

1 NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF
2 HOMES AND COMMUNITY RENEWAL
3 ROCKLAND COUNTY RENT GUIDELINE BOARD
4 MEETING
5 Wednesday, June 15, 2022
6 7:20 PM
7
8 24 Chestnut Street, Spring Valley, NY 10977
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22 REPORTER: BARRINGTON MOXIE
23
24
25

1 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Rockland Guideline Board Meeting
2 starting at 7:20, Wednesday, June 15 for the purpose of
3 reviewing the survey documentation.

4 MS. CALDWELL: Okay.

5 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Do you want to do roll call?

6 MS. CALDWELL: Yeah.

7 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Or we could just acknowledge --
8 you could just check off who -- actually, we need to do the roll
9 call because it's being recorded for the record.

10 MS. CALDWELL: Oh, it's being recorded. Okay.
11 Can we call the roll?

12 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Patricia Caldwell?

13 MS. CALDWELL: Here.

14 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Kim Foskew?

15 MS. FOSKEW: Here.

16 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Milagros Guzman?

17 MR. GUZMAN: Here.

18 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Jain Jacob?

19 Alejandra Silva-Exias?

20 Jarrett Oates?

21 Robbi Hersh Horowitz?

22 Willy Trotman?

23 That completes the roll call.

24 Okay. Jeff, you want to share?

25 MR. HOROWITZ: Good evening, everyone. It's good

1 to be with you back in person. One difference in this years's
2 reporting is that we did produce a list of all buildings
3 included in this year's survey letter mailing.

4 How it works now is that we don't mail, of
5 course, actual surveys to owners like we used to in those large
6 manilla envelopes. So beginning 2019 -- sorry -- in 2016, we
7 started with the online system and so this is our 6th year at it
8 I believe. So part of that process is to send letters to owners
9 and managing agents prior to the opening of the survey for all
10 three counties: Nassau, Rockland, and Westchester. And then as
11 well we send e-mails to registered owners and managing agents.
12 You know, recent registrations. And if we do get any kickbacks
13 of any of our letters or e-mails, we investigate and we remail
14 or resend to the correct person.

15 So for Rockland, we had no kickbacks this year.
16 So I believe everyone did receive the letter. And even -- you
17 know, those who have e-mail received their e-mails so I didn't
18 receive any calls or e-mails from people who claim they didn't
19 get a letter. So this system seems to work. The only reason --
20 at least for the short-term -- is that we're continuing the
21 letters is that not everyone is as responsible as they should be
22 with registering or they haven't registered in recent years. So
23 we don't have e-mails for all the owners. So that's why, at
24 least for now, we're going to continue with the e-mails and the
25 letters to the individual owners.

1 So as you can see in the printout, we have the
2 total of 36 buildings, and the vast majority are in the Village
3 of Spring Valley. I believe three are included in Haverstraw.
4 At least two I know because of Garnerville and Pomona I believe
5 is part of Haverstraw because route 202 I believe is in
6 Haverstraw.

7 MS. HUERTAS: Yes, it borders it.

8 MR. HOROWITZ: Okay. And Darrien Court, well, at
9 least we have it indicated in Haverstraw so Pamona. And the
10 breakdown of what happened this year is that we received a total
11 of 17 completed schedules that were accepted by the union. So,
12 in other words, the owner completed all parts of the survey and
13 they were acceptable to be -- they were accepted by the union.
14 That's the initial term, accepted.

15 MS. FOSKEW: So that's about 40 percent; right?
16 About a 40 percent filled out survey?

17 MR. HOROWITZ: 36 and -- 17 out of 36.

18 MS. FOSKEW: Almost there. I mean, almost 50 --

19 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, a little over 40. It may be
20 closer to 50.

21 MS. FOSKEW: Was the percentage better when
22 everybody was getting the mail in the manilla envelope you
23 mentioned or no?

24 MR. HOROWITZ: Well, it's kind of change because
25 you see it's really more indicated in the cost of income ratio

1 table --

2 MS. FOSKEW: Uh-huh.

3 MR. HOROWITZ: -- as far as numbers of buildings
4 that were actually tabulated.

5 MS. FOSKEW: Okay.

6 MR. HOROWITZ: And when you go through it --

7 MS. FOSKEW: 58.6 percent.

8 MR. HOROWITZ: -- I mean the point is it's 19
9 buildings was the high maybe --

10 MS. FOSKEW: Okay.

11 MR. HOROWITZ: -- in 2013 and 2012 and 2011 and
12 13 buildings was the low in 2015. And now we're back up to 16.
13 For the past couple years we've been basically averaging 16 or
14 17. The highest, like I said, since we've been including this
15 data is 19 buildings.

16 So we -- I think you know part of the issue is
17 for Nassau and Rockland owners and agents, unlike Westchester
18 owners and agents is that those two County owners have to be
19 submit not only the vacancy schedule but the actual rent
20 schedule and list all of the apartments in the buildings. Where
21 at the Westchester, owners are only required to submit those
22 that became vacant during the most recent year. So you have
23 Nassau and some with many units and of course like Regency
24 Village, 500 units and they actually do submit but it's a labor
25 intensive project. But I have a good relationship with the

1 agent for Regency so they do come through but it's quite a lot
2 of work. So that could be an issue. Maybe, I'm not 100 percent
3 sure why some owners you know, they register their buildings but
4 they still don't want to go through the survey process. And we
5 try to make it plain to them that it's much easier this year
6 than in recent years because the two are on the same platform.
7 The REGIS is as well as the survey.

8 So in my mind, it's certainly easier than it was
9 before the online process. So I think hopefully that will
10 improve, but it's amazing how hard it is. We get like 13
11 included pretty regularly and then to get last couple or four or
12 five most, it's very difficult with some of these people who --
13 they're not that computer illiterate and some of them -- you
14 have to push them.

15 MS. FOSKEW: Uh-huh.

16 MR. HOROWITZ: So that's just the nature of --
17 especially with the smaller counties Nassau and Rockland. So we
18 try and always reach for the same number or level and even
19 Rockland -- Nassau was kind of difficult this year because an
20 agent who prepared a group of buildings for one owner passed
21 away over -- wow, Memorial Day weekend and I had to, like, get
22 the managing agent up to speed and luckily he got some submitted
23 before the Nassau deadline. So it's a challenge for us, but we
24 at least try to meet it, you know?

25 MS. FOSKEW: Thank you.

1 MR. HOROWITZ: Did anyone have specific questions
2 about the tables or did you want to just review them?

3 MS. CALDWELL: Just review them.

4 MR. HOROWITZ: Okay. So --

5 MS. CALDWELL: And as you review them, if
6 questions come up --

7 MR. HOROWITZ: If questions come up. Right.

8 Well, if you want to start with the '16 schedules
9 which includes Regency Village. In the heading, of course, it's
10 1568 -- units. A total of 1620 but --

11 MS. HUERTAS: Can you just hold up the one you're
12 talking about, Jeff?

13 MR. HOROWITZ: Sure. Here, I have an extra for
14 you.

15 MS. HUERTAS: All right.

16 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, the one with 16's schedules.
17 Does everyone have the 15 or do they need that as well?

18 MS. HUERTAS: I have the 15 one here.

19 MR. HOROWITZ: Okay.

20 MS. HUERTAS: I think I'm ready now. Thank you.

21 MR. HOROWITZ: Okay. All right. So the main --
22 does anyone need 15 or -- because now that we have plenty of --

23 MS. HUERTAS: This one has two different tables.

24 MS. FOSKEW: Right. I need another 16.

25 MR. HOROWITZ: Okay. Here.

1 MS. FOSKEW: Great. Thank you.

2 MR. HOROWITZ: Okay. The thing that I noticed
3 about both sets of tables is that calendar year 2020, we did
4 have a decline in income and everybody pretty much can figure
5 out the reason for that. Is that there was very little activity
6 during that year because of the height of the pandemic.

7 Then there was some, whatever the word is,
8 recovery in 2021. That's the best word. It really isn't a
9 tremendous jump because you see the 29 total for rental income
10 was only \$160 less than 2021. So it's really not a significant
11 change over the three years. It's just that there was a dip in
12 2020.

13 In terms of the individual expenses, it looks
14 like taxes are still the highest part of it. Real estate taxes.
15 Fuel has a -- you know, we've been talking about fuel especially
16 recently and that has seen an increase especially from 2020 into
17 2021 and, of course, that would continue into 2022. I'm sure of
18 that because of the way things are currently. So those to me
19 are the headlines of this table specifically about income and
20 categories of expenses.

21 The second table, again, is percentages. So this
22 again would be a total -- broken down by category. It should,
23 you know, total up to roughly 100 percent if not equaling it.
24 But, again, taxes take up percentage-wise a pretty even share
25 and a pretty significant share about, you know, a quarter of the

1 total percentage of all expenses or real estate taxes. Fuel, I
2 thought there would be a slightly higher increase
3 percentage-wise but there isn't. It's still 6.6.

4 If you go to table three, now that's interesting
5 because you can actually see the decline over the two-year
6 period. From 19 to 20 there was a 2.4 percent reduction and
7 from 20 to 21, we had some recovery, like I said. Increased by
8 3.1 percent, which is really only a net positive of .7 I would
9 think; right? Because you had a decline of 2.4 and then an
10 increase of 3.1, so it's still under a percent in terms of the
11 change over the three years. So to me, I don't know how much I
12 can really read into that except, again, there was a slight
13 recovery in income.

14 Now, the fuel did jump in that two-year period
15 from 3.7 from '19 to '20 to 9.4 percent rate of change. So that
16 is somewhat significant if you look at it that way. I mean, you
17 know, you can make an argument that, yes, that's a significant
18 increase percentage-wise.

19 So repairs and maintenance. That's kind of
20 interesting. It makes sense that during the pandemic year there
21 was a tremendous decline in work in general construction and
22 that type of work you know plumbing, any kind of capital
23 improvement work. It was just not any activity going so there
24 was a 32 percent decline in repairs and maintenance. So that is
25 somewhat significant, but it's understandable again. Because in

1 20 to 21 we have just the opposite, almost a 25 percent
2 increase. And that's from a very low base, so -- and at least
3 there was some recover again in that figure.

4 Finally table four, annual income versus
5 expenses. We have an income category of, again, those three
6 figures which are the same as before. Then we have before
7 depreciation and after depreciation. Now, I'm not the best
8 expert about cash flow. I could go through it again in the
9 office just to give you more detail about it, but in terms of
10 the percentage change, I don't see many changes during the three
11 years as a percent of income. Cash flow is a percent of income.
12 I mean, first 19, 20 relatively stable. And even -- I mean, it
13 goes from 27 to 28 back to 26 roughly. If we're rounding to the
14 nearest percent. So I don't know, that to me looks fairly
15 stable. So I don't know what to make of it other than that 2021
16 was a recovery year for -- certainly in terms of modest
17 increases and in income. And yet -- and, yes, repairs actually
18 increased and maintenance increased from a decline, especially
19 during the pandemic year, to a 24 and change increase in 2021.
20 So those are significant I think. The repairs in maintenance
21 part and the -- I guess the recovery in income -- slight
22 recovery in income from a decline of 2.4 percent to an increase
23 of 3.1, which is a net positive of .7.

24 Now, of course, that's with the inclusion of
25 Regency Village because we have a 1,568 total, because Regency's

1 a very large property at 500 plus units. So if you go to the
2 15-unit table, you'll see at the heading again based on 15
3 schedules containing 1,058 total housing units of which a 1,006
4 are subject, so that minuses the 562 units of Regency. Because
5 you go from 1,568 to 1,006 total.

6 And, again, there's some similarities in income.
7 I mean, a lower amount figure-wise but still a slight decline in
8 2020 and, yeah, an increase in 2021. Again, individual
9 categories of expenses; taxes still have the largest share; fuel
10 had some increase, it did increase during the three-year period
11 up to 810,000 from 752 in '19. So it's -- I don't know if it's
12 significant, but it's somewhat significant. Utilities also went
13 up. Even a little bit more number-wise from 734 to 807, so it's
14 not only the fuel, it's also -- it could be the utilities. And
15 really when you look at it, real estate taxes were fairly stable
16 throughout the three years. Now, repairs and maintenance,
17 again, there was a significant decline in calendar year 2020 due
18 to the pandemic and there was some recovery in 2021.

19 Page two, again, percent distribution of
20 expenses. Taxes has the line-share; fuel not a significant
21 change from year to year; utilities fairly steady; pay roll
22 fairly steady; even insurance is not that dramatic. I mean,
23 again, repairs and maintenance as a distribution, yes, it
24 declined to 5.7 percent again in 2020 that's somewhat
25 significant from 8.5 percent. And then it rallied a little to

1 6.6 percent.

2 So owner's expenses are kind of frozen in a way
3 or certainly minimal during -- oh and there's maintenance I
4 should say and repairs expenditures. But that might not only
5 have been due to them, it might have been due to the lack of
6 repair people that were able to work, so we're not sure about
7 that really. And I'm sure the lack of qualified personnel.

8 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Also, in the services cases
9 what we have found is that a lot of times the tenants wouldn't
10 let anybody in their apartment, so even if somebody -- if an
11 owner showed up with the door with a worker ready to do the
12 work, a lot of people were hesitant to let anybody in.

13 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, no access in other words.
14 And these are the people making the complaints so or some of
15 them I should say, you know?

16 All right. In the same situation there was a --
17 page three, again, it has percent of change over the two-year
18 periods. A decline at 1.7 percent in income.

19 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Which table are you doing,
20 Jeff?

21 MR. HOROWITZ: The third table.

22 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Okay.

23 MR. HOROWITZ: Right. So you see during '19 and
24 '20 there was a 1.7 percent decline. And then in '20 to '21
25 overall 3.4 percent. I mean, it kind of -- it's very little

1 change only in real estate. The other two categories there were
2 significant increases in. And, I mean, significant in that
3 there was a decline of 1.5 percent in rental and an increase of
4 3.4. All right. It's somewhat significant. And miscellaneous,
5 which in the instructions we can go over that if you want, I
6 mean, you know, question and answer but I didn't know if I
7 brought the instructions with me but I could forward those to
8 you if you want. You know the owner instructions? Because I
9 know there was some issues with Westchester about certain
10 categories. But the general instructions for -- owners we can
11 forward it if you would like.

12 On the fourth page of this, again, an annual
13 income versus expenses. Do you see that top heading? Which is
14 what we had in the initial page, the first page of rental
15 income. And they have a breakdown before and after
16 depreciation. Now, before depreciation the cash flow, fairly
17 static. I mean nothing earth shattering. After depreciation
18 there's a negative cash flow. I suppose it's theoretically
19 possible. A small negative cash flow. You could take a look at
20 that, but I don't know if it's that significant.

21 What's interesting about the two sets of tables
22 is they kind of mirror each other. Let me see about cash flow
23 under 16. See cash flow in 16 has a positive cash flow.
24 Including the Regency. Excluding Regency there's a negative
25 cash flow. It's small but it's there. In the low of 3's, 2.5,

1 2.9 minus 2.90. So Regency can play a role as, you know, as can
2 see, it can play a role.

3 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: So why did you do one with
4 Regency and one without? Just because of the size?

5 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, because again -- I mean this
6 is debatable whether it's -- whether it, quote, skews the data
7 because it's such a huge chunk of the rental population in the
8 County.

9 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Right. Like if you look at it
10 right, it's -- if it was 500 -- you said it was 500 units at
11 Regency, but overall the number of units was 1,500 so it's like
12 a third of the numbers on the one table as opposed to the other.
13 And the others 15 buildings with only a thousands units.

14 MR. HOROWITZ: Uh-huh.

15 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: That one building has 500,
16 so --

17 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, it's a factor and an earlier
18 Board decided to break -- have two separate sellers.

19 MS. CALDWELL: Yeah, that's why we asked because
20 initially we're looking at the --

21 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Yeah, it doesn't skew.

22 MR. HOROWITZ: Yes, when you were there, right.

23 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Thank you.

24 MR. HOROWITZ: Okay. Now, the vacancy tables, I
25 know people were discussing this earlier about rental amounts

1 and the first table is about prior rental amounts.

2 MS. HUERTAS: Do we have any --

3 MR. HOROWITZ: I think we should have some.

4 Whoever needs some. Do you have it?

5 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: This one; right?

6 MR. HOROWITZ: Yes.

7 So the first table talks about the prior rents
8 and the largest number are in the 1,000 to 1,499 range. Now,
9 again, this is for a one-year lease. And these are -- most
10 people in research go with the meeting figures on the left, the
11 lower left corner rather than the median because the median kind
12 of takes out the outliers -- the real outliers in the figures.
13 And there's not too much of a difference really when you look at
14 it. But we generally site the median ranks.

15 So the majority of them percentage-wise are the
16 1,000 to 1,499 range. And then the second one talks about
17 two-year leases. And, again, because not as many tenants elect
18 two-year leases, we have relatively fewer -- significantly fewer
19 rents in that -- for a two-year -- that took a two-year. So you
20 had lease terms of two years. Three of the units were in the 15
21 to 1999. One was in the 2,000 to 2,499 and that was pretty much
22 it. There were four units in that category.

23 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: That were reported.

24 MR. HOROWITZ: That were reported.

25 Now, the third goes back to a one-year lease.

1 Now, the previous rent by percentage increase. Now, this is
2 you, know, it's academic really. I mean, you can't have
3 increases of 70 percent or of 30 percent or to even 10 percent
4 or even 5 now, I mean, unless there's a change for the new
5 guideline because it looks like everything is under 5, which is
6 should be especially with a one-year lease term. There
7 shouldn't be any increases over 5 rightfully -- you know,
8 rightfully, given the low guidelines.

9 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Well this is also for a vacant
10 apartment which means the only thing you can add other than that
11 after HISPA is any improve -- any IAI's --

12 MR. HOROWITZ: Any IAI's.

13 MS. RODRIGUEZ: -- into the apartment.

14 MR. HOROWITZ: Right. And those are limited.

15 MS. RODRIGUEZ: There's no vacancy allowed.

16 MR. HOROWITZ: No, there's no statutory, right.

17 So if we had the statutory, yeah, you'd see the
18 20 to 29 maybe being -- having three or four. And the two-year
19 term, again, four apartments the same under 5 percent category.
20 Three in the 15 to 19 and 1 in the 2000 to 24.

21 Now, it's interesting the median rent increase
22 for the one -- one-year was 1.3 and the median rent increase for
23 the two-year term is 0, which I find kind of interesting. Maybe
24 owners just kept the leases for those that did take a two-year
25 term static I mean.

1 MS. RODRIGUEZ: I'm surprised more didn't take
2 two-years during those years too.

3 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, they might have not raised
4 the rent at all. I don't know. I'm trying to remember if they
5 were allowed. And the only other thing -- well, not the only
6 other thing, but the other thing is they vacate -- I know the
7 table about cost to income ratios and that's a single sheet. I
8 think I gave Karen what I had on those.

9 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: We all have them.

10 MR. HOROWITZ: You have them, yes?

11 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Is it only one sheet?

12 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, a single sheet.

13 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

14 MR. HOROWITZ: So like I was saying before about
15 2005 we started reporting for both categories of buildings,
16 maybe that's when we started to use two sets of tables. And
17 that year where he had 16 total units that were tabulated like
18 this year and you can pretty much see -- so that's how you can
19 see basically how many submissions we've had from year to year
20 because the one -- the ones in parenthesis are the lower
21 figures, it is the percentage for the 5th -- for the 2nd
22 category without Regency. Because you see the 58 points -- 56.9
23 percent figure for this year for 15 buildings means the one in
24 parenthesis is without Regency Village and the 58.6 percent
25 figure is including Regency.

1 MS. CALDWELL: So one column includes interest
2 and depreciation and the other one excludes it?

3 MR. HOROWITZ: Right. The one excluding has a
4 lower figure, generally. And the one including has a higher
5 percentage ratio. But I mean for pure number counting, it's a
6 good tool because it shows you how many from year to year we've
7 received and tabulated.

8 MS. CALDWELL: Uh-huh.

9 MR. HOROWITZ: So I never -- I don't think we've
10 hit 20 yet. Maybe one year, but not recently. That would be
11 very hard. But we try to aim for 16 or more so between 16 and
12 20, if we get that for the future years we'll be okay I think.
13 We just have to somehow encourage more people to file and, you
14 know, it's not easy because of the lack of penalty now. Unlike
15 the Reg's where they have a penalty at least if a complaint is
16 filed. And with surveys, generally, there are no, quote,
17 penalties anymore unless there's a law change again and I don't
18 know if there would be because of the court case but it was a
19 Nassau case but it effected all three counties so.

20 MS. CALDWELL: Right.

21 MR. HOROWITZ: So it's not a -- I mean ironically
22 given those circumstances, we still do get decent submission
23 rates. I mean, you think of the fact there is no penalty now
24 and yet owners still submit. Granted, I went through like --
25 maybe in my second job I'll be a salesman or like a collection

1 agent guy because my work would be -- with the fees. Collecting
2 ETPA fees.

3 In any event, you have to like be kind of pushy
4 still trying to get these people to submit and complete it. And
5 I like -- it's kind of funny sometimes when I speak to owners
6 that maybe missed a year or two and now we want them to file
7 again maybe because of COVID they say no, no, no we never used
8 to submit this about fuel consumption, no, no. I said yeah, I
9 got a year from 2018. You got a figure there for
10 uninterrupted gas so I think you did fill that out last time.
11 Okay, Jeff. We'll check it.

12 I mean I have to keep my sense of humor about it
13 because, you know, these things happen because they're not the
14 most, maybe, technically savvy -- some of them, but they have
15 accountants and lawyers and they can find that out. Obviously
16 they've done it in prior years some of them.

17 MS. CALDWELL: Right.

18 MR. HOROWITZ: So it's not like it's that new to
19 them, so that's my approach when I see someone who did file in a
20 recent prior year, I try to catch up with them to see if we can
21 help them file again.

22 So I think that's pretty much it in a nutshell
23 for this year. I mean, we've had a pretty decent year all
24 things considered. It maxed last years total number and, you
25 know, we'll try and keep you know giving you as many reports as

1 we can. I'll try if you guys want that instruction report.

2 MS. RODRIGUEZ: If you wouldn't mind sending it
3 please through e-mail.

4 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah.

5 MS. RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

6 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, the general instructions --

7 MS. RODRIGUEZ: That would be helpful. Thank
8 you.

9 MR. HOROWITZ: -- for the year. Okay.

10 MS. CALDWELL: (Inaudible) Regency.

11 MS. RODRIGUEZ: We just call it the big building.

12 MS. CALDWELL: Okay. All right. Well, thank you
13 for that presentation.

14 MS. HUERTAS: Does anybody have any questions?

15 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, I mean I did go over one
16 going that was excluded I think because it was non comparable
17 because it had a low number of ETPA units. It's kind of an
18 unusual case because it's a building called Edison Court, 69
19 Edison, I believe that's the building that was excluded. And it
20 has a complex with two out of three being non ETPA and 1 of the
21 3 being ETPA.

22 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: And that was excluded from --

23 MR. HOROWITZ: Yes, because it's not -- it
24 doesn't have a high enough percentage of units subject.

25 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Right. It was a co-op

1 building I think.

2 MR. HOROWITZ: I thought that --

3 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Is that what it is?

4 MR. HOROWITZ: -- I didn't get the impression
5 that the other two were co-op. I thought they were still rental
6 -- maybe a year of construction, I'm not sure.

7 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Okay.

8 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, I'm really not sure about
9 that.

10 MS. CALDWELL: It's right in the middle --

11 MR. HOROWITZ: 69 -- I believe it's 69 Edison
12 Court.

13 MS. CALDWELL: -- then it's community. It's hard
14 to tell what they have in there.

15 MR. HOROWITZ: But it's supposed to be three
16 distinct buildings and one of the three has ETPA tenants and the
17 other two do not.

18 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Maybe at the time the building
19 was built, possibly?

20 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, that's my only thought
21 possibly the year of construction.

22 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Maybe one of the buildings was
23 before 74 and the others --

24 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah.

25 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: -- were after.

1 MR. HOROWITZ: They were constructed after.

2 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: And then they wouldn't
3 qualify.

4 MR. HOROWITZ: No, right.

5 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Well, do you know if they
6 collect the \$10 for all the buildings? If they collect the
7 registration fee for all the buildings?

8 MR. HOROWITZ: They do file and we bill the 20
9 now -- of course, it's gone up to 20 per unit.

10 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Okay.

11 MR. HOROWITZ: So that was -- no it's been 20
12 since after the --

13 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: 2019.

14 MR. HOROWITZ: Yeah, and we bill Edison Court
15 for, I think. It's 60-something units. They're always -- no,
16 they pay Spring Valley but --

17 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Okay.

18 MR. HOROWITZ: And they can't -- and they do file
19 the survey, but it's not acceptable because it's a low number
20 relative to the total number.

21 MS. CALDWELL: Well, then maybe they
22 misunderstood it, like you said.

23 MR. HOROWITZ: Well, maybe they did construct the
24 other two after 74. Or it's close, but that's all I really can
25 figure out at this point.

1 MS. CALDWELL: Okay.

2 MR. HOROWITZ: I'll try and delve into it a
3 little deeper. I'll see if I can come up with something.

4 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Thank you.

5 MR. HOROWITZ: All right. Good to see everybody
6 in person --

7 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Yeah, this is great.

8 MR. HOROWITZ: -- after this period.

9 MS. RODRIGUEZ: I know.

10 MS. GRAY-HUERTAS: Thanks Valerie.

11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh, my pleasure. I always
12 learn something wherever I go.

13 MS. CALDWELL: Motion to adjourn? So moved in
14 second. All three of us. Thank you.

15 (Whereupon the proceeding concluded until Tuesday, June 21,
16 2022.)

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 C E R T I F I C A T E

2 The prior proceedings were transcribed from audio
3 files and have been transcribed to the best of my
4 ability. I further certify that I am not connected by
5 blood, marriage, or employment with any of the parties
6 herein nor interested directly or indirectly in the
7 matter transcribed.

8

9

10

11 MARISA D'ANTONIO

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

<hr/>	2,499 15:21	32 9:24
<hr/> \$ <hr/>	2.4 9:6,9 10:22	36 4:2,17
\$10 22:6	2.5 13:25	<hr/> 4 <hr/>
\$160 8:10	2.9 14:1	<hr/>
<hr/> 0 <hr/>	2.90 14:1	40 4:15,16,19
0 16:23	20 9:6,7,15 10:1,12 12:24 16:18 18:10,12 22:8,9,11	<hr/> 5 <hr/>
<hr/> 1 <hr/>	2000 16:20	5 16:4,5,7,19
1 16:20 20:20	2005 17:15	5.7 11:24
1,000 15:8,16	2011 5:11	50 4:18,20
1,006 11:3,5	2012 5:11	500 5:24 11:1 14:10,15
1,058 11:3	2013 5:11	56.9 17:22
1,499 15:8,16	2015 5:12	562 11:4
1,500 14:11	2016 3:6	58 17:22
1,568 10:25 11:5	2018 19:9	58.6 5:7 17:24
1.3 16:22	2019 3:6 22:13	5th 17:21
1.5 13:3	202 4:5	<hr/> 6 <hr/>
1.7 12:18,24	2020 8:3,12,16 11:8,17,24	6.6 9:3 12:1
10 16:3	2021 8:8,10,17 10:15,19 11:8,18	60-something 22:15
100 6:2 8:23	2022 8:17 23:16	69 20:18 21:11
13 5:12 6:10	21 9:7 10:1 12:24 23:15	6th 3:7
15 2:2 7:17,18,22 11:2 14:13 15:20 16:20 17:23	24 10:19 16:20	<hr/> 7 <hr/>
15-unit 11:2	25 10:1	7 9:8 10:23
1568 7:10	26 10:13	70 16:3
16 5:12,13 7:8,24 13:23 17:17 18:11	27 10:13	734 11:13
16's 7:16	28 10:13	74 21:23 22:24
1620 7:10	29 8:9 16:18	752 11:11
17 4:11,17 5:14	2nd 17:21	7:20 2:2
19 5:8,15 9:6,15 10:12 11:11 12:23 16:20	<hr/> 3 <hr/>	<hr/> 8 <hr/>
1999 15:21	3 20:21	8.5 11:25
<hr/> 2 <hr/>	3's 13:25	807 11:13
2,000 15:21	3.1 9:8,10 10:23	810,000 11:11
	3.4 12:25 13:4	
	3.7 9:15	
	30 16:3	

<hr/> 9 <hr/>	beginning 3:6	claim 3:18
9.4 9:15	big 20:11	close 22:24
<hr/> A <hr/>	bill 22:8,14	closer 4:20
academic 16:2	bit 11:13	co-op 20:25 21:5
acceptable 4:13 22:19	Board 2:1 14:18	collect 22:6
accepted 4:11,13,14	borders 4:7	Collecting 19:1
access 12:13	break 14:18	collection 18:25
accountants 19:15	breakdown 4:10 13:15	column 18:1
acknowledge 2:7	broken 8:22	community 21:13
activity 8:5 9:23	brought 13:7	comparable 20:16
actual 3:5 5:19	building 14:15 20:11,18,19 21:1,18	complaint 18:15
add 16:10	buildings 3:2 4:2 5:3,9,12,15,20 6:3,20 14:13 17:15,23 21:16,22 22:6,7	complaints 12:14
adjourn 23:13	built 21:19	complete 19:4
agent 6:1,20,22 19:1	<hr/> C <hr/>	completed 4:11,12
agents 3:9,11 5:17,18	Caldwell 2:4,6,10,12,13 7:3,5 14:19 18:1,8,20 19:17 20:10,12 21:10,13 22:21 23:1,13	completes 2:23
aim 18:11	calendar 8:3 11:17	complex 20:20
Alejandra 2:19	call 2:5,9,11,23 20:11	computer 6:13
allowed 16:15 17:5	called 20:18	concluded 23:15
amazing 6:10	calls 3:18	considered 19:24
amount 11:7	capital 9:22	construct 22:23
amounts 14:25 15:1	case 18:18,19 20:18	constructed 22:1
annual 10:4 13:12	cases 12:8	construction 9:21 21:6,21
anymore 18:17	cash 10:8,11 13:16,18,19,22,23,25	consumption 19:8
apartment 12:10 16:10,13	catch 19:20	continue 3:24 8:17
apartments 5:20 16:19	categories 8:20 11:9 13:1,10 17:15	continuing 3:20
approach 19:19	category 8:22 10:5 15:22 16:19 17:22	corner 15:11
argument 9:17	challenge 6:23	correct 3:14
averaging 5:13	change 4:24 8:11 9:11,15 10:10,19 11:21 12:17 13:1 16:4 18:17	cost 4:25 17:7
<hr/> B <hr/>	check 2:8 19:11	counties 3:10 6:17 18:19
back 3:1 5:12 10:13 15:25	chunk 14:7	counting 18:5
base 10:2	circumstances 18:22	County 5:18 14:8
based 11:2		couple 5:13 6:11
basically 5:13 17:19		court 4:8 18:18 20:18 21:12 22:14
		COVID 19:7

D

Darrien 4:8
data 5:15 14:6
Day 6:21
deadline 6:23
debatable 14:6
decent 18:22 19:23
decided 14:18
decline 8:4 9:5,9,21,24 10:18,22 11:7,17 12:18,24 13:3
declined 11:24
deeper 23:3
delve 23:2
depreciation 10:7 13:16,17 18:2
detail 10:9
difference 3:1 15:13
difficult 6:12,19
dip 8:11
discussing 14:25
distinct 21:16
distribution 11:19,23
documentation 2:3
door 12:11
dramatic 11:22
due 11:17 12:5

E

e-mail 3:17 20:3
e-mails 3:11,13,17,18,23,24
earlier 14:17,25
earth 13:17
easier 6:5,8
easy 18:14
Edison 20:18,19 21:11 22:14
effected 18:19

elect 15:17
encourage 18:13
envelope 4:22
envelopes 3:6
equaling 8:23
estate 8:14 9:1 11:15 13:1
ETPA 19:2 20:17,20,21 21:16
evening 2:25
event 19:3
excluded 20:16,19,22
excludes 18:2
excluding 13:24 18:3
expenditures 12:4
expenses 8:13,20 9:1 10:5 11:9,20 12:2 13:13
expert 10:8
extra 7:13

F

fact 18:23
factor 14:17
fairly 10:14 11:15,21,22 13:16
fee 22:7
fees 19:1,2
fewer 15:18
figure 8:4 10:3 17:23,25 18:4 19:9 22:25
figure-wise 11:7
figures 10:6 15:10,12 17:21
file 18:13 19:6,19,21 22:8,18
filed 18:16
fill 19:10
filled 4:16
Finally 10:4
find 16:23 19:15
flow 10:8,11 13:16,18,19,22,23,25
forward 13:7,11

Foskew 2:14,15 4:15,18,21 5:2,5,7, 10 6:15,25 7:24 8:1
found 12:9
fourth 13:12
frozen 12:2
fuel 8:15 9:1,14 11:9,14,20 19:8
funny 19:5
future 18:12

G

Garnerville 4:4
gas 19:10
gave 17:8
general 9:21 13:10 20:6
generally 15:14 18:4,16
give 10:9
giving 19:25
good 2:25 5:25 18:6 23:5
Granted 18:24
GRAY-HUERTAS 12:8,19,22 14:3, 9,15,21,23 15:5,23 17:9 20:22,25 21:3,7,18,22,25 22:2,5,10,13,17 23:4,7,10
great 8:1 23:7
group 6:20
guess 10:21
guideline 2:1 16:5
guidelines 16:8
guy 19:1
guys 20:1
Guzman 2:16,17

H

happen 19:13
happened 4:10
hard 6:10 18:11 21:13
Haverstraw 4:3,5,6,9

heading 7:9 11:2 13:13**headlines** 8:19**height** 8:6**helpful** 20:7**Hersh** 2:21**hesitant** 12:12**high** 5:9 20:24**higher** 9:2 18:4**highest** 5:14 8:14**HISPA** 16:11**hit** 18:10**hold** 7:11**Horowitz** 2:21,25 4:8,17,19,24 5:3, 6,8,11 6:16 7:1,4,7,13,16,19,21,25 8:2 12:13,21,23 14:5,14,17,22,24 15:3,6,24 16:12,14,16 17:3,10,12,14 18:3,9,21 19:18 20:4,6,9,15,23 21:2, 4,8,11,15,20,24 22:1,4,8,11,14,18, 23 23:2,5,8**housing** 11:3**HUERTAS** 4:7 7:11,15,18,20,23 15:2 20:14**huge** 14:7**humor** 19:12

I

IAI's 16:11,12**illiterate** 6:13**impression** 21:4**improve** 6:10 16:11**improvement** 9:23**Inaudible** 20:10**included** 3:3 4:3 6:11**includes** 7:9 18:1**including** 5:14 13:24 17:25 18:4**inclusion** 10:24**income** 4:25 8:4,9,19 9:13 10:4,5, 11,17,21,22 11:6 12:18 13:13,15 17:7**increase** 8:16 9:2,10,18 10:2,19,22 11:8,10 13:3 16:1,21,22**increased** 9:7 10:18**increases** 10:17 13:2 16:3,7**individual** 3:25 8:13 11:8**initial** 4:14 13:14**initially** 14:20**instruction** 20:1**instructions** 13:5,7,8,10 20:6**insurance** 11:22**intensive** 5:25**interest** 18:1**interesting** 9:4,20 13:21 16:21,23**investigate** 3:13**ironically** 18:21**issue** 5:16 6:2**issues** 13:9

J

Jacob 2:18**Jain** 2:18**Jarrett** 2:20**Jeff** 2:24 7:12 12:20 19:11**job** 18:25**jump** 8:9 9:14**June** 2:2 23:15

K

Karen 17:8**kickbacks** 3:12,15**Kim** 2:14**kind** 4:24 6:19 9:19,22 12:2,25 13:22 15:11 16:23 19:3,5 20:17

L

labor 5:24**lack** 12:5,7 18:14**large** 3:5 11:1**largest** 11:9 15:8**law** 18:17**lawyers** 19:15**learn** 23:12**lease** 15:9,20,25 16:6**leases** 15:17,18 16:24**left** 15:10,11**letter** 3:3,16,19**letters** 3:8,13,21,25**level** 6:18**limited** 16:14**line-share** 11:20**list** 3:2 5:20**lot** 6:1 12:9,12**low** 5:12 10:2 13:25 16:8 20:17 22:19**lower** 11:7 15:11 17:20 18:4**luckily** 6:22

M

mail 3:4 4:22**mailing** 3:3**main** 7:21**maintenance** 9:19,24 10:18,20 11:16,23 12:3**majority** 4:2 15:15**make** 6:5 9:17 10:15**makes** 9:20**making** 12:14**managing** 3:9,11 6:22**manilla** 3:6 4:22**maxed** 19:24**means** 16:10 17:23**median** 15:11,14 16:21,22**meet** 6:24

meeting 2:1 15:10**Memorial** 6:21**mentioned** 4:23**middle** 21:10**Milagros** 2:16**mind** 6:8 20:2**minimal** 12:3**minus** 14:1**minuses** 11:4**mirror** 13:22**miscellaneous** 13:4**missed** 19:6**misunderstood** 22:22**modest** 10:16**Motion** 23:13**moved** 23:13

N

Nassau 3:10 5:17,23 6:17,19,23
18:19**nature** 6:16**nearest** 10:14**negative** 13:18,19,24**net** 9:8 10:23**noticed** 8:2**number** 6:18 14:11 15:8 18:5 19:24
20:17 22:19,20**number-wise** 11:13**numbers** 5:3 14:12**nutshell** 19:22

O

Oates 2:20**office** 10:9**one-year** 15:9,25 16:6,22**online** 3:7 6:9**opening** 3:9**opposed** 14:12**opposite** 10:1**outliers** 15:12**owner** 4:12 6:20 12:11 13:8**owner's** 12:2**owners** 3:5,8,11,23,25 5:17,18,21
6:3 13:10 16:24 18:24 19:5

P

Pamona 4:9**pandemic** 8:6 9:20 10:19 11:18**parenthesis** 17:20,24**part** 3:8 4:5 5:16 8:14 10:21**parts** 4:12**passed** 6:20**past** 5:13**Patricia** 2:12**pay** 11:21 22:16**penalties** 18:17**penalty** 18:14,15,23**people** 3:18 6:12 12:6,12,14 14:25
15:10 18:13 19:4**percent** 4:15,16 5:7 6:2 8:23 9:6,8,
10,15,24 10:1,11,14,22 11:19,24,25
12:1,17,18,24,25 13:3 16:3,19
17:23,24**percentage** 4:21 9:1 10:10 16:1
17:21 18:5 20:24**percentage-wise** 8:24 9:3,18
15:15**percentages** 8:21**period** 9:6,14 11:10 23:8**periods** 12:18**person** 3:1,14 23:6**personnel** 12:7**plain** 6:5**platform** 6:6**play** 14:1,2**pleasure** 23:11**plenty** 7:22**plumbing** 9:22**point** 5:8 22:25**points** 17:22**Pomona** 4:4**population** 14:7**positive** 9:8 10:23 13:23**possibly** 21:19,21**prepared** 6:20**presentation** 20:13**pretty** 6:11 8:4,24,25 15:21 17:18
19:22,23**previous** 16:1**printout** 4:1**prior** 3:9 15:1,7 19:16,20**proceeding** 23:15**process** 3:8 6:4,9**produce** 3:2**project** 5:25**property** 11:1**pure** 18:5**purpose** 2:2**push** 6:14**pushy** 19:3

Q

qualified 12:7**qualify** 22:3**quarter** 8:25**question** 13:6**questions** 7:1,6,7 20:14**quote** 14:6 18:16

R

raised 17:3

rallied 11:25
range 15:8,16
ranks 15:14
rate 9:15
rates 18:23
ratio 4:25 18:5
ratios 17:7
reach 6:18
read 9:12
ready 7:20 12:11
real 8:14 9:1 11:15 13:1 15:12
reason 3:19 8:5
receive 3:16,18
received 3:17 4:10 18:7
recent 3:12,22 5:22 6:6 19:20
recently 8:16 18:10
record 2:9
recorded 2:9,10
recover 10:3
recovery 8:8 9:7,13 10:16,21,22 11:18
reduction 9:6
Reg's 18:15
Regency 5:23 6:1 7:9 10:25 11:4 13:24 14:1,4,11 17:22,24,25 20:10
Regency's 10:25
REGIS 6:7
register 6:3
registered 3:11,22
registering 3:22
registration 22:7
registrations 3:12
regularly 6:11
relationship 5:25
relative 22:20
re-mail 3:13
remember 17:4

rent 5:19 16:1,21,22 17:4
rental 8:9 13:3,14 14:7,25 15:1 21:5
rents 15:7,19
repair 12:6
repairs 9:19,24 10:17,20 11:16,23 12:4
report 20:1
reported 15:23,24
reporting 3:2 17:15
reports 19:25
required 5:21
research 15:10
resend 3:14
responsible 3:21
review 7:2,3,5
reviewing 2:3
rightfully 16:7,8
Robbi 2:21
Rockland 2:1 3:10,15 5:17 6:17,19
RODRIGUES 2:5
RODRIGUEZ 2:1,7,12,14,16,18 16:9,13,15 17:1,11,13 20:2,5,7,11 23:9
role 14:1,2
roll 2:5,8,11,23 11:21
roughly 8:23 10:13
rounding 10:13
route 4:5

S

salesman 18:25
savvy 19:14
schedule 5:19,20
schedules 4:11 7:8,16 11:3
sellers 14:18
send 3:8,11
sending 20:2

sense 9:20 19:12
separate 14:18
services 12:8
sets 8:3 13:21 17:16
share 2:24 8:24,25 11:9
shattering 13:17
sheet 17:7,11,12
short-term 3:20
showed 12:11
shows 18:6
significant 8:10,25 9:16,17,25 10:20 11:12,17,20,25 13:2,4,20
significantly 15:18
Silva-exias 2:19
similarities 11:6
single 17:7,12
site 15:14
situation 12:16
size 14:4
skew 14:21
skews 14:6
slight 9:12 10:21 11:7
slightly 9:2
small 13:19,25
smaller 6:17
speak 19:5
SPEAKER 23:11
specific 7:1
specifically 8:19
speed 6:22
Spring 4:3 22:16
stable 10:12,15 11:15
start 7:8
started 3:7 17:15,16
starting 2:2
static 13:17 16:25
statutory 16:16,17

steady 11:21,22
subject 11:4 20:24
submission 18:22
submissions 17:19
submit 5:19,21,24 18:24 19:4,8
submitted 6:22
suppose 13:18
supposed 21:15
surprised 17:1
survey 2:3 3:3,9 4:12,16 6:4,7 22:19
surveys 3:5 18:16
system 3:7,19

T

table 5:1 8:19,21 9:4 10:4 11:2
12:19,21 14:12 15:1,7 17:7
tables 7:2,23 8:3 13:21 14:24 17:16
tabulated 5:4 17:17 18:7
takes 15:12
talking 7:12 8:15
talks 15:7,16
taxes 8:14,24 9:1 11:9,15,20
technically 19:14
tenants 12:9 15:17 21:16
term 4:14 16:6,19,23,25
terms 8:13 9:10 10:9,16 15:20
theoretically 13:18
thing 8:2 16:10 17:5,6
things 8:18 19:13,24
thought 9:2 21:2,5,20
thousands 14:13
three-year 11:10
time 19:10 21:18
times 12:9
tool 18:6
top 13:13

total 4:2,10 7:10 8:9,22,23 9:1 10:25
11:3,5 17:17 19:24 22:20
tremendous 8:9 9:21
Trotman 2:22
Tuesday 23:15
two-year 9:5,14 12:17 15:17,18,19
16:18,23,24
two-years 17:2
type 9:22

U

Uh-huh 5:2 6:15 14:14 18:8
understandable 9:25
UNIDENTIFIED 23:11
uninterruptible 19:10
union 4:11,13
unit 22:9
units 5:23,24 7:10 11:1,3,4 14:10,
11,13 15:20,22 17:17 20:17,24
22:15
unlike 5:17 18:14
unusual 20:18
utilities 11:12,14,21

V

vacancy 5:19 14:24 16:15
vacant 5:22 16:9
vacate 17:6
Valerie 23:10
Valley 4:3 22:16
vast 4:2
versus 10:4 13:13
Village 4:2 5:24 7:9 10:25 17:24

W

Wednesday 2:2
weekend 6:21

Westchester 3:10 5:17,21 13:9
Willy 2:22
word 8:7,8
words 4:12 12:13
work 3:19 6:2 9:21,22,23 12:6,12
19:1
worker 12:11
works 3:4
wow 6:21

Y

year 3:7,15 4:10 5:22 6:5,19 8:3,6
9:20 10:16,19 11:17,21 17:17,18,19,
23 18:6,10 19:6,9,20,23 20:9 21:6,
21
year's 3:3
years 3:22 5:13 6:6 8:11 9:11 10:11
11:16 15:20 17:2 18:12 19:16,24
years's 3:1