mean if
- 6 we were -- if you guys can set the board meeting
- 7 for January, that will be a concern. But you're
- 8 pretty much running in line with when the -- when
- 9 the owners have to file those registrations.
- MR. TAMPONE: Well, you're saying you've
- 11 already received probably one registration for a
- 12 building?
- 13 MS. HUERTAS: One building registration
- 14 but I don't know whether or not they served their
- 15 tenants.
- 16 MR. TAMPONE: So we assume that they
- 17 have then by the time -- and let's say we set a
- 18 quideline in the beginning of -- or middle of
- 19 November then that would leave at least those
- 20 tenants less than 30 days to -- to do something.
- 21 MS. HUERTAS: Correct.
- MR. TAMPONE: Okay. So that's the
- 23 worst-case scenario I guess that we're looking at,
- 24 right?

- 1 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Given the -- this
- 2 conversation, do we as a board feel like we want
- 3 to revisit the conver -- the motions that we
- 4 passed about dates in regards to the meetings?
- 5 MR. TIERNEY: We already made the
- 6 motion.
- 7 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: We make -- we did
- 8 make a motion.
- 9 MR. TIERNEY: When we vote.
- 10 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Yeah, we vote. We
- 11 can't undo it. Well, I guess we can't undo it.
- 12 Given the time of the conversation here and what
- 13 feels like a sense among the board members that --
- 14 that Kingstonians would appreciate a clear process
- 15 and clear fact sheets about how to file fair
- 16 market rent appeals. Does DHCR have a sense --
- 17 are -- are you going back to the office thinking
- 18 about this.
- 19 MS. HUERTAS: I'm not sure I understand
- 20 what your question.
- 21 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: It seems like this
- 22 board would appreciate a fact sheet for people
- 23 filing fair market rent appeals and perhaps a form
- 24 that -- that is more narrowly tailored to the

- 1 needs of this community at this moment. Do you
- 2 have plans to do anything about? Would you like
- 3 this board to make an advisory motion saying that
- 4 we would like you to do that? I know we can't
- 5 like tell you to do anything. And -- but what is
- 6 the -- what is your sense of what's possible and
- 7 what the agency may be up for?
- 8 MS. HUERTAS: The fact sheet will be
- 9 updated when the board has set the fair market
- 10 rent appeal. Which there's nothing we can do
- 11 right now with the fact sheet unless you -- I
- 12 mean, we don't have any information with that. So
- 13 what would we put out a fact sheet even if I -- if
- 14 I had said to you right now. Of course I'll go
- 15 back on Monday and I'll get a fact sheet. I have
- 16 no information to put on the fact sheet other than
- 17 maybe the guideline, the PC guideline where we
- 18 will set a fair market rent appeal in November.
- MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: And maybe a process
- 20 of -- of how you would go about filing a fair
- 21 market rent appeal. I think -- I think that the -
- 22 the form doesn't require the guidelines to have
- 23 a form and the -- like the office that you send
- 24 the form to doesn't require the guidelines to like

- 1 name the office that you send the form to. And
- 2 the required information --.
- 3 MS. HUERTAS: But to process that --
- 4 well, for a tenant to file a fair market rent
- 5 appeal, they need to have information. It's --
- 6 it's a formula. So perhaps -- that's a
- 7 hypothetical -- perhaps five months ago, Mrs.
- 8 Jones got a -- got an increase of ten percent.
- 9 She thinks that's excessive, right?
- 10 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Uh-huh.
- 11 MS. HUERTAS: She can file -- she could
- 12 file whatever she wanted to I assume but there's
- 13 nothing for us to do as an agency for processing
- 14 purposes because this board hasn't set the look
- 15 back period and/or percentage increase. So other
- 16 than putting it in a queue and letting it sit
- 17 there, there's nothing for us to do in putting a
- 18 piece of paper that says this might -- we can't
- 19 say what this board might be doing. We serve
- 20 solely as staff to the board. So we can't tell
- 21 the board what to do. We're not going to go over
- 22 a piece -- you know, a documentation or to say
- 23 that. We have updated our forms so that Kingston
- 24 is included. We -- we last night, you know, we

- 1 probably gave out the information for what the
- 2 easiest contact information is for both getting
- 3 information off of our website, updated website,
- 4 and a phone number for people to contact us.
- 5 MS. INOOYE: Sorry if I'm
- 6 misunderstanding this conversation. But the
- 7 tenants that may already have received the
- 8 registration. They could fill this out even
- 9 though we haven't yet set a guideline or can they
- 10 not -- they can't --?
- 11 MS. HUERTAS: There's nothing for them -
- 12 there's nothing for -- there's nothing for them
- 13 to fill out because they don't have -- what are
- 14 they going to fill out. They don't know what the
- 15 guideline look back. They don't know what the --
- 16 this board is setting as a look back period or
- 17 whether this board is going to consider to be the
- 18 fair market rent appeal increase that you sent
- 19 them, right? So the board sets two -- two things.
- 20 They set the fair market rent appeal information,
- 21 which is as of August 1st what this board thinks
- 22 is the look back period that's acceptable for when
- 23 an owner might have charged in excess. And the
- 24 board will also determine what would have been an

1 ... number to show -- present this charge for at 2 least during that look back period. 3 MS. INOOYE: Right. So the -- the fair market 4 MS. HUERTAS: rent appeal form filled out by tenants submitted 5 to the agency has to say I got a -- I got a lease 6 7 renewal on such a such a date. It's whether the 8 period that the Kingston board set as the look-9 back period and a percentage that the owner gave 10 me or the lease period that the tenant -- the 11 owner gave me for that time period and the 12 percentage is in excess of what the board said 13 would be acceptable. And that would be processed 14 by the agency so that they would get an order, provided the ... order that says yes, Mrs. Jones, 15 16 you are correct. What you were charged during this time period was -- the time period was within 17 the time period set by the right guidelines board. 18 19 MS. INOOYE: Uh-huh. 20 MS. HUERTAS: And the percentage that 21 you were charged was in excess of it. The owner would be directed to refund that amount of rent. 22 23 MS. INOOYE: Right. So if I were like a

24 tenant and I were filling it out on question

- 1 thirteen, where it says I am complaining about
- 2 rent overcharges from blank to blank. That would
- 3 be the look back period. It would be within the
- 4 look back period. And then I would track fair
- 5 market rent appeal.
- 6 MS. HUERTAS: Correct.
- 7 MS. INOOYE: So -- okay, so they need to
- 8 know what the look back period is. So I guess the
- 9 thing would just be that it would be good if
- 10 tenants who may have already received the
- 11 registration knew when to expect, roughly, like
- 12 when to expect our guidelines.
- MS. HUERTAS: Right.
- 14 MS. INOOYE: So that they could plan to
- 15 fill out the form within the window. So is there
- 16 a way to communicate that to people who might have
- 17 already -- whose landlords might have already sent
- 18 the --.
- MS. HUERTAS: The body of the ...
- MS. INOOYE: Yeah.
- 21 MR. TAMPONE: I have a question. What
- 22 does the registered notice that the tenant
- 23 receives, what does that look like? Is it the --
- 24 the property owner has to send a tenant a

- 1 registered letter?
- 2 MR. STECKER: Just a copy of the
- 3 registration.
- 4 MR. TAMPONE: A copy and --.
- 5 MR. STECKER: That's why it would be
- 6 restrictive so that ...
- 7 MR. TAMPONE: Does it would include any
- 8 other information or it's just like a -- it looks
- 9 like legal form?
- 10 MR. STECKER: So the information in the
- 11 registration statement is what the rent on the
- 12 premises is, the name of the tenant, services
- 13 provided. And there's several different boxes of
- 14 information. So the tenant is receiving a copy of
- 15 the registration statement.
- 16 MR. TAMPONE: Is -- is this what they
- 17 would get? Just -- so that --.
- 18 MR. STECKER: That's the registration
- 19 form, yeah, so. Yeah. And then for purposes of
- 20 the fair market rent appeal, you know, the most
- 21 important aspect of it is what the rent is listed
- 22 on it but there's a whole host of other
- 23 information on it.
- MR. TAMPONE: Oh, yeah. I just want to

- 1 kind of get a feeling for what the tenant's point
- 2 of view is going to be as they get notification of
- 3 this process.
- 4 MS. HUERTAS: So sometimes what will
- 5 happen, right? Because there's a lot of
- 6 possibilities, perhaps the owner files that with
- 7 the agency. If lists two thousand dollars as the
- 8 rent. But the tenant knows that the the rent is
- 9 twelve hundred. Maybe it lists the wrong lease
- 10 period. Maybe it lists the wrong, you know, the
- 11 wrong amount. And maybe it says it's for this
- 12 period and not that period. That's all part
- 13 whether to file to the agency as a fair market
- 14 rent appeal. They might look at it in and the
- owner says the rent is only nine hundred dollars
- 16 but they know they're paying twelve hundred
- 17 dollars. They would also file an appeal because
- 18 you're telling the agency my rent is nine hundred
- 19 dollars and I pay twelve hundred. Clearly, the
- 20 owner owes me three hundred dollars a month.
- 21 MR. TAMPONE: Right.
- MS. HUERTAS: That's all part of the
- 23 process that we have ... staff that have been
- 24 assigned solely to determine these cases that are

- 1 coming in from Kingston once the board has done --
- 2 done setting the guidelines, I mean.
- 3 (Off-the-record)
- 4 MS. HUERTAS: To the fair market rental.
- 5 If the tenant looks at this and says my services
- 6 are X, Y, and Z, whatever they may be, those are
- 7 not the services. Or those services are not being
- 8 provided. There are online forms for the tenants
- 9 to also file service at one point alleging of what
- 10 was the service listed here or the date that's in
- 11 your lease hasn't been provided to them. But
- 12 that's -- all of that is outside of the purview of
- 13 the guidelines board. What it -- what the board
- 14 does is part -- is going to be the basis for the -
- 15 for the tenants on -- at least initially to be
- 16 able to file this complaint forms.
- 17 MR. TAMPONE: Is there a phone number
- 18 that -- that a tenant can call from to -- to help
- 19 them understand this notification? And there's a
- 20 website on here but there's no phone numbers. I
- 21 imagine this is back of this form probably.
- MR. STECKER: I can tell you that they
- 23 were hours of information testifying --.
- 24 MR. TAMPONE: Yes. Yeah. Yeah.

1 MR. STECKER: And the number was 2 disseminated there. I don't have it off the top 3 of my fingertips but that has been disseminated. It's on the website. So it's easy to find. 4 yeah, as I mentioned, there is robust public 5 information of the HCR so there's a lot of people 6 7 ready, willing, and able to help anyone that needs 8 a question answered on any aspect of all this 9 stuff. 10 The City of Kingston has a MS. PERRY: 11 web page and all of this information should be on 12 there. I checked it before we came here and it 13 said that there was a rent guidelines board 14 meeting form. But it didn't said that there was a meeting today which is public meeting and -- and 15 so it had not been updated. But I think that's an 16 important component here is the cities involvement 17 in that -- in getting this information out. 18 19 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Great. One of the -20 - one of the challenges that I think it was 21 alluded to a couple of times here is that we as a 22 board, we are empowered to do two specific things 23 and nothing else. And -- and our work as a board 24 is an input into much of the enforcement work that

- 1 -- that staff and investigators of DHCR do to --
- 2 to support compliance with the law and to support
- 3 landlords and tenants in following the guidelines
- 4 that we set and we rely on the -- the agencies of
- 5 the city or the state, of legal aide, of local
- 6 organizations, of -- of organizers on the ground
- 7 who are organizing tenants. And -- and kind of
- 8 the, you know, the local real estate boards to --
- 9 to do their part of letting people know what's
- 10 going on and support people in following the --
- 11 the guidelines that we set and the laws enforced
- 12 by our friends at DHCR, which is a fine service.
- 13 ... to come. Do we have other business or are we
- 14 ready to adjourn? I -- I would hear a motion to
- 15 adjourn. You have to say it out loud.
- 16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So moved.
- MS. INOOYE: Second. What? Oh, did you
- 18 make a motion?
- 19 MR. TIERNEY: You're the Chair. You can
- 20 --.
- 21 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Michael made a
- 22 motion.
- MS. INOOYE: Second.
- 24 MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: I'll call roll,

1	Diana.		
2	MS. MARTINEZ: Aye.		
3	MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Mie.		
4	MS. INOOYE: Aye.		
5	MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Anthony.		
6	MR. TAMPONE: Aye.		
7	MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Tara?		
8	MS. PERRY: Aye.		
9	MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Michael Tierney?		
10	MR. TIERNEY: Aye.		
11	MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Carol.		
12	MS. SOTO: Aye.		
13	MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Aye and we are		
14	14 adjourned. Thank you so much.		
15	MR. TAMPONE: Thank you.		
16	MR. KIPPLEY-OGMAN: Everybody like oh,		
17	my goodness. You all are saints.		
18	(The meeting concluded at 8:42 p.m.)		
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

1	STATE OF NEW YORK
2	
3	I, ANNETTE LAINSON, do hereby certify that the foregoing was reported by me, in the cause, at the
4	time and place, as stated in the caption hereto,
5	at Page 1 hereof; that the foregoing typewritten
6	transcription consisting of pages 1 through 97, is
7	a true record of all proceedings had at the hearing.
8	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
9	
10	subscribed my name, this the 6th day of October,
11	2022.
12	Annette Lainson
13	ANNETTE LAINSON, Reporter
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

	· -	- accept 15:15 55:9,13
1	3	acceptable 93:22 94:13
10/19 39:3	30 89:20	accepted 80:20
10/25 48:5	31st 87:16,20 88:24	access 31:22
100 40:10		accessibility 44:14
10th 58:12,18,20	4	accessible 49:22 50:15 55:6
11 58:23	48 62:14	accountant 8:3
11/14 59:19	40 02.14	accurate 87:1
11/15 58:6	5	acoustics 81:7
11/9 58:6,24	5th 47:12 48:6,9 58:20 60:7,12,19 62:19	act 8:9,14 9:13,16 10:24 31:13 69:10
14th 59:16,17 60:2,21 62:20 64:22		87:5 88:17
15 37:16 39:8		acting 87:13
15th 37:12 58:4,5,10	6	action 11:10 69:4
16th 57:10,13,14 59:6,8	6:30 39:4	acts 70:24
17 59:15	6:37 2:1	actual 71:4
17th 58:11 59:14		addition 13:10 16:3
19 38:24 45:23	7	additional 15:6
1974 69:10,14	70s 6:11	address 32:22 33:4 34:10,19 36:1,2
19th 39:11 40:21 41:9		addresses 33:9,20
1st 14:13,14 17:3,6,8 20:10,12,15,	78 11:10	adequate 35:5 37:4
16,19 24:21 26:12 27:22 29:9 31:7	8	adjourn 100:14,15
38:6,8 84:12 93:21		adjourned 101:14
2	8:42 101:18	adjustment 17:1
	9	adjustments 18:20 70:1,9
20-plus 19:5		adopt 8:16 69:24
2018 73:5	9 45:23 78:8	adoption 3:15 8:8,13,19,23 9:14
2019 14:8 71:7 77:5 78:22	96-year-old 83:16	17:4,5 23:3 25:10,11 27:19 29:1
2020 78:9	9th 57:10,12 58:23 59:4,7 60:2,20 61:15 62:18,20 77:18 88:1	advance 40:8,9 61:21 62:4,10,14 65:2,4,7
2022 2:4 27:22 31:8		advantage 44:11
2023 20:11,13,16,19	Α	advice 12:4 52:20
21 77:4	A D A = 51:10	advisory 91:3
21st 2:3	A.D.A. 51:10	advocate 7:11 74:23
25th 47:20,24 60:9,10,17 62:19	A.M.I. 12:12 13:1,16 ability 35:12	affect 21:1
26th 46:1 47:9,14 60:7	ability 35:12 absent 2:18	affected 42:10
27th 47:20		afield 84:23
	absolutely 5:2 34:12 49:10	agencies 100:4
	accelerate 88:20	

agency 8:22 9:2 33:14 37:15 70:24 73:6 86:1 91:7 92:13 94:6,14 97:7, 13,18

agenda 3:11 8:5 30:13 61:16 62:2,4, 5,6,8,11,12,19 63:3,16 65:10,12

agenda's 61:20

agendas 61:22 62:16 66:3 67:3

agents 77:15,16

agree 35:13,16 47:10 75:5

agreed 10:5 agreeing 60:6 ahead 2:10,18 35:1

aide 100:5 **air** 66:23

alderwoman 78:7

allay 76:23 alleging 98:9

allowable 17:10 20:1 22:4

allowed 15:14 37:23 39:24 81:2

allowing 43:3 alluded 99:21 ambition 65:23 amend 84:21 amended 84:14

America 6:15

amount 17:14 24:16 26:8 31:24 39:13 40:22 66:18 94:22 97:11

analysis 4:15 36:21 39:13 40:14

71:1

analyze 41:17 and/or 92:15 annual 20:1 22:21

Anthony 2:19 7:9 42:12 56:13 68:11

101:5

anxiety 76:23 anxious 76:10 apartment 7:19

apartments 5:16 34:6 78:10,17

apologize 80:21 81:4

appeal 8:21 21:21 24:6,8,14 25:2 27:14 70:13,23 79:21 80:3,9 82:18 83:23 84:9,13 85:12,13 86:14,24 91:10,18,21 92:5 93:18,20 94:5 95:5 96:20 97:14,17

appeals 22:12,24 30:5 73:24 79:13, 16 90:16.23

applicability 69:17 applicable 8:18 26:17

application 8:22 28:17 29:24

applications 24:6 25:4 27:16

applied 24:10 apply 26:1 75:18 appointment 57:24 approved 84:16

April 6:21,23 7:7 19:20 40:12 58:8 63:7 70:20

arbitrarily 74:7

area 6:3

areas 13:5 78:17

arms 6:19

arranged 51:15 article 11:10 articulate 22:23

aspect 96:21 99:8

ASR 54:22

assemble 61:20 62:11 63:16

assessment 41:24 assigned 97:24 assistance 7:2 assisting 3:7

assume 89:16 92:12

assumes 86:4 atomic 6:17 attached 80:10 attachments 62:13 attempt 6:19

attempted 88:11

attend 35:7 65:19 88:3

attention 82:6

attorney 3:6 6:24 7:6

attorneys 15:16

Aug 20:4

August 17:3,6,8 20:15,16 24:20 26:12 27:22 29:9 31:7,20 38:6,8 45:7 76:7 84:12 93:21

authority 9:1 awards 69:14 aware 87:10

aye 61:4,5,6,9,12 68:4,8,10,14,16, 18,19 101:2,4,6,8,10,12,13

В

back 11:16,23 13:5,7 16:10 21:23 23:6,7,17,23 24:4 26:9 28:18,22 43:6 54:24 70:8 73:8 75:20 77:16 78:19,22 80:3 83:3 84:1 90:17 91:15 92:15 93:15,16,22 94:2,9 95:3,4,8 98:21

backward 84:14

backward-looking 27:17

balancing 87:8

Bard 5:24

based 19:17 26:7 27:3 38:2 43:4 62:11 87:23 88:24

basically 44:21 53:1

basis 98:14 **begin** 86:2

beginning 37:6 42:13 58:13 87:5 89:18

believes 33:11

bets 50:8

big 50:16 51:11

bills 78:16

bit 4:23 44:14 45:10 49:23 87:14

blank 95:2 **board** 2:5 3:8,11,16 4:4,5 5:23 7:15, 18 8:14,16,20,24 9:6,18,19,24 10:5, 7,8,13 11:2,11,16,21 14:1,20 15:7,8, 9,14,15 16:15,19 17:7,12 18:16 20:8 21:10 23:11,15 24:7,15,17 25:2,7 27:2,3,23 30:15,19 31:5,12 32:19,24 33:5 36:3,4 38:20,24 39:4 40:1,11, 23 41:1 43:21,24 49:2 51:15 53:3 56:8 58:18 61:23 62:7,12 63:9,10, 13,15 66:6 71:18,20 72:1,10 73:7 75:16 76:4 77:24 78:8,24 80:3,18,23 81:2,10,20 82:16,17 83:22 84:22 86:18 87:8,13,24 88:12,24 89:6 90:2,13,22 91:3,9 92:14,19,20,21 93:16,17,19,21,24 94:8,12,18 98:1, 13 99:13,22,23 **board's** 9:10 48:14 67:21 84:20

boards 14:9,11 19:6 20:7 22:9 40:5, 6 48:17 62:16 70:4 100:8

body 95:19 bomb 6:17 book 57:12 borrow 52:12 boxes 96:13 breakdown 83:17

bringing 4:15 6:17 15:1,8 54:17

broken 12:12 13:1 Brook 31:19 32:4 brought 39:14 Brown 2:17

building 32:1 89:12,13 **buildings** 33:13 50:6,9

bulk 41:21bullet 69:7

bunch 21:24 40:20 45:3 88:16

business 8:13,16 65:23 66:7 67:4 100:13

C

call 2:7,10 7:10 51:20 61:2 68:5 85:5 88:19 98:18 100:24

called 2:18 3:12 **campaigns** 6:14 **cancel** 56:18

cancelled 57:24 82:7 can't 59:15 92:18

cap 37:24

capacity 36:11 capital 74:13 caps 10:24 11:4 captured 11:18

care 38:10

careful 31:18 53:9

Carol 3:1 6:9 65:20 68:17 70:10,11 101:11

Caroline 6:9 Carolyn 77:19

case 21:17 26:22 59:2 64:2 70:5

71:13 77:14

cases 31:10 97:24 **census** 12:13 13:2,17

Central 6:15 certified 85:16

challenge 74:7

chair 2:7 5:4,6,9 8:6 30:11 34:23 62:6,11 68:6,22 71:24 88:19 100:19

challenged 19:9 challenges 99:20 chambers 49:16 54:9 chance 43:16 44:3 change 84:21 changed 40:5 charge 21:2 94:1

charged 84:11 93:23 94:16,21

charges 21:7Charles 3:3check 49:17checked 99:12

checks 82:7
 Chester 35:24
 Chestnut 78:9
 childcare 54:16
 children 54:17
 choose 17:23 74:6
 chooses 8:20

circumstance 25:20

cities 99:17

city 2:5 4:4,20 5:16 6:18 7:12,24 8:9 14:9 18:5 33:10 34:2 37:17 49:18, 20,23 78:21 79:4,8 84:5 99:10 100:5

clarification 10:17 39:10

clarify 63:4

clarifying 14:24 64:24 clarity 16:15 64:13 clear 90:14,15 clock 28:6 87:22

close 3:24 45:24 46:12

closed 15:17

closer 12:1,8,10 16:5 35:15 63:17

closest 51:4 collect 87:11

collecting 34:15 41:16

collective 4:17
College 6:1
Collins 75:1
Comanche 6:3
commence 20:10,12
commenced 2:1

comment 35:20 66:2 67:19

comments 36:15 38:4 41:3,7 65:19

79:12

commission 30:23,24 **Committee** 69:4 **common** 54:19 78:16

communicate 95:16

communities 84:6

community 4:13 6:4,5,13 7:10 31:23 52:14 55:8 63:12 91:1

comparative 22:17

compare 82:24

complaining 95:1

complaint 98:16

complaints 84:7

complete 81:1

completing 83:17

complex 42:2 77:20

compliance 51:11 100:2

complicated 70:14,16 72:11 84:24

85:9

compliment 70:20

component 99:17

compressed 46:17

comprised 39:2

computers 31:22

concentrate 70:9,13

concern 89:7

concerned 86:7

concerns 70:17

concluded 101:18

conference 86:16

conflict 47:13 58:17 59:4

confusing 76:18,24 86:9

congratulate 69:13

consideration 51:12

considered 26:5,6

constituent 7:20

constraint 45:4

contact 34:7,20 72:8 93:2,4

context 87:15

continue 61:19

control 4:5 33:5 73:12,17

controlled 7:19 86:21

controls 69:17

conver 90:3

conversation 39:18 56:14 61:19

90:2,12 93:6

Cool 53:8

copies 36:4 82:6

copy 28:7 96:2,4,14

core 76:11

correct 18:4 19:20 20:6 25:22 30:9, 10 34:12 76:22 86:24 89:21 94:16

95:6

costs 13:13

couldn't 29:21

council 49:16

counsel 19:6 74:23 81:1

counsels 73:6

counties 43:19

county 23:3 50:5 73:6

countywide 12:13 13:2

couple 3:20 64:1 99:21

court 11:8 19:9 51:13,15,17,19 52:6

covered 33:5

crazy 47:3

critical 11:13

crystallized 63:24

culture 73:15

curious 22:6 86:17

D

D.H.C.R. 5:18

Daily 78:15

DAS 16:17

data 4:15 14:24 15:2 23:5,13 31:14 36:20 39:19 41:16,17 51:2 71:2,4

date 9:13 17:4,5 25:8 29:1 31:7 55:21 56:9,18 57:22,23 63:17 88:4

94:7 98:10

dates 30:13 38:14 44:6 48:5 56:12,

16 65:22 90:4

daunting 49:24

day 8:19 16:8 37:13,17 43:1 44:7 45:16 47:17 59:14 63:3,5,22 77:7

86:2

days 28:10,11,13,14 35:4,6 57:17,20 58:15 63:22 64:1,4,5,7 65:1,4,11,14

77:7 85:15,18 88:18 89:20

deadline 31:3,4 88:22

deal 21:20 70:19

dealing 70:16 77:13

December 46:13 47:3 77:4 86:6

decide 27:15 66:16

decided 27:7

decides 27:4

decision 19:9 36:23 42:17

declining 75:14

decrease 17:20

defining 24:18

degree 84:15

delegate 48:12

deliberate 30:23 66:22

deliberating 64:19 76:19

deliberative 19:17

denied 74:7

deny 69:5

department 78:3

depend 49:14

depending 87:12

depends 49:13 52:22

deserve 18:9

design 73:16

designed 66:20 73:17

determination 9:2 14:21

determine 9:6,11 11:2,21 17:19 24:5 25:4,19 71:6 84:23 93:24 97:24

determined 37:23 81:10,15

determining 12:11,24 13:7 24:11

developing 79:22

Index: developments..expertise

developments 76:11

DHCR 3:6 24:5,9,13 25:3,19 27:15 32:20 48:23 73:20 74:1 79:11 90:16

100:1,12

Diana 2:13 6:2 68:7 101:1

dice 18:19

didn't 26:20 50:20

difference 26:16 70:22 89:4

digest 41:21 direct 34:9 directed 94:22 directional 12:19

directly 35:20 disagree 79:24 discern 40:2

discuss 3:14 8:7 61:17

discussed 62:9 discussing 29:19 discussion 26:19 46:6 disseminate 61:21

disseminated 32:18,23 62:4 99:2,3

distribute 72:7 district 51:6,8 division 21:11 Dobkin 75:1 doc 13:11

documentation 14:1 82:5.21 92:22

documentations 14:15 documents 62:9 84:18

doesn't 11:1 23:21 26:21 53:22

88:22

dollars 97:7,15,17,19,20

don't 2:9 13:14 15:21 27:4 40:18 42:8 43:7 44:7,23 45:7 46:14,17,20 51:19 53:21 55:5,12 99:2

doors 77:11 doubling 29:13 downstate 48:17,20 dozen 29:11

draft 85:13 86:9,13 drafting 62:24 Dutch 50:23 duty 16:21

Ε

e-mail 36:2

E.T.P.A. 17:6 86:22

earlier 84:7 early 36:22 37:2 easier 49:7 52:7

easiest 50:6 51:7 93:2

easily 49:22 52:13

easy 99:4

economics 13:13

Edison 51:3 **Edson** 51:3

educated 10:4 31:21 educational 76:6

effect 38:11

effective 17:4,5 25:8 31:7

efforts 33:1 **El** 6:15

elaborate 18:21 elderly 31:22 77:20 elected 33:23 67:6

electric 78:16 elementary 51:4

email 34:19 35:21 36:1

emails 32:21

Emergency 8:9,13 9:13,15 10:23

69:10

empowered 99:22 enactment 69:9 encouraged 16:9 end 20:10 23:16 35:18 41:19 42:4

46:5

enforced 100:11 enforcement 99:24

engage 32:8

English 54:18

engagements 10:13

ensure 35:4,7,11 entire 45:9 entity 43:23 envision 63:5 equipment 52:12

Eric 77:3

estate 71:10 73:18 100:8

ETPA 3:15 25:12 70:15 71:9 73:5 **evening** 2:2,19 47:14 69:2 77:3,9,12

78:6

eventually 39:3 eviction 26:7 examine 26:3 examples 22:14 exceed 24:16 Excellent 14:3

excess 93:23 94:12,21

excessive 9:3 24:11,13 25:13,21

45:10 92:9

Excuse 74:10

exercise 4:16 22:20 63:18 67:2 74:5

existed 80:11
existing 70:4
exists 7:22
exorbitant 78:13

oxonditant 70.10

expand 69:16

expect 69:20 95:11,12

expenses 40:16

experience 5:15 82:2

expertise 63:15

experts 4:14 15:3 39:19 63:12

explain 24:1 express 82:1 extreme 78:21

F

fact 74:1 79:3,6,8,19 82:10,11,12,18 90:15,22 91:8,11,13,15,16

factors 9:22 87:9

facts 23:12

fair 8:20 12:11,24 21:20 22:12,23 24:5,7,13 25:2 26:8,18,20 27:14,15 28:3 30:4 31:23 70:13,18,22 73:24 79:13,15,21 80:3,9 81:11 82:18 83:23 84:9,13,15 85:11,12 86:14 90:15,23 91:9,18,20 92:4 93:18,20 94:4 95:4 96:20 97:13 98:4

faith 49:2

fall-ish 16:16

familiar 6:11 18:15

familiarity 5:19

families 49:8 54:16

family 77:5

FAQ 76:22

favor 34:16

feel 5:7 22:2 30:5 42:19 55:4 88:17

90:2

feeling 32:4 41:6 97:1

feelings 43:12

feels 47:7,8 90:13

fees 50:7

field 77:8

fifteen 25:15

fifty 69:9

figure 22:19 36:7 48:11 60:3 63:2,16

figured 63:1

figures 17:23

figuring 39:20

file 24:8 28:2,17 80:8,9 85:15,24

86:24 87:15 88:11,22,23 89:9 90:15 92:4,11,12 97:13,17 98:9,16

filed 11:9 85:23 87:19

files 97:6

filing 79:20 90:23 91:20

filings 87:20

fill 82:3 83:24 93:8,13,14 95:15

filled 94:5 filling 94:24 filter 40:2

find 16:8 29:11 99:4

finding 69:18 findings 31:3

fine 38:22 47:24 48:2 59:17,23 64:2 80:1 100:12

fingertips 99:3

finish 47:4 64:21

finished 65:21 66:24 81:4

firm 74:24

firsthand 7:20

fixed 66:17,18

flexible 45:13

focus 43:2

focusing 7:11

folks 33:22 34:17 38:18 45:13,14

54:18 66:9 67:12

follow 12:4

follow-up 25:24

football 77:8

forced 28:21

form 43:3 73:17,20,22,24 79:24 80:10,11 81:21 82:2,4,5 83:10,12, 13,18,20,24 84:14,24 85:4,12,14 86:9,12,13,14 90:23 91:22,23,24 92:1 94:5 95:15 96:9,19 98:21 99:14

format 86:11

forms 76:22 79:15 82:3,24 84:21

85:9 92:23 98:8,16

formula 92:6

forty-eight 40:8 69:15

forum 35:22

forward 3:17 4:10,20 8:19 9:14 12:4 17:3,6,8 24:21 27:23 33:21 71:7

76:14 77:19 84:12

found 77:9 free 5:7 26:13

Freeman 78:15

freeze 31:20

frequently 82:3

friends 100:12

frozen 31:9 70:4

full 49:1

G

G.W. 50:17

gas 78:17

gather 9:24 31:13 41:12 42:4

gathered 64:16

gave 93:1 94:9,11

general 14:7 38:18

gentleman 74:17 77:2

George 50:22

get all 57:6

give 9:16 14:17 31:24 33:21 35:4 38:6 39:24 43:16,17 48:18 72:24 80:23 81:16

giving 40:11

glad 4:3

goals 44:5

God 47:1

good 2:2 32:2 37:3,18 45:16,18 54:13 55:15 61:13 63:19 64:12 66:14 67:21 69:2 72:22 73:14 77:3 78:6 81:8 88:2 95:9

goodness 101:17 governing 30:24

government 7:21 50:6,9

Gray-huertas 3:23 6:24 81:3,6

great 18:1 21:20 38:16 39:10 43:8 47:3 55:19 57:2 65:15 70:17 76:3 99:19

greater 88:17

greatest 40:22

ground 100:6

group 4:11 75:18

groups 75:17

guess 2:6 5:13 16:7 29:8 30:14 41:14 42:21 76:18 84:19 86:17 88:15 89:23 90:11 95:8

guessing 84:18

guidance 11:1 65:24

guideline 8:18,21 9:1 10:4 11:22 14:8,11,12 17:7 19:6 20:3,9,12,18 21:1,16 23:15 24:14,19,20 25:19 27:20 38:7 41:20 55:22 56:8 63:7 84:2 87:24 89:2,18 91:17 93:9,15

guidelines 2:5 8:17 9:19 18:17 20:1 22:12,21,23 23:8 24:17 25:2 27:14, 24 30:4 56:15,17 64:15,20,21 69:14 70:4 73:7 80:4 86:23 87:7 91:22,24 94:18 95:12 98:2,13 99:13 100:3,11

guys 89:6

Н

H.C.R. 13:22,24 84:21 85:6 88:5

half 37:6 52:18

hall 2:5 49:20,23

Halloween 47:7

handling 32:20

happen 19:10 66:18 97:5

happened 26:12,18 29:9 73:4

happening 31:11,12

happy 7:24 72:9 75:16

hard 43:7 53:17 71:2

hasn't 98:11

haste 87:5

haven't 88:8

HCR 40:13 99:6

HCR's 82:23

HCRS 40:7

he'll 72:23

head 13:15 23:22

hear 4:12,13,14 10:2 12:15,16 19:18 31:16 36:12 37:1 46:21 50:21 51:24 53:4 55:5 66:5,8 67:5,9 100:14

heard 21:19,22,23 38:7 41:4 42:12 44:3 46:6 64:6 71:14,15 73:12 79:12

hearing 10:1 11:13 15:16,17 30:17 32:9,18 33:18 35:21 36:15 37:13,17 38:21 39:1 44:6 48:5 49:3,6,12 60:18 64:17 67:23 77:8

hearings 10:9 13:11 23:6,12 30:14 31:18 35:3 36:22 37:1 40:24 41:11 42:7,13,16,17,24 43:10,14,18 44:2, 8,12,21,22 45:19 48:18,20 49:20 50:10 51:16 52:21 53:15 54:9,15 55:18,21 56:2,3 59:1 60:6,17 65:22 66:20 76:20

heat 18:11,12 19:1

held 10:6,10 23:6

helpful 23:2 24:1

here's 85:16

higher 8:24

Hill 50:23 76:1,2,3

Hirsch 78:6,7

hold 23:11 30:16 60:3 67:3

holding 10:9

holidays 46:13,24

home 6:12 77:9

homeowner 8:3

homework 9:20

honest 45:17

hope 21:21 76:20

hopes 10:3

hoping 7:1,7 63:3

host 96:22

hot 18:11,12,13 19:1

hour 52:18

hours 40:8 52:17 53:11 54:6 62:14 98:23

housing 7:11,14 21:12 74:24

HUERTAS 5:2,6 6:23 11:7 13:3,10, 24 14:4 15:4,12,19,24 16:2,6 19:5, 13 21:9 26:8 28:11,14 33:8 34:11 35:23 37:11,15 38:2 47:17 48:8,21 50:2 51:20 54:23 55:11,20 56:1,4,21 57:6,22 59:18,21 64:12 72:1,4,18,23 74:10,14 79:23 80:13,17,22 81:9 82:14,16 83:20 84:4 85:18,22 87:1 88:8,21 89:13,21 90:19 91:8 92:3,11 93:11 94:4,20 95:6,13,19 97:4,22 98:4

hundred 17:14 34:6,7 76:9 78:10 97:9,15,16,18,19,20

hypothetical 29:23 92:7

- 1

idea 67:21

identified 63:11

identify 66:4

illegal 78:14

imagine 8:10 41:18 43:9 63:14 98:21

imbalance 7:21

implement 44:1

implementation 69:12 70:15

implemented 14:13 70:18

implementing 76:7

important 13:16 42:8 55:17 74:3 79:3 96:21 99:17

imposed 73:13

impossible 42:4 58:1

improve 62:8

inappropriate 73:21

include 13:7 21:6 36:1 66:7 96:7

included 19:1 21:3,14 92:24

including 13:12 62:9

income 40:16

increase 9:3,9 17:22 24:10,12,24 25:12,18,20 26:5 27:1 28:20 71:7,11 92:8,15 93:18

increases 9:11 11:15 17:8,11 38:6, 8 69:22,24 70:2 78:13,21

individual 21:17 26:9 43:22 73:13

individually 75:17

informal 62:22

information 4:16 10:1,14 13:6,12, 17,18,23 14:17,20 15:5,6,8,15,18 16:3,6,8 19:18 21:16 30:20 33:17 34:8,20 36:17 38:3,9 39:5,13,23,24 40:2,15,20,23 41:12,14,21 42:6 48:21 56:6 63:8,17 64:16 72:9 75:2 81:11,16 85:2,7 91:12,16 92:2,5 93:1,2,3,20 96:8,10,14,23 98:23 99:6,11,18

initial 19:23 21:20 22:10,24 23:3 24:9 28:7 30:5 74:8

initially 98:15

Inooye 5:22 12:15,18,21 14:23 15:10 20:3 27:6,11,18 28:1,4,15 30:9 31:2 36:24 37:3 44:11,17,20 46:7,12 47:2,13 48:7 49:10 50:13,19 52:2,16,24 53:6,8,13,18,24 54:4,7, 11 58:11 59:5,7,10 61:5,12,24 64:24 65:5,9,14 68:10 83:6,18 84:3 93:5 94:3,19,23 95:7,14,20 100:17,23 101:4

Inouye 2:15,16

input 32:9 39:19 40:23 43:20 62:5, 12 99:24

inputs 63:11 insist 73:23

instance 31:19 institution 73:16

instructions 82:9,11

interact 36:20

interest 36:10 53:3

interested 10:2 34:15,18 67:7 79:20

interesting 29:22

interpretation 54:22 55:15,18

interpretations 54:18

interpreter 55:2,10

interrupt 80:14

introduce 3:5

introduced 7:5

introduction 4:23

investigators 100:1

invite 65:24

involved 69:9.11

involvement 48:16 99:17

issue 48:24 70:10,16 74:2 87:11

issues 21:12 51:11 72:11 77:14

item 8:5 30:12

it'd 23:24 35:17

It'll 65:6

it's 23:16 26:23 29:10 34:5 36:19 40:8 50:11 55:17 57:11 60:7 62:21 63:23 70:8 73:21 75:17 84:20 88:24 92:5

l'd 70:9

I'll 91:15

l'm 3:6 28:8 29:1 54:8 62:23 75:16 76:4,14 78:17 86:17

l've 53:10

J

J-A-R-M-O-N 77:4

jacking 73:11

January 78:9 86:6 89:7

Jarmon 77:3

JARNAN 77:3

job 5:12 15:9 61:13 69:23,24

John 74:22 75:8,10,23

join 31:1

Jones 92:8 94:15

Jr 7:10

judgment 4:17 19:17 22:20 25:17 63:19 67:2 79:14 82:1

July 14:13

June 20:9.11

jurisdictionally 28:24

jurists 77:23

Κ

K-E-E 74:13

keeping 51:14

kids 49:8

kind 3:17 9:4 14:4 18:21 22:2 31:9 41:5 43:5,16 44:1 49:13 61:17 62:22 63:23 76:6 80:18 86:6 97:1 100:7

kindly 81:21

Kingston 2:4,5 4:4 5:16 6:6 7:12,24 8:4,10 14:6 18:6 29:5 33:11 40:17 41:3 69:19 70:18 71:8 73:10 74:4,5 78:8 80:5,6,7 83:8 86:12 88:9 92:23 94:8 98:1 99:10

Kingston's 3:15 17:4

kingston.org 7:13

Kingstonians 90:14

Kingston's 17:5

KIPLEY-OGMAN 30:10

Kippley-ogman 2:9,11,12 3:19,22 4:2 5:3,8,21 6:21 8:2,3,7 10:15,20 11:24 12:3,8 13:21 14:3,22 16:5,14, 20,24 17:9,13,18 18:1,5,15,18,23 19:12,15,21 21:19 22:11,18 23:20 24:3 25:6,11,23 30:2 31:15 34:14,24 35:14 36:6 37:2,8,14,18 38:13,16,23 39:12 41:7,23 42:11,15 45:19,22 46:11 47:6,11,16,19 48:4,9 49:4 52:19 54:20 55:4,24 56:3,11 57:1,9, 16,19 58:3,6,10,15,22 59:15,17,19, 24 60:8,11,14 61:1,10,13,18 62:3 63:6 64:3,6,9,18 65:20 66:11,14 67:1,16 68:2,7,9,11,13,15,17,19,24 71:17,20 72:13,16,22 74:16,20 75:9, 13,21,24 77:1 78:4,23 79:10,18 81:19 82:13,15,23 83:4,7,11,14 85:10,20 86:8 90:1,7,10,21 91:19 92:10 99:19 100:21,24 101:3,5,7,9, 11,13,16

knew 95:11

knowing 31:6

L

labeled 80:5 86:10

lack 31:9

land 36:18 39:17

landlord 24:10,21 26:4 28:8 29:14 71:11 73:7 78:12,16 85:15

landlord's 73:11

landlords 4:13 7:23 10:2 21:6 33:24 34:2 37:21 38:1,5 71:13 78:14 95:17 100:3

language 54:19,21

large 17:21 42:2

lasted 53:11

late 53:22

latest 88:21

Latin 6:15

law 9:19,22 10:7 13:10 15:5 25:8 31:5 32:16,17 40:4 56:20 69:22,24 70:3 74:24 100:2

lawfully 19:19

laws 100:11

lawsuit 73:7

lay 36:18 39:17

lean 12:1

learn 4:8 18:6 39:3

learned 18:24 76:15

lease 8:23 9:16,18 18:3,11,12 24:24 26:10,11,24 94:6,10 97:9 98:11

leases 8:18 9:12,15 17:1 23:9,10,19

82:6

leave 29:17 89:19

leeway 32:1

left 29:14 48:13

legal 16:12 19:14,16,23 21:20 30:5 74:8 96:9 100:5

legislature 69:19

length 11:21 25:18 88:23

letter 96:1

letting 92:16 100:9

liability 48:24

libraries 50:8,9

library 50:13,14

light 79:12

Lilienthal 74:21,22

limit 10:21 24:18 43:22 73:3

limitation 16:11 19:11

limited 4:7 13:2

limiting 67:12

limits 19:7 43:21

lined 88:18

list 13:11 33:10,19 34:2,18,21

listed 96:21 98:10

listen 66:21

lists 97:7,9,10

literally 27:5

live 7:18 31:20 63:11

lived 6:10

living 42:2

lobbyist 73:18

local 33:23 100:5,8

location 80:8

locations 48:11

lock-back 81:17

lockout 78:14

logistical 50:11

long 13:19 16:12 19:13 22:7 28:1 43:11 45:8 52:17,20 63:23 69:15

75:17

longer 65:4

look- 11:22 23:22 94:8

look-back 9:7,8 10:22 11:3,17 24:1

26:2,24 27:2,8 30:3 73:3

lookback 24:12

looked 23:5

loose 36:6

Lopez 2:13 6:2,3

LOPEZ-MARTINEZ 68:8

lot 6:5,14 7:11 17:21 22:2 31:18 43:11,12,20 45:20 63:12 65:3 71:2 76:10,14,17 77:20 82:4,5 85:1 87:8, 12,20 97:5 99:6

loud 100:15

love 4:22 5:9 8:4 16:14 22:21 52:19

57:1 61:18 67:5,9

M

M-C 74:13

made 48:14 83:21 85:2 90:5 100:21

mail 33:7 35:21 85:16

mailing 32:22 33:4 34:10

maintenance 77:10

make 9:2 12:5 14:21 25:17 26:16 32:8 36:9,23 41:10 44:2 46:15 48:10 49:18 50:24 57:7 60:15 62:8,23 66:6 69:7 77:17,22 78:1 90:7,8 91:3 100:18

makes 3:13 27:4 52:7

making 4:11 30:3 36:11 42:17 57:4

87:9

manage 5:15,18

manager 5:17 77:10

manner 10:8

mansion 78:9

manuals 71:9

manufactured 71:9

Margaret 75:24 76:2 77:2

market 8:20 12:12 13:1 21:21 22:12, 23 24:5,8,13 25:2 26:13,18,20 27:14,15 28:3 30:4 70:13,19,23 73:24 79:13,15,21 80:3,9 81:11 82:18 83:23 84:9,13,15 85:11,12 86:14 90:16,23 91:9,18,21 92:4 93:18,20 94:4 95:5 96:20 97:13 98:4

Martinez 2:13,14 6:2 15:20,22 16:1 41:8 45:11,21 47:23 48:1 54:13 61:9

101:2

materials 61:21

matter 53:23

Mckee 69:2,3 70:12 71:19,23 72:3,5, 15,20 73:2 74:13,15,18 75:1,3,6,11, 12,15 79:17,24 80:10,13,16,21 81:3, 7,21

meaningful 4:18

means 26:22

meantime 80:24

mechanics 87:3

mechanism 43:6

media 32:23

meet 28:20 36:9 41:16,18 46:5 56:8 64:22

meeting 2:1,4 3:9 20:8 30:17 33:18 36:14,16,23 38:20,24 39:1,2,3,4 40:1,6,21,22 42:21 56:23 58:18,23, 24 59:1 61:15 62:7,10,15,18,21 63:23 64:14 65:8 66:4 67:18 77:6, 12,18 78:1 87:5 88:19 89:6 99:14,15 101:18

meetings 10:6 15:2 30:14,19,22 32:16,19 38:4 40:7 41:2 42:16 45:9 51:17 53:10 56:19 60:2,19 61:20,21 65:18,19 87:6,10 90:4

member 15:7 72:10 75:16 80:17

members 3:11 6:3,5 10:3 11:14 15:9,15 36:3,5 52:23 53:4 62:7 63:10 68:20 90:13

mentioned 33:23 40:12 61:17 77:19

99:5

met 77:15 88:8

metropolitan 74:23

mic 3:24 75:6,7

Michael 2:17,23 7:17 68:15 69:3 71:17 74:11,16 75:3,5,11 83:8 84:7 100:21 101:9

...

Michelle 78:5,7

mid-november 36:23

mid-october 32:3 36:16

middle 31:8 36:10 89:18

Mie 2:15,16 5:22 68:9 101:3

Miller 75:1

mind 15:22 65:21 74:11

minute 81:20,23

minutes 4:9 43:22,23 67:13 68:23 71:21 72:2,3,7,14,17,19,24 73:1 80:23

misunderstanding 93:6

moment 10:18 91:1

Monday 47:8 59:19 91:15

money 29:16

month 37:6 45:9 65:7 97:20

month's 42:4

monthly 21:8 64:14

months 23:7 58:2 73:8 76:8 92:7

morning 80:12

motion 57:7,8 60:15,16 62:23 63:4 67:14,17,22 68:19 90:6,8 91:3 100:14,18,22

motions 48:10 57:5 90:3

move 7:2 8:4 30:12 31:6 36:13 41:1 42:9 60:16

moved 6:10 67:24 100:16

moving 3:17 36:10 67:3

multiple 43:14

municipality 69:19

N

names 25:7

narrowly 90:24

Nassau 14:10

navigate 85:8

nay 61:4

necessarily 86:15

needed 60:21

negative 17:13

neighbor 83:16

neighborhoods 13:14

nervous 83:16

news 32:23 33:24

newspaper 78:15

newspapers 33:24

Nicaragua 6:15

nice 22:14 52:6 66:13

night 26:19 38:4,17,22 45:14 54:10 57:2 70:21 76:16 85:3 92:24

nightmare 35:8 50:11

ninety 28:10,11,13,14 76:13 85:15,

ninety-day 86:16

18 86:2

ninety-days 86:22

Noah 2:11 3:23 8:2

non-members 66:5

noon 54:12,13 60:19

notary 77:22

note 50:4 83:15 85:1

notice 3:9 10:11 32:17,21 33:1 35:5 46:16 56:22 61:15 62:24 63:2,21 65:1 87:21 89:5 95:22

noticed 51:13 86:20

notices 33:12,15 77:7,11 88:16

noticing 82:4

notification 32:10 33:7 56:19 97:2

98:19

notifications 88:13

notify 88:14

noting 85:5

November 36:22 37:2,6,12,16 42:13 44:21 45:23 46:1,5,9,20 47:5, 12 48:6,9 57:3,10,13,15 58:12,14,20 59:4 60:2,12,19,20,21 61:15 62:18 64:1,14 77:18 87:22 88:1 89:3,19 91:18

nuclear 6:19

number 10:6 30:22 38:7 73:2 93:4

94:1 98:17 99:1

numbers 17:21 18:24 22:17 98:20

numbers-wise 27:21

O.R.A. 73:15 oath 14:2

obligation 30:16

obtuse 70:14

October 14:13 20:10,12,16,18 35:17,18 38:24 39:8,11 40:21 41:9 45:7 46:19 47:7,9,20 50:18 60:8,17 87:16,20 88:24

odd 14:5

Off-the-record 98:3

offering 78:2

office 51:21 78:8,19 85:6 90:17

91:23 92:1

officers 88:9

officials 33:23 67:6

one-year 18:3,10

online 35:22 80:1,2 83:21 98:8

open 32:16 36:14 41:2 49:23 51:23 56:19 67:18

001.00.1.0

open-ended 66:20

opening 67:22

operating 33:13

opportunity 69:5 74:22

opposed 35:3,6

opted 69:20 73:5

opting 71:8

option 9:17

options 17:19 22:20,22

oracle 75:2

order 3:12 8:12,15 28:17 44:2 63:18

94:14,15

ordered 77:10

ordinance 76:17

organizations 33:24 100:6

organize 32:1

organizer 6:4,13

organizers 100:6

organizing 100:7

Ossining 73:4,5

outline 22:9 83:22 84:16

outlined 44:9

outlining 22:10

outreach 32:7

overcharge 70:19,22 73:22,23

84:6,8,10

overcharges 95:2

overhead 83:6

owes 97:20

owner 77:15 85:24 88:5,10 93:23 94:9,11,21 95:24 97:6,15,20

owners 5:14 7:15 33:12,13 38:10 40:15 81:17 85:3,23,24 87:15 88:21

89:9

oyster 22:7

Ρ

p.m. 2:1,3 39:4 60:3,17,20,21 101:18

packet 83:19

paid 82:8

paper 34:17 92:18

paperwork 76:17

parameters 9:5 25:3 27:15

Pardon 57:18

parenthesis 56:22

part 3:7 6:4 14:14 16:10 39:19 43:23 70:14 81:9 86:3 97:12,22 98:14

100:9

pass 34:16,23

passed 45:6 90:4

passes 68:20

past 6:12 25:8 56:23

pay 21:4 29:12,16 78:16 97:19

paying 18:7,8 26:3 97:16

PC 91:17

people 7:10 14:19 29:12 31:19,24 32:8,13 33:2,20 34:15,18 35:11,20 36:1,12 37:5 42:5,9 43:4,11,13,16 45:3 46:21 48:23 49:24 53:16,22 54:2 56:5 65:2,19 66:22 67:7 73:14 76:15,16 77:20 86:11 90:22 93:4 95:16 99:6 100:9,10

percent 23:8,9 25:12,15 40:10

76:13 92:8

percentage 18:2 27:3,6,7,11 92:15

94:9,12,20

percentages 17:1 18:2,10

perfect 24:3 61:7

perfectly 75:16

period 9:7,8 10:22 11:3,16,17,23 13:8 14:5,6 18:13,17 23:17,18,23 24:1,4,12,16 25:7 26:2,24 27:2,8 28:9,18,22 41:22 73:3 80:4 81:18 84:1 86:3,5 92:15 93:16,22 94:2,8,9, 10,11,17,18 95:3,4,8 97:10,12

periods 13:5 21:23 30:3 45:17

permission 5:4 67:11

Perry 2:21,22 5:13,14 12:10 37:20 38:12 44:24 50:14 58:9,12,19 59:3, 9,12,14,20,22 60:23 61:7 68:14 69:1 99:10 101:8

person 23:21 26:24 66:19 73:14

77:24

person's 26:10,11

personal 6:18

persons 77:24

perspective 40:9

Peter 3:6 7:5 8:10 10:15 11:24 33:23

71:2

phone 93:4 98:17,20

phonetic 6:24 50:23

phrase 31:10

physically 43:5

pick 16:7

picked 56:16

piece 16:8 34:16 92:18,22

pieces 13:17

Index: piggyback..ready

piggyback 32:6 place 49:24 98:9

Piggybacking 13:21

places 26:14 plan 66:3 95:14 Planning 7:12

plans 79:18,19,21 91:2

point 2:6 3:13,16 9:24 11:6 14:18 26:20 33:9,15 38:21 40:11,18 48:21 49:19 64:19 73:19 84:7 89:3 97:1

points 10:16 69:8

policy 22:5 polish 74:3 Politics 5:24 portion 50:24 positive 17:14 possibilities 97:6 possibly 42:24 72:5

post 62:13

posted 40:7 41:14 potentially 34:6

power 70:7

premises 96:12 prepare 36:17

prepared 8:10 84:16

prerogative 5:9

present 2:12,14,16,20,22,24 3:2 14:19 41:13 66:6 94:1

presentation 70:21

presented 13:12 15:2 23:5,13 28:19 36:3 63:8

pretty 13:15 34:4 42:3 52:13 87:1 89:8

previously 40:12 44:9

prior 8:23 26:15 27:19 32:18

problem 49:11 problems 42:5 proceed 70:11

process 21:21 33:12 39:20 47:4 62:15 64:10,19 67:8 76:5,6 85:12 90:14 91:19 92:3 97:3.23

processed 94:13 processes 76:21 processing 92:13

produce 16:16,19,24 63:10

produced 16:21 producing 30:8 professionals 48:12 Professor 5:24

prolonging 45:6

promulgate 31:14 69:23

promulgated 10:4 23:15 24:14 25:1

87:7

promulgates 24:7 promulgating 87:24 **properties** 33:10 34:3

property 5:14,17,18 7:14 77:10 88:5

95:24

proposal 36:7 proposed 39:11 proposing 58:23

Protection 8:9,14 9:13,16 10:24

69:10

proud 4:19

provide 7:2 10:11 13:22,24 14:14 15:4 34:19 39:6,16 54:16 55:8 82:20

provided 36:4,21,22 38:3 94:15 96:13 98:8,11

provider 7:14

providing 3:8 7:7 85:16

public 3:9,10 5:23 6:4 10:1,3,9,11, 13 11:13,14 13:11 15:16 16:4 19:18 23:6,12,14 30:13,14,17 31:18 32:9, 18,20 33:1 35:2,21 36:15,22 37:1, 12,17 38:4,20 39:1,2 40:1,24 41:3, 11 42:7,13,16,17,24 43:10,14,18 44:7,12,21,22 45:9 48:5,16 49:2 50:10 52:20,23 53:4,15 54:9,15 55:5,21 56:2,3 58:24 60:6,16,18

61:15 62:21,24 63:21 64:17 65:17, 22 66:19,21 67:19,22 68:20,23 76:20 77:8 81:12,14 85:1,6 87:10 99:5,15

publicly 62:14 publics 77:22 published 81:13 pull 9:23 81:15 85:4

purposes 51:14 61:14 92:14 96:19

purview 9:10 48:14 67:21 98:12

push 43:6

put 56:22 75:6 79:4 81:12 91:13,16 putting 76:16 84:18 92:16,17

Q

question 10:19 12:7 13:4 14:24 15:13 19:2 20:24 21:13 22:13 26:1, 23 29:5 30:15 32:5 37:20 39:22 51:23 62:17 65:1,16 79:11 86:19 88:7,15 90:20 94:24 95:21 99:8

questions 10:16 19:22,24 30:2 63:13 86:7

queue 92:16 quick 85:11 quicker 86:4,5

quickly 31:6 33:1 42:9 87:7

quorum 3:5 48:15

R

raise 22:13 69:1 71:12 85:17

raised 25:14 26:4 **raises** 19:2

raising 37:22

range 17:9,11,18,23

rate 8:24 9:9

ray 38:9

read 69:7 75:15 reading 34:3 65:21

ready 60:14 64:20 65:7 99:7 100:14

real 71:10 73:18 100:8 regulation 26:14 required 9:12,16,20 29:13 33:14 38:5 77:13 87:15 92:2 regulations 26:15 realistically 46:8 requirement 32:10,17 realize 26:11 relevant 5:11 9:24 63:13 82:12 research 40:10,14,19 54:23 63:9 realizing 85:9 rely 100:4 71:1 reason 86:3 remember 13:15 28:8 70:3,8 reset 20:5 reasonable 11:8,9 16:12 17:20 remind 31:2 69:21 resident 77:4 19:4,14,16 22:8 25:18 30:21 35:11 **remove** 77:11 39:20 42:1,20 62:15 64:10 71:7,11, resources 32:6 54:21 55:8 85:2 renewal 9:12 94:7 response 78:21 receipt 86:1 renewals 26:2 31:11 responsibilities 3:14,18 8:8 receive 15:17 28:6 83:1 renewed 8:23 responsibility 4:7 30:6 84:20 received 3:9 89:11 93:7 95:10 rent 2:5 4:4,5 8:18,21 9:3,11 11:15 responsible 15:1 30:7 79:5 12:12 13:1 17:1,10,20,22 18:20 receives 95:23 rest 46:9 67:4,11 21:7,21 22:10,12,23,24 24:6,8,9,10, receiving 78:13,20 96:14 12,13,16 25:1,2,12,14,20 26:4,18 restrictive 96:6 27:14,16 28:3,20,21 29:13 30:4 recent 23:2 69:14,17,22,23,24 70:2,4,9,13,19,23 return 86:1 71:7,11,12 73:6,12,17,22,24 74:8 recently 6:10,16 40:4 review 63:8,18 78:13,21 79:13,15,21 80:3,9 82:8 recommend 44:5 83:23 84:9.13.16 85:11.13.17 86:14 reviewing 29:24 recommendation 38:11 90:16,23 91:10,18,21 92:4 93:18,20 revisit 90:3 94:5,22 95:2,5 96:11,20,21 97:8,14, **record** 3:4 29:10 34:4 52:2,8 74:12 15,18 99:13 rights 7:22,23 81:12 rent- 7:18 robust 85:6 99:5 recorded 3:24 rental 29:15 70:22 78:22 82:18 98:4 **Rockland** 14:10 35:24 records 51:14 77:24 rental- 26:6 roll 2:7,8,10 3:13 61:2 68:6 100:24 recourse 28:22 29:15,18 rents 19:23 21:3,20 30:5 37:22 70:5 **room** 34:17,23 48:12 55:14 56:10 refer 82:11 73:11 63:21 66:9,23 67:8 81:7 referring 82:10 repeat 17:16 rough 41:20 reflect 3:4 64:16 repeating 15:22 roughly 95:11 **reform** 79:22 report 70:20 route 42:17 **refund** 94:22 reporter 51:13,19 52:1,6 row 58:16 regard 77:6 **reporters** 51:16,18 rule 14:7 19:3 region 6:11 reports 39:14 rules 15:14 24:23 44:9 register 33:14 represent 5:14 run 7:12 50:23 87:23 registered 24:9 88:5 95:22 96:1 representative 7:18 running 89:8 registration 28:7 85:19,21 87:16 representatives 5:23 rustle 39:15 88:11 89:11,13 93:8 95:11 96:3,11, representing 7:14 15,18 S registrations 85:22 89:9 request 13:23

require 56:14 67:14,16 91:22,24

safe 50:8

saints 101:17

requested 86:2

regularly 20:8

regulated 34:6 74:8

Salvador 6:16

Sanchis 3:3

Saturday 45:16,24 46:2 47:11 48:6, 8,22 49:6,8,12 54:11 58:20 60:11,18

scared 73:6

scenario 89:23

schedule 60:16

scheduled 65:22

scheduling 30:13 59:1

school 6:18 49:9 51:4,6,8

scope 30:7

screaming 55:14

Seconded 68:12

send 16:10 32:24 33:20,22 65:1 79:8 83:24 91:23 92:1 95:24

sending 32:20 33:12

sense 3:13 27:4 30:3 36:9 39:7 40:19 41:10 43:18 90:13,16 91:6

sensitivity 46:22

separate 8:17 9:19 21:7 23:8 27:10,

11,20,24 67:6 73:24

separately 21:2,5

September 2:3 31:8

serve 86:1 92:19

served 85:19 86:20 89:5,14

service 7:21 98:9,10 100:12

service-related 21:12

services 7:21 21:1,14 78:2 85:16 96:12 98:5,7

serving 85:21

set 9:1,22 10:1,6 13:4 14:11,12 16:17 17:7 18:1,10,16,24 19:22 20:4,9,11,18 22:23 23:18 27:20 28:14,16 31:4 34:22 41:2,11 43:21

44:4,5,6 48:5,10 50:1,3 53:14 55:21, 22 56:8 61:19,22 62:5,6,16 63:7 64:20 68:22 71:20 72:1,3 76:4 87:6, 24 89:1,6,17 91:9,18 92:14 93:9,20

94:8,18 100:4,11

sets 17:12 27:2 62:3 80:3 82:17

83:22 93:19

setting 9:18 19:22 27:10,13 40:3 50:11 64:15 93:16 98:2

settings 43:1

sewage 21:4,5

shape 88:2

share 41:23 62:12 63:14 66:1

shared 81:21

sheet 34:23 74:1 79:3,6,8,20 82:10, 11,12,19 90:22 91:8,11,13,15,16

sheets 76:22 90:15

shoot 50:18

show 45:3,13 51:16 52:23 76:19

94:1

sign 54:2

sign-in 34:22

signed 26:24

significant 50:24

similar 27:21

Similarly 9:10

simple 13:19

simply 31:22

single 56:17

sit 92:16

sitting 77:16

situation 26:17

sixty 78:11

slice 18:19

sloppy 70:1

slowly 12:14

solely 38:2 92:20 97:24

sooner 46:4

sort 22:1,16 30:21 51:12 87:13

Soto 3:1,2 6:8,9 20:24 31:17 35:13, 16 42:1,14 50:20 57:14,18,21,23 58:5 61:6 65:16 66:10,13 68:4,18

74:19 79:2 83:15 101:12

sounds 54:13 57:2 64:9

sources 19:19 39:14 64:17

space 4:11 43:5

Spanish 55:17

speak 9:20 12:14 51:19 54:2 66:19

68:21 74:22 80:19 81:2

SPEAKER 28:10 60:24 79:7 100:16

speakers 43:21 68:23

Speaking 34:14

specific 21:16 25:20 99:22

specifically 16:15

speed 36:11,13

spelling 50:23,24 74:11

spoke 80:14

spokesperson 83:8

spread 44:14,15,18 45:8

stabilized 28:24

staff 3:8 7:2,8 13:22 32:19 39:24

41:13 48:23 73:14 77:11 88:14

92:20 97:23 100:1

stakeholders 41:4

stand 74:18

start 17:2 36:18,19 38:13 42:12 48:20 52:24 53:2,18 64:18 76:16,21

85:21

started 71:8 73:11

starting 86:16

starts 28:6 55:14 86:22 87:23

state 4:6,14 7:1,6,23 20:7 32:16 39:6,15 62:13 69:18 83:4 100:5

state's 83:9,11,13

statement 69:6 72:8,12 75:15 81:1

96:11.15

statements 67:13

states 80:4

statewide 69:17

statute 22:5

statutory 10:21

stay 29:17

Stecker 2:2,11,13,15,17,21,23 3:1, 3,6,21 7:4,5 8:6,12 10:23 11:12,20 12:2,14,19,22,23 16:18,23 17:3,11,

Index: stip..time

16,24 18:4,14,16,21 20:6,17,22 22:15 23:1,24 24:4 25:10,22 27:9, 13,19 28:3,5,12,16,23 29:4,22 31:4 32:12,15 34:22 39:9 40:4 43:17 44:10 48:13 50:3 51:10,22 52:4,10, 15,22 53:2,7,9,14 58:8 59:16 61:14 62:17 63:20 64:5,8,23 65:3,6,12 67:20 68:22 84:19 87:4,18 88:6 96:2,5,10,18 98:22 99:1

stip 66:16

stipulate 66:17

Stony 31:19 32:4 50:22

stop 6:19 13:18

stops 15:7

stored 38:3

stories 6:18

street 78:9

stress 23:10

stressed 76:15

strong 43:12

strongly 23:11

stuff 52:7 99:9

subject 21:15 33:11

submit 36:2 56:7

submitted 24:6 25:4 94:5

subsequent 56:7

successful 52:13

suggest 42:23

suggested 48:19

suggesting 42:12 79:15

suggestion 62:8 77:17

sum 72:18,24

summarize 72:5,6

summary 72:4

summing 72:20

support 3:8 7:8 32:19 39:16 100:2,

10

supposed 9:21 79:8 87:3

survey 40:13 78:22

survivors 6:17

sworn 77:23

system 6:18

Т

tailored 90:24

taking 5:9 66:22

talk 9:4 36:7 49:24 51:5 62:1 69:22 70:2,12 72:9 73:7 75:16 79:1

talking 11:15 38:14,19 71:8 89:4

Tampone 2:19,20 7:9 10:19,21 11:19 15:11,13,21 16:13 20:14,20, 23 28:18 29:3,7 30:1 32:5,13 33:3 34:9,13 35:19 38:19 39:22 41:5,10 42:19 44:4,15,18 46:3 47:1,10,21,24 49:11 51:3 52:8,11 53:21 54:1,5,8 55:16 56:16 57:4 58:17 59:6,13,23 60:5,10,13,22 66:15 67:24 68:5,12 86:19 87:2,17 88:4,12 89:10,16,22 95:21 96:4,7,16,24 97:21 98:17,24 101:6,15

Tara 2:21 5:14 68:13 101:7

task 4:11,18

taxes 13:13

team 3:7 61:13 63:9 79:11

telling 97:18

ten 6:16 54:10 92:8

tenant 7:17 8:9,14 9:13,15,16,17 10:23 24:8,22 26:3,4,9 28:19 69:10 74:5,23,24 85:14 86:1,20 92:4 94:10,24 95:22,24 96:12,14 97:8 98:5,18

tenant's 25:14

tenants 4:12 7:22 8:22 10:2 18:7,8 21:4,11 23:9,10,18,19 24:7 25:5 26:15 28:2 29:1 34:1 38:5 74:4 76:10,23 78:11,14,20 79:20 80:2,7,8 81:17 83:23 85:3 86:17 87:21 88:13 89:15,20 93:7 94:5 95:10 98:8,15 100:3,7

tenant's 97:1

tend 79:23

term 19:23 26:20

terminator 75:23

terms 31:18 44:14

terrorized 78:12

testify 35:12 43:4,14 69:5

testifying 65:17 98:23

testimony 16:4 36:2 55:10 56:5 69:5 71:3 72:6,8 76:19 80:11

Thanksgiving 46:1,9 57:11

that'll 8:18

that's 3:7 23:15 37:4 55:14 69:20 76:4 92:6.9 98:10

theoretically 17:24 33:3

there's 37:13

they're 84:8 85:23 97:16

thing 25:6 26:21 27:17 49:15 50:4 54:14 62:22 80:14 86:11 88:10 95:9

things 5:19 7:13 11:1 16:22 19:3 21:23 22:2,8 26:15 62:8 67:10,12 77:6 84:8,21 87:14 93:19 99:22

thinking 18:22 30:20 35:17 36:14 52:16 90:17

thinks 26:22 92:9 93:21

thirteen 77:7 95:1

thirty 35:4 48:20 49:9 53:19 54:3 60:3,20,21 64:7

thirty-eight 2:3

thought 45:10 81:4 83:7

thoughts 87:11

thousand 97:7

three-year 78:18

Thursday 47:20 58:12

ticking 28:6

Tierney 2:23,24 7:16,17 12:6,9,11, 16,20,24 13:9,20 25:24 35:2 37:4, 10,19 38:15 49:7 50:16,22 55:7 58:7 64:11,13 67:14,18 68:1,15,16 83:3, 9,13 90:5,9 100:19 101:9,10

tight 39:6

time 11:16 14:5,6 17:15 23:17 24:15 25:7,18 26:23 27:2 28:8 31:9,24 33:16 36:17 37:5 38:21 41:22 43:15

45:4 46:15,22 48:7,19 49:19 53:1,2 54:14 58:3 65:18 66:17,18 69:15 71:5 75:3,4,10 82:8 83:1 89:17 90:12 94:11,17,18

timeframe 9:8 11:18 30:22 87:23 timeline 16:16 30:22 39:6 46:17 88:20

timer 68:23 71:21

times 30:18 43:1 48:10,14 58:1 70:6 85:7 99:21

title 86:11

today 84:11 99:15

told 82:14

tonight 51:13 56:10

Tonight's 38:16

top 13:15 99:2

total 38:3

totally 73:21

touch 72:10 75:19

track 95:4

tract 12:13 13:2

transcribe 4:1

transcribed 52:4

translations 55:9

treasurer 69:3

treatment 18:9

Tuesday 47:20,24 48:5 53:20 58:4,5 60:8,17

turn 2:6

tuiii 2.0

turnover 61:11

twelve 34:5,7 76:9 97:9,16,19

twenty 4:9 55:1 twenty-five 6:7

twenty-four 5:17

two-year 9:15,17 18:3,11,13

type 18:19,20 35:22 36:20,21 39:5

43:3 54:20

U

Uh-huh 11:19 54:7 87:17 92:10 94:19

unable 28:20

unavailable 57:14

unaware 38:10

underscore 23:14

understand 23:21 29:4 30:6,24 57:21 71:24 86:13 87:2 90:19 98:19

understanding 32:2 36:18 39:16

understands 70:21

undo 90:11 unfair 73:10

UNIDENTIFIED 28:10 60:24 79:7

100:16

unit 29:15,18 33:4 40:10,14,19

86:21

units 18:20 19:1 33:6 76:9,13

unreasonable 27:1 28:19 71:15

unusual 48:17 update 81:14

updated 65:10,13 82:19 91:9 92:23 93:3 99:16

urge 78:18

urged 87:4

urgency 31:13 87:13 88:17

usual 48:19 **utilities** 18:7,8

٧

vacancies 31:12

valuable 49:19 63:18

varied 86:4

variety 9:21 43:1 67:7

venue 49:14,21 50:1 51:11

venues 50:5 version 85:13 vicious 77:14

view 40:21 41:3 97:2

village 73:4

vision 61:16

visited 6:12

voice 61:2,3

volunteers 54:16

vote 61:3 68:3 90:9,10

W

wait 55:22 86:6

walk 51:1.7 56:10

wanted 62:23 69:21 92:12

ward 76:8 78:10

wards 76:12

Washington 50:22

water 13:13 18:11,12,13 19:1 21:5

ways 18:19

weak 73:16

web 99:11

website 40:7 41:15 74:1 81:13 93:3

98:20 99:4

Wednesday 2:3 38:17,21,23 45:23

47:9,14 53:19 57:2

week 37:9 44:13 46:9,18 47:18 57:11,22,23 59:11,12 62:10 64:1

87:22 88:9 89:2,3,4

weekday 45:14

weekend 35:9 45:12 47:6 48:18

49:1

weekends 51:18

West 35:24 78:9

Westchester 14:9 23:3 43:19 50:5

53:11 55:1 70:5 73:6 84:6

we'd 41:18 53:18

we'll 36:1 55:15

we're 31:9 51:5 54:2

we've 35:24 39:11 78:10

what's 63:2
who's 85:8
wiggle 63:21
window 95:15
wonderful 76:3
wondering 29:20 46:14,16 79:4
won't 55:4
word 46:16
words 3:20 21:22,24 71:10 79:17
work 4:21 5:18,24 6:5 7:20 8:1 35:7
38:17 41:9 43:18 45:15 46:23 58:7
64:21 69:8 74:24 87:3 99:23,24
worked 6:13 69:16
working 4:10 39:8 66:1 73:14
works 47:18 48:2 59:20,21

world 22:7,19,22 worst-case 89:23

worth 82:20 85:5

wouldn't 21:17 26:17 28:24 34:7 51:24

wrap 23:22

write 56:17 74:2

writing 55:13

written 69:6 72:8

wrong 19:8 55:14 97:9,10,11

Υ

year 14:12 18:12 20:4,9,10,15,21 27:7 29:10 33:14 40:12 43:20 47:8

years 4:6 5:17 6:7,16 19:5 25:16 55:1 69:9,15,16,18 70:6 71:4 73:10 78:19 82:7,8,20,21

yield 75:3,4,10

York 4:6 6:17 7:1,6,23 14:9 32:16 37:17

you'll 71:4 75:15

you're 15:8 27:16,20 48:15,22 59:24 65:21 71:3 84:12