1	NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF
2	DIVISION OF HOMES AND COMMUNITY RENEWAL
3	WESTCHESTER COUNTY RENT GUIDELINE BOARD
4	
5	PUBLIC HEARING
6	
7	DATE: June 21, 2022
8	TIME: 8:00 PM
9	LOCATION: Mount Vernon City Hall City Council Chambers
10	1 Roosevelt Square Mount Vernon, NewYork 10550
11	House Vernon, New Jork 10330
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	REPORTER: BARRINGTON MOXIE
23	
24	
25	

- 1 MR. STECKER: Okay. Good evening. The time is
- 2 8:00 p.m. we are in the Mount Vernon City Hall Counsel
- 3 Chambers at City Hall. The third Westchester County Rent
- 4 Guidelines Board public hearing. I will turn it over to
- 5 you, Chair Rubin.
- 6 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 7 Good evening and welcome. We apologize for this
- 8 delay. We had to adjust to certain things that came up and
- 9 so I'm going to start the meeting right now. This is the
- 10 3rd of -- the last public hearing to consider comments and
- 11 opinions concerning rent adjustments for leases commencing
- or being renewed between October 1st, 2022 and September
- 13 30th, 2023.
- I will now take roll call. Please respond if
- 15 you're present.
- Velene Acquah, public member?
- 17 MS. ACOUAH: Present.
- 18 CHAIR RUBIN: Lamont Badru, public member?
- MR. BADRU: Here.
- 20 CHAIR RUBIN: Eddie Mae Barnes, public member?
- MR. BARNES: Present.
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Elliot Cherson, owner representative?
- MR. CHERSON: Here.
- 24 CHAIR RUBIN: Kenneth Finger, owner representative?
- MR. FINGER: Here.

1 Sylvia Hamer, tenant representative? CHAIR RUBIN: 2 MS. HAMER: Here. 3 Evelyn Santiago, public member? CHAIR RUBIN: 4 MS. SANTIAGO: Present. CHAIR RUBIN: Tamara Stewart --5 6 MS. STEWART: Present. 7 CHAIR RUBIN: -- tenant representative? 8 And I'm Elsa Rubin, public member. 9 Let the record show that we have a quorum. I will now ask our counsel, Mr. Peter Stecker, to see if he has any 10 11 announcements. 12 MR. STECKER: Just one announcement. There's a 13 meeting tomorrow which will be for the presentation for the 14 owner and tenant representatives. That will be in the New Rochelle City Hall and the City Council Conference room at 15 16 7:00 p.m. 17 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. So before we start this hearing, I would like to go 18 19 through certain rules and procedures for those testifying before this committee -- for this Board and you have not 20 21 signed in advance, you can still have the opportunity to do 22 it. We have about 18 -- 15 people who had signed up in 23 advance. 24 Those who are representing themselves as

25

individuals will have three minutes for the presentation and

- 1 the person representing an entity or organization will have
- 2 five minutes. And Mr. Stecker will keep track of the time.
- 3 So I will kindly and respectfully ask you to stick to your
- 4 time considering that we are starting late and I will also
- 5 ask the audience to please, please abstain from clapping
- 6 because that will only delay our procedure here.
- 7 If you have materials to support your presentation,
- 8 please give them to Mr. Stecker and he will distribute it to
- 9 us. And when you finish your presentation at the podium,
- 10 please stay there in case the members of the Board have a
- 11 question or comments for you.
- 12 Your comments should be addressed to the members of
- 13 the Board only and not to individuals or members of the
- 14 audience. I will attempt to switch --
- 15 Can somebody close that door, please? Thank you,
- 16 Ms. Stewart.
- I will attempt to alternate between owners and
- 18 tenants if that is possible. That may not be possible all
- 19 the time, but I will try. And, lastly, I will ask you to
- 20 please silence your phones starting with the members of the
- 21 Board, please, so that we don't have any interruptions. I
- 22 will now call the first person on the list here. It's
- 23 Anthony Mariani (phonetic). Is Anthony Mariani here? If
- 24 not, I'm going to skip to the next person and we can come
- 25 back to him if he shows up.

1 Matt Persanis. 2 MR. PERSANIS: Good evening. 3 CHAIR RUBIN: Good evening, Mr. Persanis, are you 4 representing yourself or --5 MR. PERSANIS: I'm representing the Building Resident Institute on behalf of the owners. 6 7 CHAIR RUBIN: You have five minutes. 8 MR. PERSANIS: Thank you. I have some papers. You 9 don't necessarily need them, but if you'd like. 10 MR. STECKER: Thank you. 11 MR. PERSANIS: My name is Matthew Persanis, I'm an 12 attorney with Elefante and Persanis. I'm the labor 13 I represent the BRI and their collective attorney. 14 bargaining with Local 32BJ, which is the largest union building service employees in the nation. 15 We have a collective bargaining agreement that 16 17 covers roughly 85 percent of the rental buildings in Westchester County. Therefore, it's often looked at -- the 18 19 contract -- between the employers and the Union is often 20 looked at as the basis of what is the average and what is 21 the agreement between employers, the owners of the 22 buildings, and the employees -- the service employees. We have a contract that's expiring this year, so we 23 24 have some historical increases. So over the years, the last

contract was a four-year contract, 2018 to 2022 and that

25

- 1 averaged between 3 and 3.3 percent per year overall
- 2 increases. In the last contract -- in the last year of this
- 3 contract, the wages went up 1.5 percent, which is
- 4 historically low. Health coverage, which is a large portion
- of the cost, went up 8 percent. Pension cost went up 2.66
- 6 percent. We're looking at increases going forward and since
- 7 the contract does not expire until September of this year,
- 8 we can only look around to try and project what do we expect
- 9 to be our increases.
- 10 Some of the issues, I'm sure you're aware of, that
- 11 are going to affect our bargaining are affecting people
- 12 every day. Number one is inflation. Right now it's
- 13 hovering at 8.5 percent and we have already learned from the
- 14 union that they are going to be looking to not just stay
- 15 even in their mind 8.5 percent increases, but they'd like to
- 16 get ahead. In their mind, the idea of a raise is to get
- 17 better, not to just stay even. So that's going to be one of
- 18 our biggest issues with this go around is how do we -- how
- 19 do we deal with 8.5 percent rate of inflation where the
- 20 employees are going to want an increase of that amount while
- 21 trying to keep cost down for the employers. I think it's
- 22 going to be very tough this year.
- 23 Health cost. The average health cost is going up
- 24 17 to 20 percent, depending on which program. That's
- another cost that's absorbed by the employers. So we need

- 1 to figure out how to keep those cost low. When we look
- 2 around, has there been any other contracts with 32BJ in the
- 3 area that have been negotiated recently? And there has.
- 4 The RAB, Realty Advisory Board, does the same function as
- 5 the BRI but in Manhattan. They just completed their
- 6 contract in April of this year, so they didn't get the full
- 7 effect of all the inflation that we've been seeing, but they
- 8 had some of it. So we looked at it and we said, well, what
- 9 have they done? They did an average of 3.2 percent wage
- 10 increase. They were able to maintain health coverage at 4
- 11 percent, which is going to give us some help we hope, but
- 12 their pension had increased to 3.5 percent in order to keep
- 13 even.
- 14 Since April, when they've done their's, our stock
- 15 market has gone down quite a bit. The year, it's down 20
- 16 percent. And why does that affect us? It affects us
- 17 because when we're looking to do a pension, we have to look
- 18 at it and say, okay, how much does the fund need to be
- 19 solvent and to continue. And in order to continue, a lot of
- 20 their money that they collect is invested and that's how
- 21 they try. So in good years, they need less. In bad years,
- 22 like this year, they're going to need more. So we're a
- 23 little worried about that number.
- One thing they included in the RAB, which has never
- 25 been included in any contract with 32BJ in this area, was an

- 1 inflation trigger. And what it said was if inflation is
- 2 over 6.5 percent, the employers will receive an additional
- 3 ten cents per hour for every 1 percent over 6.5. I've been
- 4 involved in this contract and contracts in the area for
- 5 thirty years and I've never seen that. So that be will be
- 6 interesting and it will be interesting to see what the
- 7 argument will be.
- 8 My feeling in speaking to some of my counterparts
- 9 who represented the RAB was that was the only way they were
- 10 going to get out of not giving a 6, 7 percent raise was
- 11 that -- this inflation trigger. I don't know if that's
- 12 going to work out for them or not. I guess we'll find out
- 13 at the end of the year.
- 14 So I think that's what we're looking at. If I'm
- 15 asked to guess and that really is all it is right now since
- 16 we haven't even begun negotiations, I would say we're
- 17 looking at a minimum of 4 to 4.5 percent increases overall
- 18 to the labor force. Labor makes up about 22 percent of the
- 19 cost of buildings an average.
- Thank you.
- 21 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. Great timing.
- MR. PERSANIS: All right. I didn't even time
- 23 myself at home.
- 24 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay. Any questions for Mr. Persanis?
- 25 MR. PERSANIS: Thank you for your time.

- 1 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 2 MR. PERSANIS: I appreciate it.
- 3 CHAIR RUBIN: The next person I have on my list is
- 4 Michael Rosenberg.
- 5 MR. ROSENBERG: Good evening.
- 6 CHAIR RUBIN: Good evening, Mr. Rosenberg.
- 7 MR. ROSENBERG: Can you hear me?
- 8 CHAIR RUBIN: Will you be representing yourself or an
- 9 entity?
- 10 MR. ROSENBERG: Yes, I'm representing myself and
- 11 our entity. I'm the founder of M & R Windows. We're a
- 12 local leading window and door installation and repair
- 13 company in the tri-state area.
- 14 CHAIR RUBIN: You will have five minutes.
- MR. ROSENBERG: Sure. I first want to thank you
- 16 for the opportunity to speak this evening. I will be
- 17 addressing a very important topic to all of those who are
- 18 involved in multifamily buildings and complexes.
- 19 The current business climate is one of the worst
- 20 environments that I have experienced in the last 45 years of
- 21 running my company and I will explain why. The enactment of
- 22 the Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act, which is
- 23 HSTPA, in June of 2019 has had a series of negative effects
- 24 on owners and managers, rent stabilized apartment buildings,
- 25 and complexes in Westchester County and throughout the New

- 1 York and metropolitan region. Owners and managers of rent
- 2 stabilized buildings due to the negative economic components
- 3 of the Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act are not
- 4 able on a regular basis to conduct installation and repair
- 5 projects involving windows and doors and other construction.
- 6 As a result, the contractors have lost jobs and have lost
- 7 business which in turns hurts the local economy. And the
- 8 situation also hurts tenants of multifamily buildings and
- 9 complexes.
- 10 Another key point that I would like to mention
- 11 involves the recent increases in building material costs.
- 12 It's been outstanding. The National Association of Home
- 13 Builders recently announced a 19 percent increase in those
- 14 costs since last year and it's still rising. Their
- increases provide owners and managers of multifamily
- 16 buildings and contractors involved in those buildings with a
- 17 serious series of economic challenges.
- 18 What do we do next? The New York City Rent
- 19 Guidelines Board last month released it's price index of
- 20 operating costs report. The report analyzes expenses facing
- 21 owners of the multifamily buildings in New York City.
- 22 Expenses that owners in Westchester County also face.
- 23 According to the report, maintenance expenses rose 9.2
- 24 percent this year. 6.1 percentage points higher than last
- 25 years rise of 3.1. The increases involved in repainting;

- 1 plumbing; electrical services; boiler repairs; floor
- 2 maintenance repairs right down the line.
- In addition, this year's operations and maintenance
- 4 cost surveys involving Westchester County's rent stabilized
- 5 properties shows an 11.1 percent increase in repair and
- 6 maintenance expenses and is not stopping for owners during
- 7 the 2020 2021 term. Each of these points illustrate the
- 8 need for your Board to issue fair guidelines increases this
- 9 year so that the owners and managers can receive some help
- 10 in dealing with the significant increases in expenses that
- 11 they are facing.
- 12 I thank you for the opportunity to voice my
- 13 concerns and if anybody has any questions, I'll be glad to
- 14 answer it.
- 15 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- Any questions of Mr. Rosenberg?
- 17 Yes, Mr. Cherson?
- 18 MR. ROSENBERG: Have a good evening.
- 19 CHAIR RUBIN: No, he has a questions.
- MR. ROSENBERG: Oh, okay.
- 21 MR. CHERSON: What is the percentage increase in
- 22 your business since 2019?
- 23 MR. ROSENBERG: Since 2019? About 40 percent.
- 24 MR. CHERSON: 40 percent?
- MR. ROSENBERG: Yes.

1 MR. CHERSON: Increase? 2 MR. ROSENBERG: Yes. 3 MR. CHERSON: And what about employees? 4 MR. ROSENBERG: Employees, half the amount of 5 employees. 6 MR. CHERSON: You have half the employees that you 7 had in 2019? 8 MR. ROSENBERG: Yes. 9 MR. CHERSON: Thank you. 10 You're welcome. Have a good MR. ROSENBERG: 11 evening, everybody. Thank you --12 CHAIR RUBIN: Anybody else? 13 MR. ROSENBERG: -- for your time. 14 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. MR. ROSENBERG: You're welcome. 15 I will now call -- I'll switch to a 16 CHAIR RUBIN: 17 tenant representative I will switch to Mr. Dennis Hanratty 18 (phonetic). 19 MR. HANRATTY: Good evening ladies and gentlemen of the Board, HCR staff, and all those in attendance. My name 20 21 is Dennis Hanratty and I'm the Executive Director the of 22 Mount Vernon United Tenants. I have been providing testimony to the Rent Guidelines Board for over thirty 23 24 During this time, we have seen tenants' rent

increase almost astronomically, doubling, tripling, and in

25

- 1 some cases quadrupling.
- 2 Further, we have seen the absolute number of units
- 3 covered under the ETPA law shrink dramatically. When I
- 4 started at MVUT there were approximately 80,000 units
- 5 covered under the law. As of November 2019, the time when
- 6 Westchester County published the Westchester County Housing
- 7 Needs Assessment, which I will be referencing in my
- 8 testimony, the report found that there were 34,221 units
- 9 covered by ETPA. The numbers produced by the HCR for your
- 10 deliberations this year lists 25,029 units subject to the
- 11 ETPA law.
- 12 These kind of numbers spell nothing but trouble for
- 13 those tenants still lucky enough to be covered. Genevieve
- 14 Roche of my office will be providing you with an expert
- analysis of the numbers this Board will be utilizing in your
- 16 deliberations. Please pay close attention to that analysis.
- 17 I will be putting the issues and your responsibilities in a
- 18 broader context of overall affordability and the crisis
- 19 facing renters today and, most especially, low to modern
- 20 income tenants.
- In here, I'd like to clearly discount the argument
- 22 that many landlords and their spokespersons make regarding
- 23 low income tenants and their inability to afford ever
- 24 -increasing rents. That is, well, they should just get
- 25 Section 8 or some other subsidy. It's normally impossible

- 1 to get Section 8 in less than five years and there really
- 2 isn't any other ongoing reliable subsidy available.
- 3 I mention the Westchester County Housing Needs
- 4 Assessment. I'm going to show you that right here. The
- 5 assessment in the appendices. This was published in
- 6 November 2019 and was prepared by the Hudson Valley Pattern
- 7 for Progress. I don't know who, if anyone, among you have
- 8 seen or read this report and it's appendices, but it
- 9 contains a wealth of, quote, research, data analysis, and
- 10 recommendations. This is an incredibly valuable tool in
- 11 highlighting just how bad the affordability crisis is here
- 12 in Westchester.
- 13 I'm going to site a number of the reports findings
- 14 and I'm attaching a few copies of tables from the report and
- its appendices. This will hopefully help the Board in
- 16 contextualising the problems facing tenants and provide you
- 17 with the ammunition necessary to deny the landlords any
- 18 guideline increases and hopefully rollback previous
- 19 increases. I encourage people to get a copy of this if they
- 20 can through the County -- Westchester County.
- 21 41.4 percent of the household, both owners and
- 22 renters, are both paying more than 50 percent of their
- 23 income for housing. They're considered severely cost
- 24 burdened. A staggering 66,950 households are paying more
- 25 than 30 percent of their income for rent. They're rent

- 1 burden, cost burden. 89,839 people are living in poverty in
- 2 Westchester, which is 9.4 percent of the population. Almost
- 3 94 percent of Westchester's homeless families were from the
- 4 five largest cities: Mount Vernon where -- we're here
- 5 tonight; New Rochelle, will be tomorrow night; Peekskill;
- 6 White Plains where we were at; and Yonkers where we were at.
- 7 Even though those cities represent only 46 percent of the
- 8 counties population. This is something everybody should be
- 9 concerned about.
- 10 The age cohort 30 to 44 shows a decline in
- 11 population most likely because of the lack of affordable
- 12 housing options. People are moving out because they can't
- 13 afford to live here. Affordability challenges for renters
- on page 75 and 76 and you'll see some dramatic issues there
- 15 about the Affordability Act. Asset limited, income
- 16 constrained, employed, ALICE. So three cities: Mount
- 17 Vernon, Yonkers, and Peekskill all with over 50 percent of
- 18 the household either in poverty or in an ALICE households,
- 19 page 85. That ALICE data set is created by United Way to
- 20 say, you know, how difficult it is even if you're not
- 21 above -- if you're above poverty but how you just really
- 22 can't care for your family properly.
- 23 Out Of Reach. That's a national study that's put
- 24 out every year. Monthly gap between affordable rents and
- 25 two bedroom fair market rents on page 107 and 108. The gap

- between affordable rents and the fair market two-bedroom
- 2 unit Westchester is \$770. That same gap for affordable
- 3 rents in Westchester and the market rents is \$1,578. This
- 4 is what tenants are up against. There's a Westchester
- 5 County summary about the cost burden and there's a thing
- 6 about the municipality the severely cost-burdened household.
- 7 I'll ask you all to look through those things carefully.
- Please take your time in reviewing this data to get
- 9 a real handle on how severe our housing crisis is. Most
- 10 people throw up their hands when confronted with disgrace
- 11 and say, what can I do about it? This Board can do
- 12 something about it. You can say no more guideline increases
- 13 that will only serve to worsen the crisis.
- 14 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 15 MR. HANRATTY: Just one more paragraph.
- 16 CHAIR RUBIN: I'm going to let you to continue your
- 17 train of thoughts --
- 18 MR. HANRATTY: Okay.
- 19 CHAIR RUBIN: -- without questions.
- MR. HANRATTY: Okay.
- 21 CHAIR RUBIN: I have a question. What is your
- 22 conclusion?
- MR. HANRATTY: What's my conclusion?
- 24 CHAIR RUBIN: Conclusion in your presentation.
- 25 MR. HANRATTY: I think there should be a rollback

- 1 in rents. No question about it.
- 2 MR. BADRU: Are you giving him an opportunity to
- 3 finish the last paragraph?
- 4 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
- 5 MR. HANRATTY: Okay. Because of the actions of the
- 6 Westchester Rent Guidelines Board before any of the present
- 7 tenant members and public members were on the Board the Rent
- 8 Guidelines Board passed vacancy guidelines of 100 percent of
- 9 the highest -- in 11 of 12 years during the '90's and early
- 10 2000's which raised virtually all vacancies to market levels
- and largely eviscerated the economic benefits of the ETPA
- 12 for incoming tenants. We see this confirmed regularly by
- 13 quote, unquote preferential rents when legal regulated rents
- 14 have equaled and in some cases have exceeded market rents.
- 15 It's another reason why it's often tough to get tenants to
- 16 come out to the public hearings as increasing numbers of
- 17 tenants covered by ETPA don't see the economic benefit as
- 18 their legal regular rents are at market level.
- 19 It's this Board's responsibility to stop -- to work
- 20 to stop these ever-increasing rents and provide relief to
- 21 already overextended tenants. No quideline increases, if
- 22 anything, rollback the rents. Thank you.
- 23 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 24 Any other questions from the Board? Yes?
- MS. HAMER: Because of what you do on a regular

- 1 basis, can you tell me what's been your experience with
- 2 tenants affordability? And I know everyone has been talking
- 3 about inflation as well, so how has it impacted tenants?
- 4 MR. HANRATTY: My office happens to be right across
- 5 the street. You can see it right from the window here. I
- 6 can't tell you the horror that some people face on a regular
- 7 basis. A week doesn't go by that we don't have somebody
- 8 come in who's threatening suicide or something like that.
- 9 People are facing eviction on a regular basis. Fortunately,
- 10 we're able to stop most of those evictions. We had the
- 11 pandemic and it was a moratorium for a while, but now it's
- 12 picking up again. More and more people are being brought to
- 13 court. But it's terrifying when you have a single mother
- 14 with two children who may get a notice they got to court and
- 15 they figured they're going to be homeless. We've got to
- 16 deal with that. They come to our office, they cry, they
- 17 breakdown. On a regular basis we see that.
- I mean, the rents are just, like the gentlemen
- 19 said, too damn high. People can't afford it. People are
- 20 making, you know, basically minimum wage or a little bit
- 21 more making \$10 or \$12 an hour. You can't pay a \$1,800 a
- 22 month rent and that's what the rents are going for now.
- 23 Even, you know, stabilized rents. It used to be you could
- 24 get a stabilized rent for, you know, \$1,000, \$1,100, \$1,200.
- 25 You can't get that anymore. And then what happens is people

- 1 go to private houses where they really get ripped off and
- 2 they live in basement apartments, they live in attic
- 3 apartments, they live in garage apartments. We have fires
- 4 on a regular basis. It's just desperate. People are
- 5 desperate and I think this Board -- even though it's not
- 6 going to cover that many of the overall universe of tenants
- 7 in Westchester County, only those rent stabilized -- it will
- 8 be a big benefit for tenants or a good portion of those
- 9 tenants to have them know that they're not going to have to
- 10 pay an ever-increasing rent. So we see that. And, I mean,
- 11 you wouldn't want to see the pain that people experience on
- 12 a regular basis.
- MS. HAMER: Thank you.
- 14 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, Ms. Stewart?
- MS. STEWART: Mr. Hanratty, can you please -- I
- 16 know Mount Vernon on United Tenants was one of the leading
- 17 organizations that helped people fill out ERAP applications.
- 18 Can you speak a little bit about that?
- 19 MR. HANRATTY: Yeah. ERAP -- I mean ERAP is the
- 20 Emergency Rental Assistance Program, federal dollars that
- 21 come down to the states and the counties to help people if
- 22 they had either lost income or had additional expenses as a
- 23 result of COVID-19. We successfully processed over 300
- 24 applications and then we helped another 300 plus people, you
- 25 know, providing documentation and all. But we stopped. Out

- 1 of those over 300, probably 280 of those were made, you
- 2 know, stopped their -- stopped people from becoming
- 3 homeless. And, I mean, that's -- we're still doing that. I
- 4 mean, still -- and there has still been some confusion about
- 5 ERAP money that it was over and stuff, it's not. There's
- 6 still money available and we're encouraging people -- if you
- 7 know people who did lose money because of COVID-19 or had
- 8 additional expenses to reach out to our office and we'll
- 9 help them.
- 10 MS. STEWART: Thank you.
- 11 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay. Thank you.
- 12 Any other questions?
- 13 MR. HANRATTY: Once again, look for these reports.
- 14 Contact the County Department of Planning.
- 15 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 16 MR. HANRATTY: It's valuable tools for everybody.
- 17 Thank you.
- 18 CHAIR RUBIN: I'm going now to call Mr. Jason
- 19 Schiciano.
- 20 MR. SCHICIANO: Good evening.
- 21 CHAIR RUBIN: Good evening. Are you representing
- 22 yourself or an entity?
- 23 MR. SCHICIANO: Thank you. I have --
- 24 CHAIR RUBIN: An entity?
- 25 MR. SCHICIANO: -- copies of my speech. Can I hand

- 1 that out now?
- 2 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, please.
- 3 MR. SCHICIANO: Good evening, everyone. My name is
- 4 Jason Schiciano, I'm co-president of Levitt-Fuirst Insurance
- 5 in Tarrytown New York. We are a licensed insurance broker
- 6 for over 52 years, one of Westchester's largest brokers for
- 7 the placement of real estate insurance. We represent many
- 8 of the largest insurers and we are the insurance advisors to
- 9 the Building and Realty Institute. And the Apartment
- 10 Owners' Advisory Counsel have asked me to comment on the
- 11 insurance market relative to these proceedings.
- 12 Before I continue, I just have to say, it continues
- 13 to perplex me why it's always argued that landlords have an
- 14 obligation to address circumstances that make Westchester
- 15 County the most expensive place -- one of the most expensive
- 16 places in the country to operate real estate by holding
- 17 rents where they are or even rolling them back and it just
- doesn't make sense to me. 8.7, 6.8 percent, and 9 percent.
- 19 These are the DHCR reported insurance expense increases over
- 20 the last three years. A total of 24.5 percent. Cumulative
- 21 total Westchester Rent Guidelines for the same three-year
- 22 period, 2.25 percent. Less than one tenth of the
- 23 accumulative increases in insurance percentage.
- Insurance premiums are one of the top expenses for
- 25 Westchester landlords. And while 9 percent insurance

- 1 increase last year ranks only third in magnitude behind
- 2 repairs and maintenance as mentioned up 11.1 percent and
- 3 fuel which was up 15 percent last year, insurance premiums
- 4 have a backbreaking burden on landlords especially while
- 5 rents had been more difficult than ever to collect.
- 6 How large does the gap between major expenses have
- 7 to be versus allowed rent increases before landlords are
- 8 provided with tangible relief? Last year I vowed in front
- 9 of this Board that expense would continue to rise. I was
- 10 correct and I will make that prediction again this year.
- 11 Insurance will go up yet again. One solution to this
- 12 out-of-control insurance premium increases would be reform
- of New York State Labor Law 240 the Scaffold Law. I'm going
- 14 to spare you the details of what that law says, but suffice
- it to say, it's a major driver of high insurance premiums in
- 16 New York and in Westchester specifically. And as many of
- 17 you know, that law is not going any time soon.
- In addition, with recent laws discouraging landlord
- 19 upgrades and improvements, it's logical to predict that
- 20 apartment buildings are now getting older faster than ever
- 21 which is only going to result in more property insurance
- 22 claims such as pipe breaks; water damage; electrical system
- 23 malfunctions resulting in fires; et cetera. While major
- 24 building repairs such as roof replacement and exterior brick
- 25 pointing are often mandated by insurance companies as a

- 1 condition of maintaining the renewal of their insurance,
- 2 this nation's unprecedented inflation will bring
- 3 unprecedented repair cost. In fact, insurance-related
- 4 mandated repairs will almost certainly make this years 11.1
- 5 percent DHCR reported repairs and maintenance expense
- 6 percentage look like a bargain next year.
- 7 Most Westchester landlords try to protect their
- 8 real estate investment. And their tenants by maintaining
- 9 ample property and liability insurance. But without a
- 10 reasonable rent increase to begin to offset years of huge
- insurance expenses, many landlords will eventually cutback
- 12 on the amounts and types of insurance that they maintain
- 13 keeping only the bare minimum of coverage. I will not go
- 14 into the details of the potential ramifications of such
- 15 cutbacks. But suffice it say, the outcome may not only be
- 16 devastating for landlords but also for the tenants who call
- 17 the landlord's buildings their own.
- 18 Thank you for listening.
- 19 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 20 Any questions from the Board? Yes, Mr. Cherson?
- 21 MR. CHERSON: I heard you just saying you don't
- 22 want to get into ramifications.
- 23 MR. SCHICIANO: I just didn't have the time, but
- 24 I'm happy to get into them.
- 25 MR. CHERSON: But you know the ramifications and

- 1 maybe Ken and I do as well, but I would like you to present
- 2 to the Board what exactly the ramifications are.
- 3 MR. SCHICIANO: Relative to my last comments?
- 4 MR. CHERSON: Yes.
- 5 MR. SCHICIANO: Yeah, look, I mean, the -- you only
- 6 have so much money that you're going to allocate to
- 7 expenses. You know, I know that it's often debated whether
- 8 or not a landlord has a right to make money or not but if
- 9 you cutback on insurance expenses and there is a loss, let's
- 10 say there's a terrible fire -- and they've been in the news.
- 11 Buildings collapse, buildings catch fire, people get hurt.
- 12 The ramifications of not having enough and proper insurance
- 13 because you're cutting back on insurance and buying the
- 14 bargain policy, are that if the building is substantially
- 15 damaged or destroyed, it doesn't get rebuilt. It just
- 16 doesn't get rebuilt, there's not enough money and, you know,
- 17 the lot will be repurposed into something else.
- 18 And, you know, on -- the other ramification is that
- 19 if there is, let's say, a fire and tenants logically have
- 20 the right no pursue claims of liability against the landlord
- 21 if the fire shouldn't have happened, maybe because the
- 22 landlord was cutting back on repairs because he was trying
- 23 to save money somewhere or she was trying to save money
- 24 somewhere, there's often not going to be enough liability
- 25 insurance to pay the liability claims of the tenants that

- 1 are harmed or have to move out and have costs et cetera.
- 2 The landlord just won't have the liability insurance.
- 3 They'll just, you know, turn over their property and say
- 4 here's the asset and, you know, that will be the end of it.
- 5 That has happened with major devastating building fires,
- 6 building collapses, et cetera, that you all know what I'm
- 7 talking about, they've been in the news. There's not enough
- 8 liability insurance to pay those claims.
- 9 MR. CHERSON: Thank you.
- 10 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, Mr. Finger?
- 11 MR. FINGER: I was going to ask the same question.
- 12 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay. Anybody else?
- 13 Thank you very much.
- 14 MR. SCHICIANO: Okay. Thanks very much.
- 15 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. I will now call Genevieve
- 16 Roche.
- 17 Welcome, Ms. Roche. I assume you are representing
- 18 an entity?
- 19 MS. ROCHE: Yes, I am. Thank you.
- 20 CHAIR RUBIN: You have five minutes. Thank you.
- 21 MR. FINGER: Can I ask what entity? I didn't hear.
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, she will say.
- MR. CHERSON: She will?
- 24 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
- MR. FINGER: No, I asked what entity. She didn't

- 1 give an entity.
- 2 MS. ROCHE: You said am I speaking on behalf of an
- 3 entity?
- 4 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
- 5 MS. ROCHE: I am.
- 6 CHAIR RUBIN: I assume that you will introduce
- 7 yourself and --
- 8 MS. ROCHE: I will.
- 9 CHAIR RUBIN: -- say your entity.
- 10 MS. ROCHE: Your assumption is correct.
- 11 Good evening. My name is Genevieve Roche and I am
- 12 CFO of Mount Vernon United Tenants and a cooperate attorney
- 13 who spends a fortune -- spends a portion of my practice
- 14 representing tenants pro bono.
- There is no way I could possible get through all
- 16 the materials, so please take the time next week to go
- 17 through all the documents and my statement carefully and
- 18 deliberatively because the research conclusively confirms
- 19 the following three points.
- One, landlords continue to thrive. Two, there is a
- 21 deficit of affordable apartments numbering more than
- 22 600,000. Three, there's a growing disparity in the levels
- 23 of poverty, income, and the impact of inflation on
- 24 Westchester's low-income tenants.
- 25 I'm only going to be able to have time to address

- 1 the first point tonight. A rent increase is neither
- 2 warranted nor justified by the numbers that a rent freeze
- 3 is. The 2020 numbers are interesting in so far as I thought
- 4 there would have been a reduction in rental income; however,
- 5 landlords only lost nine tenths of one percent. Would the
- 6 tenants have been so lucky? And while rental income was
- 7 steady, expenses were down a hefty 36 percent, mostly seen
- 8 in reduction of maintenance no doubt due to COVID resulting
- 9 in an NOI in 2020 of 40.29 percent, a level not seen in 20
- 10 years.
- 11 Let's not forget that as of June 15th, Westchester
- 12 landlords had received an additional \$43 million in ERAP
- 13 funds. In addition, the New York State budget just
- 14 allocated another \$925 million for 2023. Notably, the
- 15 research analysis group just informed us last Friday that no
- 16 ERAP funds were reported in the owners survey numbers, nor
- 17 we were told did the owner income figures disclose the
- 18 number of forgiven PPP loans received by owners.
- 19 CHAIR RUBIN: Excuse me. I'm going to ask the
- 20 owner's representatives to please remain quiet while she's
- 21 presenting. Thank you.
- 22 MS. ROCHE: Landlords leave no stone unturned in
- 23 their quest for increased profits, but only you, the Board,
- 24 can give slowly recovering regulated tenants a break as they
- 25 struggle to catch up during the recovery complicated by

- 1 inflation and an imminent recession.
- 2 As for 2021, rental income was almost identical to
- 3 2019 levels, in fact, 1.3 percent higher. Average regulated
- 4 rent was \$1,561 a month, up 10.63 percent over three years.
- 5 Expenses were predictably up as COVID eased, but repairs and
- 6 maintenance equaled 99.5 percent of 2019 expenditures. And
- 7 despite the increase in oil prices, NOI for 2021 was
- 8 nevertheless a robust 37.37 percent, just a smidgen below
- 9 2019's resulting in a three-year average of 38.68 percent.
- 10 These facts underscore that the rent freeze and
- 11 effect the first three quarters of 2021 did not hurt
- 12 landlord profit margins and apparently neither did the
- 13 pandemic, the impact of HSTPA, or the continued loss of rent
- 14 stabilized units.
- 15 Speaking of oil prices, as I explain every year,
- 16 individual categories of expenses are not relevant in the
- 17 overall analysis because at the end of the day it is net
- 18 operating income that is the relevant indicia of what kind
- 19 of guidelines increase is or isn't needed to keep rents low
- 20 or seeking a reasonable net profit for landlords.
- 21 While the overall increase in expenses is largely
- 22 attributed to heating fuel, overall expenses were back to
- 23 2019 levels. While fuel prices have recently spiked
- 24 temporarily based on increased post-pandemic demand and
- 25 global politics, let's not forget to put this short-term

- 1 volatility in perspective.
- 2 Three points. First, the spike in prices in 2008
- 3 lead to large guideline increases that are baked into base
- 4 rents ever since. And even though not once in the 14
- 5 intervening years until this one did heating oil prices ever
- 6 reach 2008 levels. Notably, rents weren't rolled back each
- 7 year that prices were less than 2008 levels.
- I ask you to please focus on handout four which
- 9 puts -- it's a graph that puts the current spike in prices
- 10 in the proper context. Two, according to the US EIA
- 11 projections show that prices will level off this year and
- 12 into 2023. Finally, my belief was always that guideline
- increases were based on facts derived from last year's
- 14 number, not speculation about next year's numbers that would
- 15 lock increases permanently into base rents whether or not
- 16 those predictions come to pass. You don't get to argue for
- 17 increases every year based on half numbers and future
- 18 projections unless, of course, you're willing to rollback
- 19 rents for every year when the facts later show that the
- 20 increases weren't necessary.
- I just have the one final point to make, okay?
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
- MS. ROCHE: Thank you.
- 24 Finally, I want to put to rest once and for all the
- 25 necessary distinction between operating profit and return on

- 1 equity and the fact that the latter is totally misplaced in
- 2 a discussion on rent guidelines. This is financial apples
- 3 and oranges. Rent regulation is intended to protect tenants
- 4 from illegal rent increases and allow owners to maintain
- 5 their buildings and realize a reasonable profit. That's a
- 6 direct quote from the DHCR Office of Rent Administration.
- 7 Speculating in real estate is not an expense
- 8 appropriate nor intended for a regulated tenant. In fact,
- 9 it's pretty darn cynical to expect a tenant in regulated
- 10 housing that is intended by definition, to address the
- 11 emergency protection of tenants, to expect them to
- 12 contribute via a permanently increased rent base to the cost
- 13 of an owner incurring financing in -- the cost that an owner
- 14 incurs financing its appreciating real estate investment
- 15 because the owner is unwilling to dip into its consistently
- 16 healthy net operating profit to cover these costs.
- 17 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay. Thank you.
- 18 Any questions? Yes, Ms. Stewart?
- 19 MS. STEWART: What I would like to really you hear
- 20 finish that thought, but I also wanted you to talk a little
- 21 bit more about those additional two points that you said you
- 22 weren't going to have time to address, please.
- 23 MS. ROCHE: Yeah, I actually have a summary --
- 24 summary statement. There is a deficit of affordable
- 25 apartments, more than half a million. Like climate change,

- 1 the growing income gap between the rich and the poor in
- 2 Westchester and the lack of affordable housing for those in
- 3 the lower tier is beyond dispute and escalating.
- In a County where the average Westchester's family
- 5 income is just shy of \$190 thousands. 1 in 5 households
- 6 earn less than 35,000. And I want -- would ask you to focus
- 7 on handouts 7 through 11 that address that point.
- 8 CHAIR RUBIN: Any other questions?
- 9 MS. SANTIAGO: Yes.
- 10 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, Ms. Santiago.
- 11 MS. SANTIAGO: You mentioned early in your
- 12 presentation the amount of money that landlords have
- 13 obtained through ERAP. Could you just elaborate a little
- 14 bit on that.
- 15 MS. ROCHE: I can, yes. In fact, there are two
- 16 handouts that give the details. This is the ERAP report for
- 17 Westchester --
- 18 MS. SANTIAGO: Uh-huh.
- 19 MS. ROCHE: -- dated June 15th --
- MS. SANTIAGO: Got it.
- 21 MS. ROCHE: -- 2022.
- MS. SANTIAGO: Okay.
- 23 MS. ROCHE: And it shows that Westchester landlords
- 24 got close to \$43 million. There's been another 925 million
- 25 allocated for New York State landlords for next year.

- 1 MR. CHERSON: I have a question.
- 2 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, Mr. Cherson?
- 3 MR. CHERSON: I don't want to get into an argument
- 4 with you. I really don't.
- 5 MS. ROCHE: Of course not.
- 6 MR. CHERSON: But when you say ERAP money, whatever
- 7 the figure that you just gave, I just want to be clear and I
- 8 assume you agree, that is not additional money to the
- 9 landlords. That is just the rent that the tenants were
- 10 supposed to pay during that time. Do you agree with that?
- 11 MS. ROCHE: It is compensating landlords. There's
- 12 ERAP and --
- 13 MR. CHERSON: Well, is it additional money?
- 14 MS. ROCHE: Well, let me answer your question.
- 15 There's ERAP and there's LRAP and that money goes to
- 16 landlords. And according to the survey numbers, rental
- income went down nine tenths of one percent.
- 18 MR. CHERSON: But it just makes up the rent;
- 19 correct?
- 20 MS. ROCHE: So, wait. So -- I beg your pardon?
- 21 MR. CHERSON: It just -- if the landlords gets
- 22 \$2,500 of ERAP money and the rent's \$500 a month, that just
- 23 represents five months of rent, does it not?
- 24 MS. ROCHE: Regardless of what it represents,
- 25 Eliot, regardless of what it represents --

- 1 MR. CHERSON: But I think it's important.
- 2 MS. ROCHE: Yeah, but I'm going to tell you. But
- 3 regardless of that distinction this is the amount
- 4 Westchester landlords were funded as of December 31st, 2021.
- 5 MR. CHERSON: But it's not in addition; is that
- 6 correct?
- 7 MS. ROCHE: It doesn't matter. Your net operating
- 8 income and as your own landlord survey numbers say, the
- 9 rent -- nine tenths of one percent. So you take that
- 10 amount, which is based on your numbers, and you add \$43
- 11 million of ERAP money --
- 12 MR. CHERSON: It's not additional money to do --
- 13 CHAIR RUBIN: Excuse me.
- 14 MR. CHERSON: It's not additional money. So you
- 15 can't say the landlords --
- 16 MS. ROCHE: I think that --
- 17 MR. CHERSON: It's not any extra money. And I know
- 18 I'm not going to convince you or the tenants, I understand
- 19 that. But I need the Board to understand that there is not
- 20 one cent extra to the landlords because of ERAP or LRAP.
- 21 MS. ROCHE: All I know is what the landlord numbers
- 22 show, okay? And, in addition to that, there is ERAP funds
- 23 that aren't reported in the survey. The DHCR statisticians
- 24 said that --
- 25 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's a lie.

1	CHAIR RUBIN: Excuse me. Excuse me.
2	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's false information.
3	CHAIR RUBIN: One minute. The audience is not
4	supposed to be talking about the presentation. And if
5	somebody is talking, I'm going to ask them to leave.
6	Please continue.
7	MS. ROCHE: Thank you. The fact of the matter is
8	there's the money reported by landlords in the surveys,
9	which the DHCR statistician said, they looked at them, we
10	asked them. It did not include under miscellaneous any
11	entries for ERAP or PPP forgiven loans by the way, okay.
12	The fact that whether I mean, who knows what they were
13	paid or weren't paid, but we know this ERAP money was
14	distributed in Westchester County. The report just came out
15	on June 15th. I enclosed a copy of it in my handouts.
16	So I will believe what the landlord survey shows
17	even though we can't test it and I will believe what
18	June 15th New York State report just issued says.
19	CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
20	MS. ROCHE: What more can I say?
21	CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
22	MS. ROCHE: Okay. And is there anything else?
23	CHAIR RUBIN: No, that's it. Thank you.
24	MS. ROCHE: Okay.
25	CHAIR RUBIN: I will now call thank you very much

- 1 for your presentation.
- 2 MS. ROCHE: You're welcome.
- 3 CHAIR RUBIN: I will now call Lisa DeRosa.
- 4 MS. DEROSA: Good evening. Before I start my
- 5 presentation, my name is Lisa DeRosa, I'm the president of
- 6 the Building and Realty Institute of Westchester County.
- 7 I'm also the first female president of the Building and
- 8 Realty Institute of Westchester County.
- 9 I'm a landlord. I've been a landlord for over 20
- 10 years. Fill out those DHCR forms every year, I also
- 11 collected ERAP money. She is correct, there's no separate
- 12 line for ERAP money because it went to the rent. So if the
- tenant owed me \$500 a month for four months, that's \$2,000
- 14 and when that \$2,000 came in, it went to the tenants rent
- 15 account so the tenant didn't owe that rent anymore. So, of
- 16 course, there's not going to be a separate line for ERAP, it
- 17 goes to rent.
- 18 Having settled that, I would like to begin my
- 19 presentation. My name is Lisa DeRosa, I'm the president of
- 20 the Building and Realty Institute and I've been a landlord
- 21 in White Plains for most of my life. My journey in the
- 22 housing industry actually began when I was much younger when
- 23 I sold my first house at the age of 13 with the help of my
- 24 father, John DeRosa, who instilled in me the qualities and
- 25 necessities required in order to manage a building

- 1 successfully. I know first hand what it really looks like
- 2 for a small business and family-run businesses to build and
- 3 operate multifamily apartment buildings in Westchester. And
- 4 I know what it means to keep them afloat in good times and
- 5 in bad and how to maintain safe, secure, and affordable
- 6 homes that working families in Westchester can depend on.
- 7 As I watched my family business grow I realized how
- 8 valuable home builders, landlords, and developers are to our
- 9 communities. We provide sufficient housing for those who
- 10 cannot afford or choose not to be homeowners and we bear the
- 11 cost and burdens of the homeownership. We're not faceless
- 12 corporations or fly-by-night investors or people looking to
- 13 make a quick buck. We have deep roots in these communities,
- 14 we have deep connections with many of our tenants and we're
- 15 dedicated to investing in our buildings to keep them in good
- 16 conditions and the type of apartments our residents deserve,
- 17 want, and will hopefully want to live in for a very long
- 18 time.
- 19 However, it seems to me that instead of viewing
- 20 landlords as valuable pillars of our communities, we're
- 21 often times punished for finding ways to keep our businesses
- 22 afloat and still manage to provide the same quality of
- 23 service despite facing one obstacle after another. New York
- 24 has some of the toughest rent regulations and yet we still
- 25 try to manage. We used to be able to cross-subsidize jumps

- 1 and costs like this through vacancy bonuses through fully
- 2 reimbursed IAI's for reasonable repayments relate to MCI's
- 3 or from some flexibility from market rate tenants or even
- 4 commercial tenants helping to subsidize the rent stabilized
- 5 units.
- 6 After the ruling of HSTPA we can no longer do that.
- 7 Then the COVID pandemic hit and we were faced with an
- 8 eviction moratorium. Other industries that have had their
- 9 own much shorter moratoriums in payments were resumed as
- 10 soon as they were lifted. However, with the courts backed
- 11 up, many of us were left with missing payments, a loss of
- 12 income, and no one to help us.
- 13 Many of my fellow landlords who have testified
- 14 before me can attest to the fact that evicting a tenant is
- 15 always the very last resort. But what about us? We're
- 16 talking about our lively hoods here. If a customer
- 17 repeatedly went to a restaurant and could not afford to pay
- 18 for their meals every time they ate there, is the restaurant
- 19 expected to pick up the slack? No, because that's not how
- 20 business operates. So why isn't the same logic provided to
- 21 landlords?
- While ERAP helped ease the burden slightly, the
- 23 program has been far from helpful. We have tenants who have
- 24 qualified but still owe additional rent arrears including
- 25 myself who has one tenant that owes over \$17,000. Inflation

- 1 is currently over 8 percent and that does not include
- 2 housing, food, and gas. Businesses everywhere are adjusting
- 3 their prices to co-inside with the rates in order to stay
- 4 afloat. Why shouldn't we be able to do the same?
- 5 Building materials were up over 35 percent since
- 6 March of '20. The cost of lumber has sky rocketed 60
- 7 percent since last September, steel has increased 128
- 8 percent year after year, and labor costs are shooting up.
- 9 Daniel Singer of Robison Oil testified last week that the
- 10 cost of oil and gas is now nothing compared to what we'll
- 11 see in the next few years. How are we supposed to keep our
- 12 businesses going if we can't make the necessary adjustments
- 13 that allow us to give the best service possible to our
- 14 tenants?
- Without a proper increase in rent renewals, our
- 16 buildings will suffer tremendously and so will our tenants.
- 17 Tonight I'm asking you for a fair and reasonable increase,
- 18 which is 6 to 8 percent for a one year and 10 to 12 for two
- 19 years. Your group is the only resource we have. We cannot
- 20 go anywhere else to plead our case. Please listen to our
- 21 concerns and understand that we are all on the same side at
- 22 the end of the day. We all want safe and quality housing
- 23 for all of our communities. I hope you can understand that
- 24 that takes resources and cost money all of which we need to
- 25 properly need to run our buildings.

- 1 Thank you very much for your time.
- 2 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you, Ms. DeRosa.
- 3 MS. DEROSA: How is that?
- 4 CHAIR RUBIN: Impeccable timing.
- 5 MS. DEROSA: Perfect. And I didn't plan it either.
- 6 CHAIR RUBIN: Can you please -- I have a question for
- 7 you. Can you please repeat the margins that you just spoke
- 8 about to 6 to --
- 9 MS. DEROSA: 6 to 8 percent for a one-year lease.
- 10 CHAIR RUBIN: Uh-huh.
- MS. DEROSA: And 10 to 12 percent for a two-year
- 12 lease.
- 13 CHAIR RUBIN: And, Mr. Finger, do you have a
- 14 question?
- 15 MR. FINGER: Yeah, I have a question.
- 16 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
- 17 MR. FINGER: Have you found that the HSTPA has any
- 18 impact on your ability to do either basic capital
- 19 improvements to the building or repair or improvements for
- 20 individual apartment repairs?
- MS. DEROSA: HSTPA has pretty much put a wrench the
- 22 wheel of our repairs. My contractor is M & R Windows, I
- 23 think he left, but I was working with him and we were doing
- 24 two floors of windows a year in my building. And I was
- 25 trying to work my way up to putting in double pane windows.

- 1 It will keep the apartments warmer, it will make the
- 2 buildings more green, it will cut down on the fuel costs, so
- 3 we'll have less heating complaints. And this was the first
- 4 year the window cost -- and, again, we've been doing
- 5 business for years, we're over 60 percent. I couldn't --
- 6 MR. FINGER: 60 percent of what? It went up 60
- 7 percent?
- 8 MS. DEROSA: They went up over 60 percent. So if I
- 9 was spending \$100,000 last year, I was spending \$160,000
- 10 this year.
- 11 MR. FINGER: And they aren't even able to continue
- 12 doing it?
- MS. DEROSA: No, I stopped.
- 14 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, Mr. Cherson?
- MR. CHERSON: Besides windows, are there other
- 16 projects that you had planned or were needed that you cannot
- 17 do because of the lack of funds through HSTPA annual or
- 18 lower in guidelines?
- MS. DEROSA: Yes, my buildings are between 50 and
- 20 60 years old. I have a boiler that's older than me and
- 21 while I may look young and fresh to everybody, I'm a little
- 22 bit older than you may think. My appliances -- they don't
- 23 make appliances today like they did 20 years ago. They last
- 24 a couple years. A lot of times they have -- you have a
- one-year warranty, the one-year comes up, the appliance

- 1 isn't working and you're spending, you know, hundred of
- 2 dollars on an appliance that you recently just bought, but
- 3 how do you say to a tenant, I'm sorry, but I can't give you
- 4 a refrigerator? I'm sorry, I can't fix your refrigerator
- 5 because it cost too much. We keep extra refrigerators in
- 6 stock so that when a tenant's refrigerator goes, they don't
- 7 have to wait for a new one come in which now takes about
- 8 four months to get a refrigerator. We have been in a panic
- 9 for the last two years just trying to get appliances in to
- 10 meet our tenant's needs. We'll order an appliance and we're
- 11 definitely paying a lot more for them now then we were. And
- 12 we'll order an appliance November 1st, with a delivery date
- of maybe November 15th and then we'll get an e-mail saying,
- 14 oh, sorry, that's not coming in until March or April. What
- 15 do I do for four months? A refrigerator is not optional. A
- 16 refrigerator is not a luxurious item and I'm running around
- 17 scrambling paying top dollar just trying to get my tenant
- 18 basic needs. Everything is going up.
- 19 MR. CHERSON: Other than replacements for
- 20 appliances, and if anybody's been -- you know, they're
- 21 basically out of stock and it will take months to get.
- MS. DEROSA: Oh, yeah, months to get it.
- 23 MR. CHERSON: But I'm talking about --
- 24 MS. DEROSA: The major stuff.
- MR. CHERSON: -- repairs, renovations, replacements

- 1 of old items and systems in the building. Are those
- 2 things -- have you put them on hold or canceled them?
- 3 MS. DEROSA: Yes.
- 4 MR. CHERSON: Have you called within the past two
- 5 or three years?
- 6 MS. DEROSA: Yes.
- 7 MR. CHERSON: And what would they do?
- 8 MS. DEROSA: I have a building that every time it
- 9 rained -- it was kind of a wind tunnel -- and the rain would
- 10 hit the side of the building and the rain would go through
- 11 the brick and damage the floors, the walls, tenant's belongs
- 12 that were near there. We should have replaced the brick on
- 13 the entire building --
- 14 MR. CHERSON: Is that pointing?
- 15 MS. DEROSA: It was a little bit more than pointing
- 16 because --
- 17 MR. CHERSON: Okay.
- MS. DEROSA: -- on every floor there's steel and
- 19 there's a steel ledge that supports the brick. You just
- 20 can't put brick on top of brick. You need things to support
- 21 it intermittently. And we would -- we did a partial job as
- 22 best we could. While we were doing it, we discovered that
- 23 the four corners of the buildings, the brick had shifted out
- 24 an inch or two and brick is only about three inches, so now
- 25 you were talking about a major safety issue. Like one of

- 1 the safety issues you read about in Manhattan where
- 2 someone's walking down the street and all of a sudden part
- 3 of the building falls on people and kills them. So we
- 4 actually had to borrow money and overextend ourselves to
- 5 create a safe situation because nobody was dying on my
- 6 property.
- 7 MR. CHERSON: Thank you.
- 8 MS. DEROSA: Yes.
- 9 MS. SANTIAGO: We've talked about ERAP and how much
- 10 landlords have received. In your case, do you feel
- 11 (inaudible.)
- MS. DEROSA: It helps some tenants with rent, but I
- 13 found that I had a good chunk of tenants who really took
- 14 advantage of the moratorium. So tenants that for, I don't
- 15 know, years, 5, 10 years paid their rent by the 5th, knowing
- 16 that we couldn't charge a late fee, were paying their rent
- 17 on the 15th, on the 20th. My mortgage date didn't change.
- 18 I still had to pay my mortgage on the same date. My
- 19 electric due date from Con Edison didn't change, that still
- 20 had to be paid.
- 21 I'm sorry. Can you tell me your question again?
- 22 MS. SANTIAGO: Sure. So do you think --
- 23 CHAIR RUBIN: Ms. Santiago --
- MS. SANTIAGO: Yes.
- 25 CHAIR RUBIN: -- can you speak up, please.

```
1
              MS. SANTIAGO:
                             Sure.
 2
              CHAIR RUBIN:
                            It's hard to hear you.
 3
              MS. SANTIAGO: Maybe I'll just take off my mask.
 4
              CHAIR RUBIN:
                            I'm sorry.
 5
              MS. SANTIAGO:
                             No, it's okay. So my question --
    what I really want to know, and we already had a discussion
 6
 7
     about ERAP and I asked how much -- you know how much is
 8
     received by tenant, by landlords overall in Westchester
 9
     County. So my question to you is, have you found that that
10
    has helped to offset the cost of tenants owing you money due
11
     to the order -- the moratorium?
12
              MS. DEROSA: Well, it did offset -- it didn't
13
                   It offset the rent that they owed. A lot of
     offset cost.
14
     tenants -- a lot of tenants struggled with the ERAP system.
    We wound up helping them. We would get the information from
15
     the Builders Institute and send that information to tenants
16
17
     so that they knew when it was opened, what they were needed,
     they would have current statements of what was due.
18
19
              Again, a lot of people took advantage of it.
20
     People would say, you know, I'm sorry. I'm going to leave
21
     and I'm not going to pay my last month's rent and there's
22
    nothing you could do about it. See ya. And we were like
23
    you have a lease, you know, any judge will tell you that
24
     you're not supposed to use security for your rent.
25
     supposed to use security for the apartment. I've had judges
```

- 1 say that to me in NY plain city court, but you know
- 2 people -- tenants knew that we were at a disadvantage and a
- 3 lot of people took advantage of us during that time and
- 4 there was nothing we could do about it.
- 5 And, you know, it's not like we could lower the
- 6 temperature on the boiler because we still had to maintain
- 7 68 degrees in the coldest part of the building; we still had
- 8 to plow the snow; we still had to fix potholes; we still had
- 9 to have the elevator company come in monthly and do their
- 10 preventative maintenance. I mean the building still
- 11 operated.
- Regardless of what happens in the world, buildings
- 13 still have to operate. Elevators still have to come down to
- 14 the lobby floor when you push the button and they have to
- 15 safely take residents who may not be able to walk upstairs
- 16 to the 6, 7th, 12th floor. So whether there's an eviction
- 17 moratorium, whether there's inflation, whether, you know,
- 18 all costs drop to the floor and we're bathing in money, we
- 19 still have to run those buildings. And ERAP -- not ERAP --
- 20 HSTPA really, really, hurt us and then you put low
- 21 guidelines on top of low guidelines, on top of low
- 22 guidelines year after year after year. Where's the money
- 23 supposed to come from? My elevator company expects a check
- 24 every month to come in and do my elevators. Where am I
- 25 supposed to --

- 1 CHAIR RUBIN: Mr. Finger has a question for you. I'm
- 2 sorry.
- 3 MS. DEROSA: I'm sorry. I did not answer the
- 4 question?
- 5 MR. FINGER: No, I have an additional question.
- 6 Are you still carrying additions to -- are you still
- 7 carrying in addition to tenants who got the ERAP assistance
- 8 arrears from those tenants?
- 9 MS. DEROSA: Yes, we work with tenants as best we
- 10 can. The easiest and best solution is to approach a tenant
- 11 and say, okay, we know you're struggling what can you do?
- 12 You know, would it help if we took your back balance and
- 13 spread it out over 24 months, would that help you? Would it
- 14 help if we -- so we work with tenants as best we can to make
- 15 payment arrangements and payment plans that, you know, as
- 16 people went back to work, they were able to now start paying
- 17 towards their arrears.
- 18 And a lot of people were very honorable to us.
- 19 People would call us up and say, look, I know I owe you
- 20 money but the pandemic stopped and I'm just going back to
- 21 work and I'll have you paid off by the end of the year and
- 22 we really want to thank you for -- and appreciate you for
- 23 working with us. And those were the nice moments that --
- 24 that came through during a very difficult time for
- 25 everybody.

- 1 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, Mr. Cherson.
- 2 MS. DEROSA: Don't fight over me.
- MR. CHERSON: Just to emphasize, the money that you
- 4 received from the ERAP went as a credit against the rent
- 5 owed and was reported as rent on the survey; right?
- 6 MS. DEROSA: Yeah, it has to be.
- 7 MR. CHERSON: Okay.
- 8 MS. DEROSA: I mean, whether someone's father pays
- 9 the rent or a tenant uses their paycheck to pay the rent or
- 10 they get Section 8 or they get money from ERAP, regardless
- 11 of where the money comes from, it has to go to their rental
- 12 account so you can keep track of where they are. You know,
- 13 if they overpaid, if they under paid, it goes towards their
- 14 rent. It would be a financial bookkeeping nightmare to have
- 15 to apply ERAP money to two separate places. Thank God they
- 16 didn't ask me for a separate line item for ERAP.
- 17 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay. I have to wrap up because we
- 18 have a lot of people --
- 19 MR. CHERSON: Okay.
- 20 CHAIR RUBIN: -- who are still pending. I'm sorry.
- 21 Thank you very much for your presentation.
- MS. DEROSA: Thank you for your time. It was good
- 23 seeing everybody in person for the first time in many years.
- 24 CHAIR RUBIN: I'm -- we have two presentations of
- 25 people who could not make it here. So I'm going to ask

- 1 Mr. Stecker to read one of them is from Rosagna Rubiano.
- 2 She's a tenant and --
- 3 MR. STECKER: Okay. Chair, so you want me to read
- 4 that written statement that was provided to the Board prior
- 5 to the meeting?
- 6 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
- 7 MR. STECKER: Do you want me to set a time for
- 8 that, Chair?
- 9 CHAIR RUBIN: Excuse me?
- 10 MR. STECKER: Do you want me to set a timer for it?
- 11 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah, three minutes.
- 12 MR. STECKER: As an individual. Okay.
- MR. CHERSON: I have a question. For someone
- 14 that's not here, don't we just hand out their written
- 15 statement? We've never read a written statement before of
- 16 people who aren't here whether they be landlord or tenant.
- 17 CHAIR RUBIN: We can --
- 18 MR. CHERSON: In addition to that, we obviously
- 19 cannot question somebody who's not here. And, I mean, it's
- 20 time that I've asked for which is why I'm here.
- 21 As Mr. Finger points out, we've never taken
- 22 statements. Yes, you can hand out a statement but -- from
- 23 politicians and various people, various tenants but we've
- 24 never had them read out loud.
- 25 CHAIR RUBIN: Well, I will leave it to the rest of

- 1 the Board to decide if they want to continue doing this or
- 2 not. We'll just hand the written statements that we have.
- 3 Mr. Counsel, what do you say?
- 4 MR. STECKER: I say they --
- 5 CHAIR RUBIN: You're our counsel, you can tell us
- 6 what you --
- 7 MR. STECKER: I think it's appropriate to put it up
- 8 to a vote of the Board as to whether they want written
- 9 statements to be read into the record or just kept as
- 10 statements that were passed to the Board and keep it as is
- and not spend the time to read them into the record.
- 12 CHAIR RUBIN: Can you call the roll, please?
- 13 MR. STECKER: Sure. You should probably see if you
- 14 can take a motion to that first.
- 15 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah. We have a motion to either the
- 16 statements or just handout the copies.
- 17 MR. CHERSON: I have a question to Mr. Stecker.
- 18 How is it proper to have a motion in the middle of a public
- 19 hearing where we're supposed to be hearing from the public
- 20 and that's the purpose of this hearing, but --
- MR. STECKER: Uh-huh.
- MR. CHERSON: -- to change the tradition that we've
- 23 had, which is not to read in statements. I don't see how
- 24 it's proper procedure to, in the middle of our hearing, to
- 25 have a vote on such a motion.

- 1 MR. STECKER: Well, I think it's worth pointing out
- 2 that in the last two years during the pandemic, the Board
- 3 did take written comments and they were read into the record
- 4 and there was no requirement that any questions be made to
- 5 the public.
- 6 MR. CHERSON: If they want it read into the record
- 7 and I have no objection to taking --
- 8 MR. STECKER: Well, they were read into the record.
- 9 I remember perfectly that they were because I read them into
- 10 the record during the meeting. So the Chair has asked me
- 11 for advice on this. Given that there's a conflict, I think
- 12 it's worthwhile to see if somebody wants to make a motion
- 13 for it to resolve the issue at this point.
- 14 MR. CHERSON: Right and the motion should not come
- 15 from Mr. Stecker. A motion has to come from one of the
- 16 Board members and not from counsel.
- 17 CHAIR RUBIN: I just did.
- 18 MR. STECKER: Exactly.
- 19 CHAIR RUBIN: I just made the motion to read --
- 20 MR. CHERSON: But who's the motion and who's
- 21 seconding it?
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: I'm making the motion.
- 23 MR. CHERSON: Okay. And who's second that?
- 24 MS. STEWART: Second.
- 25 MR. STECKER: I think the motion should be

- 1 clarified, Chair, what exactly the motion is.
- 2 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah, the motion is to either read the
- 3 statements that the people who cannot be here, read it to --
- 4 read it out loud to the audience and to the Board or just
- 5 hand out the copies of the paper.
- 6 MR. CHERSON: If he's just handing it out, but it
- 7 becomes part of the record.
- 8 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, definitely. Yeah. So both --
- 9 MR. STECKER: So, Chair, you're going to -- I mean,
- 10 the motion needs to be clarified as to which of those you're
- 11 making a motion for.
- 12 CHAIR RUBIN: For reading it.
- 13 MR. STECKER: But you have to decide which one you
- 14 want to happen and then make a motion towards that.
- 15 CHAIR RUBIN: Well, I want to read it.
- 16 MR. CHERSON: You want it read?
- 17 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah.
- 18 MR. CHERSON: Okay.
- 19 CHAIR RUBIN: I want it to be read and to be -- at
- 20 the beginning I asked Mr. Stecker to read one and
- 21 Ms. Stewart to read the other one for two people who could
- 22 not be here for health reasons I think.
- 23 MR. FINGER: Who would read the other one?
- 24 MR. CHERSON: Ms. Stewart.
- MS. STEWART: Me.

1	CHAIR RUBIN: Ms. Stewart.
2	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And you're going to second
3	on that motion?
4	CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
5	MS. STEWART: I seconded it.
6	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.
7	MR. STECKER: Okay. So there's a motion by the
8	Chair to have the written comments received prior to the
9	meeting read into the record. Seconded by Ms. Stewart.
10	I'll call the roll.
11	Velene Acquah?
12	MS. ACQUAH: Here.
13	MR. STECKER: Yes?
14	MS. ACQUAH: Yes.
15	MR. STECKER: Lamont Badru?
16	MR. BADRU: No.
17	MR. STECKER: Eddie Mae Barnes?
18	MR. BARNES: Yes.
19	MR. STECKER: Evelyn Santiago?
20	MS. SANTIAGO: Yes.
21	MR. STECKER: Eliot Cherson?
22	MR. CHERSON: No.
23	MR. STECKER: Ken Finger?
24	MR. FINGER: No.
25	MR. STECKER: Tamara Stewart?
1	

1	MS. STEWART: Yes.
2	MR. STECKER: Sylvia Hamer?
3	MS. HAMER: Yes.
4	MR. STECKER: And Chair Rubin?
5	CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
6	MR. STECKER: So the motion carries by a vote of
7	six to three. So the Board has voted to have the ability to
8	read these into the record.
9	So, Chair, at your direction I can do that. You're
10	just going to have to give me specific directions as
11	CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
12	MR. STECKER: to which you want me to read into
13	the record and whether you're going to constrain it to the
14	time limits.
15	CHAIR RUBIN: You will have three minutes to read the
16	statement from Rosagna Rubiano.
17	MR. STECKER: Okay.
18	MR. CHERSON: (Inaudible.)
19	CHAIR RUBIN: Rosagna Rubiano.
20	MR. FINGER: Do you have a copy of that?
21	MR. STECKER: The copy was e-mailed prior to
22	CHAIR RUBIN: He sent an e-mail.
23	MR. FINGER: Okay. So it was not distributed?
24	MS. STEWART: What's the question?
25	MR. STECKER: Okay. Starting three minutes now.
1	

```
1
              Members of the Board. Dear Rent Board, I'm writing
 2
     to you as a concerned tenant and DHCR complainant who has
 3
     dealt with multiple unresolved matters since 2016.
     only through the help of my attorney that I was able to
 4
 5
     navigate this broken system. Not many tenants had the
     opportunity to retain an attorney or the stamina to persist
 6
 7
     three years of slow-moving proceeding. And, yet despite our
 8
     rent overcharge when (inaudible) services ordered followed
 9
    by two enforcement proceedings, the system has still dragged
10
     out these complaints without resolution to this day.
11
              While I have incurred additional charges and my
12
     family's health continues to be at risk.
                                               I'm a nurse
13
    practitioner that has worked the front lines during the
14
    pandemic and there was no break for us for two full years.
    We helped everybody, we stood holding their hands while they
15
    were dying when their family members could not be there with
16
17
           We're still in the midst of recovering from a
     them.
    pandemic which is not over. People are struggling to catch
18
19
     up on bills from the 2020 height of unemployment due to the
20
    pandemic. It is people like me, people who are doing
21
     everything possible to make ends meet who then have to come
22
    home to a deteriorated building with mice running across my
23
     apartment floor and mold throughout my apartment.
24
    mention the long list of building lack of services as to
25
    which nothing has happened since our tenants association
```

- 1 filed a complaint last year.
- 2 This foot dragging is a calculating tactic by slum
- 3 landlords who take advantage of the slow action by the DHCR
- 4 to get us to move out so they can renovate and raise the
- 5 rent. Yet the system fines these landlords a mere \$500 for
- 6 the first are refusal, \$2,000 for the second refusal to
- 7 comply with DHCR orders for repairs. This is simply the
- 8 cost of doing business for landlords. There's absolutely no
- 9 incentive for them to do the right thing, only for slum
- 10 landlords to make a profit and essentially put tenants
- 11 health at risk.
- During the past six years my family and I have
- 13 dealt with the following issues which have yet to be
- 14 resolved. Exposure to mold, which has exacerbated medical
- 15 conditions for my asthmatic daughter; refusal to make
- 16 repairs such as water leaks; falling ceiling debris; broken
- 17 pipes; mice, roach, and water bug infestations that have
- 18 vermin crawling across our feet in the middle of the day;
- 19 gas pipe leaks and the gas being shutoff to the building for
- 20 over six months without means for tenants to cook; nor was
- 21 any reimbursement offered to the cost of take out, hot
- 22 plates, toaster ovens so we can feed our families; pet fecal
- 23 matter left throughout our building that never gets cleaned
- 24 up and petrifies after being left in the same spot for a
- 25 month; I've been stuck in the elevator on a hot summer day

- 1 with several children without a functioning emergency bell
- 2 for assistance; refusal to renew my lease that took six
- 3 years to get fixed; threats of eviction despite paying my
- 4 rent in a timely manner; harassment and threats including a
- 5 personal visit by the landlord and super to a senior
- 6 tenant's apartment to intimidate her to get the tenant's
- 7 association to drop the building-wide complaint.
- I beg you not to raise rents this year when the
- 9 DHCR landlord survey numbers released show that landlords in
- 10 2020 made a 40 percent profit and in 2021 a 37 percent
- 11 profit after expenses --
- 12 CHAIR RUBIN: You may finish your sentence.
- 13 MR. STECKER: They continue to profit while many of
- 14 us are struggling to recover from pandemic loss of full
- 15 income, barely able to make ends meet. Facing rising
- 16 inflation cost and possible recession. Please do the right
- 17 thing and do not impose unnecessary rent increases on the
- 18 tenants this year.
- 19 Rosagna Rubiano, 527 Riverdale Avenue, Yonkers, New
- 20 York.
- 21 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- I will now call the next person on the list, it is
- 23 Alana Ciuffetelli.
- 24 MS. CIUFFETELLI: You got it. Thank you.
- 25 CHAIR RUBIN: Finally.

- 1 MS. CIUFFETELLI: Good evening and thank you for
- 2 your time tonight. Hello. My name is Alana Ciuffetelli and
- 3 I'm the Chair of the Apartment Owner's Advisory Council of
- 4 the BRI and I sit on the Board of Directors of the
- 5 Westchester Owners' Association. Not only have I been a
- 6 small landlord for basically my entire life, but I'm also a
- 7 real estate broker and managing agent. Some of you may know
- 8 me because I've testified numerous times in the past. If
- 9 you don't, I'm sure you can assume from the organizations
- 10 that I'm heavily involved in that I'm passionate about what
- 11 I do.
- I live and breathe my buildings. Not only are they
- 13 a piece of my livelihood, but they are also part of my
- 14 family legacy. My real estate company is called Three C
- 15 Realty because three generations of Ciuffetelli's have
- 16 owned, managed, and operated our buildings. With a 4th
- 17 grade education and little to no understanding of the
- 18 English language, my grandfather, a first generation
- 19 immigrant from Italy risked it all on hopes of providing
- 20 better -- a better future for his family and generations to
- 21 come. And our buildings have given back to us as much as we
- 22 have put into them. But for the first time in my life I'm
- 23 afraid. Afraid of what's going to happen to my buildings,
- 24 afraid of what's going to happen to my tenants and afraid
- 25 for my family.

- 1 Year after year the increases made by the Rent
- 2 Guidelines Board have not been sustainable. Managing
- 3 buildings cost money and it comes with a lot of unexpected
- 4 risks and expenses. Yes, this is with every business, but
- 5 somehow landlords are hardly viewed as business owners. The
- 6 argument of a high ROI that was mentioned at previous
- 7 hearings and tonight as well does not account for additional
- 8 costs such as interest payments, depreciation, or
- 9 amortization.
- 10 Earlier tonight a tenant's advocate mentioned that
- 11 interest should not be reported in the operating -- as an
- 12 operating cost. We're also being told that depreciation
- 13 shouldn't be considered. We are -- tenant advocates are
- 14 constantly citing incorrect and grossly inflated percentages
- 15 and here's why that's incorrect. What I handed out tonight.
- 16 The NYC RGB which has hundred of thousands of more ETPA
- 17 units than Westchester, Nassau, and Rockland combined gives
- its board members every year, and definitely this year, the
- 19 2020 mortgage survey report. If New York City RGB thought
- 20 that interest should not be an -- if the NYC RGB thought
- 21 that interest should not be an operating cost, then why was
- 22 it given out? We had a CPA testify, Angelo Milone, he's
- 23 licensed and practicing in New York State. He tells us that
- 24 interest must be considered as an operating expense. Jerry
- 25 Houlihan, my co-chair, great guy, licensed mortgage sales

- 1 broker in New York gave us examples in clear detail which
- 2 show owner's real rate of return on investment is less than
- 3 5 percent. I repeat, less than 5 percent.
- Also, if the IRS let's me deduct interest payments,
- 5 depreciation, amortization why do tenant advocated think we
- 6 should turn a blind eye to those expenses? Tenant advocates
- 7 can say that we still made a return on our investments, but
- 8 this is our bread and butter. We have to make a return.
- 9 This is how I feed my families.
- 10 As inflation rate continues upwards of 8.5 percent
- 11 and the building and repair costs sky rocket, we're finding
- 12 it more and more difficult to make any sort of return on
- 13 renovations leading to more vacancies. Our job is to
- 14 provide quality and safe housing for our tenants. When we
- 15 suffer, they suffer as well and we understand that. With
- 16 these deplorable increases, how do we provide the same
- 17 quality and services that our tenants deserve? We are here
- 18 tonight because we care. We care about our buildings, we
- 19 care about our tenants, we want to provide the best for
- 20 them. Quality services cost resources, time, but most
- 21 importantly, money.
- In the past few years IAI's have been curtailed by
- 23 regulation and MCI's have been completely changed. \$15,000
- 24 for an apartment renovation can't be done. You can't do
- 25 anything with that. The math doesn't add up. For ample, in

- 1 one of my buildings a boiler went in the dead of winter. I
- 2 wanted to replace the boiler but received quotes ranging
- 3 from \$88,000 to \$125,000. To put it into perspective, six
- 4 years ago, the same boiler cost me \$26,000. This is a
- 5 21-unit building, I don't have that kind of money. And with
- 6 the changes in HSTPA that they brought on, I can't save
- 7 towards reserves. It ultimately cost me \$10,000 to make a
- 8 repair, but trying to get it fixed in the winter was
- 9 extremely difficult because we had shortage of supply.
- In another building, we continuously have to patch
- 11 a roof as it was damaged by hurricane Ida. I want to
- 12 replace the roof, the cost quoted for this, 40k plus the
- 13 cost of new plywood. Again, I can't afford to do that.
- 14 During the last storm, the back gutter went down a building.
- 15 To replace 38 square foot of gutter cost me \$10,000.
- 16 \$10,000. It should have cost \$2,500 to \$3,000 but COVID and
- 17 inflation has driven up pricing for all of us. Landlords as
- 18 well. We are not inflation proof, we are not COVID proof,
- 19 we are not pandemic proof, we don't have deep pockets as
- 20 small landlords.
- 21 With insufficient increases how do you expect us to
- 22 continue keeping our buildings safe for our tenants? Sure
- 23 landlord corporations may afford to eat up such costs, but
- 24 not us small landlords. And there's a lot of us. A lot of
- 25 good landlords. A lot of family-owned operated businesses

- 1 that bought buildings or built buildings in the hope of
- 2 achieving the ultimate American dream. We took a risk. If
- 3 these increases continue to trend the way they have in the
- 4 past few years, you will lose these people. You will -- I
- 5 only have a paragraph left.
- 6 CHAIR RUBIN: Go ahead.
- 7 MS. CIUFFETELLI: Thank you.
- 8 We are the ones who have worked meticulously to
- 9 work with our tenants during the pandemic. We are the ones
- 10 who help those qualify for ERAP apply for the program. We
- 11 are the ones who take pride in keeping our buildings, the
- 12 kind of buildings that we want our tenants to live in. Like
- 13 I said before, I've testified numerous times in the past but
- 14 for the first time in my life I'm afraid. I'm afraid for my
- 15 tenants. I'm afraid for my buildings. You are our only
- 16 means of an increase. We cannot go anywhere else to voice
- 17 our concerns. Our livelihoods are in your hands and I
- 18 implore you to consider the struggles that we have faced
- 19 these past few years and the ongoing struggles we will face
- 20 going forward if reasonable increases are not made. I thank
- 21 you for your time.
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. Any questions from the
- 23 Board. No?
- 24 MS. CIUFFETELLI: Thank you.
- 25 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.

```
1
              Is Ms. Antoinette Rose here?
 2
              MS. ROSE: Yes.
 3
              CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, please.
              MR. CHERSON:
 4
                            Say your name.
 5
              MS. ROSE: Antoinette Rose.
 6
              CHAIR RUBIN: Antoinette Rose, are you representing
 7
    yourself or an entity?
 8
              MS. ROSE: An entity, 1199SEIU.
 9
              CHAIR RUBIN:
                            Thank you. You have five minutes.
10
              MS. ROSE: Can I give you --
11
              MR. CHERSON: Can you repeat what you said?
12
    didn't hear you.
13
                         1199SEIU Healthcare Workers Union East.
              MS. ROSE:
14
              MR. CHERSON:
                            Okay.
                                   Thank you.
15
             MS. ROSE: Can I give you --
              CHAIR RUBIN: You have five minutes.
16
17
              MS. ROSE: Okay.
                                Thank you.
              Good evening Board members, Westchester County
18
19
     residents, and interested guests. My name is Antoinette
20
    Rose, I live at Mount Vernon and I work for Montefiore
21
    Medical Center in Tarrytown. I am a proud delegate for
22
     1199SEIU, the countries largest healthcare workers Union
23
    with over 45,000 members, over 12,000 of whom live in
24
    Westchester County. I appeared before this Board last year
25
    to tell you about how badly the pandemic was affecting me
```

- 1 and my coworkers. Today I am back to speak on behalf of a
- 2 severely rent burdened tenant and I respectfully request
- 3 that you freeze rents for Westchester tenants.
- 4 Like my 1199SEIU coworkers, I go to work everyday
- 5 to help people. Our members are frontline caregiver's in
- 6 hospitals; nursing homes; home care; clinics; pharmacies;
- 7 and all areas of the healthcare industry. We are nurses;
- 8 nurses aides; physician assistants; techs; lab workers;
- 9 clerks; housekeepers; dietary workers; transporters;
- 10 pharmacies; social workers; and many other types of medical
- 11 professionals.
- We are the healthcare heroes who continue to fight
- 13 through the COVID pandemic which is not over. I moved into
- 14 my rent stabilized one-bedroom apartment in Mount Vernon six
- 15 years ago and my rent is almost \$2,000. Although I have
- 16 been with Montefiore for 22 years and many -- employment has
- 17 been steady, it's a challenge to pay my rent every month.
- 18 When I moved into my apartment I had a roommate to share
- 19 expenses with. Unfortunately, my first roommate moved out
- 20 and things didn't work out with my second roommate.
- 21 Consequently, I've been paying more than half of my income
- 22 for rent. You can't work from home, if you have no home.
- 23 Many of my coworkers and neighbors lived in rent stabilized
- 24 buildings and are also struggling to pay rent. Due to the
- 25 high cost of housing in our community, many of us are having

- 1 a hard time paying rent even before COVID and the pandemic
- 2 just made things worse. Many of our members household
- 3 require several people working multiple shifts to pay for
- 4 rent; food; child-care; transportation; and necessities.
- 5 Child-care and elder-care responsibilities are still making
- 6 it difficult for some of our members or their spouses to
- 7 return to work full-time even though the household needs
- 8 additional income to pay rent. Many fixed income neighbors
- 9 are having a difficult time meeting their expenses due to
- 10 the inflation that's affecting all of us and the food
- 11 distribution lines that this church across the street from
- 12 my building are getting longer, not shorter.
- While I thank God for a life saving vaccines and
- 14 I'm encouraged that our economic is bouncing back, many
- individual households like mine, my retired neighbors, and
- 16 many of my coworkers are still struggling to pay for
- 17 necessities. And slowly digging out of debt while grieving
- 18 the loss of more than 1 million of our fellow citizens.
- 19 If this Board recognize the plight that many
- 20 tenants find ourselves in because there just isn't enough
- 21 affordable housing to go around. If you truly appreciate
- 22 the sacrifices that healthcare workers made you in this
- 23 worse of the pandemic and if you believe that our seniors
- 24 deserve to live out their golden years with dignity and some
- 25 measure of comfort, then please help struggling rent

- 1 stabilized tenants by freezing rent this year.
- 2 Thank you.
- 3 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 4 Any questions for Ms. Rose?
- 5 Thank you for your presentation.
- 6 MS. ROSE: Okay.
- 7 CHAIR RUBIN: I will now call Sandra Borducci.
- 8 MS. BORDUCCI: Good evening.
- 9 CHAIR RUBIN: Hello.
- 10 MS. BORDUCCI: Hi. Good evening Board. My name is
- 11 Sandra Borducci and I'm testifying on behalf of some
- 12 landlords in southwest Yonkers and Mount Vernon. I just
- 13 want to address the point about seniors. We do have a few
- 14 senior tenants in rent stabilized buildings who do get SCRIE
- 15 which basically freezes their rent. So I just want to note
- 16 that. Even though the legal rent goes up, theirs is frozen.
- I just want to go over some caselaw that I found.
- 18 Number 1. According to Rose Associates v. DHCR, the
- 19 Appellate Division of New York indicated that the purpose of
- 20 the Rent Guidelines Board is to balance the landlords needs
- 21 against the tenants. There has to be a rational basis for
- 22 the agency's determination considering substantial evidence
- 23 on both sides.
- 24 In the case of Casado v. New York City Rent
- 25 Guidelines Board (phonetic) in 2011, the Court of Appeals of

- 1 New York opine that small annually authorized increases do
- 2 not come close to covering increase costs. 2011, that was
- 3 way before the 2019 update to the rent guidelines which
- 4 totally crushed landlord's abilities to increase rents
- 5 proportionate to economic conditions.
- 6 Further, in the case of Rent Stabilization
- 7 Association of New York City, Inc. V. New York City Rent
- 8 Guidelines Board of 2017, the Supreme Court of New York held
- 9 that while tenant affordability is a proper factor for the
- 10 Board to consider in establishing annual rent guidelines,
- 11 tenant affordability is not the only factor. Other factors
- 12 include the economic condition of the residential real
- 13 estate industry in the affected area as explained by a
- 14 landlord representative and business industry
- 15 representatives. These factors include real estate taxes;
- 16 utility rates; operating maintenance cost; insurance rates;
- 17 governmental fees; cost of fuel; labor.
- 18 Let's go over real estate taxes. Mount Vernon real
- 19 estate taxes increased between 12 and 13 percent between
- 20 2019 and 2022. Where's the cap on Mount Vernon City Hall?
- 21 Yonkers real estate taxes increased 5 percent since 2019.
- 22 Utility rates, those are electric and water. Utility rates
- 23 increased a whopping 28 percent since 2019. Who's covering
- 24 that? Operating maintenance cost. Let's talk about
- 25 insurance. Our personal cost increased 10 percent in 2021.

- 1 10 percent for insurance. We rely so much on insurance. We
- 2 just had a building fire that -- not in New York, in another
- 3 location, it totally destroyed the building. Without
- 4 insurance we can't cover anything. Heating fuel increased
- 5 for us 8 percent since 2019. Mount Vernon imposed a
- 6 sustainability fee of \$200 per apartment. Their website
- 7 says pass this on to the tenants. Who -- under where? How
- 8 are we going to pass this onto the tenants under the Rent
- 9 Guidelines under DHCR? I would love if you guys know the
- 10 answer, please let me know. And how are tenants going to
- 11 react to paying an extra \$200 a year from now on?
- 12 And furthermore, every single one of our vendors:
- 13 Waste -- everything. Every single vendor has hiked up their
- 14 prices 3 to 8 percent. We got a letter one by one everyday.
- 15 Sorry. We're increasing our prices 3 to 8 percent,
- 16 whatever -- depending on the industry. You know, 8 percent
- 17 inflation on top of that. Our paving guy told us that
- 18 oil -- the cost of oil has sky rocketed. One parking lot
- 19 cost us \$120,000. 12 balconies cost us \$350,000. Our NOI,
- 20 ours, has decreased 26 percent this year. 26 percent. That
- 21 leaves us a lot less money to pay for capital improvements
- 22 for our aging buildings. And if I hear about MCI's as a way
- 23 to compensate for this and recover this, that's a joke. The
- 24 2019 laws capped MCI's at 2 percent per year. You get to
- 25 recover the cost over, like, the life of the thing which

- 1 could be 25 years. And, okay, 25 times 2 percent, that's 50
- 2 percent of your cost recovered over 25 years.
- 3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And then the rent goes down.
- 4 MS. BORDUCCI: And then the rent -- it's a real
- 5 joke. We're at a loss. You are the God's of our faiths.
- 6 You should change your name to the faiths because you're all
- 7 we have left at this point. And that's all I have.
- 8 CHAIR RUBIN: Any questions from the Board?
- 9 Thank you for your presentation.
- 10 MS. BORDUCCI: Thank you.
- 11 CHAIR RUBIN: I will now ask Ms. Stewart to read the
- 12 presentation that we have, but do we have copies of that
- 13 presentation, Mr. Stecker?
- 14 MR. STECKER: I do not have copies of that
- 15 presentation, Chair.
- 16 CHAIR RUBIN: I think if we don't have copies we
- 17 cannot -- we just have to --
- 18 MS. STEWART: It was e-mailed to everyone.
- 19 CHAIR RUBIN: It was e-mailed to everybody?
- MS. STEWART: Yes.
- 21 MR. STECKER: I mean it has been e-mailed to the
- 22 Board. I don't have physical copies here, Chair.
- 23 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay. So we have the copies. Excuse
- 24 me. This session is still going on.
- Yeah. Go ahead, Ms. Stewart, you can read it.

- 1 MS. STEWART: Thank you. This is the testimony of
- 2 Michael McKee who's the treasurer of Tenants PAC, New York
- 3 City and he's very sorry that he can't be here in person at
- 4 this evening's hearing.
- 5 CHAIR RUBIN: He has five minutes.
- 6 MS. STEWART: Yes.
- 7 CHAIR RUBIN: And if the reading is longer than that,
- 8 I will have to interrupt you.
- 9 MS. STEWART: Sure.
- 10 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 11 MS. STEWART: I want to remind you that the very
- 12 purpose of rent regulation is to give tenants security from
- 13 arbitrary or a retaliatory evictions and to keep rent
- 14 affordable over time. Not only for the benefit of current
- 15 tenants, but for the future families who will need an
- 16 affordable place to live.
- 17 In this year of raising inflation you will hear
- 18 appeal from landlords for large rent increases, but please
- 19 remember that inflation affects everyone, landlords and
- 20 tenants in that, landlords are better equipped to withstand
- 21 it. The data provided to you by the DHCR Office of Rent
- 22 Administration Staff based on income and expense reported --
- 23 reports filed by landlords give you all the justification
- 24 you need for another rent freeze at least for one-year lease
- 25 renewals.

- 1 Net operating incomes. Whether looking at table
- 2 one with data from buildings where landlords provide heat or
- 3 table one for buildings where landlords do not, rental
- 4 income for 2021 exceeds rental income from 2019.
- 5 Expenditures have increased only slightly from 2019 to 2021
- 6 and net operating income from 2019 to 2021 has essentially
- 7 held steady over the last 35 years.
- 8 The bottom line is that the average NOI for rent
- 9 stabilized properties is Westchester County was 37.37
- 10 percent in 2021 compared to 34.5 percent in 1987. The
- 11 first -- excuse me.
- 12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm leaving. It's okay.
- 13 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes, please.
- 14 MS. STEWART: Please do so quietly.
- 15 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: All right.
- MS. STEWART: Thank you.
- 17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I can't listen to the lies.
- 18 MS. STEWART: Leave quietly, thank you.
- 19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I will. I can't listen to
- 20 the lies.
- 21 MS. STEWART: All right. The first year under
- 22 historical (inaudible) provided by ORA staff. Owners of
- 23 rent stabilized properties in Westchester County are doing
- 24 quite well.
- 25 Inflation. The current inflationary spiral is

- 1 having a negative impact on the residential rental market
- 2 everywhere in the United States. Around the world, in fact.
- 3 Market rents have soared above anyone's expectations and
- 4 additional pressure on rents comes from more affluent
- 5 consumers who find themselves unable to afford to buy homes
- 6 at the moment, but can outbid ordinary renters for a
- 7 diminishing supply of rental housing.
- Please remember that inflation affects everyone.
- 9 Tenants are affected every bit as much as landlords and
- 10 don't have any of the financial advantages that come from
- 11 ownership of real property.
- 12 Impact of rent increases. According to the vacancy
- 13 reports provided by ORA the median rent for apartments that
- 14 turned over between 2019 and 2021 in Westchester was a
- 15 \$1,787 for those who signed one-year vacancy leases. While
- 16 these figures apply only to apartments that turned over,
- 17 remember that since 2019 landlords have not been allowed to
- 18 increase rents for vacant units substantially over what the
- 19 former tenants were paying.
- 20 So let's use this median to calculate what your
- 21 decision this year would mean for ETPA tenants. A 1 percent
- 22 rent hike would be \$18; a 2 percent increase would be \$35; 3
- 23 percent, \$54; 4 percent, \$71; 5 percent \$89. These are
- 24 rounded. These numbers are a fairly exact measure of what
- 25 tenants move into ETPA apartments in the last few years

- 1 would have to pay if you adopted such an adjustment. While
- 2 we don't have rent numbers for occupied apartments, let's
- 3 just assume for a moment that this median ETPA rent in
- 4 Westchester County was \$1,500 in 2021.
- With a monthly rent of \$1,500 here's the impact
- 6 your potential decision this year would have on tenants. 1
- 7 percent rent hike, \$15; 2 percent, \$30; 3 percent, \$45; 4
- 8 percent, \$60; 5 percent, \$75. These are rounded. Think in
- 9 terms of the dollar amounts not percentages when you are
- 10 considering your vote on Thursday. These are real numbers
- 11 that will have a real impact on tenants who are struggling
- 12 with paying more every time they go to the grocery store or
- 13 pay their utility bills or fill up at the gas station. Even
- 14 a modest rent increase will be harmful to most tenants.
- During the last two years many renters were laid
- 16 off from their jobs or had their hours substantially
- 17 reduced. Many have not qualified for unemployment or other
- 18 benefits and even where tenants have successfully obtained
- 19 ERAP payments to cover some of their back rent, many still
- 20 owe some back rent and/or lack the ability to pay future
- 21 rent. Here's the question you must answer: Who is more
- 22 able to survive the economic breakdown of the last two
- 23 years, the people who live in rent stabilized apartments or
- 24 the people who own those apartments? For many reasons it is
- 25 clear that landlords are better positioned to come

- 1 reasonably whole. Thank you.
- 2 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- I will now call Gene Diresta. Mr. Diresta, are you
- 4 representing yourself or an entity?
- 5 MR. DIRESTA: I'm a financial model consultant.
- 6 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay. So you have five minutes.
- 7 MR. DIRESTA: Thank you.
- 8 Mr. Stecker, it's really important that when you
- 9 get these that you look at it carefully because I will be
- 10 referring to it during this presentation with a larger
- 11 version of what I have.
- 12 I'm a mathematician, professor of mathematics and
- 13 engineering and I currently teach artificial intelligence to
- 14 professional engineers. So I received some interesting data
- 15 sets from PRI and asked for my opinion.
- 16 So I now begin. Good evening Rent Guideline
- 17 Members, colleagues, and audience. This evening I will
- 18 summarize a two-part report on financial modeling analysis
- 19 using only DHCR data and rent increases the Rent Guidelines
- 20 Board has granted in response to that data and the
- 21 simulation recommendation for the rent increase the Rent
- 22 Guideline Board should grant for 2022. Part one presents
- 23 the findings from a statistical analysis of historical data
- 24 relating Rent Guideline Board increases for one-year lease
- 25 versus New York inflation rates for it's period 1974 to

- 1 2021. And a closer evaluation of how the period 2010 to
- 2 2021 has affected the actual growth rate metric for the
- 3 landlords, cash flow not including depreciation per unit,
- 4 also referred to as the bottom line.
- 5 Figure 1. This is figure 1. You have it. Please
- 6 look at it so that you will understand the comments that I
- 7 am going to make next. Figure one summarizes how the Rent
- 8 Guideline Board one-year rent increases have tracked with
- 9 the New York inflation rate from '74 -- 1974 to '21. The
- 10 data is -- the data set is broken into two parts. The green
- 11 dots are the rent guideline data during the period 1974 to
- 12 2010 and the red squares are the rent guideline data during
- 13 the period 2010 to 2021. Note, this second period will
- 14 allow us to correlate the rent guideline activities with the
- 15 actual growth rate analysis that uses available DHCR data.
- 16 The two data sets were analyzed using linear regression
- 17 analysis that asks the question, is there correlation
- 18 between rent guideline rent increases and inflation rate.
- 19 Now, a little bit about the correlation
- 20 coefficient. It has -- it's broken into three ranges from
- 21 0 -- the range goes from 0 to 1. It provides a metric that
- 22 is used to answer the question. Our squared valued between
- 23 0 and point .33 suggest the low correlation between
- 24 variables values between .34 and 66 suggests a moderate
- 25 correlation and values above .67 suggest strong correlation.

- 1 The negative values indicate no correlation. From our
- 2 analysis for the -- for the '74 to 2010 the period -- the R
- 3 squared is .6821 that indicates strong correlation between
- 4 rent guideline rent increase and the inflation rate. While
- 5 for the period 2010 to 2021, the R squared is minus .264
- 6 that indicates no correlation between the two variables.
- 7 The slope of the regression line through the
- 8 correlated '74 to 2010 data suggests that the -- that
- 9 historically the Rent Guideline Board was 98.2 percent of
- 10 the inflation rate. Let me repeat that. The rent guideline
- 11 rent increase was 98.2 percent of the inflation rate.
- 12 That's the historical data. Your organization, okay?
- 13 Shown here. This is the green line, okay? And you can see
- 14 the correlation. On the other hand, the red is buckshot.
- 15 There is no correlation. So the slope comparison analysis
- 16 performed that the two data sets confirmed that they are
- 17 statistically different. Two completely different sets of
- 18 data.
- 19 We next consider the effects the rent guideline
- 20 decision has had on the landlord's bottom line metric. The
- 21 actual growth rate. And now we refer to picture two. This
- 22 is picture two. Everybody see it? Picture two. Okay. The
- 23 actual growth rate for cash flow minus depreciation per unit
- 24 is evaluated in five, two-year periods. There's a
- 25 noticeable change following 2017 from a positive rate to a

- 1 negative rate and that the declining trend has continued for
- 2 over four years.
- Further, the trend went negative before HSTPA 219
- 4 law and the COVID pandemic. So this occurred before COVID,
- 5 before HSTPA. Let me explain and show you hear, okay? This
- 6 is the profit, the bottom line is rate of growth, okay? And
- 7 you can see that in this period it went negative and
- 8 continues to go negative. The brown line is the inflation
- 9 rate.
- 10 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. Have you finished or you
- 11 would like to wrap up?
- MR. DIRESTA: I will just jump the packet to part
- 13 two and say that on the basis of the modeling analysis,
- 14 which does not consider interest, okay? Using the NOI
- 15 concept, okay? The rent increase that should be granted is
- 16 8.76 percent for a one-year lease. Let me repeat that.
- 17 Using the NOI analysis strictly, the rent increase should be
- 18 8.76 percent. If we follow the historical data then the
- 19 rent increase should be 4.15 percent.
- 20 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. Any questions?
- 21 MR. CHERSON: Quick question.
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes.
- 23 MR. CHERSON: Could you please give a little bit of
- 24 background about your professional life to present this
- 25 case?

```
1
                            Sure.
                                   I was -- I'm a professor, I
             MR. DIRESTA:
 2
    was a professor. I'm recently retired from NYU.
                                                       I was the
 3
    director of the bioengineering group. I was also a medical
 4
    nuclear physicists at Memorial Sloan-Kettering where I still
 5
     conduct research on drug delivery. My specialty is
    mathematics and modeling. When you look at how to determine
 6
 7
    whether you should give an injection, you use people like me
 8
     to analyze the data to make a statement as to whether or not
 9
     the data suggests to move forward. So I'm currently working
10
     triple negative breast cancer. Trying to improve drug
     delivery to those woman who have that disease. But I'm a
11
12
    modeler. Data is what I work with.
13
              CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
14
             Any other questions?
             Thank you, Mr. Diresta.
15
             I will now call Tim Foley. Good evening.
16
             MR. FOLEY: Good evening, Madam Chair.
17
18
             CHAIR RUBIN: Are you representing yourself or an
19
     entity?
20
             MR. FOLEY: An entity, the BRI.
             CHAIR RUBIN: You have five minutes.
21
22
             MR. FOLEY: Thank you so much.
23
              Good evening, everyone.
                                       I'm the CEO of the
24
     Building and Realty Institute, the BRI. And, as always, we
```

appreciate your thorough review of the data, the overall

25

- 1 economic picture and this orderly public (inaudible), so
- 2 thank you for your service.
- When I spoke before you last year, the last part of
- 4 my comment was how in addition to sky rocketing prices for
- 5 lumber, we were beginning to see price increases in about a
- 6 dozen distinct building supplies. Well, as we now know,
- 7 that wound up being just the beginning. Even with the rate
- 8 of inflation as often mentioned that's higher than anything
- 9 we've seen since 1989, the cost of building supplies and
- 10 repairs has increased 40 percent since the start of the
- 11 pandemic and that is between three and five times the rate
- 12 of inflation.
- As you've heard at every public meeting, the
- 14 combination of this surge in prices, the changes of HSTPA,
- 15 the rent freeze in 2020, and the mostly frozen increases of
- 16 2021 has produced an observable effect. These buildings are
- 17 not seeing the level of repair, upkeep, and improvements
- 18 that we would expect and that they probably need. And
- 19 you've heard time and again it's because owners can't figure
- 20 out how to afford them.
- In the cost reports provided by HCR, repairs and
- 22 maintenance is the only main expense category that is lower
- 23 than it was in 2019. You've heard from multiple local small
- 24 business vendors about how this loss is directly affecting
- 25 their business and their employees. Now, as I mentioned,

- 1 the BRI includes home builders and remodelers and so I can
- 2 say with certainty that this decrease in repairs and
- 3 construction is not industry-wide. New housing starts both
- 4 in the nation and as a whole and in Westchester are back
- 5 higher than their pre-pandemic levels. And the NAHB West
- 6 Lake Royal Remodeling Market Index show that the residential
- 7 modeling industry had already recovered by the end of 2020
- 8 and the index for the first quarter of 2022 is also higher
- 9 than that pre-pandemic.
- Now, building supplies in these parts in the
- industry are expensive too, yet, there's still a boom in
- 12 residential construction, repair, and remodeling here in
- 13 Westchester. We are only seeing a decrease like this in
- 14 rent stabilized buildings.
- Now, we've talked a lot about inflation and cost in
- these meetings, but we haven't talked as much about what's
- 17 happening elsewhere in the economy. All the focus on
- 18 inflation overshadows the fact that overall this is actually
- 19 the strongest job market we've seen for decades. The
- 20 unemployment rate nationally is under 4 percent and here in
- 21 Westchester it's 3.7 and that is the lowest mark for our
- 22 County on record. Not pre-pandemic, ever. Even more
- 23 impressive is the average wage index. After the great
- 24 recession we consistently limped along with wage growth. It
- 25 was basically flat, but not last year. Last year the

- 1 average wage index was 5.6 percent and that is the highest
- 2 it's been in over two decades and is twice as high as our
- 3 average has been since 2008.
- 4 The wage index for this year is still in progress
- 5 but it continues to hover around 5 percent, which would
- 6 again be the strongest we've seen. So the reality is that
- 7 although costs are going up for everybody, landlords and
- 8 tenants alike, this is actually the most affordable moment
- 9 in terms of jobs and wages for a modest increase to invest
- in the TLC these buildings need and these tenants deserve.
- 11 Now, of course, that is just an average. Some
- 12 people are still struggling. Some people will still fall
- 13 behind on their bills. Some won't see the wage gains that
- 14 most are seeing and some will face a financial hardship.
- 15 Our organization strongly believes in and has championed in
- 16 Albany and elsewhere targeted approaches to help stabilize
- 17 housing costs for those who are struggling just as we
- 18 passionately believe in increasing access to affordable
- 19 housing. When we find the most effective tools for those
- 20 goals are to be found outside of this process. This process
- 21 has how often produced a justifiable and, therefore,
- 22 economically sustainable increase that tenants and owners
- 23 have usually been able to afford. And if that's the goal,
- 24 it unusually works. But if the goal instead is to provide a
- 25 broad based anti-poverty effort, then sorry to say that is

- 1 not going to be successful. For one thing, as mentioned
- 2 earlier, the number of housing burdened individuals and
- 3 families in Westchester is four times the number of total
- 4 rent stabilized units. It's a drop in the bucket. For
- 5 another rent stabilization is a confluence of the age of the
- 6 buildings, the municipality it's in, often how long the
- 7 tenant has lived there, it is just not a mechanism that's
- 8 targeted by need.
- 9 If we want to help those suffering hardships,
- 10 please by all means outside of this room let's work together
- 11 and push for better tools and solutions.
- 12 Last sentence, Chair.
- But inside this room, let's find a reasonable
- 14 economically sustainable and justifiable way to make sure
- 15 these homes continued to provide affordability, safety, and
- 16 dignity for those who live here.
- 17 Thank you for your time.
- 18 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- 19 Any questions for Mr. Foley? No?
- Thank you.
- 21 MR. FOLEY: Thank you.
- 22 CHAIR RUBIN: I will now call Suzanne Johnson.
- 23 Ms. Johnson?
- 24 MS. JOHNSON: I'm representing an entity.
- 25 CHAIR RUBIN: Good. You have five minutes.

```
1
              MR. CHERSON:
                            I didn't get her name.
 2
              MS. JOHNSON:
                            Suzanne Johnson.
 3
              CHAIR RUBIN: Suzanne Johnson.
 4
              MS. JOHNSON:
                            I'm a property manager for
 5
     St. Andrews. We're in southwest Yonkers.
 6
              Good evening, everyone.
 7
              CHAIR RUBIN:
                            Good evening.
 8
              MS. JOHNSON:
                            I just want to make a note before I
 9
     start that I've been renting apartments at St. Andrews for
10
     30 years and I wish our rents quadrupled in that time.
11
     when I started 30 years ago, we rented one-bedrooms for
12
     $1,175 and today we rent them for $1,500. So that's the
13
     increase we got in 30 years for market rate. We usually
14
    have to go by the market. We don't get legal rents where we
    have buildings.
15
              Landlords need a lifeline and we have suffered
16
17
     tremendous financial losses since the passing of the 2019
     rent law. Loss revenue from the pandemic and years of
18
19
     extremely low rent increases. As we watch our taxes;
20
     insurance; payroll; supply; maintenance; and utility cost
21
     continue to sky rocket, we feel abandon. Many building
     owners feel it's a waste of time to even come here to speak.
22
23
              Our pleading for fair increases has fallen on deaf
24
     ears for years and now landlords are one of the most abused
```

groups in New York State. I want to share one story to

25

- 1 demonstrate what New York State policies have done to
- 2 building owners. Last year we heard from this Board that
- 3 the ERAP program would save us from financial worries.
- 4 Here's the reality of what we've been dealing with. We have
- 5 a tenant who's been in court for nonpayment of rent since
- 6 2018. This tenant was supposed to be evicted in March of
- 7 2020 but the courts shut down and the warrant was never
- 8 served. Fast forward to June 2020 -- 2022, that's this
- 9 month, and this tenant owes over \$44,000 in rent. ERAP -- I
- 10 talked to the caseworker last Friday -- and they said, we're
- 11 going to give this person \$25,000 but they're going to have
- 12 to come up with \$19,000 on their own otherwise they're not
- 13 going to give them this ERAP money. So they can only
- 14 guarantee ERAP if the tenant promises to pay the balance so
- 15 that they don't get evicted.
- 16 Unfortunately, I don't think this tenant -- after
- 17 all the vacations she has taken -- is going to be able to
- 18 pay \$19,000 to us. You may be thinking this is just one
- 19 tenant and what are you complaining about, but it actually
- 20 setoff a cycle of events. Four out of the seven neighbors
- 21 on this floor decided they were not going to pay rent either
- 22 because they watched this other tenant for four years get
- 23 away with not paying rent. So now I had to incur legal
- 24 charges in the tens of thousands to take three additional
- 25 tenants to court. This is with them not paying rent for at

- 1 least two years and these other tenants owe us about
- 2 \$50,000.
- I would like to remind everyone that rent is the
- 4 only means of income for a landlord to maintain a property.
- 5 In 2022 we are making less than we did in 2019. ETPA
- 6 increases have been historically behind in keeping up with
- 7 inflation. As costs are sky rocketing, we have absolutely
- 8 no recourse to catch up. We're going through our savings
- 9 right now to keep up with the repairs. Our buildings are
- 10 getting older. Rents are simply not keeping up with the
- 11 expenses. A significant increase this year cannot be
- 12 disputed. Landlords cannot continue to shoulder the
- 13 financial burden any longer without giving the right to
- 14 substantially raise rents and collect rents.
- I thank you and implore you to look at the data and
- 16 vote to increase rents this year at a minimum of 8.3 percent
- 17 for one-year leases and 12 percent for two-year leases.
- 18 Thank you.
- 19 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you. Any questions for
- 20 Ms. Johnson?
- 21 Thank you, Ms. Johnson.
- The next person is Liana Wortel. Did I pronounce
- 23 your name correctly?
- 24 MS. WORTEL: Liana, yes.
- 25 CHAIR RUBIN: Are you representing --

```
1
             MS. WORTEL: I'm going to make this short.
 2
             CHAIR RUBIN: Are you representing yourself?
 3
             MS. WORTEL:
                           I'm representing an entity. I've been
 4
    managing properties for 30 years. I'm representing a
 5
     landlord in Yonkers and Mount Vernon.
              Good evening, Madam Chair, members of the board,
 6
 7
     and members of the community. Let's talk about building a
 8
    healthy system and structure. When the body has no food, it
 9
     cannot function.
                       It becomes lethargic and eventually
10
     develops disease.
                       The same is true about a building housing
                    If there isn't the necessary income to feed
11
    many families.
12
     the building, life or death choices have to be made. Do we
13
     repair a boiler that could possibly breakdown in the middle
14
     of a cold winter or replace bathroom tiles that are old and
     cracked?
15
             Why should we have to choose between the two and
16
17
     allow our tenants to wait until the necessary money comes in
     to do the repairs? What happens to the quality of living
18
19
    when funding to a building is squeezed so hard that it is
20
    unsustainable.
                    The operating cost of a building should be
21
    met by the necessary income and everyone has to contribute
     their fair share. Our tenants deserve to live in buildings
22
     that are well-maintained. How is it that we are expected to
23
24
    make improvements when our rents are not in line with an 8
25
     to 9 percent inflation? Our costs have significantly
```

- 1 increased and without allowing for a rent increase to keep
- 2 up with inflation, we cannot survive.
- I recently read an article about a landlord, his
- 4 name is Justin Fung who owns and manages a building in the
- 5 Bronx. The building has been in his family for a century
- 6 but he has to work two jobs to pay the bills. With property
- 7 taxes and utility costs increasing and most of the units in
- 8 his building rent regulated, the rents's as low as \$500, he
- 9 said it's getting tough to hold on to his family's building.
- 10 Increasing rents would be the only solution for him to keep
- 11 the building running. The landlord said he's worried for
- 12 the neighborhood too, fearing that developers who have
- 13 already made offers would tear down the building and make
- 14 rents -- and raise rents and gentrify the area. Let me
- 15 repeat that. The landlord, Mr. Fung, said he's worried for
- 16 the neighborhood fearing developers who have already made
- 17 offers would tear down the buildings, raise rents, and
- 18 gentrify the area.
- 19 We get calls everyday to sell our buildings. It's
- 20 getting really close to that. Mr. Fung finished by saying,
- 21 there was a time in the neighborhood's history that there
- 22 wasn't anywhere else for the Chinese immigrants to go and
- 23 that I feel like it's a sense of responsibility.
- 24 Thank you so much.
- 25 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.

```
1
              Any questions for Ms. Wortel?
 2
              MR. CHERSON:
                            I didn't get her name.
 3
              CHAIR RUBIN: Liana Wortel.
              MR. CHERSON: Lilianna Montel?
 4
              CHAIR RUBIN: L-i-a-n-a.
 5
              MR. CHERSON: L-i-a what?
 6
 7
              CHAIR RUBIN: N-a; W-o-r-t-e-l.
 8
              MR. CHERSON:
                            Thank you.
 9
              CHAIR RUBIN:
                            Thank you.
10
              MS. WORTEL:
                           Thank you.
11
                            The last person on my list is Chris
              CHAIR RUBIN:
12
     Johnson.
13
              Welcome, Mr. Johnson. Are you representing
14
    yourself or an entity?
15
              MR. JOHNSON: I'm representing my -- an entity.
16
    And if everyone could -- I just want to get everyone's
     attention. Put the phones down, please. It would be nice
17
18
    to have some eye contact.
19
              Mr. Finger, I want you to pay attention over there.
20
              I'm a maintenance supervisor for multiple
21
    properties, all right? I actually have some of my employees
22
    with me today, so your decision actually affects them.
    take a lot of pride in maintaining a high standard of our
23
24
    buildings. We want to provide our tenants a very good
25
    product. We also hired multiple vendors and the example the
```

- 1 gentlemen presented from Ross Windows is a perfect example.
- We have reduced the hiring of vendors and that affects the
- 3 local job market which circles right back into Mount Vernon.
- I have news for you, we are in the perfect storm
- 5 right now. Inflation is 8.6 percent. That's the highest
- 6 since 1981. Definition of inflation. It cost more money to
- 7 buy the same product. That's what inflation is. Our
- 8 operating cost as a maintenance supervisor running these
- 9 buildings have sky rocketed as everyone has said. Rent
- 10 increases have not kept up with inflation and I have news
- 11 for you, again, inflation is going to continue to increase
- 12 exponentially and these buildings need money to operate.
- 13 Everyone wants an operating elevator. Everyone wants heat
- 14 in January. Everyone wants a nonleaking roof. Guess what?
- 15 That costs money.
- The only income landlords get is through rents. So
- 17 we are using our savings, our money that we set aside for
- 18 capital improvements and emergencies to stay afloat. And to
- 19 answer your questions from earlier, sir, yes, we have slid
- 20 projects that we should do. We have 65 year-old boilers
- 21 that I'm going to pray every night this winter that it
- 22 doesn't break because we cannot fix it right now because
- 23 we're doing hundreds of thousands of dollars on other things
- 24 and we're done. We don't have any room for error here. And
- 25 everyone wants heat this winter; correct? Well, where's the

- 1 money going to come from?
- 2 Everyone knows everything's up. Everyone's bought
- 3 a jug of milk, everyone's filled their gas up. That applies
- 4 across every vendor, everything we buy in the maintenance
- 5 area for a building. So my question to you, how do we
- 6 maintain our buildings when the rent increase is rapidly
- 7 intersecting with our operating costs leaving us no reserve
- 8 tank for capital improvements; emergencies in January; or
- 9 building improvements that are nice to have. We have --
- 10 appliance costs are through the roof, appliance wait time is
- 11 months, we're trying to do our best for our tenants by front
- 12 loading that. It's a challenge but we need rents, we need
- 13 fair rents. We always want to be fair on both sides, but it
- 14 has to be a fair decision.
- We have to make a big correction here people.
- 16 We're way behind the power curve. I'm going to recommend 8
- 17 percent for one-year leases, 12 percent for two-years
- 18 leases. We have to keep up with inflation. Things cost
- money.
- 20 Questions for me?
- 21 CHAIR RUBIN: Any?
- 22 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you.
- 23 CHAIR RUBIN: One minute.
- MR. JOHNSON: Yeah.
- 25 CHAIR RUBIN: Any questions for Mr. Johnson? No?

- 1 Thank you for your presentation.
- 2 MR. JOHNSON: Yep.
- 3 CHAIR RUBIN: I believe that brings us to our -- to
- 4 the end of our --
- 5 MS. STEWART: Pardon me, Chair. I believe there
- 6 was somebody who wanted to sign up, but they came late and
- 7 she didn't have an opportunity.
- 8 CHAIR RUBIN: Oh. Okay. Can you come to the podium
- 9 and introduce yourself, please.
- MS. COX: Good evening.
- 11 CHAIR RUBIN: Good evening.
- MS. COX: My name is Ronnie Cox. I'm here
- 13 representing myself, but I work for Westchester County
- 14 Department of Senior Programs and Services and I wanted to
- 15 speak to you tonight on behalf seniors. I wanted to be sure
- 16 that you are aware that the population is aging all over the
- 17 United States and they're particularly here in Westchester
- 18 County and in Mount Vernon.
- 19 If you look at census -- the 2020 census and you
- 20 compare it to the 2010 census, you will see that the
- 21 population in America is gray. The people in the industry
- 22 refer to it as the gray tsunami or the age wave. And that
- 23 is exactly what's happening in Westchester County as well.
- 24 Of the million people here in Westchester County,
- 25 about a little bit more than 20 percent are over the age of

- 1 65. Mount Vernon mirrors that same demographic of the
- 2 70-something thousand people here in Mount Vernon, over 20
- 3 percent are age 65. And the reason that I bring this data
- 4 up to you that is so important because this data also
- 5 reflects the tenants that you have in rent controlled
- 6 buildings. According to the 2020 comparison to the 2010,
- 7 the baby boomers, 10,000 baby boomers are turning 65 every
- 8 single day. 10,000 baby boomers, those that were born after
- 9 World War II are turning 65.
- 10 It is estimated by 2030 that there will be 73
- 11 million baby boomers. And why do I this that this is
- 12 important for a body like this? First of all, you make all
- of the decisions that control the rent, but your decisions
- 14 are very important because there's a lot of homeowners who
- 15 have aged out of their job, they had little part-time jobs
- 16 before the pandemic, after the pandemic they're income has
- 17 not been able to keep pace. So we want you to know that the
- 18 decisions that are in your hands, the decisions that you
- 19 make affect many more people then you could ever possibly
- 20 image.
- One thing I want you to remember, that every person
- 22 that is alive today will become a senior and you will face
- 23 that day when you will no longer be able to work. Whatever
- 24 you're able to get in Social Security, you're going to have
- 25 to live off of. That -- jobs back in the '80's gave a

- 1 pension, but the majority of the jobs today don't give a
- 2 pension. But what you -- decisions that you make today will
- 3 impact Westchester County for years and decades to come, so
- 4 that's why I think that it's important that you understand
- 5 where your population is and also where the county
- 6 population is in general.
- 7 I want you to know that typically we would like to
- 8 have people pay 30 percent of their income towards their
- 9 housing expenses. Well, I'm here to guarantee you that most
- 10 people are paying between 50 and 60 percent. One of the
- 11 things that I do in my department for the Department of
- 12 Senior Programs and Services, I'm the housing specialists.
- 13 So I -- from my perch I get a look at all over Westchester
- 14 County, not just Mount Vernon, Yonkers, the big
- 15 municipalities. I get a look at all of the towns and
- 16 villages. All of the seniors that get into trouble and end
- 17 up in court, either someone is going to call me on their
- 18 behalf or they're going to call me direct.
- 19 So from my perch I see County wide, I know that we
- 20 have a crisis in housing. We have an obligation, the County
- 21 along with each and everyone one of you folks who agreed to
- 22 serve on this very important body, we have an obligation to
- 23 do what we can to save housing. It is important. It is
- 24 part of our survival to be able to have our housing. I want
- 25 you to be aware that evictions are sky rocketing. It is

- 1 people who have lost their spouse or their significant other
- 2 and now they have one household income. Many of the little
- 3 part-time jobs, school bus drivers, beauticians or whatever
- 4 haven't fully returned yet. So you have a lot of people who
- 5 are under water.
- 6 One of the things that I have noticed, you know
- 7 that ERAP or heard a lot talked about ERAP tonight, but with
- 8 ERAP, yes, you had the 12 months plus the additional 3
- 9 months for 15 months. But what I have found out is that I'm
- 10 getting telephone calls because after the 30 to 31,000 has
- 11 been paid to the landlord, the person still can't maintain
- 12 their rent because they have not been able to get their
- income back or get their job back to where they were before
- 14 the pandemic. So we have a lot of people in landlord tenant
- 15 court who are after ERAP, after the landlord got \$30,000
- 16 they are now in court being evicted. So we have to really
- 17 take a look at our housing stock. We have to protect it, we
- 18 have to keep it affordable, and most importantly, we have to
- 19 do everything that we can to advocate for more housing.
- 20 The other thing I just wanted to say to you is
- 21 that, again, every single one of us, if we are lucky, we
- 22 will be a senior and we will be faced with the same thing
- 23 that people are faced with today. Thank you for your time.
- 24 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you, Ms. Cox.
- 25 Any questions for Ms. Cox?

- 1 MS. HAMER: I think I missed one of your status'.
- 2 Did you give us the number for the number of folks in
- 3 Westchester County that are over the age of 65?
- 4 MS. COX: 20 to 21 percent according to the 2020
- 5 census. Again, the entire nation is aging. And as I said,
- 6 for us preparing in the industry even when we go to
- 7 conferences, it's the same issue throughout the nation, it
- 8 is housing and it is affordable housing. Thank goodness
- 9 Westchester County hasn't been forced to put tents out for
- 10 people to live in tents. But I understand in California --
- MS. HAMER: Uh-huh.
- MS. COX: -- and upper New York State, there are
- 13 people who are living in tents. And so Westchester County
- 14 has not had that problem yet. But we're asking for your
- 15 expertise and your wisdom that in whatever decisions you
- 16 make that you are fair. Remember the population that you
- 17 represent. Remember the need, but it is also important to
- 18 protect the youngins because actually we're all in this
- 19 together. If they can't survive, we'll have nowhere to live
- 20 either. So it is a partnership, whether we like it or not.
- 21 But I wanted to make sure that you were aware of what's
- 22 happening with our seniors, not just within Westchester or
- 23 New York State, but nationwide.
- 24 CHAIR RUBIN: Thank you.
- MS. COX: Thank you so much.

- 1 CHAIR RUBIN: Ms. Stewart has a question for you.
- MS. STEWART: Pardon me, Ms. Cox. Several people
- 3 have spoken about SCRIE. And I know you're -- I expect that
- 4 you're familiar with it.
- 5 MS. COX: Yes.
- 6 MS. STEWART: My understanding of SCRIE is that
- 7 each municipality sets whatever the income guideline is that
- 8 will allow a person to be -- to qualify for SCRIE and that
- 9 there are only some municipalities in the county that have
- 10 adopted it and also that the income guidelines varies
- 11 significantly from one municipality to the next.
- 12 So the solution that some people say is, well, the
- 13 seniors can apply for SCRIE and then that will freeze their
- 14 rent. Can you please speak to that point?
- MS. COX: Yes, SCRIE and DRIE have been around for
- 16 many many decades. SCRIE is for senior citizens I believe
- 17 over the age of 62 or 65 that in certain municipalities they
- 18 can qualify to freeze future rent increases and it gets
- 19 offset with whatever the State does and whatever the
- 20 rebates, taxes or whatever it is that they do. But there's
- 21 also a sister program called DRIE. And that's for people
- 22 who are disabled. There is an office of New York State
- 23 housing, if you contact my office, the Westchester County of
- 24 Office of Aging my name is Ronnie Cox and I can get you the
- 25 State fact sheet '20 and '21 that describes the State

- 1 program. There's an office right here in White Plains,
- 2 that's where you get the application and you submit your
- 3 document.
- 4 What I would hope is that more municipalities will,
- 5 in fact, participate in the SCRIE and DRIE program. I'm
- 6 happy to say that I had a housing conference back it was
- 7 2018 I think, I had it at the County Center and one of the
- 8 staff members of Mount Vernon came to the conference and
- 9 found out that Mount Vernon on I don't think was part of the
- 10 DRIE program, it was part of SCRIE and then they went and
- 11 they talked with the state and they made Mount Vernon on a
- 12 SCRIE and DRIE location.
- 13 So I would recommend anybody that needs
- 14 information, I'll get you the State fact sheets on that and
- 15 give you the address in White Plains that you can go and
- 16 submit your application. But these freezes in future rent
- 17 are critical because I have people who call me who are
- 18 preretirement and they're scared to death because they may
- 19 only have Social Security and not have a pension. So those
- 20 two programs are terribly underused and they have to be more
- 21 widely publicized. I find that younger seniors, people who
- 22 are just retiring now, don't know very much about those
- 23 programs, but people who are like my age, a senior, and been
- 24 out here for a while, we're familiar with them.
- 25 So I think that is all of our responsibility to get

- 1 the message out on those two programs because they really do
- 2 work and it will freeze your rent increase as long as you
- 3 need meet the income guidelines that are established by the
- 4 municipality.
- 5 MS. STEWART: Just one other follow-up question.
- 6 When it comes to SCRIE, it does freeze your rent, but it
- 7 doesn't necessarily --
- 8 MS. COX: Well, it freezes future increases.
- 9 MS. STEWART: Future increases.
- 10 MS. COX: That's the way that they describe it.
- MS. STEWART: But it doesn't necessarily keep you
- 12 from being rent burdened or severally rent burdened;
- 13 correct?
- MS. COX: No, that's the whole reason that I'm here
- 15 about the guidelines board and your decision on whatever the
- 16 percentage is because a lot of people are house-expense
- 17 burdened. We find that our surveys that we do within our
- 18 office, the main complaints we get is that people don't have
- 19 enough transportation and they don't have enough for
- 20 medication and that has been consistent now for more than
- 21 ten years whenever our office does a survey.
- 22 So it is important -- I felt that it was important
- 23 enough for me to bring this message to you because, again,
- 24 your decision, whatever decision that you make, all of us
- 25 will have to live with it for many, many years to come. So

```
1
        I wanted to just make this appeal to you on behalf seniors
 2
        and to remind you that if you're lucky, all of us will end
 3
        up being a senior and one day not being able to work and
        will have to rely on whatever the fixed income that we have.
 4
 5
                 And are there anymore questions?
6
                 MS. STEWART:
                               Thank you.
 7
                 CHAIR RUBIN:
                               Thank you.
8
                 MS. COX: Thank you very much for the opportunity.
9
                 CHAIR RUBIN:
                               I believe that that's the last person
10
        that I have on the list unless there's anybody in the
11
        audience that hasn't spoken and wants to speak, I will give
12
        them the opportunity.
13
                 If not, then that concludes the business of this
14
       meeting and do I hear a motion to adjourn?
15
                 MS. STEWART: So moved.
16
                 MS. BARNES:
                              Second.
17
                 CHAIR RUBIN: This meeting is adjourned.
                                                            Thank you
18
        very much for everybody who's here present. Thank you for
19
        your time.
20
    (Whereupon the proceeding concluded until Wednesday, June 22,
21
    2022.)
22
23
24
25
```

1	CERTIFICATE		
2	The prior proceedings were transcribed from audio		
3	files and have been transcribed to the best of my		
4	ability. I further certify that I am not connected by		
5	blood, marriage, or employment with any of the parties		
6	herein nor interested directly or indirectly in the		
7	matter transcribed.		
8			
9			
10	Marisa D'Antonio		
11	MARISA D'ANTONIO		
12			
13	DATE: 06/29/2022		
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

Index: \$1,000..2022

	<b>\$45</b> 72:7	<b>12th</b> 45:16
<b>\$</b>	<b>\$50,000</b> 84:2	<b>13</b> 35:23 66:19
<b>\$1,000</b> 18:24	<b>\$500</b> 32:22 35:13 55:5 86:8	<b>14</b> 29:4
<b>\$1,100</b> 18:24	<b>\$54</b> 71:23	<b>15</b> 3:22 22:3 93:9
<b>\$1,175</b> 82:12	<b>\$60</b> 72:8	<b>15th</b> 27:11 31:19 34:15,18 41:13
<b>\$1,200</b> 18:24	<b>\$71</b> 71:23	43:17
<b>\$1,500</b> 72:4,5 82:12	<b>\$75</b> 72:8	<b>17</b> 6:24
<b>\$1,561</b> 28:4	<b>\$770</b> 16:2	<b>18</b> 3:22
<b>\$1,578</b> 16:3	<b>\$88,000</b> 60:3	<b>19</b> 10:13
<b>\$1,787</b> 71:15	<b>\$89</b> 71:23	<b>1974</b> 73:25 74:9,11
<b>\$1,800</b> 18:21	<b>\$925</b> 27:14	<b>1981</b> 88:6
<b>\$10</b> 18:21		<b>1987</b> 70:10
<b>\$10,000</b> 60:7,15,16	<u> </u>	<b>1989</b> 78:9
<b>\$100,000</b> 40:9	-increasing 13:24	<b>1st</b> 2:12 41:12
<b>\$12</b> 18:21		2
<b>\$120,000</b> 67:19	0	
<b>\$125,000</b> 60:3	<b>0</b> 74:21,23	<b>2</b> 67:24 68:1 71:22 72:7
<b>\$15</b> 72:7		<b>2.25</b> 21:22
<b>\$15,000</b> 59:23	1	<b>2.66</b> 6:5
<b>\$160,000</b> 40:9	<b>1</b> 8:3 31:5 64:18 65:18 71:21 72:6	<b>20</b> 6:24 7:15 27:9 35:9 38:6 40:23 90:25 91:2 94:4 95:25
<b>\$17,000</b> 37:25	74:5,21	<b>2000's</b> 17:10
<b>\$18</b> 71:22	<b>1.3</b> 28:3	<b>2008</b> 29:2,6,7 80:3
<b>\$19,000</b> 83:12,18	<b>1.5</b> 6:3	<b>2010</b> 74:1,12,13 75:2,5,8 90:20 91
<b>\$190</b> 31:5	<b>10</b> 38:18 39:11 43:15 66:25 67:1	<b>2011</b> 65:25 66:2
<b>\$2,000</b> 35:13,14 55:6 63:15	<b>10,000</b> 91:7,8	<b>2016</b> 54:3
<b>\$2,500</b> 32:22 60:16	<b>10.63</b> 28:4	<b>2017</b> 66:8 75:25
<b>\$200</b> 67:6,11	<b>100</b> 17:8	<b>2018</b> 5:25 83:6 96:7
<b>\$25,000</b> 83:11	<b>107</b> 15:25	<b>2019</b> 9:23 11:22,23 12:7 13:5 14:6
<b>\$26,000</b> 60:4	<b>108</b> 15:25	28:3,6,23 66:3,20,21,23 67:5,24
<b>\$3,000</b> 60:16	<b>11</b> 17:9 31:7	70:4,5,6 71:14,17 78:23 82:17 84:
<b>\$30</b> 72:7	<b>11.1</b> 11:5 22:2 23:4	<b>2019's</b> 28:9
<b>\$30,000</b> 93:15	<b>1199SEIU</b> 62:8,13,22 63:4	<b>2020</b> 11:7 27:3,9 54:19 56:10 58:1 78:15 79:7 83:7,8 90:19 91:6 94:4
<b>\$35</b> 71:22	<b>12</b> 17:9 38:18 39:11 66:19 67:19	<b>2021</b> 11:7 28:2,7,11 33:4 56:10
<b>\$350,000</b> 67:19	84:17 89:17 93:8	66:25 70:4,5,6,10 71:14 72:4 74:1
<b>\$43</b> 27:12 31:24 33:10	<b>12,000</b> 62:23	13 75:5 78:16
<b>\$44,000</b> 83:9	<b>128</b> 38:7	<b>2022</b> 2:12 5:25 31:21 66:20 73:22 79:8 83:8 84:5 98:21

		Index: 20239
<b>2023</b> 2:13 27:14 29:12	<b>35,000</b> 31:6	<b>60</b> 38:6 40:5,6,8,20 92:10
<b>2030</b> 91:10	<b>36</b> 27:7	<b>600,000</b> 26:22
<b>20th</b> 43:17	<b>37</b> 56:10	<b>62</b> 95:17
<b>21</b> 74:9 94:4 95:25	<b>37.37</b> 28:8 70:9	<b>65</b> 88:20 91:1,3,7,9 94:3 95:17
<b>21-unit</b> 60:5	<b>38</b> 60:15	<b>66</b> 74:24
<b>219</b> 76:3	<b>38.68</b> 28:9	<b>66,950</b> 14:24
<b>22</b> 8:18 63:16 98:20	<b>3rd</b> 2:10	<b>67</b> 74:25
<b>24</b> 46:13		<b>68</b> 45:7
<b>24.5</b> 21:20	4	<b>6821</b> 75:3
<b>240</b> 22:13	<b>4</b> 7:10 8:17 71:23 72:7 79:20	
<b>25</b> 68:1,2	<b>4.15</b> 76:19	7
<b>25,029</b> 13:10	<b>4.5</b> 8:17	<b>7</b> 8:10 31:7
<b>26</b> 67:20	<b>40</b> 11:23,24 56:10 78:10	70-something 91:2
<b>264</b> 75:5	<b>40.29</b> 27:9	<b>73</b> 91:10
<b>28</b> 66:23	<b>40k</b> 60:12	<b>74</b> 74:9 75:2,8
<b>280</b> 20:1	<b>41.4</b> 14:21	<b>75</b> 15:14
	- <b>44</b> 15:10	<b>76</b> 15:14
3	- <b>45</b> 9:20	<b>7:00</b> 3:16
<b>3</b> 6:1 67:14,15 71:22 72:7 93:8	<b>45,000</b> 62:23	<b>7th</b> 45:16
<b>3.1</b> 10:25	<b>46</b> 15:7	
<b>3.2</b> 7:9	<b>4th</b> 57:16	8
<b>3.3</b> 6:1		<b>8</b> 6:5 13:25 14:1 38:1,18 39:9 47:10
<b>3.5</b> 7:12	5	67:5,14,15,16 85:24 89:16
<b>3.7</b> 79:21	<b>5</b> 31:5 43:15 59:3 66:21 71:23 72:8	<b>8.3</b> 84:16
<b>30</b> 14:25 15:10 82:10,11,13 85:4	80:5	<b>8.5</b> 6:13,15,19 59:10
92:8 93:10	<b>5.6</b> 80:1	<b>8.6</b> 88:5
<b>300</b> 19:23,24 20:1	<b>50</b> 14:22 15:17 40:19 68:1 92:10	<b>8.7</b> 21:18
<b>30th</b> 2:13	<b>52</b> 21:6	<b>8.76</b> 76:16,18
<b>31,000</b> 93:10	<b>527</b> 56:19	<b>80's</b> 91:25
<b>31st</b> 33:4	<b>5th</b> 43:15	<b>80,000</b> 13:4
<b>32BJ</b> 5:14 7:2,25		<b>85</b> 5:17 15:19
<b>33</b> 74:23	6	<b>89,839</b> 15:1
<b>34</b> 74:24	<b>6</b> 8:10 38:18 39:8,9 45:16	<b>8:00</b> 2:2
<b>34,221</b> 13:8	<b>6.1</b> 10:24	
<b>34.5</b> 70:10	<b>6.5</b> 8:2,3	9
<b>35</b> 38:5 70:7	<b>6.8</b> 21:18	<b>9</b> 21:18,25 85:25

		<del>-</del>
<b>9.2</b> 10:23	addressing 9:17	<b>agree</b> 32:8,10
<b>9.4</b> 15:2	adjourn 98:14	agreed 92:21
<b>90's</b> 17:9	adjourned 98:17	agreement 5:16,21
<b>925</b> 31:24	adjust 2:8	ahead 6:16 61:6 68:25
<b>94</b> 15:3	adjusting 38:2	aides 63:8
<b>98.2</b> 75:9,11	adjustment 72:1	<b>Alana</b> 56:23 57:2
<b>99.5</b> 28:6	adjustments 2:11 38:12	Albany 80:16
	Administration 30:6 69:22	<b>ALICE</b> 15:16,18,19
A	adopted 72:1 95:10	alike 80:8
abandon 82:21	advance 3:21,23	<b>alive</b> 91:22
abilities 66:4	advantage 43:14 44:19 45:3 55:3	allocate 24:6
ability 39:18 53:7 72:20	advantages 71:10	allocated 27:14 31:25
absolute 13:2	advice 50:11	allowed 22:7 71:17
absolutely 55:8 84:7	advisors 21:8	allowing 86:1
absorbed 6:25	<b>Advisory</b> 7:4 21:10 57:3	alternate 4:17
abstain 4:5	advocate 58:10 93:19	America 90:21
abused 82:24	advocated 59:5	American 61:2
access 80:18	advocates 58:13 59:6	ammunition 14:17
account 35:15 47:12 58:7	affect 6:11 7:16 91:19	amortization 58:9 59:5
accumulative 21:23	affected 66:13 71:9 74:2	amount 6:20 12:4 31:12 33:3,10
achieving 61:2	affecting 6:11 62:25 64:10 78:24	amounts 23:12 72:9
<b>Acquah</b> 2:16,17 52:11,12,14	affects 7:16 69:19 71:8 87:22 88:2	ample 23:9 59:25
Act 9:22 10:3 15:15	affluent 71:4	analysis 13:15,16 14:9 27:15 28:17
action 55:3	afford 13:23 15:13 18:19 36:10	73:18,23 74:15,17 75:2,15 76:13,17
actions 17:5	37:17 60:13,23 71:5 78:20 80:23	analyze 77:8
activities 74:14	<b>affordability</b> 13:18 14:11 15:13,15 18:2 66:9,11 81:15	analyzed 74:16
actual 74:2,15 75:21,23	<b>affordable</b> 15:11,24 16:1,2 26:21	analyzes 10:20
add 33:10 59:25	30:24 31:2 36:5 64:21 69:14,16	and/or 72:20
addition 11:3 22:18 27:13 33:5,22	80:8,18 93:18 94:8	Andrews 82:5,9
46:7 48:18 78:4	<b>afloat</b> 36:4,22 38:4 88:18	Angelo 58:22
additional 8:2 19:22 20:8 27:12	<b>afraid</b> 57:23,24 61:14,15	announced 10:13
30:21 32:8,13 33:12,14 37:24 46:5 54:11 58:7 64:8 71:4 83:24 93:8	<b>age</b> 15:10 35:23 81:5 90:22,25 91:3 94:3 95:17 96:23	announcement 3:12
additions 46:6	aged 91:15	announcements 3:11
address 21:14 26:25 30:10,22 31:7	agency's 65:22	<b>annual</b> 40:17 66:10
65:13 96:15	agent 57:7	annually 66:1
addressed 4:12	aging 67:22 90:16 94:5 95:24	Anthony 4:23
	uging 07.22 30.10 34.3 33.24	anti-poverty 80:25

**Antoinette** 62:1,5,6,19 anybody's 41:20 anymore 18:25 35:15 98:5 **anyone's** 71:3

apartment 9:24 21:9 22:20 36:3 39:20 44:25 54:23 56:6 57:3 59:24 63:14,18 67:6

apartments 19:2,3 26:21 30:25 36:16 40:1 71:13,16,25 72:2,23,24 82:9

apologize 2:7 apparently 28:12 appeal 69:18 98:1 Appeals 65:25 appeared 62:24 Appellate 65:19 **appendices** 14:5,8,15

apples 30:2

appliance 40:25 41:2,10,12 89:10

appliances 40:22,23 41:9,20

application 96:2,16 applications 19:17,24

applies 89:3

**apply** 47:15 61:10 71:16 95:13

appreciating 30:14 approach 46:10 approaches 80:16 approximately 13:4 **April** 7:6,14 41:14

arbitrary 69:13

area 7:3,25 8:4 9:13 66:13 86:14,18 89:5

**areas** 63:7 argue 29:16 **argued** 21:13

argument 8:7 13:21 32:3 58:6

arrangements 46:15 arrears 37:24 46:8,17 article 86:3 artificial 73:13 asks 74:17

assessment 13:7 14:4,5

asset 15:15 25:4

assistance 19:20 46:7 56:2

assistants 63:8 Associates 65:18

association 10:12 54:25 56:7 57:5 66:7

**assume** 25:17 26:6 32:8 57:9 72:3

assumption 26:10 asthmatic 55:15 astronomically 12:25

ate 37:18

attaching 14:14 attempt 4:14,17 attendance 12:20

attention 13:16 87:17,19

attest 37:14 **attic** 19:2

attorney 5:12,13 26:12 54:4,6

attributed 28:22

audience 4:5,14 34:3 51:4 73:17 98:11

authorized 66:1 **Avenue** 56:19

average 5:20 6:23 7:9 8:19 28:3,9 31:4 70:8 79:23 80:1,3,11

averaged 6:1

aware 6:10 90:16 92:25 94:21

В

**baby** 91:7,8,11

back 4:25 21:17 24:13,22 28:22 29:6 46:12,16,20 57:21 60:14 63:1 64:14 72:19,20 79:4 88:3 91:25 93:13 96:6

backbreaking 22:4

**backed** 37:10

background 76:24 bad 7:21 14:11 36:5

badly 62:25

Badru 2:18,19 17:2 52:15,16

**baked** 29:3

balance 46:12 65:20 83:14

balconies 67:19

bare 23:13 **barely** 56:15

bargain 23:6 24:14

bargaining 5:14,16 6:11

**Barnes** 2:20,21 52:17,18 98:16

**base** 29:3,15 30:12

**based** 28:24 29:13,17 33:10 69:22 80:25

basement 19:2 basic 39:18 41:18

**basically** 18:20 41:21 57:6 65:15

79:25

**basis** 5:20 10:4 18:1,7,9,17 19:4,12 65:21 76:13

bathing 45:18 bathroom 85:14 bear 36:10

beauticians 93:3 bedroom 15:25

beg 32:20 56:8 began 35:22

begin 23:10 35:18 73:16

beginning 51:20 78:5,7

**begun** 8:16

**behalf** 5:6 26:2 63:1 65:11 90:15 92:18 98:1

**belief** 29:12 believes 80:15

**bell** 56:1

belongs 42:11

benefit 17:17 19:8 69:14

**benefits** 17:11 72:18

**big** 19:8 89:15 92:14

biggest 6:18

bills 54:19 72:13 80:13 86:6

bioengineering 77:3

**bit** 7:15 18:20 19:18 30:21 31:14 40:22 42:15 71:9 74:19 76:23 90:25

**blind** 59:6

board 2:4 3:20 4:10,13,21 7:4 10:19 11:8 12:20,23 13:15 14:15 16:11 17:6,7,8,24 19:5 22:9 23:20 24:2 27:23 33:19 48:4 49:1,8,10 50:2,16 51:4 53:7 54:1 57:4 58:2,18 61:23 62:18,24 64:19 65:10,20,25 66:8,10 68:8,22 73:20,22,24 74:8 75:9 83:2 85:6 97:15

Board's 17:19

**body** 85:8 91:12 92:22

boiler 11:1 40:20 45:6 60:1,2,4

85:13

**boilers** 88:20

**bono** 26:14

bonuses 37:1

bookkeeping 47:14

**boom** 79:11

**boomers** 91:7,8,11

Borducci 65:7,8,10,11 68:4,10

**born** 91:8

borrow 43:4

**bottom** 70:8 74:4 75:20 76:6

**bought** 41:2 61:1 89:2

bouncing 64:14

bread 59:8

break 27:24 54:14 88:22

breakdown 18:17 72:22 85:13

**breaks** 22:22

breast 77:10

breathe 57:12

BRI 5:13 7:5 57:4 77:20,24 79:1

brick 22:24 42:11,12,19,20,23,24

bring 23:2 91:3 97:23

**brings** 90:3

**broad** 80:25

broader 13:18

**broken** 54:5 55:16 74:10,20

broker 21:5 57:7 59:1

brokers 21:6

**Bronx** 86:5

brought 18:12 60:6

**brown** 76:8

**buck** 36:13

bucket 81:4

buckshot 75:14

**budget** 27:13

**bug** 55:17

**build** 36:2

builders 10:13 36:8 44:16 79:1

**building** 5:5,15 10:11 21:9 22:24 24:14 25:5,6 35:6,7,20,25 38:5 39:19,24 42:1,8,10,13 43:3 45:7,10 54:22,24 55:19,23 59:11 60:5,10,14 64:12 67:2,3 77:24 78:6,9 79:10 82:21 83:2 85:7,10,12,19,20 86:4,5, 8,9,11,13 89:5,9

building-wide 56:7

buildings 5:17,22 8:19 9:18,24 10:2,8,16,21 22:20 23:17 24:11 30:5 36:3,15 38:16,25 40:2,19 42:23 45:12,19 57:12,16,21,23 58:3 59:18 60:1,22 61:1,11,12,15 63:24 65:14 67:22 70:2,3 78:16 79:14 80:10 81:6 82:15 84:9 85:22 86:17,19 87:24 88:9,12 89:6 91:6

**built** 61:1

**burden** 15:1 16:5 22:4 37:22 84:13

burdened 14:24 63:2 81:2 97:12,17

**burdens** 36:11

**bus** 93:3

**business** 9:19 10:7 11:22 36:2.7

37:20 40:5 55:8 58:4,5 66:14 78:24, 25 98:13

businesses 36:2,21 38:2,12 60:25

butter 59:8

**button** 45:14

buy 71:5 88:7 89:4

**buying** 24:13

C

calculate 71:20

calculating 55:2

California 94:10

**call** 2:14 4:22 12:16 20:18 23:16 25:15 34:25 35:3 46:19 49:12 52:10 56:22 65:7 73:3 77:16 81:22 92:17, 18 96:17

called 42:4 57:14 95:21

calls 86:19 93:10

canceled 42:2

**cancer** 77:10

cap 66:20

capital 39:18 67:21 88:18 89:8

**capped** 67:24

care 15:22 59:18,19 63:6

carefully 16:7 26:17 73:9

caregiver's 63:5

carries 53:6

carrying 46:6,7

Casado 65:24

**case** 4:10 38:20 43:10 65:24 66:6 76:25

caselaw 65:17

cases 13:1 17:14

caseworker 83:10

cash 74:3 75:23

catch 24:11 27:25 54:18 84:8

categories 28:16

category 78:22

ceiling 55:16

census 90:19,20 94:5

cent 33:20

Center 62:21 96:7

cents 8:3 century 86:5 CEO 77:23

certainty 79:2

cetera 22:23 25:1,6

**CFO** 26:12

**Chair** 2:5,6,18,20,22,24 3:1,3,5,7,17 5:3,7 8:21,24 9:1,3,6,8,14 11:15,19 12:12,14,16 16:14,16,19,21,24 17:4, 23 19:14 20:11,15,18,21,24 21:2 23:19 25:10,12,15,20,22,24 26:4,6,9 27:19 29:22 30:17 31:8,10 32:2 33:13 34:1,3,19,21,23,25 35:3 39:2, 4,6,10,13,16 40:14 43:23,25 44:2,4 46:1 47:1,17,20,24 48:3,6,8,9,11,17, 25 49:5,12,15 50:10,17,19,22 51:1, 2,8,9,12,15,17,19 52:1,4,8 53:4,5,9, 11,15,19,22 56:12,21,25 57:3 61:6, 22,25 62:3,6,9,16 65:3,7,9 68:8,11, 15,16,19,22,23 69:5,7,10 70:13 73:2,6 76:10,20,22 77:13,17,18,21 81:12,18,22,25 82:3,7 84:19,25 85:2,6 86:25 87:3,5,7,9,11 89:21,23, 25 90:3,5,8,11 93:24 94:24 95:1 98:7,9,17

**challenge** 63:17 89:12

**challenges** 10:17 15:13

Chambers 2:3

championed 80:15

**change** 30:25 43:17,19 49:22 68:6

75:25

charge 43:16

**charges** 54:11 83:24

check 45:23

**Cherson** 2:22,23 11:17,21,24 12:1, 3,6,9 23:20,21,25 24:4 25:9,23 32:1, 2,3,6,13,18,21 33:1,5,12,14,17 40:14,15 41:19,23,25 42:4,7,14,17 43:7 47:1,3,7,19 48:13,18 49:17,22 50:6,14,20,23 51:6,16,18,24 52:21,

22 53:18 62:4,11,14 76:21,23 82:1

87:2,4,6,8

**child-care** 64:4,5 **children** 18:14 56:1 **Chinese** 86:22

choices 85:12

**choose** 36:10 85:16

Chris 87:11 chunk 43:13 church 64:11 circles 88:3

circumstances 21:14

cities 15:4,7,16 citing 58:14

citizens 64:18 95:16

**city** 2:2,3 3:15 10:18,21 45:1 58:19 65:24 66:7,20 69:3

Ciuffetelli 56:23,24 57:1,2 61:7,24

Ciuffetelli's 57:15

claims 22:22 24:20,25 25:8

clapping 4:5 clarified 51:1,10 cleaned 55:23

clear 32:7 59:1 72:25

**clerks** 63:9

**climate** 9:19 30:25

clinics 63:6

close 4:15 13:16 31:24 66:2 86:20

closer 74:1 co-chair 58:25 co-inside 38:3 co-president 21:4 coefficient 74:20 cohort 15:10

cohort 15:10 cold 85:14 coldest 45:7 collapse 24:11 collapses 25:6 colleagues 73:17

**collect** 7:20 22:5 84:14

collected 35:11
collective 5:13,16
combination 78:14
combined 58:17
comfort 64:25
commencing 2:11

comment 21:10 78:4

**comments** 2:10 4:11,12 24:3 50:3

52:8 74:6

commercial 37:4 committee 3:20

**communities** 36:9,13,20 38:23

community 63:25 85:7 companies 22:25

**company** 9:13,21 45:9,23 57:14

compare 90:20

compared 38:10 70:10 comparison 75:15 91:6 compensate 67:23 compensating 32:11 complainant 54:2 complaining 83:19

complaint 55:1 56:7

complaints 40:3 54:10 97:18

completed 7:5

**completely** 59:23 75:17 **complexes** 9:18,25 10:9 **complicated** 27:25

comply 55:7 components 10:2

**Con** 43:19 **concept** 76:15

concerned 15:9 54:2

concerns 11:13 38:21 61:17

## Index: concluded..cutbacks

concluded 98:20 concludes 98:13 conclusion 16:22,23,24 conclusively 26:18 condition 23:1 66:12 conditions 36:16 55:15 66:5 conduct 10:4 77:5 conference 3:15 96:6,8 conferences 94:7 confirmed 17:12 75:16 confirms 26:18 conflict 50:11 confluence 81:5 confronted 16:10 confusion 20:4 connections 36:14 considered 14:23 58:13,24 consistent 97:20

consistently 30:15 79:24

constantly 58:14 constrain 53:13 constrained 15:16

construction 10:5 79:3,12

consultant 73:5 consumers 71:5

**contact** 20:14 87:18 95:23

context 13:18 29:10 contextualising 14:16

**continue** 7:19 16:16 21:12 22:9 26:20 34:6 40:11 49:1 56:13 60:22 61:3 63:12 82:21 84:12 88:11

**continued** 28:13 76:1 81:15

**continues** 21:12 54:12 59:10 76:8

80:5

continuously 60:10

**contract** 5:19,23,25 6:2,3,7 7:6,25

8:4

contractor 39:22

contractors 10:6,16

contracts 7:28:4

contribute 30:12 85:21

control 91:13 controlled 91:5 convince 33:18 cook 55:20

**copies** 14:14 20:25 49:16 51:5

68:12,14,16,22,23

cooperate 26:12

**copy** 14:19 34:15 53:20,21

corners 42:23

**corporations** 36:12 60:23

correct 22:10 26:10 32:19 33:6

35:11 88:25 97:13

correction 89:15 correctly 84:23 correlate 74:14

correlated 75:8

**correlation** 74:17,19,23,25 75:1,3, 6,14,15

**cost** 6:5,21,23,25 7:1 8:19 11:4 14:23 15:1 16:5 23:3 30:12,13 36:11 38:6,10,24 40:4 41:5 44:10,13 55:8, 21 56:16 58:3,12,21 59:20 60:4,7, 12,13,15,16 63:25 66:16,17,24,25 67:18,19,25 68:2 78:9,21 79:15 82:20 85:20 88:6,8 89:18

cost-burdened 16:6

**costs** 10:11,14,20 25:1 30:16 37:1 38:8 40:2 45:18 58:8 59:11 60:23 66:2 80:7,17 84:7 85:25 86:7 88:15 89:7,10

Council 3:15 57:3

counsel 2:2 3:10 21:10 49:3,5 50:16

counterparts 8:8 counties 15:8 19:21 countries 62:22 country 21:16

**county** 2:3 5:18 9:25 10:22 13:6 14:3,20 16:5 19:7 20:14 21:15 31:4

34:14 35:6,8 44:9 62:18,24 70:9,23 72:4 79:22 90:13,18,23,24 92:3,5, 14,19,20 94:3,9,13 95:9,23 96:7

County's 11:4 couple 40:24

**court** 18:13,14 45:1 65:25 66:8 83:5, 25 92:17 93:15,16

courts 37:10 83:7

cover 19:6 30:16 67:4 72:19

coverage 6:4 7:10 23:13

covered 13:3,5,9,13 17:17

**covering** 66:2,23

covers 5:17

**COVID** 27:8 28:5 37:7 60:16,18

63:13 64:1 76:4

COVID-19 19:23 20:7

coworkers 63:1,4,23 64:16

**Cox** 90:10,12 93:24,25 94:4,12,25 95:2,5,15,24 97:8,10,14 98:8

**CPA** 58:22

cracked 85:15

crawling 55:18

create 43:5

created 15:19

credit 47:4

crisis 13:18 14:11 16:9.13 92:20

critical 96:17

cross-subsidize 36:25

crushed 66:4

**cry** 18:16

Cumulative 21:20

current 9:19 29:9 44:18 69:14 70:25

curtailed 59:22 curve 89:16 customer 37:16

cut 40:2

**cutback** 23:11 24:9 **cutbacks** 23:15

## Index: cutting..distribute

cutting 24:13,22 determination 65:22 **decrease** 79:2.13 decreased 67:20 determine 77:6 cycle 83:20 cynical 30:9 dedicated 36:15 devastating 23:16 25:5 deduct 59:4 developers 36:8 86:12,16 D deep 36:13,14 60:19 develops 85:10 deficit 26:21 30:24 **DHCR** 21:19 23:5 30:6 33:23 34:9 damage 22:22 42:11 35:10 54:2 55:3,7 56:9 65:18 67:9 definition 30:10 88:6 damaged 24:15 60:11 69:21 73:19 74:15 degrees 45:7 damn 18:19 dietary 63:9 delay 2:8 4:6 Daniel 38:9 difficult 15:20 22:5 46:24 59:12 60:9 64:6.9 delegate 62:21 darn 30:9 deliberations 13:10,16 digging 64:17 data 14:9 15:19 16:8 69:21 70:2 73:14,19,20,23 74:10,11,12,15,16 deliberatively 26:18 dignity 64:24 81:16 75:8,12,16,18 76:18 77:8,9,12,25 diminishing 71:7 delivery 41:12 77:5,11 84:15 91:3.4 **demand** 28:24 **dip** 30:15 date 41:12 43:17,18,19 direct 30:6 92:18 demographic 91:1 dated 31:19 direction 53:9 demonstrate 83:1 daughter 55:15 **Dennis** 12:17,21 directions 53:10 day 6:12 28:17 38:22 54:10 55:18,25 91:8,23 98:3 directly 78:24 **deny** 14:17 dead 60:1 department 20:14 90:14 92:11 director 12:21 77:3 deaf 82:23 depend 36:6 Directors 57:4 deal 6:19 18:16 **Diresta** 73:3,5,7 76:12 77:1,15 depending 6:24 67:16 dealing 11:10 83:4 disabled 95:22 deplorable 59:16 dealt 54:3 55:13 depreciation 58:8,12 59:5 74:3 disadvantage 45:2 75:23 **Dear** 54:1 disclose 27:17 derived 29:13 death 85:12 96:18 discount 13:21 **Derosa** 35:3,4,5,19,24 39:2,3,5,9, debated 24:7 discouraging 22:18 11,21 40:8,13,19 41:22,24 42:3,6,8, debris 55:16 15,18 43:8,12 44:12 46:3,9 47:2,6,8, discovered 42:22 22 debt 64:17 discussion 30:2 44:6 describe 97:10 decades 79:19 80:2 92:3 95:16 disease 77:11 85:10 describes 95:25 December 33:4 disgrace 16:10 deserve 36:16 59:17 64:24 80:10 **decide** 49:1 51:13 disparity 26:22 85:22 decided 83:21 dispute 31:3 desperate 19:4,5 **decision** 71:21 72:6 75:20 87:22 disputed 84:12 **destroyed** 24:15 67:3 89:14 97:15,24 distinct 78:6 detail 59:1 decisions 91:13,18 92:2 94:15 distinction 29:25 33:3 details 22:14 23:14 31:16 decline 15:10 distribute 4:8

deteriorated 54:22

declining 76:1

## Index: distributed..evening

12:11,19 20:20,21 21:3 26:11 35:4

distributed 34:14 53:23 enclosed 34:15 ears 82:24 distribution 64:11 **ease** 37:22 encourage 14:19 Division 65:19 **eased** 28:5 encouraged 64:14 document 96:3 easiest 46:10 encouraging 20:6 documentation 19:25 East 62:13 end 8:13 25:4 28:17 38:22 46:21 79:7 90:4 92:16 98:2 documents 26:17 eat 60:23 ends 54:21 56:15 dollar 41:17 72:9 economic 10:2,17 17:11,17 64:14 enforcement 54:9 66:5.12 72:22 78:1 dollars 19:20 41:2 88:23 **economically** 80:22 81:14 engineering 73:13 door 4:15 9:12 economy 10:7 79:17 engineers 73:14 doors 10:5 **Eddie** 2:20 52:17 English 57:18 dots 74:11 **Edison** 43:19 entire 42:13 57:6 94:5 **double** 39:25 education 57:17 **entity** 4:1 9:9,11 20:22,24 25:18,21, doubling 12:25 25 26:1,3,9 62:7,8 73:4 77:19,20 effect 7:7 28:11 78:16 doubt 27:8 81:24 85:3 87:14,15 effective 80:19 **entries** 34:11 **dozen** 78:6 effects 9:23 75:19 environments 9:20 dragged 54:9 **effort** 80:25 dragging 55:2 equaled 17:14 28:6 **EIA** 29:10 dramatic 15:14 equipped 69:20 elaborate 31:13 dramatically 13:3 equity 30:1 elder-care 64:5 **dream** 61:2 **ERAP** 19:17,19 20:5 27:12,16 31:13, **electric** 43:19 66:22 16 32:6,12,15,22 33:11,20,22 34:11, **DRIE** 95:15,21 96:5,10,12 13 35:11,12,16 37:22 43:9 44:7,14 **electrical** 11:1 22:22 45:19 46:7 47:4,10,15,16 61:10 **driven** 60:17 72:19 83:3,9,13,14 93:7,8,15 Elefante 5:12 **driver** 22:15 **elevator** 45:9,23 55:25 88:13 error 88:24 drivers 93:3 escalating 31:3 **elevators** 45:13,24 drop 45:18 56:7 81:4 Eliot 32:25 52:21 essentially 55:10 70:6 drug 77:5,10 established 97:3 Elliot 2:22 **due** 10:2 27:8 43:19 44:10.18 54:19 establishing 66:10 63:24 64:9 **Elsa** 3:8 estate 21:7,16 23:8 30:7,14 57:7,14 dying 43:5 54:16 **emergencies** 88:18 89:8 66:13,15,18,19,21 emergency 19:20 30:11 56:1 estimated 91:10 Ε emphasize 47:3 **ETPA** 13:3,9,11 17:11,17 58:16 employed 15:16 **e-mail** 41:13 53:22 71:21,25 72:3 84:5 employees 5:15,22 6:20 12:3,4,5,6 e-mailed 53:21 68:18,19,21 evaluated 75:24 78:25 87:21 earlier 58:10 81:2 88:19 evaluation 74:1 **employers** 5:19,21 6:21,25 8:2 early 17:9 31:11 **Evelyn** 3:3 52:19 employment 63:16 earn 31:6 evening 2:1,7 5:2,3 9:5,6,16 11:18 enactment 9:21

## Index: evening's..finish

57:1 62:18 65:8,10 73:16,17 77:16, 17,23 82:6,7 85:6 90:10,11

evening's 69:4 events 83:20

eventually 23:11 85:9

ever-increasing 17:20 19:10

**everyday** 63:4 67:14 86:19

everyone's 87:16 89:2,3

everything's 89:2

evicted 83:6,15 93:16

evicting 37:14

eviction 18:9 37:8 45:16 56:3

evictions 18:10 69:13 92:25

evidence 65:22

eviscerated 17:11

exacerbated 55:14

**exact** 71:24

examples 59:1

exceeded 17:14

exceeds 70:4

**excuse** 27:19 33:13 34:1 48:9 68:23

70:11

Executive 12:21

**expect** 6:8 30:9,11 60:21 78:18 95:3

expectations 71:3

expected 37:19 85:23

expects 45:23

expenditures 28:6 70:5

expense 21:19 22:9 23:5 30:7 58:24

69:22 78:22

**expenses** 10:20,22,23 11:6,10 19:22 20:8 21:24 22:6 23:11 24:7,9 27:7 28:5,16,21,22 56:11 58:4 59:6

63:19 64:9 84:11 92:9

**expensive** 21:15 79:11 **experience** 18:1 19:11

experienced 9:20

**expert** 13:14

expertise 94:15

expire 6:7

expiring 5:23

explain 9:21 28:15 76:5

explained 66:13

exponentially 88:12

Exposure 55:14

exterior 22:24

extra 33:17,20 41:5 67:11

extremely 60:9 82:19

eye 59:6 87:18

F

face 10:22 18:6 61:19 80:14 91:22

faced 37:7 61:18 93:22,23

faceless 36:11

facing 10:20 11:11 13:19 14:16 18:9

36:23 56:15

fact 23:3 28:3 30:1,8 31:15 34:7,12

37:14 71:2 79:18 95:25 96:5.14

factor 66:9,11

factors 66:11,15

facts 28:10 29:13,19

fair 11:8 15:25 16:1 38:17 82:23

85:22 89:13,14 94:16

**fairly** 71:24

faiths 68:5.6

fall 80:12

**fallen** 82:23

falling 55:16

falls 43:3

**false** 34:2

familiar 95:4 96:24

families 15:3 36:6 55:22 59:9 69:15

81:3 85:11

**family** 15:22 31:4 36:7 54:16 55:12

57:14,20,25 86:5

**family's** 54:12 86:9

family-owned 60:25

family-run 36:2

Fast 83:8

**faster** 22:20

father 35:24 47:8

fearing 86:12,16

fecal 55:22

federal 19:20

fee 43:16 67:6

feed 55:22 59:9 85:11

feel 43:10 82:21,22 86:23

feeling 8:8

fees 66:17

feet 55:18

fellow 37:13 64:18

felt 97:22

female 35:7

fight 47:2 63:12

figure 7:1 32:7 74:5,7 78:19

figured 18:15

figures 27:17 71:16

filed 55:1 69:23

fill 19:17 35:10 72:13

filled 89:3

final 29:21

**Finally** 29:12,24 56:25

financial 30:2 47:14 71:10 73:5.18

80:14 82:17 83:3 84:13

financing 30:13,14

**find** 8:12 64:20 71:5 80:19 81:13

96:21 97:17

finding 36:21 59:11

findings 14:13 73:23

**fines** 55:5

**Finger** 2:24,25 25:10,11,21,25 39:13,15,17 40:6,11 46:1,5 48:21

51:23 52:23,24 53:20,23 87:19

finish 4:9 17:3 30:20 56:12

finished 76:10 86:20

fire 24:10,11,19,21 67:2

fires 19:3 22:23 25:5

**fix** 41:4 45:8 88:22

fixed 56:3 60:8 64:8 98:4

flat 79:25

flexibility 37:3

floor 11:1 42:18 45:14,16,18 54:23

83:21

floors 39:24 42:11

flow 74:3 75:23

fly-by-night 36:12

focus 29:8 31:6 79:17

Foley 77:16,17,20,22 81:19,21

folks 92:21 94:2

**follow** 76:18

follow-up 97:5

food 38:2 64:4,10 85:8

foot 55:2 60:15

force 8:18

**forced** 94:9

forget 27:11 28:25

forgiven 27:18 34:11

forms 35:10

Fortunately 18:9

fortune 26:13

forward 6:6 61:20 77:9 83:8

found 13:8 39:17 43:13 44:9 65:17

80:20 93:9 96:9

founder 9:11

four-year 5:25

freeze 27:2 28:10 63:3 69:24 78:15

95:13,18 97:2,6

freezes 65:15 96:16 97:8

freezing 65:1

fresh 40:21

Friday 27:15 83:10

front 22:8 54:13 89:11

frontline 63:5

frozen 65:16 78:15

fuel 22:3 28:22.23 40:2 66:17 67:4

full 7:6 54:14 56:14

full-time 64:7

fully 37:1 93:4

function 7:4 85:9

functioning 56:1

**fund** 7:18

funded 33:4

**funding** 85:19

funds 27:13,16 33:22 40:17

**Fung** 86:4,15,20

future 29:17 57:20 69:15 72:20

95:18 96:16 97:8.9

G

gains 80:13

gap 15:24,25 16:2 22:6 31:1

garage 19:3

gas 38:2,10 55:19 72:13 89:3

gave 32:7 59:1 91:25

Gene 73:3

general 92:6

generation 57:18

generations 57:15,20

Genevieve 13:13 25:15 26:11

gentlemen 12:19 18:18 88:1

gentrify 86:14,18

**give** 4:8 7:11 26:1 27:24 31:16 38:13 41:3 53:10 62:10,15 69:12,23 76:23

77:7 83:11,13 92:1 94:2 96:15 98:11

giving 8:10 17:2 84:13

**glad** 11:13

**global** 28:25

**goal** 80:23,24

goals 80:20

God 47:15 64:13

God's 68:5

golden 64:24

**good** 2:1,7 5:2,3 7:21 9:5,6 11:18 12:10,19 19:8 20:20,21 21:3 26:11 35:4 36:4,15 43:13 47:22 57:1 60:25 62:18 65:8,10 73:16 77:16,17,23 81:25 82:6,7 85:6 87:24 90:10,11

goodness 94:8

governmental 66:17

**grade** 57:17

grandfather 57:18

grant 73:22

granted 73:20 76:15

graph 29:9

gray 90:21,22

great 8:21 58:25 79:23

green 40:2 74:10 75:13

grieving 64:17

grocery 72:12

grossly 58:14

group 27:15 38:19 77:3

groups 82:25

grow 36:7

growing 26:22 31:1

growth 74:2,15 75:21,23 76:6 79:24

quarantee 83:14 92:9

guess 8:12,15 88:14

**guests** 62:19

**guideline** 14:18 16:12 17:21 29:3, 12 73:16,22,24 74:8,11,12,14,18

75:4,9,10,19 95:7

**guidelines** 2:4 10:19 11:8 12:23 17:6,8 21:21 28:19 30:2 40:18 45:21,22 58:2 65:20,25 66:3,8,10

67:9 73:19 95:10 97:3,15

gutter 60:14,15

guy 58:25 67:17

<b>guys</b> 67:9	heat 70:2 88:13,25	horror 18:6
	heating 28:22 29:5 40:3 67:4	hospitals 63:6
Н	heavily 57:10	hot 55:21,25
half 12:4,6 29:17 30:25 63:21	hefty 27:7	Houlihan 58:25
Hall 2:2,3 3:15 66:20	height 54:19	hour 8:3 18:21
<b>Hamer</b> 3:1,2 17:25 19:13 53:2,3	held 66:8 70:7	hours 72:16
94:1,11	<b>helped</b> 19:17,24 37:22 44:10 54:15	house 35:23
<b>hand</b> 20:25 36:1 48:14,22 49:2 51:5 75:14	helpful 37:23	house-expense 97:16
handed 58:15	helping 37:4 44:15	household 14:21 15:18 16:6 64:2,7
handing 51:6	<b>helps</b> 43:12	93:2
handle 16:9	heroes 63:12	<b>households</b> 14:24 15:18 31:5 64:15
handout 29:8 49:16	<b>high</b> 18:19 22:15 58:6 63:25 80:2	housekeepers 63:9
handouts 31:7,16 34:15	87:23	houses 19:1
hands 16:10 54:15 61:17 91:18	<b>higher</b> 10:24 28:3 78:8 79:5,8	housing 9:22 10:3 13:6 14:3,23
	highest 17:9 80:1 88:5	15:12 16:9 30:10 31:2 35:22 36:9
<b>Hanratty</b> 12:17,19,21 16:15,18,20, 23,25 17:5 18:4 19:15,19 20:13,16	highlighting 14:11	38:2,22 59:14 63:25 64:21 71:7 79:3 80:17,19 81:2 85:10 92:9,12,20,23,
happen 51:14 57:23,24	hike 71:22 72:7	24 93:17,19 94:8 95:23 96:6
happened 24:21 25:5 54:25	<b>hiked</b> 67:13	hover 80:5
happening 79:17 90:23 94:22	hired 87:25	hovering 6:13
happy 23:24 96:6	hiring 88:2	<b>HSTPA</b> 9:23 28:13 37:6 39:17,21
harassment 56:4	<b>historical</b> 5:24 70:22 73:23 75:12 76:18	40:17 45:20 60:6 76:3,5 78:14
hard 44:2 64:1 85:19	historically 6:4 75:9 84:6	Hudson 14:6
hardship 80:14	history 86:21	huge 23:10
hardships 81:9	hit 37:7 42:10	hundred 41:1 58:16
harmed 25:1	hold 42:2 86:9	hundreds 88:23
harmful 72:14	holding 21:16 54:15	hurricane 60:11
HCR 12:20 13:9 78:21	home 8:23 10:12 36:8 54:22 63:6,22	hurt 24:11 28:11 45:20
health 6:4,23 7:10 51:22 54:12 55:11	79:1	hurts 10:7,8
	homeless 15:3 18:15 20:3	
healthcare 62:13,22 63:7,12 64:22	homeowners 36:10 91:14	·
healthy 30:16 85:8	homeownership 36:11	IAI's 37:2 59:22
hear 9:7 25:21 30:19 44:2 62:12	homes 36:6 63:6 71:5 81:15	lda 60:11
67:22 69:17 76:5 98:14	honorable 46:18	<b>idea</b> 6:16
heard 23:21 78:13,19,23 83:2 93:7	hoods 37:16	identical 28:2
<b>hearing</b> 2:4,10 3:18 49:19,20,24 69:4	hope 7:11 38:23 61:1 96:4	<b>II</b> 91:9
	hopes 57:19	illegal 30:4

illustrate 11:7

**image** 91:20

immigrant 57:19

immigrants 86:22

imminent 28:1

impact 26:23 28:13 39:18 71:1,12

72:5,11 92:3

impacted 18:3

Impeccable 39:4

**implore** 61:18 84:15

**important** 9:17 33:1 73:8 91:4,12,

14 92:4,22,23 94:17 97:22

importantly 59:21 93:18

**impose** 56:17

imposed 67:5

impossible 13:25

impressive 79:23

improve 77:10

**improvements** 22:19 39:19 67:21 78:17 85:24 88:18 89:8,9

inability 13:23

inaudible 43:11 53:18 54:8 70:22

78:1

incentive 55:9

inch 42:24

inches 42:24

include 34:10 38:1 66:12,15

included 7:24,25

includes 79:1

including 37:24 56:4 74:3

income 13:20,23 14:23,25 15:15 19:22 26:23 27:4,6,17 28:2,18 31:1, 5 32:17 33:8 37:12 56:15 63:21 64:8 69:22 70:4,6 84:4 85:11,21 88:16 91:16 92:8 93:2,13 95:7,10 97:3

98:4

incomes 70:1

incoming 17:12

incorrect 58:14,15

increase 6:20 7:10 10:13 11:5,21 12:1,25 22:1 23:10 27:1 28:7,19,21 38:15,17 61:16 66:2,4 71:18,22 72:14 73:21 75:4,11 76:15,17,19 80:9,22 82:13 84:11,16 86:1 88:11 89:6 97:2

increased 7:12 27:23 28:24 30:12 38:7 66:19,21,23,25 67:4 70:5 78:10 86:1

increases 5:24 6:2,6,9,15 8:17 10:11,15,25 11:8,10 14:18,19 16:12 17:21 21:19,23 22:7,12 29:3,13,15, 17,20 30:4 56:17 58:1 59:16 60:21 61:3,20 66:1 69:18 71:12 73:19,24 74:8,18 78:5,15 82:19,23 84:6 88:10 95:18 97:8,9

increasing 17:16 67:15 80:18 86:7,

incredibly 14:10

incur 83:23

incurred 54:11

incurring 30:13

incurs 30:14

index 10:19 79:6,8,23 80:1,4

indicia 28:18

individual 28:16 39:20 48:12 64:15

individuals 3:25 4:13 81:2

industries 37:8

industry 35:22 63:7 66:13,14 67:16

79:7,11 90:21 94:6

industry-wide 79:3

infestations 55:17

inflated 58:14

inflation 6:12,19 7:7 8:1,11 18:3 23:2 26:23 28:1 37:25 45:17 56:16 59:10 60:17,18 64:10 67:17 69:17, 19 70:25 71:8 73:25 74:9,18 75:4, 10,11 76:8 78:8,12 79:15,18 84:7 85:25 86:2 88:5,6,7,10,11 89:18

inflationary 70:25

information 34:2 44:15,16 96:14

informed 27:15

injection 77:7

**inside** 81:13

installation 9:12 10:4

instilled 35:24

**Institute** 5:6 21:9 35:6,8,20 44:16

77:24

insufficient 60:21

**insurance** 21:4,5,7,8,11,19,23,24, 25 22:3,11,12,15,21,25 23:1,9,11,12 24:9,12,13,25 25:2,8 66:16,25 67:1, 4 82:20

insurance-related 23:3

insurers 21:8

intelligence 73:13

intended 30:3,8,10

interest 58:8,11,20,21,24 59:4

76:14

interested 62:19

interesting 8:6 27:3 73:14

intermittently 42:21

interrupt 69:8

interruptions 4:21

intersecting 89:7

intervening 29:5

intimidate 56:6

introduce 26:6 90:9

invest 80:9

invested 7:20

investing 36:15

investment 23:8 30:14 59:2

investments 59:7

investors 36:12

involved 8:4 9:18 10:16,25 57:10

involves 10:11

involving 10:5 11:4

**IRS** 59:4

issue 11:8 42:25 50:13 94:7

**issued** 34:18

**issues** 6:10,18 13:17 15:14 43:1

55:13

Index: Italy..live

**Italy** 57:19

item 41:16 47:16

items 42:1

J

January 88:14 89:8

Jason 20:18 21:4

**Jerry** 58:24

**job** 42:21 59:13 79:19 88:3 91:15 93:13

**jobs** 10:6 72:16 80:9 86:6 91:15,25 92:1 93:3

John 35:24

**Johnson** 81:22,23,24 82:2,3,4,8 84:20,21 87:12,13,15 89:22,24,25 90:2

joke 67:23 68:5

journey 35:21

judge 44:23

**judges** 44:25

**jug** 89:3

**jump** 76:12

jumps 36:25

**June** 9:23 27:11 31:19 34:15,18 83:8 98:20

justifiable 80:21 81:14

justification 69:23

justified 27:2

Justin 86:4

Κ

keeping 23:13 60:22 61:11 84:6,10

Ken 24:1 52:23

Kenneth 2:24

key 10:10

kills 43:3

kind 13:12 28:18 42:9 60:5 61:12

kindly 4:3

knew 44:17 45:2

**knowing** 43:15

L

L-I-A 87:6

L-I-A-N-A 87:5

**lab** 63:8

labor 5:12 8:18 22:13 38:8 66:17

lack 15:11 31:2 40:17 54:24 72:20

ladies 12:19

laid 72:15

Lake 79:6

Lamont 2:18 52:15

landlord 22:18 24:8,20,22 25:2 28:12 33:8,21 34:16 35:9,20 48:16 56:5,9 57:6 60:23 66:14 84:4 85:5 86:3,11,15 93:11,14,15

landlord's 23:17 66:4 75:20

landlords 13:22 14:17 21:13,25 22:4,7 23:7,11,16 26:20 27:5,12,22 28:20 31:12,23,25 32:9,11,16,21 33:4,15,20 34:8 36:8,20 37:13,21 43:10 44:8 55:3,5,8,10 56:9 58:5 60:17,20,24,25 65:12,20 69:18,19, 20,23 70:2,3 71:9,17 72:25 74:3 80:7 82:16,24 84:12 88:16

language 57:18

large 6:4 22:6 29:3 69:18

largely 17:11 28:21

larger 73:10

largest 5:14 15:4 21:6,8 62:22

**lastly** 4:19

late 4:4 43:16 90:6

law 13:3,5,11 22:13,14,17 76:4

82:18

laws 22:18 67:24

lead 29:3

leading 9:12 19:16 59:13

leaks 55:16,19

learned 6:13

**lease** 39:9,12 44:23 56:2 69:24 73:24 76:16

leases 2:11 71:15 84:17 89:17,18

leave 27:22 34:5 44:20 48:25 70:18

**leaves** 67:21

leaving 70:12 89:7

ledge 42:19

**left** 37:11 39:23 55:23,24 61:5 68:7

**legacy** 57:14

legal 17:13,18 65:16 82:14 83:23

lethargic 85:9

**letter** 67:14

level 17:18 27:9 29:11 78:17

levels 17:10 26:22 28:3,23 29:6,7

79:5

Levitt-fuirst 21:4

**liability** 23:9 24:20,24,25 25:2,8

Liana 84:22,24 87:3

licensed 21:5 58:23,25

lie 33:25

lies 70:17,20

**life** 35:21 57:6,22 61:14 64:13 67:25 76:24 85:12

lifeline 82:16

lifted 37:10 Lilianna 87:4

limited 15:15

limits 53:14

limped 79:24

**linear** 74:16

lines 54:13 64:11

Lisa 35:3,5,19

list 4:22 9:3 54:24 56:22 87:11 98:10

listen 38:20 70:17,19

listening 23:18

lists 13:10

**live** 15:13 19:2,3 36:17 57:12 61:12 62:20,23 64:24 69:16 72:23 81:16

85:22 91:25 94:10,19 97:25

lived 63:23 81:7 livelihood 57:13

livelihoods 61:17

lively 37:16

living 15:1 85:18 94:13

loading 89:12 loans 27:18 34:11

lobby 45:14

local 5:14 9:12 10:7 78:23 88:3

location 67:3 96:12

lock 29:15 logic 37:20 logical 22:19 logically 24:19

long 36:17 54:24 81:6 97:2

longer 37:6 64:12 69:7 84:13 91:23

looked 5:18,20 7:8 34:9

lose 20:7 61:4

loss 24:9 28:13 37:11 56:14 64:18 68:5 78:24 82:18

losses 82:17

lost 10:6 19:22 27:5 93:1

**lot** 7:19 24:17 40:24 41:11 44:13,14, 19 45:3 46:18 47:18 58:3 60:24,25 67:18,21 79:15 87:23 91:14 93:4,7, 14 97:16

loud 48:24 51:4

love 67:9

**low** 6:4 7:1 13:19,23 28:19 45:20,21 74:23 82:19 86:8

low-income 26:24

iow income 20.24

lower 31:3 40:18 45:5 78:22

lowest 79:21

LRAP 32:15 33:20

lucky 13:13 27:6 93:21 98:2

lumber 38:6 78:5 luxurious 41:16

М

Madam 77:17 85:6

**made** 20:1 50:4,19 56:10 58:1 59:7 61:20 64:2,22 85:12 86:13,16 96:11

**Mae** 2:20 52:17

magnitude 22:1

main 78:22 97:18

**maintain** 7:10 23:12 30:4 36:5 45:6 84:4 89:6 93:11

maintaining 23:1,8 87:23

**maintenance** 10:23 11:2,3,6 22:2 23:5 27:8 28:6 45:10 66:16,24 78:22 82:20 87:20 88:8 89:4

major 22:6,15,23 25:5 41:24 42:25

majority 92:1

**make** 13:22 21:14,18 22:10 23:4 24:8 29:21 36:13 38:12 40:1,23 46:14 47:25 50:12 51:14 54:21 55:10,15 56:15 59:8,12 60:7 74:7 77:8 81:14 82:8 85:1,24 86:13 89:15 91:12,19 92:2 94:16,21 97:24 98:1

makes 8:18 32:18

**making** 18:20,21 50:22 51:11 64:5

malfunctions 22:23

manage 35:25 36:22,25

managed 57:16 manager 82:4

managers 9:24 10:1,15 11:9

manages 86:4

managing 57:7 58:2 85:4

mandated 22:25 23:4

Manhattan 7:5 43:1

manner 56:4

March 38:6 41:14 83:6

margins 28:12 39:7

Mariani 4:23

mark 79:21

**market** 7:15 15:25 16:1,3 17:10,14, 18 21:11 37:3 71:1,3 79:6,19 82:13, 14 88:3

mask 44:3

material 10:11

materials 4:7 26:16 38:5

math 59:25

mathematician 73:12

mathematics 73:12 77:6

**Matt** 5:1

matter 33:7 34:7 55:23

matters 54:3

Matthew 5:11

MCI's 37:2 59:23 67:22,24

Mckee 69:2 meals 37:18

means 36:4 55:20 61:16 81:10 84:4

measure 64:25 71:24

mechanism 81:7

median 71:13,20 72:3

medical 55:14 62:21 63:10 77:3

medication 97:20

meet 41:10 54:21 56:15 97:3

**meeting** 2:9 3:13 48:5 50:10 52:9 64:9 78:13 98:14,17

meetings 79:16

member 2:16,18,20 3:3,8

**members** 4:10,12,13,20 17:7 50:16 54:1,16 58:18 62:18,23 63:5 64:2,6 73:17 85:6,7 96:8

Memorial 77:4

mention 10:10 14:3 54:24

**mentioned** 22:2 31:11 58:6,10 78:8, 25 81:1

mere 55:5

message 97:1,23

met 85:21

meticulously 61:8

metric 74:2,21 75:20

metropolitan 10:1 mice 54:22 55:17

Michael 9:4 69:2

middle 49:18,24 55:18 85:13

midst 54:17 milk 89:3

**million** 27:12,14 30:25 31:24 33:11 64:18 90:24 91:11

Milone 58:22 mind 6:15,16

mine 64:15

minimum 8:17 18:20 23:13 84:16

minus 75:5,23 minute 34:3 89:23

**minutes** 3:25 4:2 5:7 9:14 25:20 48:11 53:15,25 62:9,16 69:5 73:6 77:21 81:25

mirrors 91:1

miscellaneous 34:10

misplaced 30:1 missed 94:1 missing 37:11 model 73:5

modeler 77:12

modeling 73:18 76:13 77:6 79:7

moderate 74:24 modern 13:19 modest 72:14 80:9

**mold** 54:23 55:14

moment 71:6 72:3 80:8

**moments** 46:23

**money** 7:20 20:5,6,7 24:6,8,16,23 31:12 32:6,8,13,15,22 33:11,12,14, 17 34:8,13 35:11,12 38:24 43:4 44:10 45:18,22 46:20 47:3,10,11,15 58:3 59:21 60:5 67:21 83:13 85:17 88:6,12,15,17 89:1,19

Montefiore 62:20 63:16

Montel 87:4

**month** 10:19 18:22 28:4 32:22 35:13 45:24 55:25 63:17 83:9

month's 44:21

monthly 15:24 45:9 72:5

**months** 32:23 35:13 41:8,15,21,22 46:13 55:20 89:11 93:8,9

**moratorium** 18:11 37:8 43:14 44:11 45:17

moratoriums 37:9

mortgage 43:17,18 58:19,25

**mother** 18:13

**motion** 49:14,15,18,25 50:12,14,15, 19,20,22,25 51:1,2,10,11,14 52:3,7 53:6 98:14

**Mount** 2:2 12:22 15:4,16 19:16 26:12 62:20 63:14 65:12 66:18,20 67:5 85:5 88:3 90:18 91:1,2 92:14 96:8.9.11

**move** 25:1 55:4 71:25 77:9

**moved** 63:13,18,19 98:15

**moving** 15:12

**multifamily** 9:18 10:8,15,21 36:3

**multiple** 54:3 64:3 78:23 87:20,25

municipalities 92:15 95:9,17 96:4

**municipality** 16:6 81:6 95:7,11 97:4

**MVUT** 13:4

Ν

**N-A** 87:7

**NAHB** 79:5

Nassau 58:17

nation 5:15 79:4 94:5.7

nation's 23:2

national 10:12 15:23

nationally 79:20

nationwide 94:23

navigate 54:5

necessarily 5:9 97:7,11

necessities 35:25 64:4,17

needed 28:19 40:16 44:17

**negative** 9:23 10:2 71:1 75:1 76:1,3,

7,8 77:10

negotiated 7:3

negotiations 8:16

neighborhood 86:12,16

neighborhood's 86:21

neighbors 63:23 64:8,15 83:20

**net** 28:17,20 30:16 33:7 70:1,6

news 24:10 25:7 88:4,10

nice 46:23 87:17 89:9

**night** 15:5 88:21

nightmare 47:14

**NOI** 27:9 28:7 67:19 70:8 76:14,17

nonleaking 88:14

nonpayment 83:5

Notably 27:14 29:6

note 65:15 74:13 82:8

**notice** 18:14

noticeable 75:25

noticed 93:6

**November** 13:5 14:6 41:12,13

nuclear 77:4

**number** 6:12 7:23 13:2 14:13 27:18

29:14 65:18 81:2,3 94:2

numbering 26:21

**numbers** 13:9,12,15 17:16 27:2,3, 16 29:14,17 32:16 33:8,10,21 56:9 71:24 72:2,10

11.24 12.2,10

**numerous** 57:8 61:13

**nurse** 54:12

**nurses** 63:7,8

nursing 63:6

**NY** 45:1

**NYC** 58:16,20

**NYU** 77:2

72:12 83:23,25 92:10

	oranges 30:3	packet 76:12
0	<b>order</b> 7:12,19 35:25 38:3 41:10,12 44:11	<b>paid</b> 34:13 43:15,20 46:21 47:13 93:11
objection 50:7	ordered 54:8	<b>pain</b> 19:11
<b>obligation</b> 21:14 92:20,22	orderly 78:1	<b>pandemic</b> 18:11 28:13 37:7 46:20 50:2 54:14,18,20 56:14 60:19 61:9
observable 78:16	orders 55:7	
obstacle 36:23	ordinary 71:6	62:25 63:13 64:1,23 76:4 78:11 82:18 91:16 93:14
<b>obtained</b> 31:13 72:18	organization 4:1 75:12 80:15	<b>pane</b> 39:25
occupied 72:2	organizations 19:17 57:9	panic 41:8
occurred 76:4	out-of-control 22:12	paper 51:5
October 2:12	outbid 71:6	papers 5:8
offered 55:21	outcome 23:15	paragraph 16:15 17:3 61:5
offers 86:13,17	outstanding 10:12	pardon 32:20 90:5 95:2
<b>office</b> 13:14 18:4,16 20:8 30:6 69:21 95:22,23,24 96:1 97:18,21	_	•
	ovens 55:22	parking 67:18
offset 23:10 44:10,12,13 95:19	overcharge 54:8	<b>part</b> 43:2 45:7 51:7 57:13 73:22 76:12 78:3 92:24 96:9,10
oil 28:7,15 29:5 38:9,10 67:18	overextend 43:4	part-time 91:15 93:3
older 22:20 40:20,22 84:10	overextended 17:21	partial 42:21
one-bedroom 63:14	overpaid 47:13	participate 96:5
one-bedrooms 82:11	overshadows 79:18	partnership 94:20
one-year 39:9 40:25 69:24 71:15 73:24 74:8 76:16 84:17 89:17	<b>owe</b> 35:15 37:24 46:19 72:20 84:1	parts 74:10 79:10
	owed 35:13 44:13 47:5	pass 29:16 67:7,8
ongoing 14:2 61:19	owes 37:25 83:9	passed 17:8 49:10
opened 44:17	<b>owing</b> 44:10	passing 82:17
operate 21:16 36:3 45:13 88:12	owned 57:16	
operated 45:11 57:16 60:25	owner 2:22,24 3:14 27:17 30:13,15	passionate 57:10
operates 37:20	owner's 27:20 57:3 59:2	passionately 80:18
<b>operating</b> 10:20 28:18 29:25 30:16 33:7 58:11,12,21,24 66:16,24 70:1,6 85:20 88:8,13 89:7	<b>owners</b> 4:17 5:6,21 9:24 10:1,15,21, 22 11:6,9 14:21 27:16,18 30:4 58:5 70:22 78:19 80:22 82:22 83:2	<b>past</b> 42:4 55:12 57:8 59:22 61:4,13,
		<b>patch</b> 60:10
operations 11:3	Owners' 21:10 57:5	Pattern 14:6
opine 66:1	ownership 71:11	paving 67:17
opinion 73:15	owns 86:4	<b>pay</b> 13:16 18:21 19:10 24:25 25:8 32:10 37:17 43:18 44:21 47:9 63:17, 24 64:3,8,16 67:21 72:1,13,20 83:14,18,21 86:6 87:19 92:8
opinions 2:11		
<b>opportunity</b> 3:21 9:16 11:12 17:2 54:6 90:7 98:8,12	Р	
optional 41:15	<b>p.m.</b> 2:2 3:16	paycheck 47:9
options 15:12	PAC 69:2	<b>paying</b> 14:22,24 41:11,17 43:16 46:16 56:3 63:21 64:1 67:11 71:19
	nace 91·17	

**pace** 91:17

**ORA** 70:22 71:13

payment 46:15 69:3 83:11 84:22 87:11 91:21 93:11 podium 4:9 90:8 95:8 98:9 payments 37:9,11 58:8 59:4 72:19 **point** 10:10 27:1 29:21 31:7 50:13 personal 56:5 66:25 65:13 68:7 74:23 95:14 payroll 82:20 perspective 29:1 60:3 pointing 22:25 42:14,15 50:1 pays 47:8 pet 55:22 **points** 10:24 11:7 26:19 29:2 30:21 Peekskill 15:5,17 48:21 **Peter** 3:10 pending 47:20 policies 83:1 petrifies 55:24 **pension** 6:5 7:12,17 92:1,2 96:19 **policy** 24:14 pharmacies 63:6,10 **people** 3:22 6:11 14:19 15:1,12 politicians 48:23 16:10 18:6,9,12,19,25 19:4,11,17, **phones** 4:20 87:17 politics 28:25 21,24 20:2,6,7 24:11 36:12 43:3 phonetic 4:23 12:18 65:25 44:19,20 45:2,3 46:16,18,19 47:18, **poor** 31:1 25 48:16,23 51:3,21 54:18,20 61:4 physical 68:22 63:5 64:3 72:23,24 77:7 80:12 89:15 **population** 15:2,8,11 90:16,21 physician 63:8 90:21,24 91:2,19 92:8,10 93:1,4,14, 92:5,6 94:16 23 94:10,13 95:2,12,21 96:17,21,23 physicists 77:4 portion 6:4 19:8 26:13 97:16,18 pick 37:19 positioned 72:25 percent 5:17 6:1,3,5,6,13,15,19,24 **picking** 18:12 7:9,11,12,16 8:2,3,10,17,18 10:13, positive 75:25 24 11:5,23,24 14:21,22,25 15:2,3,7, picture 75:21,22 78:1 **possibly** 85:13 91:19 17 17:8 21:18,20,22,25 22:2,3 23:5 **piece** 57:13 27:5,7,9 28:3,4,6,8,9 32:17 33:9 post-pandemic 28:24 38:1,5,7,8,18 39:9,11 40:5,6,7,8 pillars 36:20 potential 23:14 72:6 56:10 59:3,10 66:19,21,23,25 67:1, pipe 22:22 55:19 5,14,15,16,20,24 68:1,2 70:10 potholes 45:8 71:21,22,23 72:7,8 75:9,11 76:16, **pipes** 55:17 poverty 15:1,18,21 26:23 18,19 78:10 79:20 80:1,5 84:16,17 **place** 21:15 69:16 85:25 88:5 89:17 90:25 91:3 92:8,10 power 89:16 placement 21:7 **PPP** 27:18 34:11 percentage 10:24 11:21 21:23 23:6 **places** 21:16 47:15 practice 26:13 97:16 **plain** 45:1 practicing 58:23 percentages 58:14 72:9 **Plains** 15:6 35:21 96:1,15 practitioner 54:13 **perch** 92:13,19 **plan** 39:5 **pray** 88:21 perfect 39:5 88:1,4 planned 40:16 pre-pandemic 79:5,9,22 perfectly 50:9 Planning 20:14 predict 22:19 performed 75:16 **plans** 46:15 predictably 28:5 period 21:22 73:25 74:1,11,13 75:2, **plates** 55:22 5 76:7 prediction 22:10 plead 38:20 periods 75:24 predictions 29:16 pleading 82:23 permanently 29:15 30:12 preferential 17:13 **plight** 64:19 perplex 21:13 premium 22:12 **plow** 45:8 **Persanis** 5:1,2,3,5,8,11,12 8:22,24, premiums 21:24 22:3,15 25 9:2 plumbing 11:1 prepared 14:6 persist 54:6 plywood 60:13 preparing 94:6 person 4:1,22,24 9:3 47:23 56:22 pockets 60:19

preretirement 96:18

present 2:15,17,21 3:4,6 17:6 24:1

76:24 98:18

presentation 3:13,25 4:7,9 16:24 31:12 34:4 35:1,5,19 47:21 65:5

68:9,12,13,15 73:10 90:1

presentations 47:24

presented 88:1

presenting 27:21

presents 73:22

president 35:5,7,19

pressure 71:4

pretty 30:9 39:21

preventative 45:10

previous 14:18 58:6

**PRI** 73:15

price 10:19 78:5

prices 28:7,15,23 29:2,5,7,9,11 38:3

67:14,15 78:4,14

pricing 60:17

**pride** 61:11 87:23

prior 48:4 52:8 53:21

private 19:1

pro 26:14

problem 94:14

problems 14:16

procedure 4:6 49:24

procedures 3:19

proceeding 54:7 98:20

proceedings 21:11 54:9

process 80:20

processed 19:23

produced 13:9 78:16 80:21

product 87:25 88:7

professional 73:14 76:24

professionals 63:11

professor 73:12 77:1,2

**profit** 28:12,20 29:25 30:5,16 55:10

56:10,11,13 76:6

profits 27:23

program 6:24 19:20 37:23 61:10

83:3 95:21 96:1,5,10

**programs** 90:14 92:12 96:20,23

97:1

progress 14:7 80:4

project 6:8

projections 29:11,18

projects 10:5 40:16 88:20

promises 83:14

pronounce 84:22

proof 60:18,19

proper 24:12 29:10 38:15 49:18,24

properly 15:22 38:25

properties 11:5 70:9,23 85:4 87:21

property 22:21 23:9 25:3 43:6 71:11

82:4 84:4 86:6

proportionate 66:5

protect 23:7 30:3 93:17 94:18

protection 9:22 10:3 30:11

**proud** 62:21

**provide** 10:15 14:16 17:20 36:9,22 59:14,16,19 70:2 80:24 81:15 87:24

provided 22:8 37:20 48:4 69:21

70:22 71:13 78:21

**providing** 12:22 13:14 19:25 57:19

**public** 2:4,10,16,18,20 3:3,8 17:7,16

49:18.19 50:5 78:1.13

publicized 96:21

published 13:6 14:5

punished 36:21

purpose 49:20 65:19 69:12

**pursue** 24:20

**push** 45:14 81:11

put 15:23 28:25 29:24 39:21 42:2,20

45:20 49:7 55:10 57:22 60:3 87:17

puts 29:9

putting 13:17 39:25

Q

quadrupled 82:10

quadrupling 13:1

qualified 37:24 72:17

qualify 61:10 95:8,18

qualities 35:24

quality 36:22 38:22 59:14,17,20

85:18

quarter 79:8

quarters 28:11

quest 27:23

question 4:11 16:21 17:1 25:11 32:1,14 39:6,14,15 43:21 44:5,9 46:1,4,5 48:13,19 49:17 53:24 72:21

74:17,22 76:21 89:5 95:1 97:5

questions 8:24 11:13,16,19 16:19 17:24 20:12 23:20 30:18 31:8 50:4 61:22 65:4 68:8 76:20 77:14 81:19 84:19 87:1 88:19 89:20,25 93:25

98:5

quick 36:13 76:21

quiet 27:20

quietly 70:14,18

quorum 3:9

quote 14:9 17:13 30:6

**quoted** 60:12

quotes 60:2

R

**RAB** 7:4,24 8:9

rain 42:9,10

rained 42:9

raise 6:16 8:10 55:4 56:8 84:14

86:14,17

raised 17:10

raising 69:17

ramification 24:18

ramifications 23:14,22,25 24:2,12

range 74:21

**ranges** 74:20

ranging 60:2

ranks 22:1

rapidly 89:6

**rate** 6:19 37:3 59:2,10 74:2,9,15,18 75:4,10,11,21,23,25 76:1,6,9 78:7,

11 79:20 82:13

rates 38:3 66:16,22 73:25

rational 65:21

reach 15:23 20:8 29:6

react 67:11

**read** 14:8 43:1 48:1,3,15,24 49:9,11, 23 50:3,6,8,9,19 51:2,3,4,15,16,19, 20,21,23 52:9 53:8,12,15 68:11,25

86:3

reading 51:12 69:7

**real** 16:9 21:7,16 23:8 30:7,14 57:7, 14 59:2 66:12,15,18,21 68:4 71:11

72:10,11

reality 80:6 83:4

realize 30:5

realized 36:7

**Realty** 7:4 21:9 35:6,8,20 57:15

77:24

reason 17:15 91:3 97:14

reasonable 23:10 28:20 30:5 37:2

38:17 61:20 81:13

reasons 51:22 72:24

rebates 95:20

rebuilt 24:15,16

receive 8:2 11:9

received 27:12,18 43:10 44:8 47:4

52:8 60:2 73:14

recent 10:11 22:18

recently 7:3 10:13 28:23 41:2 77:2

86:3

recession 28:1 56:16 79:24

recognize 64:19

recommend 89:16 96:13

recommendation 73:21

recommendations 14:10

record 3:9 49:9,11 50:3,6,8,10 51:7

52:9 53:8,13 79:22

recourse 84:8

recover 56:14 67:23,25

recovered 68:2 79:7

recovering 27:24 54:17

recovery 27:25

red 74:12 75:14

reduced 72:17 88:2

reduction 27:4,8

refer 75:21 90:22

referencing 13:7

referred 74:4

referring 73:10

reflects 91:5

**reform** 22:12

refrigerator 41:4,6,8,15,16

refrigerators 41:5

**refusal** 55:6,15 56:2

region 10:1

regression 74:16 75:7

regular 10:4 17:18,25 18:6,9,17

19:4,12

regularly 17:12

regulated 17:13 27:24 28:3 30:8,9

86:8

regulation 30:3 59:23 69:12

regulations 36:24

reimbursed 37:2

reimbursement 55:21

relate 37:2

relating 73:24

relative 21:11 24:3

released 10:19 56:9

relevant 28:16,18

reliable 14:2

relief 17:20 22:8

rely 67:1 98:4

remain 27:20

remember 50:9 69:19 71:8,17

91:21 94:16,17

remind 69:11 84:3 98:2

remodelers 79:1

remodeling 79:6,12

renew 56:2

renewal 23:1

renewals 38:15 69:25

renewed 2:12

renovate 55:4

renovation 59:24

renovations 41:25 59:13

rent 2:3,11 9:24 10:1,18 11:4 12:23, 24 14:25 17:6,7 18:22,24 19:7,10 21:21 22:7 23:10 27:1,2 28:4,10,13 30:2,3,4,6,12 32:9,18,23 33:9 35:12, 14,15,17 36:24 37:4,24 38:15 43:12, 15,16 44:13,21,24 47:4,5,9,14 54:1, 8 55:5 56:4,17 58:1 63:2,14,15,17, 22,23,24 64:1,4,8,25 65:1,14,15,16, 20,24 66:3,6,7,10 67:8 68:3,4 69:12, 13,18,21,24 70:8,23 71:12,13,22 72:2,3,5,7,14,19,20,21,23 73:16,19, 21,24 74:7,8,11,12,14,18 75:4,9,10, 11,19 76:15,17,19 78:15 79:14 81:4, 5 82:12,18,19 83:5,9,21,23,25 84:3 86:1,8 88:9 89:6 91:5,13 93:12 95:14,18 96:16 97:2,6,12

rent's 32:22

rental 5:17 19:20 27:4,6 28:2 32:16

47:11 70:3,4 71:1,7

rented 82:11

renters 13:19 14:22 15:13 71:6

72:15

renting 82:9

**rents** 13:24 15:24,25 16:1,3 17:1,13, 14,18,20,22 18:18,22,23 21:17 22:5

28:19 29:4,6,15,19 56:8 63:3 66:4 71:3,4,18 82:10,14 84:10,14,16 85:24 86:10,14,17 88:16 89:12,13

rents's 86:8

repainting 10:25

**repair** 9:12 10:4 11:5 23:3 39:19 59:11 60:8 78:17 79:12 85:13

**repairs** 11:1,2 22:2,24 23:4,5 24:22 28:5 39:20,22 41:25 55:7,16 78:10, 21 79:2 84:9 85:18

repayments 37:2

**repeat** 39:7 59:3 62:11 75:10 76:16 86:15

repeatedly 37:17

replace 60:2,12,15 85:14

replaced 42:12 replacement 22:24 replacements 41:19,25

**report** 10:20,23 13:8 14:8,14 31:16 34:14,18 58:19 73:18

**reported** 21:19 23:5 27:16 33:23 34:8 47:5 58:11 69:22

**reports** 14:13 20:13 69:23 71:13 78:21

represent 5:13 15:7 21:7 94:17

representative 2:22,24 3:1,7 12:17 66:14

representatives 3:14 27:20 66:15

represented 8:9

**representing** 3:24 4:1 5:4,5 9:8,10 20:21 25:17 26:14 62:6 73:4 77:18 81:24 84:25 85:2,3,4 87:13,15 90:13

represents 32:23,24,25

repurposed 24:17

require 64:3 required 35:25 requirement 50:4

research 14:9 26:18 27:15 77:5

reserve 89:7

reserves 60:7 Resident 5:6

residential 66:12 71:1 79:6,12

residents 36:16 45:15 62:19

resolution 54:10 resolve 50:13 resolved 55:14 resort 37:15 resource 38:19

resources 38:24 59:20

respectfully 4:3 63:2

respond 2:14 response 73:20

responsibilities 13:17 64:5

responsibility 17:19 86:23 96:25

rest 29:24 48:25 restaurant 37:17,18 result 10:6 19:23 22:21 resulting 22:23 27:8 28:9

resumed 37:9
retain 54:6
retaliatory 69:13

retired 64:15 77:2 retiring 96:22

return 29:25 59:2,7,8,12 64:7

returned 93:4 revenue 82:18 review 77:25 reviewing 16:8 RGB 58:16,19,20

rich 31:1 ripped 19:1 rise 10:25 22:9 rising 10:14 56:15 risk 54:12 55:11 61:2 risked 57:19 risks 58:4

Riverdale 56:19

roach 55:17 Robison 38:9

robust 28:8

**Roche** 13:14 25:16,17,19 26:2,5,8, 10,11 27:22 29:23 30:23 31:15,19, 21,23 32:5,11,14,20,24 33:2,7,16,21 34:7,20,22,24 35:2

Rochelle 3:15 15:5 rocket 59:11 82:21

rocketed 38:6 67:18 88:9

rocketing 78:4 84:7 92:25

Rockland 58:17

**ROI** 58:6

roll 2:14 49:12 52:10

rollback 14:18 16:25 17:22 29:18

rolled 29:6 rolling 21:17

Ronnie 90:12 95:24

roof 22:24 60:11,12 88:14 89:10

room 3:15 81:10,13 88:24 roommate 63:18,19,20

**roots** 36:13

Rosagna 48:1 53:16,19 56:19

**rose** 10:23 62:1,2,5,6,8,10,13,15,17, 20 65:4,6,18

**Rosenberg** 9:4,5,6,7,10,15 11:16, 18,20,23,25 12:2,4,8,10,13,15

Ross 88:1 roughly 5:17

rounded 71:24 72:8

Royal 79:6

Rubiano 48:1 53:16,19 56:19

**Rubin** 2:5,6,18,20,22,24 3:1,3,5,7,8, 17 5:3,7 8:21,24 9:1,3,6,8,14 11:15, 19 12:12,14,16 16:14,16,19,21,24 17:4,23 19:14 20:11,15,18,21,24 21:2 23:19 25:10,12,15,20,22,24 26:4,6,9 27:19 29:22 30:17 31:8,10

32:2 33:13 34:1,3,19,21,23,25 35:3 39:2,4,6,10,13,16 40:14 43:23,25 44:2,4 46:1 47:1,17,20,24 48:6,9,11, 17,25 49:5,12,15 50:17,19,22 51:2, 8,12,15,17,19 52:1,4 53:4,5,11,15, 19,22 56:12,21,25 61:6,22,25 62:3, 6,9,16 65:3,7,9 68:8,11,16,19,23 69:5,7,10 70:13 73:2,6 76:10,20,22 77:13,18,21 81:18,22,25 82:3,7 84:19,25 85:2 86:25 87:3,5,7,9,11 89:21,23,25 90:3,8,11 93:24 94:24 95:1 98:7,9,17

rules 3:19 ruling 37:6 run 38:25 45:19

**running** 9:21 41:16 54:22 86:11 88:8

## S

sacrifices 64:22

**safe** 36:5 38:22 43:5 59:14 60:22

**safely** 45:15

safety 42:25 43:1 81:15

**sales** 58:25

Sandra 65:7,11

**Santiago** 3:3,4 31:9,10,11,18,20,22 43:9,22,23,24 44:1,3,5 52:19,20

save 24:23 60:6 83:3 92:23

**saving** 64:13

**savings** 84:8 88:17

Scaffold 22:13

**scared** 96:18

Schiciano 20:19,20,23,25 21:3,4

23:23 24:3,5 25:14

school 93:3

scrambling 41:17

**SCRIE** 65:14 95:3,6,8,13,15,16 96:5,

10,12 97:6

seconded 52:5,9

seconding 50:21

Section 13:25 14:1 47:10

secure 36:5

**security** 44:24,25 69:12 91:24

96:19

seeking 28:20

**sell** 86:19

send 44:16

**senior** 56:5 65:14 90:14 91:22 92:12

93:22 95:16 96:23 98:3

seniors 64:23 65:13 90:15 92:16

94:22 95:13 96:21 98:1

sense 21:18 86:23

**sentence** 56:12 81:12

separate 35:11,16 47:15,16

**September** 2:12 6:7 38:7

series 9:23 10:17

serve 16:13 92:22

served 83:8

service 5:15,22 36:23 38:13 78:2

services 11:1 54:8,24 59:17,20

90:14 92:12

session 68:24

**set** 15:19 48:7,10 74:10 88:17

**setoff** 83:20

**sets** 73:15 74:16 75:16,17 95:7

**settled** 35:18

severally 97:12

severe 16:9

severely 14:23 16:6 63:2

**share** 63:18 82:25 85:22

**sheet** 95:25

**sheets** 96:14

shifted 42:23

**shifts** 64:3

shooting 38:8

**short** 85:1

short-term 28:25

shortage 60:9

**shorter** 37:9 64:12

shoulder 84:12

**show** 3:9 14:4 29:11,19 33:22 56:9

59:2 76:5 79:6

**Shown** 75:13

**shows** 4:25 11:5 15:10 31:23 34:16

shrink 13:3

**shut** 83:7

shutoff 55:19

**shy** 31:5

side 38:21 42:10

sides 65:23 89:13

sign 90:6

**signed** 3:21,22 71:15

significant 11:10 84:11 93:1

significantly 85:25 95:11

silence 4:20

**simply** 55:7 84:10

simulation 73:21

Singer 38:9

**single** 18:13 67:12,13 91:8 93:21

sir 88:19

**sister** 95:21

sit 57:4

site 14:13

situation 10:8 43:5

skip 4:24

**sky** 38:6 59:11 67:18 78:4 82:21

84:7 88:9 92:25

**slack** 37:19

slid 88:19

**slightly** 37:22 70:5

Sloan-kettering 77:4

**slope** 75:7,15

**slow** 55:3

slow-moving 54:7

**slowly** 27:24 64:17

slum 55:2,9

## Index: small..substantially

small 36:2 57:6 60:20,24 66:1 78:23 smidgen 28:8 snow 45:8 soared 71:3 social 63:10 91:24 96:19 sold 35:23 solution 22:11 46:10 86:10 95:12 solutions 81:11 solvent 7:19

someone's 43:2 47:8 sort 59:12

**southwest** 65:12 82:5

**spare** 22:14

**speak** 9:16 19:18 43:25 63:1 82:22 90:15 95:14 98:11

**SPEAKER** 33:25 34:2 52:2,6 68:3 70:12,15,17,19

speaking 8:8 26:2 28:15

specialists 92:12 specialty 77:5 specific 53:10 specifically 22:16 Speculating 30:7

speculation 29:14 speech 20:25 spell 13:12 spend 49:11

**spending** 40:9 41:1

spends 26:13 spike 29:2,9 spiked 28:23 spiral 70:25 spoke 39:7 78:3 spoken 95:3 98:11

spokespersons 13:22

**spot** 55:24 **spouse** 93:1

spouses 64:6 spread 46:13 square 60:15

**squared** 74:22 75:3,5 **squares** 74:12

squeezed 85:19

St 82:5,9

Stability 9:22 10:3 stabilization 66:6 81:5

stabilize 80:16

**stabilized** 9:24 10:2 11:4 18:23,24 19:7 28:14 37:4 63:14,23 65:1,14 70:9,23 72:23 79:14 81:4

staff 12:20 69:22 70:22 96:8

staggering 14:24 stamina 54:6 standard 87:23

start 2:9 3:18 35:4 46:16 78:10 82:9

**started** 13:4 82:11 **starting** 4:4,20 53:25

**starts** 79:3

**state** 22:13 27:13 31:25 34:18 58:23 82:25 83:1 94:12,23 95:19,22,25

96:11,14

**statement** 26:17 30:24 48:4,15,22 53:16 77:8

33.10 77.0

**statements** 44:18 48:22 49:2,9,10,

16,23 51:3

states 19:21 71:2 90:17

station 72:13 statistical 73:23 statistically 75:17 statistician 34:9 statisticians 33:23

**status'** 94:1

**stay** 4:10 6:14,17 38:3 88:18

steady 27:7 63:17 70:7

**Stecker** 2:1 3:10,12 4:2,8 5:10 48:1, 3,7,10,12 49:4,7,13,17,21 50:1,8,15,

18,25 51:9,13,20 52:7,13,15,17,19, 21,23,25 53:2,4,6,12,17,21,25 56:13 68:13,14,21 73:8

steel 38:7 42:18.19

**Stewart** 3:5,6 4:16 19:14,15 20:10 30:18,19 50:24 51:21,24,25 52:1,5, 9,25 53:1,24 68:11,18,20,25 69:1,6, 9,11 70:14,16,18,21 90:5 95:1,2,6 97:5,9,11 98:6,15

stick 4:3

stock 7:14 41:6,21 93:17

**stone** 27:22 **stood** 54:15

stop 17:19,20 18:10

**stopped** 19:25 20:2 40:13 46:20

stopping 11:6 store 72:12 storm 60:14 88:4 story 82:25

street 18:5 43:2 64:11

**strictly** 76:17 **strong** 74:25 75:3

**strongest** 79:19 80:6

strongly 80:15 structure 85:8 struggle 27:25 struggled 44:14 struggles 61:18,19

**struggling** 46:11 54:18 56:14 63:24

64:16,25 72:11 80:12,17

stuck 55:25 study 15:23 stuff 20:5 41:24 subject 13:10 submit 96:2,16 subsidize 37:4 subsidy 13:25 14:2 substantial 65:22

substantially 24:14 71:18 72:16

## Index: successful..tier

84:14 systems 42:1 57:24 59:14,17,19 60:22 61:9,12,15 63:3 64:20 65:1,14,21 67:7,8,10 successful 81:1 69:2,12,15,20 71:9,19,21,25 72:6, Т successfully 19:23 36:1 72:18 11,14,18 80:8,10,22 83:25 84:1 85:17,22 87:24 89:11 91:5 sudden 43:2 table 70:1,3 tenants' 12:24 suffer 38:16 59:15 tables 14:14 tens 83:24 suffered 82:16 tactic 55:2 tenth 21:22 suffering 81:9 takes 38:24 41:7 tenths 27:5 32:17 33:9 suffice 22:14 23:15 taking 50:7 tents 94:9,10,13 sufficient 36:9 talk 30:20 66:24 85:7 term 11:7 suggest 74:23,25 talked 43:9 79:15,16 83:10 93:7 terms 72:9 80:9 96:11 suggests 74:24 75:8 77:9 terrible 24:10 talking 18:2 25:7 34:4,5 37:16 41:23 suicide 18:8 42:25 terribly 96:20 summarize 73:18 Tamara 3:5 52:25 terrifying 18:13 summarizes 74:7 tangible 22:8 test 34:17 summary 16:5 30:23,24 tank 89:8 testified 37:13 38:9 57:8 61:13 **summer** 55:25 targeted 80:16 81:8 **testify** 58:22 **super** 56:5 **Tarrytown** 21:5 62:21 testifying 3:19 65:11 **supervisor** 87:20 88:8 taxes 66:15,18,19,21 82:19 86:7 testimony 12:23 13:8 69:1 supplies 78:6,9 79:10 95:20 their's 7:14 **supply** 60:9 71:7 82:20 teach 73:13 thing 7:24 16:5 55:9 56:17 67:25 support 4:7 42:20 tear 86:13,17 81:1 91:21 93:20,22 supports 42:19 techs 63:8 things 2:8 16:7 42:2,20 63:20 64:2 supposed 32:10 34:4 38:11 44:24, 88:23 89:18 92:11 93:6 telephone 93:10 25 45:23,25 49:19 83:6 thinking 83:18 tells 58:23 Supreme 66:8 thirty 8:5 12:23 temperature 45:6 surge 78:14 thought 27:3 30:20 58:19,20 temporarily 28:24 **survey** 27:16 32:16 33:8,23 34:16 thoughts 16:17 ten 8:3 97:21 47:5 56:9 58:19 97:21 thousand 91:2 tenant 3:1,7,14 9:22 10:3 12:17 17:7 **surveys** 11:4 34:8 97:17 30:8,9 35:13,15 37:14,25 41:3,17 thousands 31:5 58:16 83:24 88:23 survival 92:24 44:8 46:10 47:9 48:2,16 54:2 58:13 threatening 18:8 59:5,6 63:2 66:9,11 81:7 83:5,6,9, survive 72:22 86:2 94:19 14,16,19,22 93:14 threats 56:3,4 sustainability 67:6 tenant's 41:6,10 42:11 56:6 58:10 three-year 21:21 28:9 sustainable 58:2 80:22 81:14 tenants 4:18 10:8 12:22 13:13.20.23 thrive 26:20 **Suzanne** 81:22 82:2.3 14:16 16:4 17:12,15,17,21 18:2,3 **throw** 16:10 19:6,8,9,16 23:8,16 24:19,25 26:12, switch 4:14 12:16,17 14,24 27:6,24 30:3,11 32:9 33:18 Thursday 72:10 Sylvia 3:1 53:2 35:14 36:14 37:3,4,23 38:14,16

43:12,13,14 44:10,14,16 45:2 46:7,

8,9,14 48:23 54:5,25 55:10,20 56:18

**system** 22:22 44:14 54:5,9 55:5

85:8

tier 31:3

**tiles** 85:14 **Tim** 77:16

time 2:1 4:2,4,19 8:22,25 12:13,24 13:5 16:8 22:17 23:23 26:16,25 30:22 32:10 36:18 37:18 39:1 42:8 45:3 46:24 47:22,23 48:7,20 49:11 53:14 57:2,22 59:20 61:14,21 64:1,9 69:14 72:12 78:19 81:17 82:10,22 86:21 89:10 93:23 98:19

timely 56:4 timer 48:10

**times** 36:4,21 40:24 57:8 61:13 68:1 78:11 81:3

timing 8:21 39:4

**TLC** 80:10

toaster 55:22

**today** 13:19 40:23 63:1 82:12 87:22 91:22 92:1,2 93:23

**told** 27:17 58:12 67:17 **tomorrow** 3:13 15:5

**tonight** 15:5 27:1 38:17 57:2 58:7, 10,15 59:18 90:15 93:7

tool 14:10

tools 20:16 80:19 81:11

top 21:24 41:17 42:20 45:21 67:17

**topic** 9:17

total 21:20,21 81:3

totally 30:1 66:4 67:3

tough 6:22 17:15 86:9

toughest 36:24

towns 92:15

track 4:2 47:12

tracked 74:8

tradition 49:22

train 16:17

transportation 64:4 97:19

transporters 63:9

treasurer 69:2

tremendous 82:17

tremendously 38:16

trend 61:3 76:1,3

tri-state 9:13

**trigger** 8:1,11

**triple** 77:10

tripling 12:25

trouble 13:12 92:16

true 85:10

tsunami 90:22

**tunnel** 42:9

turn 2:4 25:3 59:6

turned 71:14,16

turning 91:7,9

**turns** 10:7

two-bedroom 16:1

two-part 73:18

two-year 39:11 75:24 84:17

two-years 89:17

**type** 36:16

types 23:12 63:10

typically 92:7

U

Uh-huh 31:18 39:10 49:21 94:11

ultimate 61:2

ultimately 60:7

unable 71:5

underscore 28:10

understand 33:18,19 38:21,23

59:15 74:6 92:4 94:10

understanding 57:17 95:6

underused 96:20

**unemployment** 54:19 72:17 79:20

unexpected 58:3

**UNIDENTIFIED** 33:25 34:2 52:2,6

68:3 70:12,15,17,19

union 5:14.19 6:14 62:13.22

unit 16:2 74:3 75:23

**United** 12:22 15:19 19:16 26:12

71:2 90:17

**units** 13:2,4,8,10 28:14 37:5 58:17

71:18 81:4 86:7

universe 19:6

unnecessary 56:17

unprecedented 23:2,3

unquote 17:13

unresolved 54:3

unsustainable 85:20

unturned 27:22

unusually 80:24

unwilling 30:15

update 66:3

upgrades 22:19

**upkeep** 78:17

**upper** 94:12

upstairs 45:15

upwards 59:10

utility 66:16,22 72:13 82:20 86:7

utilizing 13:15

٧

vacancies 17:10 59:13

vacancy 17:8 37:1 71:12,15

vacant 71:18

vacations 83:17

vaccines 64:13

Valley 14:6

**valuable** 14:10 20:16 36:8,20

valued 74:22

values 74:24,25 75:1

variables 74:24 75:6

**varies** 95:10

Velene 2:16 52:11

vendor 67:13 89:4

vendors 67:12 78:24 87:25 88:2

**vermin** 55:18

**Vernon** 2:2 12:22 15:4,17 19:16 26:12 62:20 63:14 65:12 66:18,20 67:5 85:5 88:3 90:18 91:1,2 92:14

96:8,9,11

version 73:11

versus 22:7 73:25

viewed 58:5

viewing 36:19

villages 92:16

virtually 17:10

visit 56:5

voice 11:12 61:16

volatility 29:1

vote 49:8,25 53:6 72:10 84:16

**voted** 53:7 **vowed** 22:8

W

W-O-R-T-E-L 87:7

wage 7:9 18:20 79:23,24 80:1,4,13

wages 6:3 80:9

wait 32:20 41:7 85:17 89:10

**walk** 45:15

walking 43:2

walls 42:11

wanted 30:20 60:2 90:6,14,15 93:20

94:21 98:1

**War** 91:9

warmer 40:1

warrant 83:7

warranted 27:2

warranty 40:25

waste 67:13 82:22

watch 82:19

watched 36:7 83:22

water 22:22 55:16,17 66:22 93:5

wave 90:22

ways 36:21

wealth 14:9

website 67:6

Wednesday 98:20

week 18:7 26:16 38:9

well-maintained 85:23

West 79:5

Westchester 2:3 5:18 9:25 10:22 11:4 13:6 14:3,12,20 15:2 16:2,3,4 17:6 19:7 21:14,21,25 22:16 23:7 27:11 31:2,17,23 33:4 34:14 35:6,8 36:3,6 44:8 57:5 58:17 62:18,24 63:3 70:9,23 71:14 72:4 79:4,13,21 81:3 90:13,17,23,24 92:3,13 94:3,9, 13,22 95:23

Westchester's 15:3 21:6 26:24

31:4

wheel 39:22

White 15:6 35:21 96:1,15

whopping 66:23

wide 92:19

widely 96:21

wind 42:9

window 9:12 18:5 40:4

windows 9:11 10:5 39:22,24,25

40:15 88:1

winter 60:1,8 85:14 88:21,25

**wisdom** 94:15

withstand 69:20

**woman** 77:11

**work** 8:12 17:19 39:25 46:9,14,16, 21 61:9 62:20 63:4,20,22 64:7 77:12 81:10 86:6 90:13 91:23 97:2 98:3

worked 54:13 61:8

workers 62:13,22 63:8,9,10 64:22

working 36:6 39:23 41:1 46:23 64:3

77:9

works 80:24

world 45:12 71:2 91:9

worried 7:23 86:11,15

worries 83:3

worse 64:2.23

worsen 16:13

worst 9:19

Wortel 84:22,24 85:1,3 87:1,3,10

worth 50:1

worthwhile 50:12

wound 44:15 78:7

wrap 47:17 76:11

wrench 39:21

writing 54:1

written 48:4,14,15 49:2,8 50:3 52:8

Υ

**ya** 44:22

year 5:23 6:1,2,7,22 7:6,15,22 8:13 10:14,24 11:9 13:10 15:24 22:1,3,8, 10 23:6 28:15 29:7,11,17,19 31:25 35:10 38:8,18 39:24 40:4,9,10 45:22 46:21 55:1 56:8,18 58:1,18 62:24 65:1 67:11,20,24 69:17 70:21 71:21 72:6 78:3 79:25 80:4 83:2 84:11,16

year's 11:3 29:13,14

year-old 88:20

years 5:24 7:21 8:5 9:20 10:25 12:24 14:1 17:9 21:6,20 23:4,10 27:10 28:4 29:5 35:10 38:11,19 40:5,20,23,24 41:9 42:5 43:15 47:23 50:2 54:7,14 55:12 56:3 59:22 60:4 61:4,19 63:15,16 64:24 68:1,2 70:7 71:25 72:15,23 76:2 82:10,11,13,18, 24 83:22 84:1 85:4 92:3 97:21,25

**Yonkers** 15:6,17 56:19 65:12 66:21 82:5 85:5 92:14

**York** 10:1,18,21 21:5 22:13,16 27:13 31:25 34:18 36:23 56:20 58:19,23 59:1 65:19,24 66:1,7,8 67:2 69:2 73:25 74:9 82:25 83:1 94:12,23 95:22

young 40:21

Index: younger..youngins younger 35:22 96:21 youngins 94:18