1		NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF
2		HOMES AND COMMUNITY RENEWAL
3		WESTCHESTER COUNTY RENT GUIDELINE BOARD
4		
5		
6		PRESENTATION MEETING
7	DATE:	Wednesday, June 22, 2022
8	TIME:	7:09 PM
9	LOCATION:	New Rochelle City Hall
10		City Council Conference Room 90 Beaufort Place
11		New Rochelle, New York 10801
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22	REPORTER:	BARRINGTON MOXIE
23		
24		
25		

- 1 MR. STECKER: Okay. Good evening. The time is
- 2 7:09 p.m. and it is Wednesday, June 22nd. We're in the New
- 3 Rochelle City Hall and in the City Hall Conference Room for
- 4 the public meeting in the Westchester Rent Guidelines Board
- 5 to receive the presentations.
- 6 I'll turn it over to you, Chair Rubin.
- 7 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. Good evening, everyone.
- 8 My name is Elsa Rubin, I'm the Chair of the Westchester
- 9 Rent Guidelines Board. Tonight we are going to hear the
- 10 presentations of the tenant and owner representatives
- 11 regarding rent guidelines for leases commencing or renewed
- 12 between October 1st, 2022 and September 30th, 2023.
- I will now call -- I will now take roll call.
- 14 Please respond if you're present. I'm going to do this in
- 15 alphabetical order as I always do it.
- 16 Velene Acquah --
- MS. ACQUAH: Present.
- 18 CHAIR RUBIN: -- public member?
- MS. ACQUAH: Present.
- 20 CHAIR RUBIN: Lamont Badru, public member?
- MR. BADRU: Here.
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Eddie Mae Barnes is not going to be
- 23 here tonight. She's excused.
- 24 Eliot Cherson, owner representative?
- MR. CHERSON: Here.

1 Kenneth Finger, owner representative? CHAIR RUBIN: 2 MR. FINGER: Here. 3 CHAIR RUBIN: Sylvia Hamer, owner representative? 4 MS. HAMER: Here. 5 CHAIR RUBIN: Evelyn Santiago, public member? 6 MS. SANTIAGO: Present. 7 CHAIR RUBIN: Tamara Stewart, tenant representative? 8 MS. STEWART: Present. 9 CHAIR RUBIN: And I'm Elsa Rubin, public member. 10 Let the record show that we have a quorum. 11 I will now ask our counsel, Mr. Peter Stecker, if 12 he has any announcements. 13 MR. STECKER: Good evening, Chair. The only 14 announcement is that on Monday, June 27th, there will be the final meeting for this Board. It will be here in the New 15 16 Rochelle City Hall Conference Room B-1, which is downstairs and that will be at 7:00. That will be for the rebuttal 17 presentations and for the final vote. 18 19 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. 20 MR. STECKER: And that's all I have. 21 CHAIR RUBIN: So I welcome all of you. I welcome the 22 people who have taken time out of your busy schedules to be 23 here with us and I have to remind you that this is a public 24 meeting but not a hearing. So the attendant -- the people 25 attending cannot participate, just listen. And I don't know

- 1 if the tenants and the owners have agreed who's going to go
- 2 first in the presentation.
- 3 MR. CHERSON: Who went first last year?
- 4 CHAIR RUBIN: I don't remember.
- 5 MR. FINGER: You know what, I don't mind going
- 6 first. Do you want to go first?
- 7 MS. STEWART: Fine with me, Ken. It's your world.
- 8 MR. FINGER: I'll go first.
- 9 CHAIR RUBIN: So I'm going to start -- we are going
- 10 to start the presentation. Each of the representatives are
- 11 going to have 20 minutes. Mr. Stecker will take the time.
- 12 And at the end of each presentation, the members of the
- 13 Board will have the opportunity to make comments or ask
- 14 questions.
- And with that said, I'm going to let Ms. Stewart
- 16 start.
- 17 MS. STEWART: Mr. Finger says he would like to go
- 18 first.
- 19 MR. FINGER: No, I don't have to go first. I'm
- 20 okay with that.
- 21 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay. So Mr. Finger will go first.
- 22 MR. CHERSON: We should reverse it on Monday.
- 23 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah.
- 24 MR. FINGER: Okay. Am I ready to start?
- 25 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.

- 1 MR. FINGER: Is the clock going? Good.
- 2 Madam Chairperson and members of the board, thank
- 3 you again for the opportunity to address you at the end of
- 4 the hearings. I don't want to be overly dramatic, but I
- 5 think that this year the future of affordable housing in
- 6 Westchester is in your hands. I think that the decision you
- 7 will make is one of the most significant decisions this
- 8 Board has made in decades, if not more than that.
- 9 First, I want to review the Statute that gives the
- 10 Board the power to adjust the rents. And I quote, A County
- 11 Rent Guidelines Board shall establish an actual guidelines
- 12 for rent adjustments which shall be adjusted shall
- 13 consider -- and it says shall -- among other things.
- I. The economic condition of the residential
- 15 real estate industry in the effected area including such
- 16 factors as the prevailing and projected.
- 17 i. Real estate taxes and sewer and water
- 18 rates.
- ii. Gross operating maintenance cost
- 20 (including insurance rates, governmental fees, cost of fuel
- 21 and labor costs).
- 22 iii. Costs and availability of financing
- 23 (including effective rates of interest).
- iv. Over-all supply of housing
- 25 accommodations and over-all vacancy rates.

- 1 II. Relevant data from the current and projected
- 2 cost of living industries for the affected area and such
- 3 other data as may be available to it.
- 4 So before we get to the proverbial elephant in the
- 5 room, the CPI, Consumer Price Index, let's look at some
- 6 other factors that have affected the industry.
- 7 First, the Housing Stability and Tenant Protection
- 8 Act, HSTPA, has had a devastating impact on our rental
- 9 housing industry. Not only has this happened, but with the
- 10 pandemic it was even worse than forecast. The HSTPA
- 11 prohibited rent increases of vacant apartments which used
- 12 to be 20 percent plus longevity increases. What this has
- done is tenants do not move. Even if there's one elderly
- 14 tenant or non-elderly tenant in a three-bedroom apartment,
- 15 that tenant has no way to go to a smaller apartment that
- 16 is fixed up because the empty apartments are not getting
- 17 fixed up.
- 18 The Individual Apartment Improvement Increases,
- 19 IAI's, are virtually worthless. A maximum of \$15,000 in 15
- 20 years are no more than three separate payments totalling
- 21 \$15,000, which after 30 years you have to take off the rent
- 22 including any rental -- rent guideline increases on that
- 23 money. You can't renovate a bathroom for \$15,000. When a
- 24 30-year-old, 40-year-old, or 50-year-old apartment has a
- 25 tenant moving out in these mostly these 75 to 100 year old

- 1 buildings, who wants to move into an apartment with an old
- 2 kitchen; an old bathroom; old floors; lighting fixtures;
- 3 fuses; et cetera. None of this can be fixed now.
- 4 So what happens as you've heard, either apartments
- 5 are left vacant because the anticipated repairs in an old
- 6 apartment as well as the lack of availability of moderate
- 7 priced apartments are not done or no one wants to rent them
- 8 even if available. Or new tenants move into old unrenovated
- 9 apartments, which naturally now have increased repairs and
- 10 more maintenance. The extra income that used to be made --
- 11 that used to be available to make up for the lower than cost
- 12 of living rent guideline increases is no longer there.
- 13 The same is true for the condition of the
- 14 buildings. No longer is there adequate funding for MCI's
- or major capital improvement which is now capped at 2
- 16 percent a year. That doesn't even pay for the cost of
- 17 financing or major increase that could be hundreds of
- 18 thousands of dollars for boilers, or roof, or sidewalks, or
- 19 pointing, or windows.
- 20 The -- one of the interesting things of major
- 21 capital improvements that you may not be aware of -- and I'm
- 22 going to read this from the Homes and Community Renewal Fact
- 23 Sheet, No. 24, and I quote, MCI increases are prohibited for
- 24 buildings with 35 percent or fewer rent regulated units. So
- 25 if you have a building with less than 35 percent where those

- 1 units are rent regulated, you can't get an MCI even if you
- 2 need it. Even if it's a big building or a small building.
- 3 Secondly, the increase is temporary and must be removed from
- 4 the rent 30 years after the date the increase became
- 5 effective inclusive of any increases granted by the Rent
- 6 Guidelines Board. So what the government giveth, the
- 7 government taketh it away.
- 8 So now we have less housing, deteriorating
- 9 apartments and buildings and most significantly less
- 10 affordable housing. This is where our affordable housing
- is, in these older buildings that have -- are subject to
- 12 ETPA. That's the consequence of years of too low rent
- 13 guideline increases. What are other consequences? Well,
- 14 you heard suppliers say less work for local tradesman in the
- 15 area. I guess one of the unintended consequences. Less
- 16 availability of supplies. Lumber has doubled in price if
- 17 not more and the so-called drip down effect which has
- 18 detrimentally effected many in the community from the
- 19 landlord to it's suppliers to it's tradesman, and ultimately
- 20 to the tenants.
- 21 A reasonable rent increase will help maintain this
- 22 housing stock which again is the backbone of our affordable
- 23 housing. Another minimal increase will just lead to more
- 24 deterioration of the housing, less affordable housing, and
- 25 less housing for young families. When you look at the

- 1 statistics handed by HCR you see that every year there are
- 2 less and less units, this is the reason. This year, hardly
- 3 any tenants complained about the rent. Sure, we'll help pay
- 4 tenant advocates like Michael McKee, who couldn't even get
- 5 New York City to listen to him, as the New York City Rent
- 6 Guidelines Board gave increases of 3.5 percent for one year
- 7 and 5 percent for two years. In fact, we had actually
- 8 tenants who recognized the need for an increase.
- We're not arguing the concept of rent regulation,
- 10 that's something we live with. If we were to argue the
- 11 merits, we could point to literally hundred and thousands of
- 12 articles of studies that show that rent regulations is
- 13 self-defeating and lessens the availability of affordable
- 14 housing. And ETPA and the pandemic just magnifies it.
- To quote one article in a Brooklyn Institution
- 16 Study dated October 2018, Rebecca Diamond, an Associate
- 17 Professor of Economics, Stanford Graduate School of Business
- 18 reported on the deleterious effects of rent control. And I
- 19 quote her, "Once a tenant has secured a rent-controlled
- 20 apartment, he may not choose to move in the future and give
- 21 up his rent control, even if his housing needs change. This
- 22 misallocation can lead to empty-nest households living in
- 23 family sized apartments and young families crammed into
- 24 small studios, clearly an inefficient allocation.
- 25 Similarly, if rental rates are below market rates, renters

- 1 may choose to consume excessive quantities of housing. Rent
- 2 control can also lead to decay of rental housing stock;
- 3 landlords may not invest in maintenance because they can't
- 4 recoup the investment by raising rents."
- 5 This 2018 article is precedent as to our situation
- 6 in Westchester. The Westchester owners you heard testify
- 7 were given living proof to the fact that the almost zero
- 8 increase of the last year and the zero of the year before
- 9 and the minimal increases of the last six years, which is an
- 10 average of about 1 percent for one-year leases and 1.5
- 11 percent for two-year leases, coupled with the loss of
- 12 vacancy increases, preferential increases on lease renewals
- 13 has lead to the following:
- Number 1, leaving low rent apartments vacant -- and
- 15 you heard this multiple times -- which results of less
- 16 affordable housing and less housing for young families.
- 17 Two, deterioration of buildings and inability to
- 18 afford supplies as well as renovations and repairs. You
- 19 also heard that certain landlords have testified that during
- 20 the pandemic, such as Mr. Rose, they worked with tenants
- 21 during the whole pandemic.
- Three, lack of capital improvement such as not only
- 23 roofs, boilers, and heating systems which will lead to
- 24 further deterioration. That's our rent 2 percent annual
- 25 payback notwithstanding.

- 1 Four, lack of modernization apartments due to a
- 2 lack of IAI increases sufficient to justify an expenditure.
- Five, lack of work for local tradesman. The
- 4 tenants wanted to eliminate vacancy increases which didn't
- 5 hurt existing tenants and be careful what you wish for, it
- 6 subsidized the lack of yearly reasonably yearly increases is
- 7 now gone.
- 8 The figures show you that the rent increases are
- 9 nowhere near the cost of living increase for the last 10
- 10 years and now the cost of living has gone up to 8.6 percent
- 11 over the last year. And while we know that hits everybody,
- 12 look at who it really hits. Fuel costs, the major expense
- 13 to landlords has gone up over 100 percent over the last
- 14 year. Even natural gas has increased over 30 percent. And
- 15 we know that you can't switch to natural gas in Westchester
- 16 because Con Ed has a moratorium.
- 17 The largest expense in the -- the largest item in
- 18 the expense category for landlords is fuel. And while last
- 19 year it went down 12 percent, it went up 15 percent in this
- 20 survey, which is an increase of over 27 percent to landlords
- 21 since 2019. We also see that insurance went up 9 percent
- 22 and Mr. Schiciano testified that it's expected to go up at
- 23 least another 10 percent this year. Repairs went down 10
- 24 percent last year, have gone up over 11 percent this year.
- 25 An increase over two years since 19 -- 2019, rather, of over

- 1 20 percent. And they'll continue to increase because
- 2 landlords have no choice but to patch and band-aid the
- 3 buildings without MCI's.
- 4 This is the price of low rent guidelines over the
- 5 years 1 percent average. The price index for operating
- 6 cost, which you got early on in this proceeding, indicated
- 7 that the CPI adjusted net operating income commencement
- 8 adjustment was calculated to be 4.5 percent for one year and
- 9 9 percent for two years. What this -- what this adjustment
- 10 mans is that just to stay even with the cost of living,
- 11 there would have to be a 4.5 percent increase for one year
- 12 and 9 percent for two years. But that's not our number
- 13 because we know how that the cost of living that they use
- 14 was 4 percent and now it's 8.6 percent. And if we were to
- 15 look at the adjustment, it would be significantly over 4.5
- 16 percent for one year and 9 percent for two years. So if we
- 17 would adjust the (inaudible) rent, it would be well over
- 18 that -- those numbers. Anything less than that means that
- 19 the owners are going backwards and you will have further
- 20 building and apartment deterioration.
- 21 Look at the owners who testified. Everyone of them
- 22 assisted in working with their tenants affected by a
- 23 pandemic, but they said almost unanimously that they need an
- 24 8 percent increased to one year and 12 percent for two
- 25 years. Even if we just count inflation, is 8.6 percent just

- 1 to stay even.
- 2 Let's remember that we're all in this conundrum
- 3 together. The tenants and the landlords are in a classic
- 4 symbiotic relationship. Tenants need the housing, landlords
- 5 want to provide it, but have to have sufficient income to
- 6 justify not putting the money in the stock market or another
- 7 business. The senior citizen rep from the County repeated
- 8 that housing is needed and must be kept up. We agree, but
- 9 it's up to this Board to give sufficient increase to allow
- 10 that. Moreover, as she testified, if the tenant qualifies
- 11 and that means earns sufficiently low income and that
- 12 generally is up to \$50,000 although the town of Greenburgh,
- 13 I believe, only has it at \$40,000, they should be ashamed,
- 14 the tenant will get a SCRIE, Senior Citizen Subsidy which
- 15 eliminates any increase. Thus, if you grant an increase
- 16 here and the tenant is rent burdened making under \$50,000
- 17 and is qualified for either SCRIE, senior citizen, or DRIE a
- 18 disabled type of adjustment, they will not get any increase
- 19 at all. That's what SCRIE and DRIE do.
- 20 So these low-income senior tenants or disabled
- 21 tenants are absolutely protected. The HSTPA has said, as
- 22 we've said, eliminated vacancy increases which enabled the
- 23 landlords to subsidize the very minimal rent quideline
- 24 increase in past years and the elimination of virtually
- 25 major capital, individual apartment improvements, high rent,

- 1 high income increases does not even begin to give us the
- 2 suffering that the landlords will under going because of the
- 3 low rent guideline increases over the years.
- 4 So let's look a little more at the testimony and
- 5 the numbers. Looking at the survey, repairs increased by
- 6 over 11 percent from a decrease of 10.4 percent the year
- 7 before to an increase of 2019 of 21.5 percent over the 2
- 8 years. And you'll note that while total expenses increased
- 9 to a total of 5 percent, the income only increased 1.4
- 10 percent. And that loss of 3.6 percent without even
- 11 considering our 8.6 percent inflation rate.
- 12 If you add in depreciation, which you do need for
- 13 the reserves that landlords all said that they have to dip
- 14 into now, that comes to over 10 percent increase expenses
- 15 which is the 5.7 percent excluding depreciation, plus 5
- 16 percent depreciation. Who suffers from the HSTPA?
- 17 Everyone. Owners and tenants. Who suffers from losing the
- 18 IAI's and the MCI's? Everyone. Owners and tenants.
- 19 Landlords no longer have the money that they used
- 20 to use to modernize vacant apartments and tenants aren't
- 21 getting modern vacant apartments. You might also know that
- 22 there is, as I pointed out, a significant decrease in the
- 23 number of ETPA units. Well why not? Who wants to invest or
- 24 own a building where the spiral is to leave the owner with
- 25 less and less.

- We agree there are less units, there shouldn't be,
- 2 but who's going to invest in an old and deteriorating
- 3 75-year-old, 100-year-old building when the income is
- 4 insufficient and profit is a dirty word.
- 5 As we now know, rather than what the Mount Vernon
- 6 CFO reported, ERAP moneys were reported as rent income
- 7 regardless of whether or not there was a separate line item.
- 8 There was no need for that. ERAP is income and was so
- 9 reported. And regarding to a presentation for analysis was
- 10 predicated on 100 percent of the rents being legal regulated
- 11 rents, which we all know is fictitious since the significant
- 12 percentage of landlords give preferential rents.
- 13 Peter, where am I on the timing?
- 14 MR. STECKER: About three minutes left.
- 15 MR. FINGER: Three minutes left? Okay. I'll talk
- 16 really fast.
- 17 MR. STECKER: You want to give him a little more
- 18 time?
- 19 CHAIR RUBIN: If you need more time, I --
- 20 MR. FINGER: All right. And we have no problem
- 21 with giving the tenants as much time as they need.
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Sure. That should be the case.
- 23 MR. FINGER: Why should an owner invest in work if
- 24 you can't make money? Even the 1199 representative who
- 25 would seek to prevent a rent increase does not take the same

- 1 position as her own employees, which you know from her
- 2 testimony last year received an average of 3 percent a year
- 3 compounded over 3 years, which is more than 9 percent for
- 4 the 3 years. If you want the number of ETPA units to go
- 5 down to zero, we will -- we should keep penalizing the
- 6 landlords. If you want more affordable housing, then you
- 7 must at least provide people with an incentive to purchase,
- 8 renovate, rehabilitate, and construct affordable housing.
- 9 The minimum rent increases or none can no longer be
- 10 made up with vacancy increases. High income decontrol,
- 11 those have been eliminated. So if a tenant is making
- 12 \$100,000 a year -- or \$500,000 a year, that tenant still has
- 13 the benefit of the ETPA. Who's hurt? Young families, newly
- 14 weds, those looking for affordable housing. Those buildings
- 15 which are subject to ETPA are our affordable housing. Not
- 16 the fancy high rises going up all over Westchester and all
- 17 you have to do is look around here in New Rochelle, but
- 18 these 100-year-old buildings that take more and more
- 19 maintenance which they're no longer getting.
- 20 Which landlords are really getting it in the
- 21 (inaudible)? 51 percent of all rent regulated in
- 22 Westchester are 20 units or less. The ma and pa buildings
- 23 of family ownership. If we include those under 50 units,
- 24 it's 80 percent of all building subject to ETPA. While
- 25 we're looking at small landlords, large landlords also have

- 1 to bear the burden of double digit increase in insurance,
- 2 taxes, utilities, water, and the like. And their tenants
- 3 are also suffering as are the landlords.
- 4 Given a substantial loss of income due to HSTPA and
- 5 the pandemic, we believe the Board should grant a reasonable
- 6 increase to avoid a -- situation or the '70's where
- 7 buildings become abandoned and deteriorate. We don't want
- 8 that to happen in Westchester. The vacancy money is no
- 9 longer there. The minimum guidelines increases, which
- 10 we've -- I've said total about 5 percent over the last 5 or
- 11 6 years in total combined are not enough to maintain the
- 12 buildings. The expenses have increased substantially more
- 13 than income and the landlord no longer has the safety net of
- 14 vacancy increases, MCI's, and IAI's to the additional
- 15 income.
- 16 If we want to -- landlords to provide properly
- 17 maintained and adequately repaired buildings, we have to
- 18 give them reasonable increases and those increases should be
- 19 8 percent for one year, 12 percent for a two-year lease. In
- 20 2016 and '17, we had zero and .5 percent, maintenance was
- 21 substantially down at that time.
- I need about another three, four minutes.
- 23 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
- 24 MR. FINGER: There will be virtually no capital or
- 25 apartment improvements, maintenance, renovations,

- 1 restoration without a reasonable guideline. The MCI's and
- 2 IAI's, if they're done at all, you have a 1, 168th, or 100
- 3 payback for MCI's with a 2 percent cap. 2 percent doesn't
- 4 even pay the interest. As stated, the mortgage and interest
- 5 payments are not reflected as out-of-pocket and cost of
- 6 income chart which also reduces the amount of vacant
- 7 available for landlords.
- 8 As far as ERAP is concerned, we've discussed that
- 9 already, but as Tim Foley had testified before, that only
- 10 clears or arrears to tenants for a maximum of 15 months.
- 11 Materials for repairs are up, lumber is up 100 percent,
- 12 appliances, windows, doors are unavailable. Lisa DeRosa
- 13 testified that she had to cancel environmental green repairs
- 14 and renovations where she was putting in new windows for two
- 15 floors every year because the money isn't there anymore.
- 16 That not only hurts the tenants, it hurts the environment.
- 17 We lost that -- landlords lost considerable arrears that
- 18 couldn't be approved. We need those increases.
- 19 Ms. Ciuffetelli says this is a family owned
- 20 industry to a large extent. They provide affordable
- 21 housing, that's their livelihood. Landlords need -- as I've
- 22 said -- at least a guideline that matches the cost of living
- 23 of 8.6 percent. In actuality, rent controls and low rent
- 24 quidelines have the perverse effect of actually creating
- 25 less affordable housing. Many tenants gain a system remain

- 1 in their housing while having second homes and use
- 2 succession rights to deny young families affording housing.
- 3 It also has a deleterious effect on the community of single
- 4 family owners because if the value of the property goes
- 5 down, the tax burden has to be made up by the single family
- 6 homeowners. The cost to income chart, which is selectively
- 7 used by a tenants rep, excludes such expenses such as
- 8 mortgage amortization and who can carry a building without
- 9 having a mortgage? Establishments of reserves the capital
- 10 improvements, if you're going to have to do it. MCI's that
- 11 don't get MCI's or major capital improvements, rather, that
- 12 don't get MCI's. Many of these landlords only have limited
- 13 profit, if any, because they self-manage. And even the
- 14 larger landlords who don't self-manage provide jobs for many
- 15 of our citizens.
- 16 The cumulative effect of no -- almost no
- increases is destroying the affordable housing stock in
- 18 Westchester. Owners can't survive with minimal increases.
- 19 If we don't give them a reasonable increase, as I've
- 20 suggested, we're going to look and talk about going to the
- 21 Bronx of the '70's with abandoned buildings throughout the
- 22 County. And I remember that well. It was not a good time
- 23 for real estate, not a good time for tenants and landlords
- 24 in the state, city, and area.
- 25 The -- if we want people to invest and improve our

- 1 housing, we have to have the kind of increase I've
- 2 suggested. The failure to guarantee a reasonable profit
- 3 will drive out responsible landlords and leave us with
- 4 people cutting corners just to stay even. That doesn't work
- 5 to anyone's benefit. The cost of rent control are borne by
- 6 landlords, borne by tenants, borne by work people, borne by
- 7 contractors all down the line in the County. It leads to
- 8 housing shortages.
- 9 We only have to look at some other cities in the
- 10 country where rent control was lifted, such as Boston where
- 11 vacancy rates are over 7 percent. I ask that you consider
- 12 the deleterious effects of the HSTPA which virtually wiped
- 13 out any income increase but for this Board's guideline
- 14 increase. It all depends on you the public members of this
- 15 board. I submit that you consider the data, statutory
- 16 factors in exercising your fiduciary obligation to protect
- 17 the multifamily rent regulated affordable housing industry
- 18 with a fair and reasonable rent increase of 8 percent for
- 19 one year and 12 percent for two years.
- 20 Let this Board act to keep affordable housing in
- 21 Westchester. The future of Westchester affordable housing
- 22 is in the hands of this Board. Thank you very much and
- 23 thank you for the extra time.
- 24 CHAIR RUBIN: It was five minutes extra. So the
- 25 tenant representative will get five minutes extra.

```
1
              Mr. Finger, do you have copies of your presentation
 2
    or can you send them to us by e-mail?
 3
              MR. FINGER: Yeah, I'll send it to you. It's a
 4
     little lengthy. I cut out some stuff, but in essence, I'll
 5
     send it.
 6
              CHAIR RUBIN: Okay.
 7
                           If you like, I'll distribute it to the
              MR. FINGER:
8
    Board.
9
              CHAIR RUBIN: Yes please. You may send it to
10
    Mr. Stecker.
11
                           I'll send it to Peter.
              MR. FINGER:
12
              CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah, and he can send it to us.
13
                           Okay.
             MR. FINGER:
14
              CHAIR RUBIN:
                            Thank you.
             MR. FINGER: And thank you for the extra time.
15
16
              CHAIR RUBIN: Any questions -- any questions from the
17
    board members to Mr. Finger?
18
              No?
19
              If that's the case, then Ms. Stewart, your turn.
20
              MS. STEWART:
                            Thank you.
21
              CHAIR RUBIN:
                           And you did bring --
22
             MS. STEWART:
                           Should I -- I follow instructions.
23
              CHAIR RUBIN: You can -- thank you. I appreciate
24
    that.
```

25

MS. STEWART: While you're passing that around, I

- 1 will go ahead and start.
- 2 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 3 MS. STEWART: Good evening --
- 4 CHAIR RUBIN: You get 25 minutes.
- 5 MS. STEWART: Won't need anywhere near that long.
- 6 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay.
- 7 MS. STEWART: Good evening Chairwoman Rubin, fellow
- 8 board members, Counsel Stecker, and members of the public.
- 9 Sylvia and I are truly glad to see all of our colleagues in
- 10 person after two years of virtual meetings. The pandemic
- 11 has been challenging for all of us and we're relieved to see
- 12 that you are all well.
- 13 I'd like to start by putting this body's pending
- 14 decision in context. We are living through a truly historic
- 15 time that will spoken and written about for generations to
- 16 come. In less than three years COVID 19 has been
- 17 responsible for more than 7 million deaths globally with
- 18 family and friends left grieving for more than 1 million of
- 19 other fellow Americans. In New York State alone we lost
- 20 almost 69,000 people. Vladimir Putin is waging a brutal
- 21 unprovoked war in Ukraine. Indiscriminately torturing and
- 22 killing civilians in a conflict that could potentially
- 23 trigger World War III. Inflation is higher than it's been
- 24 in decades weakening everyone's buying power and forcing
- 25 tenants and landlords to take long hard looks at our budgets

- 1 to prioritize our spending.
- 2 Just today, the news is reporting that funding for
- 3 the Child Nutrition Waiver Program that has kept millions of
- 4 children fed over the past two years is said to expire at
- 5 the end of this month. While American democracy is under
- 6 assault from domestic terrorists who are willing to cease
- 7 power through violence if necessary. The constitution be
- 8 dammed.
- 9 Within this inaudible) of earthshaking events, our
- 10 power is limited and our ability to help those who are
- 11 suffering the most is small. Nonetheless, Sylvia and I are
- 12 confident that this body will search it's collective
- 13 consciousness to do the right thing. We strongly encourage
- 14 you to take the time to read through the meticulously
- 15 researched and carefully prepared packets provided by
- 16 Genevieve Roche. Prior to her current role as CFO of Mount
- 17 Vernon on United Tenants, Ms. Roche served admirably as a
- 18 tenant representative on this board, so she has both
- 19 experience and expertise in analyzing the self-reported
- 20 owner survey numbers provided by the DHCR stats team
- 21 combined with data from the National Low Income Housing
- 22 Coalition, the U.S. Census Bureau, and other reputable
- 23 sources.
- It is unfortunate that the five minute speaking
- 25 limit prevented Ms. Roche from walking this Board through

- 1 her analysis in greater detail; however, you're more than
- 2 welcome to send her any followup questions that you may
- 3 have.
- 4 We would like to remind you of several important
- 5 points covered in Ms. Roche's testimony. One, landlords
- 6 continue to thrive. Net operating income, NOI, is the most
- 7 appropriate measure for across the board comparisons of how
- 8 much profit owners have after paying for their expenses
- 9 particularly because not all owners have mortgages. The
- 10 average NOI from 2019 through 2021 was 38.68 percent,
- 11 demonstrating that owners continued to yield healthy, net
- 12 operating incomes despite the pandemic, inflation, HSTPA,
- 13 the price of oil, insurance increases, labor costs, and the
- 14 various other factors presented by owner advocates.
- Two, there are no affordable apartments. The New
- 16 York metro area which includes Westchester County is short
- 17 620,000 housing units. This shortage is placing upward
- 18 pressure on rents and there just isn't enough affordable
- 19 housing for low-income households while many higher-income
- 20 households are opting to rent rather than buy their housing.
- 21 Unfortunately, lower-income renters frequently lose out to
- 22 higher-income renters who are more attracted potential
- 23 tenants to many landlords.
- 24 Three, disparity in levels of poverty income and
- 25 the impact of inflation. The k-shaped pandemic recovery

- 1 combined with the imminent threat of recession on the heels
- 2 of levels of an inflation not seen in 40 years continue to
- 3 hit low-income workers hardest. Despite gains in employment
- 4 since the height of the pandemic, we are not back to
- 5 pre-pandemic levels, especially in Mount Vernon, New
- 6 Rochelle, and Yonkers. And tenants are still using up
- 7 savings and relying on credit cards to cover necessities and
- 8 forced all evictions now that the eviction moratorium has
- 9 expired.
- 10 Several landlords seem to misunderstand Ms. Roche's
- 11 point about the \$43 million dollars in ERAP and LRAP funds
- 12 that Westchester landlords received. While some landlords
- 13 may have included ERAP or LRAP funds as rental income on
- 14 their surveys, there was no requirement to account for the
- 15 funds on the surveys and DHCR didn't even include a question
- 16 about ERAP, LRAP, or PPP on this years surveys.
- 17 At a minimum, owners collectively lost only nine
- 18 tenths of one percent in rent while continuing to net close
- 19 to 40 percent. Add to that additional ERAP and LRAP funds
- 20 that owners will receive in 2022 and 2023 and we have every
- 21 reason to believe that landlords are going to continue to
- 22 thrive. NBUT Executive Director Dennis Hanratty's testimony
- 23 asked us to review the Westchester County Housing Needs
- 24 Assessment that was published in 2019, which underscored the
- 25 lack of affordable housing, documenting the 41.4 percent of

- 1 households that are severely rent burdened, noted the more
- 2 than 9 percent of household living in poverty before the
- 3 pandemic and raves alarms about the 94 percent of our
- 4 counties homeless families that live in Mount Vernon, New
- 5 Rochelle, Peekskill, White Plaines, and Yonkers.
- 6 Many low-income and rent-burdened tenants live in
- 7 rent stabilized buildings and they regularly visit food
- 8 pantries like Project Hope in New Rochelle where Sylvia
- 9 works. Raising rents on these tenants will almost surely
- 10 result in more missed meals and even greater food insecurity
- 11 for the most vulnerable.
- 12 Michael McKee's testimony reminds us that everyone
- 13 is affected by inflation. Both landlords and tenants. He
- 14 also encouraged us to think about potential increases in
- 15 dollar rather than percentage terms because rent increases
- 16 are real numbers that will have a real impact on tenants who
- 17 are struggling with paying more every time they go grocery
- 18 shopping, pay utility bills, or fill up at the gas station.
- 19 Ronnie Cox's testimony on behalf of seniors
- 20 passionately remind us that all of us, should we be
- 21 fortunate enough to live long enough, will become seniors
- 22 and will likely have to live on a fixed income once we stop
- 23 working. Like Ronnie, I regularly speak with seniors and
- 24 their caregiver's and many seniors are struggling to make
- 25 their Social Security and pension checks cover their growing

- 1 expenses for rent, food, transportation, and medicine while
- 2 simultaneously battling health challenges and trying not to
- 3 be a burden on friends and family members.
- 4 1199SEIU's delegate Antoinette Rose somberly told
- 5 us that our healthcare heros are still having a hard time
- 6 recovering from a continuing pandemic. She let us know that
- 7 some single tenants have to live with roommates because they
- 8 can't afford to pay their rent without financial help and
- 9 that sometimes these arrangements don't work. Although
- 10 Ms. Rose has been steadily employed for more than 20 years,
- 11 she is among the tens of thousands of severely rent-burdened
- 12 ETPA tenants that are counting on this Board not to make it
- 13 even harder for them to pay their bills.
- 14 Sylvia and I hope that you made note of the
- 15 disrespectful attitude displayed by several landlords and
- 16 their advocates. Some tenants don't attend our hearings
- 17 because they're afraid of retaliation by their landlords and
- 18 we can see why they might have a good reason to feel that
- 19 way. Several owners who asked for historically high
- 20 increases above 8 percent were also dismissive of the
- 21 difference this level of increase would make demonstrating a
- 22 lack of appreciation and even tone deafness to the sacrifice
- 23 such large increases would be for the tenants who live in
- 24 their buildings.
- 25 While we're all dealing with inflation that's

- 1 presently topping 8 percent, we're not all aware of any
- 2 one's salary that is pegged point for point to inflation and
- 3 that reality is unlikely to change.
- 4 It's clear that many landlords consider their near
- 5 40 percent NOI as sect growth and they expect tenants to
- 6 make sacrifices to maintain owner's status quo. It should
- 7 also be clear that in the current housing shortage
- 8 environment, the value of buildings is going up, not down.
- 9 Whether they want to admit it or not, owners with tangible
- 10 real estate assets are in a far better position to weather
- 11 the current storms than tenants without tangible real estate
- 12 assets. We understand that some small buildings owners that
- 13 their forbearers worked hard to build assets and create
- 14 wealth for their future generations. We respectfully remind
- 15 owners that many of our forbearers' worked equally hard but
- 16 were not allowed to create generational wealth for their
- 17 descendants.
- 18 Returning to the question of context. It's clear
- 19 that we're all fortunate to be alive; housed; fed; and not
- 20 in harms way. Unfortunately, this body does not have the
- 21 power to address any of the most challenge problems facing
- 22 the world's health, our country's economy, the war in
- 23 Ukrain, or internal threats to American democracy. What we
- 24 do have the power and opportunity to do is to not make
- 25 difficult times worse for the people who have the least

- 1 cushion to weather these storms. If you can't see your way
- 2 to freezing rents for at least one more year, which is
- 3 absolutely justified by the owner NOI of nearly 40 percent,
- 4 then at least see your way to passing minimal increases like
- 5 Rockland County, which passed a half percent for one year
- 6 and three quarters of a percent for two-year lease renewals
- 7 last night. We can enable many of our struggling bred
- 8 winners a bit more time to catch their breathes and find
- 9 better paying jobs to help them care for themselves and
- 10 their families.
- 11 We can provide Westchester's growing senior
- 12 population with a bit more peace of mind that they'll be
- 13 able to afford their rent next year. We have another
- 14 opportunity to do the right thing. I urge you to pass zero
- 15 percent increases on both one and two-year lease renewals.
- 16 Thank you.
- 17 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you Ms. Stewart. Any comments or
- 18 questions from the board members?
- 19 No?
- 20 So I didn't think this was going to be this easy.
- 21 MR. FINGER: It was shorter than last nights.
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Oh, definitely shorter than last night.
- 23 So if there are no other comments, may I ask for a motion to
- 24 adjourn the meeting?
- 25 Second?

```
This meeting is adjourned. Thank you. We'll see
 1
 2
        you on Monday.
    (Whereupon the proceeding concluded until Monday, June 27,
 3
    2022.)
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	CERTIFICATE
2	The prior proceedings were transcribed from audio
3	files and have been transcribed to the best of my
4	ability. I further certify that I am not connected by
5	blood, marriage, or employment with any of the parties
6	herein nor interested directly or indirectly in the
7	matter transcribed.
8	
9	Marisa D'Antonio
10	MARISA D'ANTONIO
11	
12	DATE: 06/29/2022
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Index: \$100,000..adjust

	– 21.5 14:7	
\$	_ 22nd 2:2	7
\$100,000 16:12	24 7:23	7 20:11 22:17
\$15,000 6:19,21,23	25 22:4	70's 17:6 19:21
\$40,000 13:13	27 11:20 30:3	75 6:25
\$43 25:11	27th 3:14	75-year-old 15:3
\$50,000 13:12,16		7:00 3:17
\$500,000 16:12	3	7:09 2:2
	- 3 16:2,3,4	
1	_ 3.5 9:6	8
1 10:10,14 12:5 18:2 22:18	3.6 14:10	8 12:24 17:19 20:18 27:20 28:1
1.4 14:9	30 6:21 8:4 11:14	8.6 11:10 12:14,25 14:11 18:23
1.5 10:10	30-year-old 6:24	80 16:24
10 11:9,23 14:14	30th 2:12	
10.4 14:6	35 7:24,25	9
100 6:25 11:13 15:10 18:2,11	38.68 24:10	9 11:21 12:9,12,16 16:3 26:2
100-year-old 15:3 16:18		94 26:3
11 11:24 14:6	4	
1199 15:24	4 12:14	A
1199seiu's 27:4	4.5 12:8,11,15	abandoned 17:7 19:21
12 11:19 12:24 17:19 20:19	40 25:2,19 28:5 29:3	ability 23:10
15 6:19 11:19 18:10	40-year-old 6:24	absolutely 13:21 29:3
168th 18:2	41.4 25:25	accommodations 5:25
17 17:20		account 25:14
19 11:25 22:16	5	Acquah 2:16,17,19
1st 2:12	5 9:7 14:9,15 17:10,20	act 6:8 20:20
	5.7 14:15	actual 5:11
2	- 50 16:23	actuality 18:23
2 7:15 10:24 14:7 18:3	50-year-old 6:24	add 14:12 25:19
20 4:11 6:12 12:1 16:22 27:10	51 16:21	additional 17:14 25:19
2016 17:20		address 5:3 28:21
2018 9:16 10:5	6	adequate 7:14
2019 11:21,25 14:7 24:10 25:24	6 17:11	adequately 17:17
2021 24:10	620,000 24:17	adjourn 29:24
2022 2:12 25:20 30:4	69,000 22:20	adjourned 30:1
2023 2:12 25:20		adjust 5:10 12:17

Index: adjusted..buying

adjusted 5:12 12:7 appliances 18:12 bear 17:1 adjustment 12:8,9,15 13:18 appreciation 27:22 **begin** 14:1 adjustments 5:12 approved 18:18 **behalf** 26:19 admirably 23:17 area 5:15 6:2 8:15 19:24 24:16 benefit 16:13 20:5 admit 28:9 **argue** 9:10 **biq** 8:2 advocates 9:4 24:14 27:16 arguing 9:9 bills 26:18 27:13 **affected** 6:2,6 12:22 26:13 arrangements 27:9 **bit** 29:8.12 afford 10:18 27:8 29:13 arrears 18:10,17 **board** 2:4,9 3:15 4:13 5:2,8,10,11 8:6 9:6 13:9 17:5 20:15,20,22 21:8, affordable 5:5 8:10.22.24 9:13 article 9:15 10:5 17 22:8 23:18,25 24:7 27:12 29:18 10:16 16:6,8,14,15 18:20,25 19:17 articles 9:12 **Board's** 20:13 20:17,20,21 24:15,18 25:25 ashamed 13:13 affording 19:2 **body** 23:12 28:20 assault 23:6 afraid 27:17 body's 22:13 Assessment 25:24 agree 13:8 15:1 **boilers** 7:18 10:23 assets 28:10,12,13 **borne** 20:5.6 agreed 4:1 assisted 12:22 ahead 22:1 **Boston** 20:10 Associate 9:16 alarms 26:3 breathes 29:8 attend 27:16 alive 28:19 **bred** 29:7 attendant 3:24 allocation 9:24 **bring** 21:21 attending 3:25 allowed 28:16 **Bronx** 19:21 attitude 27:15 alphabetical 2:15 Brooklyn 9:15 attracted 24:22 American 23:5 28:23 **brutal** 22:20 availability 5:22 7:6 8:16 9:13 Americans 22:19 budgets 22:25 average 10:10 12:5 16:2 24:10 amortization 19:8 **build** 28:13 avoid 17:6 amount 18:6 **building** 7:25 8:2 12:20 14:24 15:3 aware 7:21 28:1 16:24 19:8 analysis 15:9 24:1 **buildings** 7:1,14,24 8:9,11 10:17 analyzing 23:19 В 12:3 16:14,18,22 17:7,12,17 19:21 announcement 3:14 26:7 27:24 28:8,12 **B-1** 3:16 burden 17:1 19:5 27:3 announcements 3:12 back 25:4 **annual** 10:24 burdened 13:16 26:1 backbone 8:22 anticipated 7:5 **Bureau** 23:22 backwards 12:19 **business** 9:17 13:7 Antoinette 27:4 Badru 2:20,21 anymore 18:15 **busy** 3:22 band-aid 12:2 **buy** 24:20 anyone's 20:5 Barnes 2:22 **buying** 22:24 **apartment** 6:14,15,18,24 7:1,6 9:20 12:20 13:25 17:25 **bathroom** 6:23 7:2

battling 27:2

apartments 6:11,16 7:4,7,9 8:9

9:23 10:14 11:1 14:20,21 24:15

considerable 18:17
constitution 23:7
construct 16:8
consume 10:1
Consumer 6:5
context 22:14 28:18
continue 12:1 24:6 25:2,21
continued 24:11
continuing 25:18 27:6
contractors 20:7
control 9:18,21 10:2 20:5,10
controls 18:23
conundrum 13:2
copies 21:1
corners 20:4
cost 5:19,20 6:2 7:11,16 11:9,10
12:6,10,13 18:5,22 19:6 20:5
25:1 costs 5:21,22 11:12 24:13
counsel 3:11 22:8
count 12:25
counties 26:4
o:3 counting 27:12
country 20:10
country's 28:22
County 5:10 13:7 19:22 20:7 24:16 25:23 29:5
coupled 10:11
cover 25:7 26:25
covered 24:5
COVID 22:16
Cox's 26:19
CPI 6:5 12:7
crammed 9:23
create 28:13,16
creating 18:24
credit 25:7 cumulative 19:16
,

Index: current..Evelyn

		index: CurrentEvery
current 6:1 23:16 28:7,11	DHCR 23:20 25:15	Economics 9:17
cushion 29:1	Diamond 9:16	economy 28:22
cut 21:4	difference 27:21	Ed 11:16
cutting 20:4	difficult 28:25	Eddie 2:22
	digit 17:1	effect 8:17 18:24 19:3,16
D	dip 14:13	effected 5:15 8:18
dammed 23:8	Director 25:22	effective 5:23 8:5
data 6:1,3 20:15 23:21	dirty 15:4	effects 9:18 20:12
date 8:4	disabled 13:18,20	elderly 6:13
dated 9:16	discussed 18:8	elephant 6:4
deafness 27:22	dismissive 27:20	eliminate 11:4
dealing 27:25	disparity 24:24	eliminated 13:22 16:11
deaths 22:17	displayed 27:15	eliminates 13:15
decades 5:8 22:24	disrespectful 27:15	elimination 13:24
decay 10:2	distribute 21:7	Eliot 2:24
decision 5:6 22:14	documenting 25:25	Elsa 2:8 3:9
decisions 5:7	dollar 26:15	employed 27:10
decontrol 16:10	dollars 7:18 25:11	employees 16:1
decrease 14:6,22	domestic 23:6	employment 25:3
delegate 27:4	doors 18:12	empty 6:16
deleterious 9:18 19:3 20:12	double 17:1	empty-nest 9:22
democracy 23:5 28:23	doubled 8:16	enable 29:7
demonstrating 24:11 27:21	downstairs 3:16	enabled 13:22
Dennis 25:22	dramatic 5:4	encourage 23:13
deny 19:2	DRIE 13:17,19	encouraged 26:14
depends 20:14	drip 8:17	end 4:12 5:3 23:5
depreciation 14:12,15,16	drive 20:3	environment 18:16 28:8
Derosa 18:12	due 11:1 17:4	environmental 18:13
descendants 28:17		—— equally 28:15
destroying 19:17	E	ERAP 15:6,8 18:8 25:11,13,16,19
detail 24:1	e-mail 21:2	essence 21:4
deteriorate 17:7	early 12:6	establish 5:11
deteriorating 8:8 15:2	earns 13:11	Establishments 19:9
deterioration 8:24 10:17,24 12:20	earthshaking 23:9	estate 5:15,17 19:23 28:10,11
detrimentally 8:18	easy 29:20	ETPA 8:12 9:14 14:23 16:4,13,15,24 27:12
devastating 6:8	economic 5:14	Evelyn 3:5

Index: evening..guidelines

evening 2:1,7 3:13 22:3,7	fed 23:4 28:19	future 5:5 9:20 20:21 28:14
events 23:9	feel 27:18	
everyone's 22:24	fees 5:20	G
eviction 25:8	fellow 22:7,19	gain 18:25
evictions 25:8	fewer 7:24	gains 25:3
excessive 10:1	fictitious 15:11	gas 11:14,15 26:18
excludes 19:7	fiduciary 20:16	gave 9:6
excluding 14:15	figures 11:8	generally 13:12
excused 2:23	fill 26:18	generational 28:16
Executive 25:22	final 3:15,18	generations 22:15 28:14
exercising 20:16	financial 27:8	Genevieve 23:16
existing 11:5	financing 5:22 7:17	give 9:20 13:9 14:1 15:12,17 17:18
expect 28:5	find 29:8	19:19
expected 11:22	Fine 4:7	giveth 8:6
expenditure 11:2	Finger 3:1,2 4:5,8,17,19,21,24 5:1	giving 15:21
expense 11:12,17,18	15:15,20,23 17:24 21:1,3,7,11,13, 15,17 29:21	glad 22:9
expenses 14:8,14 17:12 19:7 24:8	fixed 6:16,17 7:3 26:22	globally 22:17
27:1	fixtures 7:2	good 2:1,7 3:13 5:1 19:22,23 22:3,7 27:18
experience 23:19	floors 7:2 18:15	government 8:6,7
expertise 23:19	Foley 18:9	governmental 5:20
expire 23:4 expired 25:9	follow 21:22	Graduate 9:17
expired 25.9 extent 18:20	followup 24:2	grant 13:15 17:5
extra 7:10 20:23,24,25 21:15	food 26:7,10 27:1	granted 8:5
EXITA 7.10 20.23,24,23 21.13	forbearers 28:13	greater 24:1 26:10
F	forbearers' 28:15	green 18:13
facing 00.04	forced 25:8	Greenburgh 13:12
facing 28:21	forcing 22:24	grieving 22:18
fact 7:22 9:7 10:7 factors 5:16 6:6 20:16 24:14	forecast 6:10	grocery 26:17
	fortunate 26:21 28:19	Gross 5:19
failure 20:2 fair 20:18	freezing 29:2	growing 26:25 29:11
	frequently 24:21	growth 28:5
families 8:25 9:23 10:16 16:13 19:2 26:4 29:10	friends 22:18 27:3	guarantee 20:2
family 9:23 16:23 18:19 19:4,5	fuel 5:20 11:12,18	guess 8:15
22:18 27:3	funding 7:14 23:2	guideline 6:22 7:12 8:13 13:23 14:3
fancy 16:16	funds 25:11,13,15,19	18:1,22 20:13
fast 15:16	fuses 7:3	guidelines 2:4,9,11 5:11 8:6 9:6 12:4 17:9 18:24

	– hope 26:8 27:14	incomes 24:12
Н	_ housed 28:19	increase 7:17 8:3,4,21,23 9:8 10:8
half 29:5	household 26:2	11:9,20,25 12:1,11 13:9,15,18,24 14:7,14 15:25 17:1,6 19:19 20:1,13,
Hall 2:3 3:16	households 9:22 24:19,20 26:1	14,18 27:21
Hamer 3:3,4	housing 5:5,24 6:7,9 8:8,10,22,23,	increased 7:9 11:14 12:24 14:5,8,9
handed 9:1	24,25 9:14,21 10:1,2,16 13:4,8 16:6, 8,14,15 18:21,25 19:1,2,17 20:1,8,	17:12
hands 5:6 20:22	17,20,21 23:21 24:17,19,20 25:23,	increases 6:11,12,18,22 7:12,23 8:5,13 9:6 10:9,12 11:2,4,6,8 13:22
Hanratty's 25:22	25 28:7	14:1,3 16:9,10 17:9,14,18 18:18
happen 17:8	HSTPA 6:8,10 13:21 14:16 17:4 20:12 24:12	19:17,18 24:13 26:14,15 27:20,23 29:4,15
happened 6:9	hundred 9:11	index 6:5 12:5
hard 22:25 27:5 28:13,15	hundreds 7:17	Indiscriminately 22:21
harder 27:13	hurt 11:5 16:13	individual 6:18 13:25
hardest 25:3	hurts 18:16	industries 6:2
harms 28:20		industry 5:15 6:6,9 18:20 20:17
HCR 9:1	I	inefficient 9:24
health 27:2 28:22	IAI 11:2	inflation 12:25 14:11 22:23 24:12,
healthcare 27:5	IAI's 6:19 14:18 17:14 18:2	25 25:2 26:13 27:25 28:2
healthy 24:11	ii 5:19 6:1	insecurity 26:10
hear 2:9	iii 5:22 22:23	Institution 9:15
heard 7:4 8:14 10:6,15,19	imminent 25:1	instructions 21:22
hearing 3:24	impact 6:8 24:25 26:16	insufficient 15:4
hearings 5:4 27:16	important 24:4	insurance 5:20 11:21 17:1 24:13
heating 10:23	improve 19:25	interest 5:23 18:4
heels 25:1	improvement 6:18 7:15 10:22	interesting 7:20
height 25:4	improvements 7:21 13:25 17:25	internal 28:23
heros 27:5	19:10,11	invest 10:3 14:23 15:2,23 19:25
high 13:25 14:1 16:10,16 27:19	inability 10:17	investment 10:4
higher 22:23	inaudible 12:17 16:21 23:9	item 11:17 15:7
higher-income 24:19,22	incentive 16:7	iv 5:24
historic 22:14	include 16:23 25:15	J
historically 27:19	included 25:13	
hit 25:3	includes 24:16	jobs 19:14 29:9
hits 11:11,12	including 5:15,20,23 6:22	June 2:2 3:14 30:3
homeless 26:4	inclusive 8:5	justified 29:3
homeowners 19:6	income 7:10 12:7 13:5,11 14:1,9	justify 11:2 13:6

15:3,6,8 16:10 17:4,13,15 18:6 19:6

20:13 23:21 24:6,24 25:13 26:22

homes 7:22 19:1

Index: k-shaped..modern

limited 19:12 23:10 making 13:16 16:11 Κ **Lisa** 18:12 mans 12:10 listen 3:25 9:5 market 9:25 13:6 k-shaped 24:25 literally 9:11 matches 18:22 **Ken** 4:7 live 9:10 26:4,6,21,22 27:7,23 Materials 18:11 Kenneth 3:1 livelihood 18:21 maximum 6:19 18:10 killing 22:22 living 6:2 7:12 9:22 10:7 11:9,10 MCI 7:23 8:1 kind 20:1 12:10,13 18:22 22:14 26:2 MCI's 7:14 12:3 14:18 17:14 18:1,3 kitchen 7:2 local 8:14 11:3 19:10,11,12 long 22:5,25 26:21 Mckee 9:4 longer 7:12,14 14:19 16:9,19 17:9, Mckee's 26:12 labor 5:21 24:13 13 meals 26:10 lack 7:6 10:22 11:1,2,3,6 25:25 longevity 6:12 means 12:18 13:11 27:22 lose 24:21 measure 24:7 Lamont 2:20 losing 14:17 medicine 27:1 landlord 8:19 17:13 loss 10:11 14:10 17:4 meeting 2:4 3:15,24 29:24 30:1 landlords 10:3.19 11:13.18.20 12:2 lost 18:17 22:19 25:17 13:3.4.23 14:2.13.19 15:12 16:6.20. meetings 22:10 25 17:3,16 18:7,17,21 19:12,14,23 **low** 8:12 10:14 12:4 13:11 14:3 member 2:18,20 3:5,9 20:3,6 22:25 24:5,23 25:10,12,21 18:23 23:21 26:13 27:15,17 28:4 members 4:12 5:2 20:14 21:17 22:8 low-income 13:20 24:19 25:3 26:6 27:3 29:18 large 16:25 18:20 27:23 lower 7:11 merits 9:11 **larger** 19:14 lower-income 24:21 meticulously 23:14 largest 11:17 **LRAP** 25:11,13,16,19 metro 24:16 **lead** 8:23 9:22 10:2,13,23 lumber 8:16 18:11 Michael 9:4 26:12 leads 20:7 million 22:17,18 25:11 lease 10:12 17:19 29:6,15 M millions 23:3 leases 2:11 10:10,11 ma 16:22 mind 4:5 29:12 leave 14:24 20:3 Madam 5:2 minimal 8:23 10:9 13:23 19:18 29:4 leaving 10:14 made 5:8 7:10 16:10 19:5 27:14 minimum 16:9 17:9 25:17 left 7:5 15:14,15 22:18 Mae 2:22 minute 23:24 legal 15:10 magnifies 9:14 minutes 4:11 15:14,15 17:22 20:24, lengthy 21:4 25 22:4 maintain 8:21 17:11 28:6 lessens 9:13 misallocation 9:22 maintained 17:17 level 27:21 missed 26:10 maintenance 5:19 7:10 10:3 16:19 levels 24:24 25:2,5 17:20,25 misunderstand 25:10 **lifted** 20:10 major 7:15,17,20 11:12 13:25 19:11

make 4:13 5:7 7:11 15:24 26:24

27:12,21 28:6,24

lighting 7:2

limit 23:25

moderate 7:6

modern 14:21

Index: modernization..power

power 5:10 22:24 23:7,10 28:21,24

modernization 11:1 number 10:14 12:12 14:23 16:4 passing 21:25 29:4 modernize 14:20 numbers 12:18 14:5 23:20 26:16 passionately 26:20 Monday 3:14 4:22 30:2,3 Nutrition 23:3 past 13:24 23:4 money 6:23 13:6 14:19 15:24 17:8 patch 12:2 0 18:15 **pay** 7:16 9:3 18:4 26:18 27:8,13 **moneys** 15:6 payback 10:25 18:3 obligation 20:16 month 23:5 paying 24:8 26:17 29:9 October 2:12 9:16 months 18:10 payments 6:20 18:5 oil 24:13 moratorium 11:16 25:8 **peace** 29:12 older 8:11 mortgage 18:4 19:8,9 Peekskill 26:5 one's 28:2 mortgages 24:9 pegged 28:2 one-year 10:10 motion 29:23 penalizing 16:5 operating 5:19 12:5,7 24:6,12 Mount 15:5 23:16 25:5 26:4 pending 22:13 opportunity 4:13 5:3 28:24 29:14 move 6:13 7:1,8 9:20 pension 26:25 **opting** 24:20 moving 6:25 **people** 3:22,24 16:7 19:25 20:4,6 **order** 2:15 multifamily 20:17 22:20 28:25 out-of-pocket 18:5 multiple 10:15 percent 6:12 7:16,24,25 9:6,7 over-all 5:24,25 10:10,11,24 11:10,13,14,19,20,21, 23,24 12:1,5,8,9,11,12,14,16,24,25 overly 5:4 Ν 14:6,7,9,10,11,14,15,16 15:10 16:2, **owned** 18:19 3,21,24 17:10,19,20 18:3,11,23 National 23:21 20:11,18,19 24:10 25:18,19,25 26:2, **owner** 2:10,24 3:1,3 14:24 15:23 3 27:20 28:1,5 29:3,5,6,15 natural 11:14,15 23:20 24:14 29:3 percentage 15:12 26:15 naturally 7:9 owner's 28:6 **person** 22:10 **NBUT** 25:22 owners 4:1 10:6 12:19,21 14:17,18 19:4,18 24:8,9,11 25:17,20 27:19 perverse 18:24 necessities 25:7 28:9,12,15 Peter 3:11 15:13 21:11 needed 13:8 ownership 16:23 placing 24:17 net 12:7 17:13 24:6,11 25:18 Plaines 26:5 Ρ **newly** 16:13 point 9:11 25:11 28:2 news 23:2 p.m. 2:2 pointed 14:22 night 29:7,22 **pa** 16:22 pointing 7:19 **nights** 29:21 packets 23:15 points 24:5 **NOI** 24:6.10 28:5 29:3 pandemic 6:10 9:14 10:20,21 12:23 population 29:12 non-elderly 6:14 17:5 22:10 24:12,25 25:4 26:3 27:6 position 16:1 28:10 Nonetheless 23:11 pantries 26:8 potential 24:22 26:14 note 14:8 27:14 participate 3:25 potentially 22:22 **noted** 26:1 pass 29:14 poverty 24:24 26:2 notwithstanding 10:25 passed 29:5

PPP 25:16 **provided** 23:15,20 record 3:10 pre-pandemic 25:5 **public** 2:4,18,20 3:5,9,23 20:14 22:8 recoup 10:4 precedent 10:5 published 25:24 recovering 27:6 predicated 15:10 purchase 16:7 recovery 24:25 preferential 10:12 15:12 Putin 22:20 reduces 18:6 prepared 23:15 putting 13:6 18:14 22:13 reflected 18:5 present 2:14,17,19 3:6,8 regularly 26:7,23 Q regulated 7:24 8:1 15:10 16:21 presentation 4:2,10,12 15:9 21:1 20:17 presentations 2:5,10 3:18 qualified 13:17 regulation 9:9 presented 24:14 qualifies 13:10 regulations 9:12 presently 28:1 quantities 10:1 rehabilitate 16:8 pressure 24:18 quarters 29:6 relationship 13:4 prevailing 5:16 question 25:15 28:18 Relevant 6:1 prevent 15:25 questions 4:14 21:16 24:2 29:18 relieved 22:11 prevented 23:25 quo 28:6 relying 25:7 price 6:5 8:16 12:4,5 24:13 quorum 3:10 remain 18:25 priced 7:7 quote 5:10 7:23 9:15,19 remember 4:4 13:2 19:22 **Prior** 23:16 remind 3:23 24:4 26:20 28:14 R prioritize 23:1 **reminds** 26:12 problem 15:20 raising 10:4 26:9 removed 8:3 problems 28:21 rate 14:11 Renewal 7:22 **proceeding** 12:6 30:3 rates 5:18,20,23,25 9:25 20:11 renewals 10:12 29:6.15 Professor 9:17 raves 26:3 renewed 2:11 profit 15:4 19:13 20:2 24:8 read 7:22 23:14 renovate 6:23 16:8 Program 23:3 ready 4:24 renovations 10:18 17:25 18:14 prohibited 6:11 7:23 real 5:15,17 19:23 26:16 28:10,11 rent 2:4,9,11 5:11,12 6:11,21,22 7:7, Project 26:8 reality 28:3 12,24 8:1,4,5,12,21 9:3,5,9,12,18,21 10:1,14,24 11:8 12:4,17 13:16,23,25 projected 5:16 6:1 reason 9:2 25:21 27:18 14:3 15:6,25 16:9,21 18:23 20:5,10, **proof** 10:7 reasonable 8:21 17:5,18 18:1 19:19 17,18 24:20 25:18 26:1,7,15 27:1,8 20:2,18 29:13 properly 17:16 Rebecca 9:16 property 19:4

rent-burdened 26:6 27:11 rent-controlled 9:19 rental 6:8,22 9:25 10:2 25:13 renters 9:25 24:21,22

rents 5:10 10:4 15:10,11,12 24:18 26:9 29:2

rep 13:7 19:7

protect 20:16

protected 13:21

Protection 6:7

proverbial 6:4

19:14 29:11

provide 13:5 16:7 17:16 18:20

rebuttal 3:17

receive 2:5 25:20

recession 25:1

recognized 9:8

received 16:2 25:12

Index: repaired..stay

repaired 17:17	Rose 10:20 27:4,10	shortage 24:17 28:7
repairs 7:5,9 10:18 11:23 14:5 18:11,13	Rubin 2:6,7,8,18,20,22 3:1,3,5,7,9, 19,21 4:4,9,21,23,25 15:19,22 17:23	shortages 20:8
,	20:24 21:6,9,12,14,16,21,23 22:2,4,	shorter 29:21,22
repeated 13:7	6,7 29:17,22	show 3:10 9:12 11:8
reported 9:18 15:6,9		sidewalks 7:18
reporting 23:2		significant 5:7 14:22 15:11
representative 2:24 3:1,3,7 15:24 20:25 23:18	sacrifice 27:22	significantly 8:9 12:15
representatives 2:10 4:10	sacrifices 28:6	Similarly 9:25
reputable 23:22	safety 17:13	simultaneously 27:2
requirement 25:14	salary 28:2	single 19:3,5 27:7
researched 23:15	Santiago 3:5,6	situation 10:5 17:6
reserves 14:13 19:9	savings 25:7	sized 9:23
residential 5:14	schedules 3:22	small 8:2 9:24 16:25 23:11 28:12
respectfully 28:14	Schiciano 11:22	smaller 6:15
respond 2:14	School 9:17	so-called 8:17
responsible 20:3 22:17	SCRIE 13:14,17,19	Social 26:25
restoration 18:1	search 23:12	somberly 27:4
result 26:10	sect 28:5	sources 23:23
results 10:15	secured 9:19	speak 26:23
retaliation 27:17	Security 26:25	speaking 23:24
Returning 28:18	seek 15:25	spending 23:1
reverse 4:22	selectively 19:6	spiral 14:24
review 5:9 25:23	self-defeating 9:13	spoken 22:15
rights 19:2	self-manage 19:13,14	Stability 6:7
rises 16:16	self-reported 23:19	stabilized 26:7
Roche 23:16,17,25	send 21:2,3,5,9,11,12 24:2	Stanford 9:17
Roche's 24:5 25:10	senior 13:7,14,17,20 29:11	start 4:9,10,16,24 22:1,13
Rochelle 2:3 3:16 16:17 25:6 26:5,8	seniors 26:19,21,23,24	state 19:24 22:19
Rockland 29:5	separate 6:20 15:7	stated 18:4
role 23:16	September 2:12	station 26:18
roll 2:13	served 23:17	statistics 9:1
Ronnie 26:19,23	severely 26:1 27:11	stats 23:20
roof 7:18	sewer 5:17	status 28:6
roofs 10:23	Sheet 7:23	Statute 5:9
room 2:3 3:16 6:5	shopping 26:18	statutory 20:15
roommates 27:7	short 24:16	stay 12:10 13:1 20:4

Index: steadily..upward

system 18:25 steadily 27:10 times 10:15 28:25 Stecker 2:1 3:11,13,20 4:11 15:14, timing 15:13 **systems** 10:23 17 21:10 22:8 today 23:2 Т **Stewart** 3:7,8 4:7,15,17 21:19,20, told 27:4 22,25 22:3,5,7 29:17 tone 27:22 taketh 8:7 **stock** 8:22 10:2 13:6 19:17 tonight 2:9,23 talk 15:15 19:20 stop 26:22 topping 28:1 Tamara 3:7 storms 28:11 29:1 torturing 22:21 tangible 28:9,11 strongly 23:13 total 14:8,9 17:10,11 tax 19:5 struggling 26:17,24 29:7 totalling 6:20 taxes 5:17 17:2 studies 9:12 town 13:12 team 23:20 studios 9:24 tradesman 8:14,19 11:3 temporary 8:3 **Study** 9:16 transportation 27:1 tenant 2:10 3:7 6:7,14,15,25 9:4,19 **stuff** 21:4 13:10,14,16 16:11,12 20:25 23:18 trigger 22:23 subject 8:11 16:15,24 tenants 4:1 6:13 7:8 8:20 9:3,8 **true** 7:13 **submit** 20:15 10:20 11:4,5 12:22 13:3,4,20,21 turn 2:6 21:19 14:17,18,20 15:21 17:2 18:10,16,25 subsidize 13:23 19:7,23 20:6 22:25 23:17 24:23 25:6 two-year 10:11 17:19 29:6,15 subsidized 11:6 26:6,9,13,16 27:7,12,16,23 28:5,11 **type** 13:18 **Subsidy** 13:14 tens 27:11 substantial 17:4 tenths 25:18 U substantially 17:12,21 terms 26:15 **U.S.** 23:22 succession 19:2 terrorists 23:6 **Ukrain** 28:23 suffering 14:2 17:3 23:11 testified 10:19 11:22 12:21 13:10 18:9,13 Ukraine 22:21 **suffers** 14:16,17 testify 10:6 ultimately 8:19 sufficient 11:2 13:5,9 testimony 14:4 16:2 24:5 25:22 unanimously 12:23 sufficiently 13:11 26:12,19 unavailable 18:12 **suggested** 19:20 20:2 thing 23:13 29:14 underscored 25:24 **suppliers** 8:14,19 things 5:13 7:20 understand 28:12 **supplies** 8:16 10:18 thousands 7:18 9:11 27:11 unfortunate 23:24 supply 5:24 threat 25:1 unintended 8:15 surely 26:9 threats 28:23 **United** 23:17 survey 11:20 14:5 23:20 three-bedroom 6:14 units 7:24 8:1 9:2 14:23 15:1 16:4, surveys 25:14,15,16 thrive 24:6 25:22 22,23 24:17 survive 19:18 **Tim** 18:9 unprovoked 22:21 **switch** 11:15 time 2:1 3:22 4:11 15:18,19,21 17:21 unrenovated 7:8 **Sylvia** 3:3 22:9 23:11 26:8 27:14 19:22,23 20:23 21:15 22:15 23:14 upward 24:17 26:17 27:5 29:8 symbiotic 13:4

urge 29:14 utilities 17:2

utility 26:18

V

vacancy 5:25 10:12 11:4 13:22 16:10 17:8,14 20:11

vacant 6:11 7:5 10:14 14:20,21 18:6

Velene 2:16

Vernon 15:5 23:17 25:5 26:4

violence 23:7 **virtual** 22:10

virtually 6:19 13:24 17:24 20:12

visit 26:7 Vladimir 22:20 vote 3:18

vulnerable 26:11

W

waging 22:20

Waiver 23:3 walking 23:25

wanted 11:4

war 22:21,23 28:22

water 5:17 17:2

weakening 22:24

wealth 28:14,16

weather 28:10 29:1

Wednesday 2:2

weds 16:14

Westchester 2:4,8 5:6 10:6 11:15 16:16,22 17:8 19:18 20:21 24:16

25:12,23

Westchester's 29:11

White 26:5

windows 7:19 18:12,14

winners 29:8

wiped 20:12

word 15:4

work 8:14 11:3 15:23 20:4,6 27:9

worked 10:20 28:13,15

workers 25:3

working 12:22 26:23

works 26:9

world 4:7 22:23

world's 28:22

worse 6:10 28:25

worthless 6:19

written 22:15

Υ

year 4:3 5:5 6:25 7:16 9:1,2,6 10:8 11:11,14,19,23,24 12:8,11,16,24 14:6 16:2,12 17:19 18:15 20:19 29:2,5,13

yearly 11:6

years 6:20,21 8:4,12 9:7 10:9 11:10, 25 12:5,9,12,16,25 13:24 14:3,8 16:3,4 17:11 20:19 22:10,16 23:4 25:2,16 27:10

yield 24:11

Yonkers 25:6 26:5

York 9:5 22:19 24:16

young 8:25 9:23 10:16 16:13 19:2