```
1
     NEW YORK STATE
 2
     DIVISION OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY RENEWAL
 3
 4
          RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS PRESENTATION MEETING
            WESTCHESTER COUNTY RENT GUIDLINES BOARD
 5
                     June 13, 2022
 6
     DATE:
 7
     TIME:
                     7:10 p.m. to 7 :38 p.m.
 8
     LOCATION:
                     Division of Housing & Community
                     Renewal
                     75 South Broadway
 9
                     White Plains, New York 10601
10
11
12
     Reported by Hannah Allen
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

APPEARANCES: BOARD MEMBERS ELIOT CHERSON TAMARA STEWART KENNETH FINGER EDDIE MAE BARNES VELENE ACQUAH ELSA RUBIN LAMONT BADRU SALVATORE HAUGHIE MICHAEL LANGIULLI PETER STECKER, ESQ. APRIL GRAY-HUERTAS, ESQ.

1 (On the record 7:08 p.m.) 2 MR. STECKER: Time is 7:08. 3 We're in White Plains, Westchester District rent office for the Westchester County rent guidelines 4 5 for public meeting to receive a research and analysis presentation. It's Monday, June 13th. 6 7 Go ahead, Chair. Call the roll. 8 CHAIR RUBIN: Hello everybody. My 9 name is Elsa Rubin, chair of the Westchester rent 10 quidelines. And I welcome you to the second 11 public meeting of 2022. Tonight we will receive 12 the presentation of the D.H.C.R. Research and 13 Analysis Unit which will help us to determine the 14 rates of rate adjustments for leases commencing -commencing or being renewed between October 1st, 15 2022 and September 30th, 2023. 16 17 In addition, D.H.C.R. has already previously provided us with reports and documents 18 19 which we have copies in front of us related to this year's rent guidelines. I will now take call 20 Please respond if you're present. 21 roll. Velene 22 Acquah? 23 MS. ACQUAH: Present. 24 CHAIR RUBIN: Lamont Badru? 25

1 MR. BADRU: Here. 2 CHAIR RUBIN: Eddie Mae Barnes? 3 MS. BARNES: Here. CHAIR RUBIN: Eliot Cherson? 4 MR. CHERSON: 5 Here. CHAIR RUBIN: Kenneth Finger? 6 7 MR. FINGER: Here. 8 CHAIR RUBIN: Sylvia Hamer is not 9 here and she is excused. Evelyn Santiago is also 10 Tamara Stewart? excused. 11 MS. STEWART: Present. 12 CHAIR RUBIN: And I'm Elsa Rubin. 13 Let the record show that we have quorum. I will 14 now ask our counsel, Mr. Stecker if he has any 15 announcements. 16 Good evening, Chair. MR. STECKER: No 17 announcement other than a reminder that the second public hearing ... will be held tomorrow at seven 18 19 p.m. at the White Plains City Hall City Council 20 Chambers, 255 Main Street in White Plains. 21 CHAIR RUBIN: Okay. I want to thank and recognize the D.H.C.R. staff for all their 22 23 work and effort especially Guy Alba 24 and Jeff Horowitz who are not here with 25

1	us today. And the rest of the team. And I would
2	like to welcome Sal Haughie and Michael Langiulli.
3	MR. LANGIULLI: Langiulli.
4	CHAIR RUBIN: Langiulli Langiulli
5	who will be the panelist for this
6	presentation. And I don't know which one of you
7	wants to become to go first.
8	MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, I'll take the lead.
9	CHAIR RUBIN: Okay.
10	MR. HAUGHIE: How is everybody doing?
11	So I guess we'll start with the what we call
12	the tab. So the document that says annual income
13	expenses that's the main gist of what you guys
14	should be looking at. The first page, again, is
15	going to be totals so you're looking at totals,
16	total income, rental income, total expenses and
17	the expenses broken down. And side by side you
18	can see kind of a breakdown of the change over
19	time for income and expenses. But, again, these
20	are just totals so we can move to the second page
21	which kind of gives you a little bit more a
22	better picture of what's going on with expenses.
23	So on the second page it's a percent
24	distribution of expenses. Again, we this year
25	

we had four hundred nineteen schedules which
 equates to buildings. There were fourteen
 thousand seven hundred and thirty-eight units of
 which twelve thousand nine hundred and twenty three were subject to ETPA ...

So if we're looking at column 2021 you 6 7 can see the breakdown based upon expenses, which 8 expenses are the -- you know, which expenses 9 basically are the majority of paid for -- paid for 10 So real estate expense is going to be by owner. 11 the highest category that owners incur. Then 12 repairs and maintenance at sixteen point five. 13 Then interest at thirteen point nine. 14 MR. FINGER: I have a question. 15 MR. HAUGHIE: Ken, sure. Yeah, if -- if a owner has 16 MR. FINGER: 17 to take out a mortgage to buy the building or buildings, whatever, where is that reflected here 18 19 if this adds up to a hundred percent? Or is it 20 not? 21 The interest expense is MR. HAUGHIE: 22 where the owner would show that the owner is 23 taking out a mortgage. So the interest and 24 expense is what's left.

25

1 MR. FINGER: But the amortization would 2 -- would that be included then? 3 MR. HAUGHIE: No. 4 MR. FINGER: No. MR. LANGIULLI: Amortization and closing 5 costs are not listed on the schedules. 6 7 MR. FINGER: All right. So -- so there 8 is a number actually, an out-of-pocket number that 9 would be in addition to a hundred percent to be as 10 a mortgage? 11 MR. LANGIULLI: Well, mortgage interest 12 was eighteen point four -- I'm sorry. 13 MR. FINGER: Go ahead. 14 MR. LANGIULLI: Mortgage interest 15 thirteen point nine percent --16 MR. FINGER: Right. 17 MR. LANGIULLI: -- of all expenses. 18 MR. FINGER: Right. Thirteen point nine 19 MR. LANGIULLI: 20 percent was for mortgage interest. 21 MR. FINGER: Right. But it does not 22 include amortization? 23 MR. HAUGHIE: No. No, and that's based 24 on the board decided this many years ago that 25

1 certain categories should not be -- certain 2 expenses should not be included in the -- in the 3 operation ... of the building. One of those is amortization. Some of those are closing costs. 4 Within the instructions there's a number of 5 different categories or reasons not to include --6 7 be included in the survey and this was decided by 8 the board. This was not decided by us. 9 MR. FINGER: Can you send me that 10 schedule? 11 MR. HAUGHIE: Sure. We can send you a 12 copy of the instructions of which it's on the --13 MR. FINGER: . . . 14 MR. HAUGHIE: -- yeah, it's on the 15 instructions. 16 MR. FINGER: Okay. 17 P.D.F. MR. HAUGHIE: 18 MR. FINGER: Yeah, that's right. 19 MR. CHERSON: Four nineteen schedules. 20 How many went out? 21 MR. HAUGHIE: We send out -- so on -- on 22 one of the leader --. 23 That's only extras. MR. LANGIULLI: 24 MR. HAUGHIE: Only extras is fifteen 25

1 hundred that go out. Fifteen hundred thirty six. 2 MR. FINGER: Last year we had about five 3 fifty I think. 4 MR. HAUGHIE: No last year we had -- if 5 you guys want to flip to another table real quick it's title --. 6 7 MR. LANGIULLI: It's this year's and 8 last year's response rates. MR. FINGER: Where is it? 9 10 MR. HAUGHIE: It's titled Westchester M and O schedules. It was titled extras in your e-11 12 mail. It's a landscape looking document. 13 MR. LANGIULLI: Last year we tabulated 14 four hundred and three. 15 MR. HAUGHIE: Oh, really? 16 MS. ACQUAH: There were more this year. 17 MR. FINGER: Yeah, I thought -- I thought --. 18 19 MR. HAUGHIE: Got a few more this year, 20 yeah. MS. MAE BARNES: Which one is it? 21 22 MR. HAUGHIE: It's going to be actually 23 right after the tabs. I see it. 24 MS. MAE BARNES: Oh, really? 25

1 MR. HAUGHIE: It might be copies of him. 2 MS. STEWART: I'm not seeing it in ... 3 MS. MAE BARNES: I don't see it. 4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Well, I don't think we have it. 5 6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: ... photocopy 7 front and back. 8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's not here. 9 MR. FINGER: No, we don't -- I don't have it either. 10 11 MR. BADRU: Should be the second to the 12 last page if we're talking about this page here. 13 MR. HAUGHIE: It's right -- it's right 14 here so it's just copied differently. That's all. If it's -- if it's -- it's a little smaller. 15 MR. HAUGHIE: So it's titled Westchester 16 ETPA M and O schedules 2020. 17 18 Right. I got it. MR. FINGER: Okay. MR. CHERSON: So fifteen thirty-six. 19 This was fifteen thirty-seven. This -- the prior 20 21 year. 22 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah. 23 2020, 2021. MR. CHERSON: 24 MR. HAUGHIE: Yes. Well, '21 and '22, 25

1 yes. 2 MR. LANGIULLI: And you got four o three 3 back. 4 MR. HAUGHIE: That was last year, yeah. 5 2021. Oh, I see. MR. FINGER: I could have sworn five 6 7 hundred. 8 MR. CHERSON: No, we haven't had five 9 hundred --10 MR. HAUGHIE: Couples years ago. 11 MR. CHERSON: -- in a number -- in a 12 number of years. 13 MR. FINGER: Okay. I'll take your word 14 for it. 15 MR. CHERSON: All right. So I have another question though. Go back to where it was. 16 17 Real estate taxes. 18 MR. HAUGHIE: Sure let's -- let's move 19 to -- let's go back to that first table and we'll 20 -- we'll go table three the first set and we'll go to table three. The first set and we'll go to 21 22 table three. Yeah, so table three is kind of the 23 gist of what you guys should be looking at so this 24 is going to be in a percent changes over the three 25

So from '19 to '21. So table one is 1 year period. 2 Table two shows percent of expenses. totals. 3 Table three now shows the percent change over 4 time. So from '19 to '21 you're going to see what 5 the changes were on the time period that we -that we ask the owners. 6 7 MR. CHERSON: How do you explain? 8 MR. FINGER: So the expenses went up 9 over eight percent -- over nine percent actually. 10 Over eight percent. You add the minus three to 11 plus five. 12 No, you wouldn't add --MR. HAUGHIE: 13 vou wouldn't add it. So it goes down three 14 percent and then it went five point seven percent. 15 MR. FINGER: So is it just a difference 16 between eight percent? It went up --. 17 Technically MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, yes. 18 Yes. 19 MR. LANGIULLI: So plus eight percent. 20 MR. FINGER: Okay. Because -- okay. 21 I have a question about MR. CHERSON: 22 real estate taxes. You guys are statisticians. 23 As far as I know, real estate taxes have not gone 24 down in Westchester as long as I've lived here 25

1 which is twenty something years. How do you 2 explain this reduction in real estate taxes? 3 MR. HAUGHIE: Where do you see a reduction in real estate taxes? 4 5 MR. CHERSON: Here. Two point three to 6 point o seven. 7 MR. HAUGHIE: No. So, no, no, no. 8 MR. FINGER: It's less of an increase. 9 MR. HAUGHIE: Less of an increase 10 exactly. So let's say --. 11 MR. FINGER: Yes, it's less of an 12 increase, Eliot. The increase is --. 13 CHAIR RUBIN: Is that table three? 14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Table three, 15 yeah. 16 MR. FINGER: The increase is only point 17 o seven percent. 18 MR. HAUGHIE: Right. 19 MR. FINGER: Last year the increase was 20 two percent or whatever. 21 MR. HAUGHIE: Right. 22 MR. FINGER: So it's less of an 23 increase. 24 MR. HAUGHIE: That's what I'm saying. 25

1 But I mean that -- I don't know -- I'm asking. 2 MR. FINGER: Because a couple of 3 communities didn't go up. I'm telling you. 4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm not asking 5 you. 6 MR. FINGER: I'm telling you. 7 MR. HAUGHIE: I can explain. I can 8 explain. Let's -- let's say your realty taxes 9 were a hundred dollars last year. We'll, say your 10 real estate taxes were a hundred dollars last year 11 in 2019 --Yeah. 12 MR. FINGER: 13 MR. HAUGHIE: -- to 2020 it went up to a 14 hundred and two dollars. Now in 2021 it went up to a hundred and three. Almost one percent. 15 So 16 over the three year period it went up three percent. It didn't go down. It just went up on a 17 18 less of an increase. 19 MR. LANGIULLI: The rate of increase from one -- one year to another. 20 21 MR. CHERSON: Okay. All right. Thank 22 you. 23 MR. HAUGHIE: Any other questions 24 regarding this table? So as you can see income 25

1 from '19 to '20 you know that was COVID year. 2 Income went down point five percent. From '20 to 3 '21 it went up one point four percent. Expenses excluding depreciation in '19 to '20 went down 4 5 three percent, and then from '20 to '21 went up five point seven percent. 6 7 MR. LANGIULLI: With the highest 8 increase in the fuel category from '20 to '21 9 because we -- our analysis shows that most 10 Westchester buildings are indeed heated by oil as 11 opposed to Nassau County which are heated by gas. 12 MR. FINGER: Really? 13 MR. CHERSON: And this is through what? This is for the year 2021. So this doesn't --. 14 15 MR. LANGIULLI: So in 2020 we know oil took a dive because of the pandemic. 16 17 So but -- so this doesn't MR. CHERSON: 18 include the huge increases in 2020? 19 MR. FINGER: Doesn't include 2022. 20 MR. CHERSON: Does not include what we 21 know is going on out there. Okay. 22 MR. BADRU: I don't know if I'm looking 23 in the wrong place but for some reason when I'm 24 looking at my table under fuel I see zero for the 25

1 last three years. 2 MR. FINGER: I don't think you're 3 looking at the right --. MR. HAUGHIE: You may looking at -- no 4 5 heat or hot water. So there's another set of tables that look similar. 6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 7 You're looking at 8 the increases. This is the change. This is the 9 one that we were just looking at. 10 MR. BADRU: Yeah, but even so it still 11 says zero percent increase. 12 MR. LANGIULLI: You're looking at the no 13 heat no hot water I have a feeling. 14 MR. HAUGHIE: So look for the other set 15 of tables that look similar. 16 MR. LANGIULLI: How many -- how many buildings are at the top? That's the no heat, no 17 18 That's where -- where tenants pay hot water. 19 their own heat. ... And you see repairs and maintenance. Table three you'll see what --. 20 21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And that's why 22 it's eight percent ... 23 MR. FINGER: That would be even more if 24 you look at it now. 25

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Now it's even 2 more. 3 MR. LANGIULLI: ... repairs and maintenance. '19 to '20 as the pandemic was in 4 5 2020 so there wasn't much work going on in buildings. Repairs went down from '19 to '20 ten 6 7 point four percent. Then from '20 to '21 8 rebounded back and had an increase of eleven point 9 one percent. More repairs were being done. 10 MR. FINGER: It's interesting that 11 interest went up too. 12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Last year, yeah. 13 MR. LANGIULLI: A lot of times owners 14 refinance. They take money out and --. 15 MR. FINGER: Yeah, last year would have 16 been a good year to do it. Now is not. 17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's going back 18 up. MR. FINGER: Well, they're talking about 19 20 three quarters of a point. 21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: The world is 22 changing. MR. FINGER: Go up and made it two point 23 24 seven five. I got another one that says four five 25

1 But for two months. now. 2 MR. HAUGHIE: Okay. We -- we can move 3 to the next table then, table four. That's on the other side of 4 MR. FINGER: 5 table three. That's right. 6 MR. HAUGHIE: So this 7 table is called annual income versus expenses. So 8 this is basically showing basically all the 9 information you -- you've been provided already but kind of a -- a breakdown of what like we like 10 11 to call net operating income. Again your cash 12 flow, and operating income ... whatever kind of 13 terminology you want to use, but as you can see 14 over the three year period the net operating income has decreased from '19 to '21. 15 16 MR. CHERSON: Decreased you said? 17 MR. HAUGHIE: Yes, decreased. So from '19 it was at that -- that second from bottom row, 18 19 it was a twenty-seven point eighteen percent. And 20 then by 2021 it was at twenty-five point ninety-21 four percent. And after depreciation nineteen 22 point zero eight. And by 2021 it was seventeen 23 point six seven. 24 MR. FINGER: So it's approximately ten 25

1 percent less. 2 MR. CHERSON: So the cash flow is going 3 down. Exactly. Cash flow is 4 MR. HAUGHIE: 5 going down for this three year time --. For this period of time. 6 MR. FINGER: 7 MR. HAUGHIE: Yes. 8 MR. FINGER: So that's almost twenty 9 percent less from last year but from 2019 about 10 ten percent. MR. HAUGHIE: But since we're -- since 11 12 we're looking at this we could -- we could go to -13 - there's a single page called cost to income 14 ratio and that -- they kind of go hand in hand. So it looks like this, everybody. 15 MR. FINGER: That's the last -- that 16 17 single page. 18 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, yeah, the single 19 page, cost to income ratio. And so we -- those --20 that table and this table kind of go hand in hand. They're the inverse of each other. So cost to 21 22 income ratio is the inverse of net operating 23 So here's a twenty, twenty-five almost income. 24 year breakdown of cost to income ratio in 25

1 Westchester County.

2 We have including interest and 3 depreciation and excluding interest and 4 depreciation. So as you could see the cost to 5 income ratio has increased over the -- this year as compared to previous years which, again, shows 6 7 that the net operating income has increased all 8 the amount of money that the owners ... taken in 9 has decreased. 10 MR. FINGER: And this is -- I'm sorry, 11 qo ahead. 12 MR. CHERSON: The difference is, this 13 one takes out interest and depreciation. 14 MR. FINGER: Right. 15 This one, table five, MR. LANGIULLI: 16 just takes out depreciation. This is actually a true snapshot of what D.N.O.I. would be. 17 The inverse of sixty two point six three. 18 Thirty-19 seven point two seven. 20 MS. ACQUAH: I have a question. How 21 many units are -- were registered for 2021? MR. HAUGHIE: 22 So, again, at -- at this 23 time, you know, like we say every year, the -- the 24 registration is ongoing --25

1 MS. ACQUAH: Yes. 2 MR. HAUGHIE: -- so there could be more 3 units registered. But at this time there was 4 twenty-five thousand and twenty-nine registered. And we captured twelve thousand nine hundred and 5 6 twenty-three. 7 MR. FINGER: Wait, twenty-five --. 8 MR. HAUGHIE: Twenty-five zero two nine. 9 MR. FINGER: And twelve thousand twenty-10 three? 11 MR. HAUGHIE: Twelve thousand nine 12 hundred and twenty-three. 13 MR. FINGER: So you have fifty percent. 14 MR. HAUGHIE: We capture over fifty 15 So we'll go to the -- after this we'll percent. go to the last table, the -- one of the other 16 17 tables. But basically we may -- we may only capture four hundred some odd buildings which is 18 19 only thirty percent of the universe. But 20 population wise we're capturing almost fifty 21 percent because not all building sizes are the 22 same, right. We have a lot of -- you have a lot of six unit buildings. You know, a lot of smaller 23 24 -- small unit buildings as well. 25

1 MR. CHERSON: How -- how do these 2 figures compare to Nassau and New York City? 3 MR. LANGIULLI: We haven't completed Nassau yet. 4 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, but very -- very 5 comparable to Nassau. We're always in the same 6 7 New York City I couldn't tell you offhand to . . . 8 be honest. 9 MR. FINGER: So this doesn't include the 10 things you told us ...? 11 MR. HAUGHIE: Well, one -- one column 12 does, one column doesn't, right. 13 MR. FINGER: I know. 14 MR. HAUGHIE: So, yeah. So but it 15 doesn't include amortization. 16 MR. FINGER: Not amortization. 17 MR. HAUGHIE: Amortization no. 18 MR. FINGER: Okay. Or closing cost or 19 whatever. 20 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah. 21 MR. FINGER: Okay. 22 MR. HAUGHIE: So we'll -- we'll go to 23 this table, the one that's actually unfortunately 24 kind of set in a -- a portrait mode instead of 25

1 landscape. So this is basically our survey 2 breakdown of how many buildings we sent out, how 3 many received. 4 MS. ACQUAH: Is that the one showing the 5 municipalities on top? MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, we'll -- we'll get 6 7 to that --. 8 MR. FINGER: We'll get there. We'll get 9 there. 10 MR. HAUGHIE: ... pages before. 11 MR. FINGER: What -- what are we looking 12 at now? 13 MR. HAUGHIE: It's just that ours is 14 landscaped. Yours is portrait. 15 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Take a look at 16 how it is. If the shading at the bottom and 17 that's the easiest way to find it. 18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Is this it? 19 MR. HAUGHIE: That's it. It's pretty 20 much right after the tables I believe. So flip a 21 couple pages. 22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Everybody on it? 23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah. 24 MR. HAUGHIE: Okay. So left side is 25

going to be 2022, right side is going to be 2021. 1 2 As you can see the breakdown of how many surveys 3 or buildings that are in our population. Fifteen hundred and thirty-six were mailed out as you see 4 5 in the highlighted spot. That's four hundred and nineteen were tabulated. 6 That's twenty-seven 7 percent of the total fifteen thirty-six.

8 But if you look all the way down to the 9 bottom, those two other highlighted numbers. 10 Twelve thousand nine hundred and twenty-three 11 units out of twenty-five thousand twenty-nine 12 units that were registered. So that's actually 13 fifty-two percent of the total units that were 14 registered we -- we were able to capture. And the other categories you see return by office, non-15 16 comparable, new owners, problematic. There's 17 other categories within, you know, in there. 18 How many of these are less MR. FINGER: 19 than three year -- oh here it is. 20 MR. HAUGHIE: New owners. Yeah. 21 MR. FINGER: Only three -- two percent. 22 Two percent. Twenty-five MR. HAUGHIE: 23 schedules are new owners. 24 MR. FINGER: I always thought those 25

1 should be included. 2 MR. LANGIULLI: We have to have three 3 full years in order for it to be tabulated. You 4 can't have -- just two years of data and one year blank, one year zeros. It would totally skew the 5 tables. 6 7 MR. CHERSON: Is that a statistical 8 requirement I think for the statistics? 9 MR. LANGIULLI: Yes. MR. CHERSON: Yeah, that's why I didn't 10 11 take it. 12 MR. LANGIULLI: Have to have three full 13 years. 14 MR. CHERSON: That's why I didn't take 15 that question. MR. HAUGHIE: Can't have a year missing. 16 17 It will skew the tables. Have to have three full 18 years of data. 19 MR. FINGER: By only -- only adapting it 20 for two thirds of the home. 21 MR. LANGIULLI: I can't adapt two thirds 22 of the whole. I have to have three full years of 23 data. 24 MR. HAUGHIE: But that's also to say 25

1 that the number is going to be equal every year, 2 The numbers are not equal --. right? 3 MR. FINGER: If Einstein could do equal 4 M.C. squared you could do two thirds. MR. HAUGHIE: We can't have one year of 5 zero income and zero --. 6 7 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah, because that 8 would disturb everything. 9 MR. HAUGHIE: That would, yeah, yeah. 10 Exactly. 11 MR. BADRU: Do we have any information 12 on the percentage of surveys returned based on 13 building size? 14 MR. HAUGHIE: On what size? 15 MR. BADRU: Based on building size? MR. HAUGHIE: We -- we do and we'll flip 16 17 through it --18 MR. BADRU: Okav. 19 MR. HAUGHIE: -- yeah, we'll get to 20 that. It's within here as well. 21 MR. BADRU: Got it. 22 MR. HAUGHIE: So we'll move to the next 23 page if you guys want. So this is going to be 24 registration data so this has nothing to do with 25

1 the survey. These are strictly registration data. 2 MR. CHERSON: This is as reported. 3 Which one are you --? 4 MR. HAUGHIE: The next page. MR. CHERSON: Back of the page. 5 MR. FINGER: Back of the page. 6 7 MR. HAUGHIE: Okay. This is an as -- as 8 reported by owners who registered their buildings 9 with H.C.R. They log into the system. They 10 register their buildings. These numbers reflect 11 what they're telling us. 12 MR. FINGER: So we lost twenty-five 13 hundred units. 14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Well, go ahead. 15 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, again, as we say like it's ongoing registration. So if we would --16 if -- so I'm looking back at last year. For 2020 17 you're looking at twenty-seven thousand three 18 19 hundred and twenty-one. You see -- does everybody see that number? 20 21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Rent stabilized 22 homes. 23 MR. HAUGHIE: You actually gained 24 sixteen hundred units since last year. So 25

1 unfortunately the way H.C.R. works it's ongoing 2 registrations so owners could back register for a 3 number of years. So last year when we were here 4 that number was -- was out about twenty-five or some -- somewhat of that sorts. 5 6 MR. FINGER: Oh, okay. 7 MR. HAUGHIE: So we've gained an extra 8 sixteen hundred --. MR. FINGER: So there's a change --9 10 MR. HAUGHIE: Yes. 11 MR. FINGER: -- but between now and the 12 time --. 13 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, anywhere from twelve 14 to eighteen hundred it's hard to -- to kind of gauge. But that -- that's been the range ... 15 MR. CHERSON: So the number of 16 17 stabilized units went up? 18 MR. HAUGHIE: No, it went up from -- in 19 2020 from what we reported to you guys last year. 20 The number -- it's going to go down but now down 21 as -- as large as it is because it's ongoing 22 registration. 23 MR. LANGIULLI: Owners can back register 24 buildings, you know. I mean, they're supposed to 25

1 register by 7/30 -- by July 31st but it's an 2 ongoing process so for the 2021 number you have 3 twenty-five o two nine. That number is going to 4 keep going up. 5 MR. CHERSON: But the trend is down. MR. HAUGHIE: The trend is down. 6 7 Yeah, the trend --. MR. LANGIULLI: 8 MR. FINGER: It's interesting though 9 because --. 10 MR. LANGIULLI: But that's going to 11 start slowing down because of the new -- the 12 housing laws of '18. 13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: '19 14 MR. LANGIULLI: '19. 15 MR. FINGER: June 14, 2019 burned into my memory. If you look at the reduction in total 16 numbers units it's about seventeen hundred. 17 And 18 yet only eighty-two are permanently exempt. Where 19 -- where do the other -- what happened to the 20 other sixteen hundred? 21 MR. HAUGHIE: Like I said, they haven't 22 registered yet. 23 MR. FINGER: No, but if -- if you follow 24 down the trend from 2017 first it's about, oh I 25

1 don't know five hundred --2 MR. HAUGHIE: Okay. 3 MR. FINGER: -- then it goes down about nine hundred. Then down about seventeen hundred. 4 5 Then down again about seventeen hundred. MR. HAUGHIE: 6 Sure. 7 MR. FINGER: And when you look as to 8 what's permanently exempt it's only eighty-two. 9 Where did the other sixteen hundred units go? In 10 -- in other words, look at your numbers. 11 MR. HAUGHIE: No, I understand. 12 MR. FINGER: You're going to show a -- a 13 reduction. 14 MR. HAUGHIE: Understood. 15 MR. FINGER: Of about seventeen hundred 16 17 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah. 18 MR. FINGER: -- looking at these 19 numbers. 20 MR. HAUGHIE: I understand that. The 21 problem is once an -- an apartment becomes 22 deregulated, a lot of owners do not register the 23 apartment deregulated. It just becomes 24 deregulated. So unfortunately the way the system 25

1 is set up owners are not registered in the 2 apartment as deregulated. It's just -- they're 3 not registered in any ... MR. FINGER: They just don't do 4 5 anything. 6 MR. HAUGHIE: They're just not 7 registered, yes. 8 MR. LANGIULLI: We will still have a --9 we have -- we have buildings that have never been 10 registered. 11 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah. 12 MR. LANGIULLI: Or respond to the 13 survey. 14 MR. FINGER: They come to us every once 15 in a while. 16 MR. LANGIULLI: They have never been registered. I'll -- I'll find a building that 17 18 hasn't been registered since 1996. 19 MS. ACQUAH: Is that allowed? 20 MR. FINGER: I've seen them --. 21 MR. LANGIULLI: Well, the thing is if an owner -- if a tenant files an overcharge then the 22 23 owner will be penalized. 24 MS. ACQUAH: Oh, I see. 25

MR. HAUGHIE: You know, owner is not 1 2 allowed to collect the rental increases after --3 MR. FINGER: If they don't file ... MR. HAUGHIE: -- if it's not registered. 4 5 MS. ACQUAH: Right. Oh, okay. MR. HAUGHIE: So if it's not registered 6 7 but the tenant needs to be proactive and ... 8 MR. FINGER: We have the --. MR. HAUGHIE: They file an overcharge 9 10 complaint. 11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's unbelievable. 12 13 MR. FINGER: We register them. 14 MS. ACQUAH: Okay. 15 MR. HAUGHIE: Is everyone okay with this table. If you ... the bottom --16 MR. FINGER: Yeah, it is what it is. 17 18 MR. HAUGHIE: -- the bottom row, that's 19 going to show you the average monthly legal 20 regulated rent. So they could see the increase of 21 the average rent in Westchester County over the 22 five year period. So starting 2017 fourteen 23 eleven, 2018 fourteen fifty-six and then finally 24 in 2021 it's fifteen sixty-one. And if you look 25

1 to the right of that you could see the percentage 2 change. So anywhere from three percent and over 3 the last year is only about one percent -- one 4 point three percent. MR. FINGER: Hundred and fifty dollars 5 total over five years. 6 7 CHAIR RUBIN: Sorry. This percentage 8 for 2021 is not finalized, correct? 9 MR. HAUGHIE: It's not finalized but we 10 don't know what -- what the apartments registered 11 are going to equate to, right. They could be 12 lower rented apartments, they could be higher 13 rented apartments. We really couldn't gauge what 14 that percentage is going to be but it's not final, 15 yes. 16 MR. CHERSON: Do you know how much the 17 C.P.I. Went up from '17 to '21? 18 That should be in the MR. FINGER: 19 chart, in one of the chart's --. 20 MR. LANGIULLI: Well, we have the C.P.I. 21 for the last twelve months. 22 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, and they have 23 something from --. 24 MR. FINGER: No, I think you gave us one 25

1 for more than that number of years. 2 MR. LANGIULLI: Did we? 3 MR. FINGER: Yeah, I don't have it with 4 me. 5 MR. HAUGHIE: Well, you had some -- a C.P.I. over -- from '18 to '22 and from April to 6 7 April looks like six point three percent from '21. 8 Well, if I'm -- -- I'm going backwards. '21 to 9 '22 with six point three percent. '20 to '21 was 10 three point two percent. 11 MR. CHERSON: Wait a minute. Slow down. 12 Two -- 2021. 13 MR. HAUGHIE: Six point three. 14 MR. CHERSON: 2022 is six point three. 15 That's --. MR. HAUGHIE: '20 to '21. You guys 16 17 should have this. Maybe not here with you right now but you definitely were e-mailed. 18 19 MR. FINGER: Yeah, we -- we got an e-20 mail. 21 MR. HAUGHIE: 2020. 22 MR. FINGER: Certainly more than ten 23 percent over five years. 24 MR. CHERSON: And what's the next one. 25

1 So six -- 2020 is --. 2 MR. HAUGHIE: Three point two percent. 3 MR. CHERSON: Three point two all right. And then '19 to '20 is one 4 MR. HAUGHIE: 5 point one. Now this is April to April. So this is the figure we -- we kind of always give you 6 7 guys --. 8 MR. CHERSON: Is it one point nine? 9 MR. HAUGHIE: One point one. So you would look at April on the second page of this New 10 11 York New Jersey --. 12 So you have the C.P.I. MR. LANGIULLI: 13 in those years is like ten percent. And the 14 increase for the rents is over that period is 15 what? 16 MR. FINGER: It's less. 17 MR. LANGIULLI: Much less. 18 MR. FINGER: Yeah, but you got to look 19 at only the three years. 20 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, it's three years. MR. FINGER: We'll look at that before -21 22 - . 23 MR. HAUGHIE: Okay. We can flip to the 24 next -- the next page. Want to flip over to the 25

1 other side? Next table states 2022 ETPA M and O 2 survey, units tabulated by a municipality. So it shows that each ... municipalities make up the 3 majority of what units were used for tabulation. 4 5 Twenty-three percent Mount Vernon, seventeen percent New Rochelle. Six percent in White Plains 6 7 and forty-one percent of Yonkers. 8 MR. LANGIULLI: So those four 9 municipalities make up eighty-seven percent of the 10 tabulated ... 11 MR. FINGER: Yeah, eighty percent goes 12 13 CHAIR RUBIN: This -- does it include 14 Ossining? The new --. 15 MR. FINGER: No, there's -- there's fifteen others. 16 17 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, well, Ossining is included in our survey but not in this -- so this 18 19 is just basically showing you what the largest 20 municipalities are that are included in this 21 survey. 22 MR. LANGIULLI: Ossining would be part 23 of the thirteen percent. 24 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah. More or less do 25

1 you have an idea? 2 MR. HAUGHIE: I know we had a hand full 3 of Ossining buildings that were tabulated. We --4 we actually this year we've had every municipality I believe represented in the survey. I don't know 5 how many of -- of each but there's definitely some 6 7 from each municipality. 8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: The buildings in 9 Ossining are pretty -- pretty large, right? 10 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah, because they --11 there was -- they -- they said the --12 MS. STEWART: They only counted 13 buildings over twenty units. 14 CHAIR RUBIN: -- they only counted --15 Right. 16 MS. STEWART: They didn't count any of 17 the buildings under twenty units. 18 CHAIR RUBIN: Right. 19 MR. HAUGHIE: . . . 20 MS. STEWART: Right. And they --21 they've exempted the smaller buildings. 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Right. 23 The ones that MR. LANGIULLI: 24 participated in our survey are large buildings. 25

1 And last CHAIR RUBIN: Right. Yes. 2 year I think if I remember well, you had reported 3 that fourteen, thirteen buildings. 4 MR. LANGIULLI: That was -- we only had a couple that responded. 5 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, believe that either 6 7 -- anywhere from thirteen to I want to say 8 seventeen max buildings that are included that we 9 mail to. 10 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah. 11 MR. HAUGHIE: And, you know, offhand 12 there may be two to three that actually are 13 tabulated or responded to the survey. 14 MR. LANGIULLI: I guess they're still 15 new to the system. --. 16 CHAIR RUBIN: Right, yeah. 17 MR. FINGER: You know, well, there's a lawsuit still pending in --. 18 19 CHAIR RUBIN: Yeah that's another 20 thing we had to speak about. 21 MR. FINGER: That's the -- and the one 22 that is -- that does report is a ... And she 23 reports it. 24 MR. HAUGHIE: Okay. That's good. So 25

1 the next table right below is going to be the --2 the apartment rents based upon the registration. 3 So you can kind of see the breakdown of the rents 4 for -- for the apartments in Westchester County. 5 So you can see the -- the majority are in between a thousand to nineteen ninety-nine. Those make up 6 7 over, you know, if you had thirty-six percent and 8 twenty-eight percent, fifty-four percent, oh, I'm 9 sorry sixty-four percent.

10 So sixty-four percent are going to be in 11 that thousand to nineteen ninety-nine, those two 12 categories. But -- but there is a wide range and 13 this is, yeah, registered ...

MR. LANGIULLI: Yeah, this is that who participated in the survey. This is as per owner registration.

17 MR. FINGER: Oh, okay.

MR. HAUGHIE: We can flip to the last --19 the last -- last page in that. Number of rental 20 buildings by unit count. So this is a breakdown 21 of the total population and the tabulated 22 buildings so you get an idea of the size of the 23 buildings that we use in the survey. And the size 24 of the buildings that are incumbent of the total 25

1 population in Westchester County. 2 MR. LANGIULLI: And this is response to 3 the survey? Yeah, four nineteen is 4 MR. HAUGHIE: 5 response to the survey, and the fifteen thirty-six are the total numbers that we mail out to and we 6 7 send e-mails out to. Anybody have any questions 8 regarding that? 9 MR. FINGER: You could do this by 10 registration too couldn't you? 11 Yeah. MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah. 12 So I believe we went over all the tables 13 besides the vacancy table. This one's called 14 changes in rent for apartments subject to the 15 emergency tenant protection act. UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's this one 16 17 right? 18 MR. HAUGHIE: Yes, yes, that's it. 19 MR. LANGIULLI: Apartments that were re-20 rented or went vacant? 21 MR. FINGER: I'm sure there were not 22 many changes to the H.S.T.B.A. 23 MR. HAUGHIE: Yes, so this table is read 24 basically left to right. There's four pages. The 25

1 first page is a -- for one year lease. The second 2 year -- second page is for two year leases and 3 then again there's percentage changes for one year 4 and two leases on page three and four. But so 5 reading from left to right we'll just look at the thousands of fourteen hundred and ninety-nine 6 7 category. 8 So there were -- if you -- if you slide 9 over to the right and look at the number fourteen, 10 there were fourteen apartments that were previously rented at a thousand to fourteen 11 12 hundred and ninety-nine dollars. And they were 13 re-rented at fifteen hundred to nineteen ninety-14 So that's how the table is read. nine. 15 MR. FINGER: Fourteen and one twenty-16 one. 17 MR. HAUGHIE: And there -- yeah. And then there were a hundred and twenty-one units 18 19 that stayed in that same range. 20 MR. FINGER: Oh, okay. 21 MR. LANGIULLI: Previous rent by current 22 rent.

23 MR. HAUGHIE: Yes. So basically, yeah, 24 previous rent by current rent. So there was a 25

1 tenant in there, the apartment went vacant. It 2 was re-rented at the rate that would be on the --3 if you're looking over to your right or from the 4 top. 5 MR. CHERSON: So that's a very small 6 increase. 7 MR. FINGER: It has to be. 8 MR. CHERSON: And I know that. 9 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, well on page -- page 10 three we'll -- we'll show percentage changes. But 11 this is, again, just totals. So page one is 12 showing totals. So there was five hundred and 13 thirty-two apartments that went vacant were re-14 rented for one year leases. If you flip to page 15 two, if you look at the bottom right corner that's 16 a hundred and forty-three. So now these are 17 apartments that were -- went vacant were re-rented 18 and rented for two years. So there's a hundred 19 and forty-three total. And, again, it varies in 20 category of where -- when it was previously rented 21 and re-rented. And if you're looking at page 22 three it's going to --. 23 MR. LANGIULLI: Going into that that's 24 right. 25

1 MR. HAUGHIE: . . . 2 MR. CHERSON: Very small increase. 3 MR. LANGIULLI: Yeah, because these are 4 vacancies, so. 5 MR. CHERSON: But vacancies don't mean 6 anything. 7 MR. LANGIULLI: The new rent laws have 8 knocked down --. 9 MR. CHERSON: They mean nothing. They 10 mean nothing. 11 MR. FINGER: The only way they could get 12 an increase would be if they did an I.O. -- I.A. 13 MR. CHERSON: And good luck with that. 14 MR. FINGER: For fifteen thousand 15 dollars. 16 MR. LANGIULLI: You guys understand how 17 that table works? 18 MR. FINGER: Yeah, we know. 19 MR. LANGIULLI: Okay. 20 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, anybody have any 21 questions regarding this table? No. So page --22 page three shows the actual percentage change. 23 MS. ACQUAH: The last page of it, right? 24 MR. HAUGHIE: For the apartments. Three 25

1 and four.

2	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Page three, yeah.
3	MR. HAUGHIE: So page three is for one
4	year leases and page four for two year leases. So
5	you can see the percentage change. So in the past
6	we've had some changes that were very high but as
7	you can see as as we mentioned there were quite
8	a bit that are under five percent. But there is
9	still a handful that are outside of that range
10	and, you know, do include some some increases.
11	MR. CHERSON: So how do you interpret
12	that? What does that mean?
13	MR. HAUGHIE: Like like was
14	previously stated, some I.A.I.s, some M.C.I.s,
15	stuff like that that were able to increase the
16	rent. You know, so apartment apartment
17	renovations, you know.
18	MR. CHERSON: But overall it's a very
19	small number.
20	MR. LANGIULLI: Well, look at the
21	bottom. Look at the
22	MR. HAUGHIE: Overall, yeah.
23	MR. LANGIULLI: the median increase
24	and the mean increase. Look at those numbers.
25	
1	

1 Zero one point nine. That's -- that's the new 2 laws right then and there. 3 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, so you can see there's -- if you look all the way to the right 4 5 there's five hundred and thirty-two apartments that were rented for one year. Of those four 6 7 hundred and forty-three were rented under five 8 percent. So there wasn't a large increase. So if 9 you go to the under five percent there's four 10 hundred and forty-three in the total, and the 11 total apartments is five thirty-two. 12 And as you can see, the median percent 13 increase was zero for one year leases and the mean 14 percentage increase for one year leases is one point nine. If you flip the page to two year 15 16 leases median percent increase was again zero and 17 the mean percent increase is one point two 18 percent. 19 MR. CHERSON: All this means substantially less income to the owners. 20 Is that 21 accurate? 22 MR. HAUGHIE: That means a less of an 23 increase on the apartments that were rented and 24 re-rented. That's what it means. 25

1 MR. LANGIULLI: Vacancy ... 2 MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah, I think we went 3 through all the tables besides the -- the no heat, no hot water table which is very small. 4 There's 5 only nine buildings that were tabulated that had no heat no hot water. So we don't really -- it 6 narrows the first set of tables so there's not 7 8 really much to discuss with that. If anybody else 9 has any other questions. 10 MR. LANGIULLI: Tenants that pay their 11 own heat and hot water? 12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah. 13 CHAIR RUBIN: Anybody has any 14 questions? No. Okay. Well, on behalf of the board members I want to thank you, both of you 15 gentlemen for this very comprehensive 16 17 presentation. And I'm sure that if anybody has a question after tonight we can contact you. 18 We can 19 send you an e-mail. 20 MR. LANGIULLI: Yeah, send to Jeff Horowitz. 21 22 CHAIR RUBIN: Yes. So --. 23 MR. LANGIULLI: To Jeff or Guy. They'll 24 just flip it to us. 25

1 CHAIR RUBIN: So we -- we sent an e-2 mail to Jeff with copy to all the members of the 3 board. And we copy to our counsel, Mr. Stecker. MR. HAUGHIE: Yeah. And I know some 4 5 requested a copy of the -- all the buildings in Westchester County. We'll get that to you guys 6 7 within the next day or so. 8 MS. STEWART: Thank you. 9 MR. HAUGHIE: Sure. 10 Okay. Any other CHAIR RUBIN: 11 comments? 12 All of the buildings you'll MR. FINGER: 13 get us the names of the owners? 14 MR. HAUGHIE: No. Only the building 15 addresses. We're not allowed to give out that ... 16 MR. LANGIULLI: E-mail too, right? MR. HAUGHIE: Yes. We'll give out the -17 - all the buildings that we mail to --. 18 19 MR. LANGIULLI: When we say mail we --20 we mail a notice telling the owners, putting them 21 on notice that hey starting March 1st you can --22 you may now log into O.R.R.A. and enter your 23 That's what the notice is income and expenses. 24 for. Then we send out an e-mail which we do 25

1 numerous e-mail blasts also. Just we're trying to 2 get as large as a response as we could possibly 3 So, you know, first is the -- first is U.S. can. Mail to all the owners that are in our -- that 4 5 participate. And then we send out e-mails as Numerous e-mail blasts. 6 well. 7 MR. FINGER: We would be happy to 8 cooperate if you give us the names. MS. GRAY-HUENTAS: 9 That's not how that 10 works. 11 CHAIR RUBIN: Nice try. 12 MR. FINGER: What? 13 MS. GRAY-HUENTAS: I said it doesn't 14 work that way. All we -- because that's part of the registration information. So we'll -- we're 15 16 not -- the agency is not sharing registration 17 That's not allowed. information. They are going to share all of the buildings that are register --18 19 that should be registered with E.T.P.A. that are, as you know, pre '74 buildings with more than six 20 21 units in Westchester County in the municipalities 22 that participate. 23 CHAIR RUBIN: Any other comments? 24 Well, if -- what about the visitors? Do you have 25

any -- any comments? Anything? Okay. So if no one has any -- anything else to comment, I will ask to -- for a motion to adjourn the meeting. UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Motion to adjourn. MR. FINGER: Okay. CHAIR RUBIN: Second? MS. ACQUAH: Second. CHAIR RUBIN: Meeting is adjourned. Thank you for your presence. I'll see you tomorrow in White Plains. (Off the record) (The proceeding concluded at 7:48 p.m.)

STATE OF NEW YORK I, HANNAH ALLEN, do hereby certify that the foregoing was reported by me, in the cause, at the time and place, as stated in the caption hereto, at Page 1 hereof; that the foregoing typewritten transcription consisting of pages 1 through 44, is a true record of all proceedings had at the hearing. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto subscribed my name, this the 20th day of June, 2022. The alle HANNAH ALLEN, Reporter

		17 28:2,23
1	Α	backwards 34:8
13th 3:6	accurate 45:21	Badru 3:24 4:1 10:11 15:22 16:10
14 29:15	Acquah 3:22,23 9:16 20:20 21:1	26:11,15,18,21
17 33:17	23:4 31:19,24 32:5,14 43:23 49:8	Barnes 4:2,3 9:21,24 10:3
18 29:12 34:6	act 40:15	based 6:7 7:23 26:12,15 39:2
19 12:1,4 15:1,4 17:4,6 18:15,18 29:13,14 35:4	actual 43:22 adapt 25:21	basically 6:9 18:8 21:17 23:1 36:19 40:24 41:23
1996 31:18	adapting 25:19	behalf 46:14
1st 3:15 47:21	add 12:10,12,13	bit 5:21 44:8
15(3.15 47.21	addition 3:17 7:9	blank 25:5
2	addresses 47:15	blasts 48:1,6
		board 7:24 8:8 46:15 47:3
20 15:1,2,4,5,8 17:4,6,7 34:9,16 35:4 2017 29:24 32:22	adds 6:19 adjourn 49:3,5	bottom 18:18 23:16 24:9 32:16,18 42:15 44:21
2018 32:23	adjourned 49:9	breakdown 5:18 6:7 18:10 19:24
2019 14:11 19:9 29:15	adjustments 3:14	23:2 24:2 39:3,20
2020 10:17,23 14:13 15:15,18 17:5	agency 48:16	broken 5:17
27:17 28:19 34:21 35:1 2021 6:6 10:23 11:5 14:14 15:14	ahead 3:7 7:13 20:11 27:14	building 6:17 8:3 21:21 26:13,15 31:17 47:14
18:20,22 20:21 24:1 29:2 32:24 33:8	Alba 4:23	buildings 6:2,18 15:10 16:17 17:6
34:12	allowed 31:19 32:2 47:15 48:17	21:18,23,24 23:2 24:3 27:8,10 28:24
2022 3:11,16 15:19 24:1 34:14 36:1 2023 3:16	amortization 7:1,5,22 8:4 22:15,16, 17	31:9 37:3,8,13,17,21,24 38:3,8 39:20,22,23,24 46:5 47:5,12,18 48:18,20
21 10:24 12:1,4 15:3,5,8 17:7 18:15	amount 20:8	burned 29:15
33:17 34:7,8,9,16	analysis 3:6,13 15:9	buy 6:17
22 10:24 34:6,9	announcement 4:17	buy 0.17
255 4:20	announcements 4:15	C
3	annual 5:12 18:7	C.P.I. 33:17,20 34:6 35:12
	apartment 30:21,23 31:2 39:2 42:1 44:16	call 3:7,20 5:11 18:11
30th 3:16	apartments 33:10,12,13 39:4 40:14,19 41:10 42:13,17 43:24 45:5, 11,23	called 18:7 19:13 40:13
31st 29:1		capture 21:14,18 24:14
7	approximately 18:24	captured 21:5
	April 34:6,7 35:5,10	capturing 21:20
7/30 29:1	average 32:19,21	cash 18:11 19:2,4
74 48:20		categories 8:1,6 24:15,17 39:12
7:08 3:1,2	В	category 6:11 15:8 41:7 42:20
7:48 49:14	back 10:7 11:3,16,19 17:8,17 27:5,6,	chair 3:7,8,9,24 4:2,4,6,8,12,16,21 5:4,9 13:13 26:7 33:7 36:13,24

Index: 13th..chair

37:10,14,18,22 38:1,10,16,19 46:13, 22 47:1,10 48:11,23 49:7,9 Chambers 4:20 change 5:18 12:3 16:8 28:9 33:2 43:22 44:5 changing 17:22 chart 33:19 chart's 33:19 Cherson 4:4,5 8:19 10:19,23 11:8, 11,15 12:7,21 13:5 14:21 15:13,17, 20 18:16 19:2 20:12 22:1 25:7,10,14 27:2,5 28:16 29:5 33:16 34:11,14,24 35:3,8 42:5,8 43:2,5,9,13 44:11,18 45:19 **City** 4:19 22:2,7 closing 7:5 8:4 22:18 collect 32:2 **column** 6:6 22:11,12 commencing 3:14,15 comment 49:2 comments 47:11 48:23 49:1 communities 14:3 **comparable** 22:6 24:16 compare 22:2 compared 20:6 complaint 32:10 completed 22:3 comprehensive 46:16 concluded 49:14 **contact** 46:18 cooperate 48:8 **copied** 10:14 copies 3:19 10:1 copy 8:12 47:2,3,5 **corner** 42:15 **correct** 33:8 **cost** 19:13,19,21,24 20:4 22:18 costs 7:6 8:4 Council 4:19

counsel 4:14 47:3 count 37:16 39:20 counted 37:12,14 County 3:4 15:11 20:1 32:21 39:4 40:1 47:6 48:21 couple 14:2 23:21 38:5 Couples 11:10 COVID 15:1 current 41:21,24

D

D.H.C.R. 3:12,17 4:22 D.N.O.I. 20:17 data 25:4,18,23 26:24 27:1 day 47:7 decided 7:24 8:7,8 decreased 18:15,16,17 20:9 depreciation 15:4 18:21 20:3,4,13, 16 deregulated 30:22,23,24 31:2 determine 3:13 difference 12:15 20:12 differently 10:14 discuss 46:8 distribution 5:24 District 3:3 disturb 26:8 dive 15:16 document 5:12 9:12 documents 3:18 **dollars** 14:9,10,14 33:5 41:12 43:15

Е

e- 9:11 34:19 47:1
e-mail 46:19 47:16,24 48:1,6
e-mailed 34:18
e-mails 40:7 48:5

Index: Chambers..fifteen

E.T.P.A. 48:19 easiest 23:17 **Eddie** 4:2 effort 4:23 eighteen 7:12 18:19 28:14 eighty 36:11 eighty-seven 36:9 eighty-two 29:18 30:8 Einstein 26:3 eleven 17:8 32:23 **Eliot** 4:4 13:12 **Elsa** 3:9 4:12 emergency 40:15 enter 47:22 equal 26:1,2,3 equate 33:11 equates 6:2 estate 6:10 11:17 12:22,23 13:2,4 14:10 ETPA 6:5 10:17 36:1 Evelyn 4:9 evening 4:16 excluding 15:4 20:3 excused 4:9,10 exempt 29:18 30:8 exempted 37:21 **expense** 6:10,21,24 expenses 5:13,16,17,19,22,24 6:7,8 7:17 8:2 12:2,8 15:3 18:7 47:23 explain 12:7 13:2 14:7,8 extra 28:7 extras 8:23,24 9:11 F

feeling 16:13

fifteen 8:24 9:1 10:19,20 24:3,7 32:24 36:16 40:5 41:13 43:14

fifty 9:3 21:13,14,20 33:5

fifty-four 39:8 fifty-six 32:23

fifty-two 24:13

figure 35:6

figures 22:2

file 32:3,9

files 31:22

final 33:14

finalized 33:8,9

finally 32:23

find 23:17 31:17

Finger 4:6,7 6:14,16 7:1,4,7,13,16, 18,21 8:9,13,16,18 9:2,9,17 10:9,18 11:6,13 12:8,15,20 13:8,11,16,19,22 14:2,6,12 15:12,19 16:2,23 17:10, 15,19,23 18:4,24 19:6,8,16 20:10,14 21:7,9,13 22:9,13,16,18,21 23:8,11 24:18,21,24 25:19 26:3 27:6,12 28:6,9,11 29:8,15,23 30:3,7,12,15, 18 31:4,14,20 32:3,8,13,17 33:5,18, 24 34:3,19,22 35:16,18,21 36:11,15 38:17,21 39:17 40:9,21 41:15,20 42:7 43:11,14,18 47:12 48:7,12 49:6

flip 9:5 23:20 26:16 35:23,24 39:18 42:14 45:15 46:24

flow 18:12 19:2,4

follow 29:23

forty-one 36:7

forty-three 42:16,19 45:7,10

fourteen 6:2 32:22,23 38:3 41:6,9, 10,11,15

front 3:19 10:7

fuel 15:8,24

full 25:3,12,17,22 37:2

G

gained 27:23 28:7 gas 15:11 gauge 28:15 33:13 gave 33:24 gentlemen 46:16 gist 5:13 11:23 give 35:6 47:15,17 48:8 good 4:16 17:16 38:24 43:13 GRAY-HUENTAS 48:9,13 guess 5:11 38:14 guidelines 3:4,10,20 Guy 4:23 46:23 guys 5:13 9:5 11:23 12:22 26:23 28:19 34:16 35:7 43:16 47:6

н

H.C.R. 27:9 28:1

H.S.T.B.A. 40:22

Hall 4:19

Hamer 4:8

hand 19:14,20 37:2

handful 44:9

happened 29:19

happy 48:7

hard 28:14

Haughie 5:2,8,10 6:15,21 7:3,23 8:11,14,17,21,24 9:4,10,15,19,22 10:1,13,16,22,24 11:4,10,18 12:12, 17 13:3,7,9,18,21,24 14:7,13,23 16:4,14 18:2,6,17 19:4,7,11,18 20:22 21:2,8,11,14 22:5,11,14,17, 20,22 23:6,10,13,19,24 24:20,22 25:16,24 26:5,9,14,16,19,22 27:4,7, 15,23 28:7,10,13,18 29:6,21 30:2,6, 11,14,17,20 31:6,11 32:1,4,6,9,15, 18 33:9,22 34:5,13,16,21 35:2,4,9, 20,23 36:17 37:2,19 38:6,11,24 39:18 40:4,11,18,23 41:17,23 42:9 43:1,20,24 44:3,13,22 45:3,22 46:2 47:4,9,14,17

hearing 4:18

heat 16:5,13,17,19 46:3,6,11 heated 15:10,11 held 4:18 hey 47:21

Index: fifty..instructions

high 44:6 higher 33:12 highest 6:11 15:7 highlighted 24:5,9 home 25:20 homes 27:22 honest 22:8 Horowitz 4:24 46:21 hot 16:5,13,18 46:4,6,11 housing 29:12

huge 15:18

hundred 6:1,3,4,19 7:9 9:1,14 11:7, 9 14:9,10,14,15 21:5,12,18 24:4,5, 10 27:13,19,24 28:8,14 29:17,20 30:1,4,5,9,15 33:5 41:6,12,13,18 42:12,16,18 45:5,7,10

I

I.A. 43:12

I.a.i.s 44:14

I.O. 43:12

idea 37:1 39:22

include 7:22 8:6 15:18,19,20 22:9, 15 36:13 44:10

included 7:2 8:2,7 25:1 36:18,20 38:8

including 20:2

- **income** 5:12,16,19 14:24 15:2 18:7, 11,12,15 19:13,19,22,23,24 20:5,7 26:6 45:20 47:23
- increase 13:8,9,12,16,19,23 14:18, 19 15:8 16:11 17:8 32:20 35:14 42:6 43:2,12 44:15,23,24 45:8,13,14,16, 17,23

increased 20:5,7

increases 15:18 16:8 32:2 44:10

incumbent 39:24

incur 6:11

- information 18:9 26:11 48:15,17
- instructions 8:5,12,15

interest 6:13,21,23 7:11,14,20 17:11 20:2,3,13 interesting 17:10 29:8 interpret 44:11 inverse 19:21,22 20:18 I'm 39:8

Jeff 4:24 46:20,23 47:2 Jersey 35:11 July 29:1 June 3:6 29:15

К

Ken 6:15 Kenneth 4:6 kind 5:18,21 11:22 18:10,12 19:14, 20 22:24 28:14 35:6 39:3 knocked 43:8 L Lamont 3:24 landscape 9:12 23:1 landscaped 23:14 **Langiulli** 5:2,3,4 7:5,11,14,17,19 8:23 9:7,13 11:2 12:19 14:19 15:7, 15 16:12,16 17:3,13 20:15 22:3 25:2,9,12,21 28:23 29:7,10,14 31:8, 12,16,21 33:20 34:2 35:12,17 36:8, 22 37:23 38:4,14 39:14 40:2,19 41:21 42:23 43:3,7,16,19 44:20,23 46:1,10,20,23 47:16,19 large 28:21 37:9,24 45:8 48:2 largest 36:19 laws 29:12 43:7 45:2 lawsuit 38:18 lead 5:8 leader 8:22 lease 41:1

leases 3:14 41:2,4 42:14 44:4 45:13, 14,16 left 6:24 23:24 40:24 41:5 legal 32:19 listed 7:6 lived 12:24 log 27:9 47:22 long 12:24 lost 27:12 lot 17:13 21:22,23 30:22 lower 33:12 luck 43:13

Μ

M.C. 26:4 M.c.i.s 44:14 made 17:23 **Mae** 4:2 9:21,24 10:3 mail 9:12 34:20 38:9 40:6 47:2,18, 19.20 48:4 mailed 24:4 main 4:20 5:13 maintenance 6:12 16:20 17:4 majority 6:9 36:4 39:5 make 36:3.9 39:6 March 47:21 max 38:8 means 45:19,22,24 median 44:23 45:12,16 meeting 3:5,11 49:3,9 members 46:15 47:2 memory 29:16 mentioned 44:7 Michael 5:2 **minus** 12:10 minute 34:11 missing 25:16

mode 22:24 Monday 3:6 money 17:14 20:8 monthly 32:19 months 18:1 33:21 mortgage 6:17,23 7:10,11,14,20 motion 49:3,4 Mount 36:5 move 5:20 11:18 18:2 26:22 municipalities 23:5 36:3,9,20 48:21 municipality 36:2 37:4,7

Ν

names 47:13 48:8 narrows 46:7 Nassau 15:11 22:2,4,6 net 18:11,14 19:22 20:7 **Nice** 48:11 nineteen 6:1 8:19 18:21 24:6 39:6, 11 40:4 41:13 ninety- 18:20 41:13 ninety-nine 39:6,11 41:6,12 non- 24:15 **notice** 47:20,21,23 number 7:8 8:5 11:11,12 26:1 27:20 28:3,4,16,20 29:2,3 34:1 39:19 41:9 44:19 numbers 24:9 26:2 27:10 29:17 30:10,19 40:6 44:24 numerous 48:1,6 0 **O.R.R.A.** 47:22

O.R.R.A. 47:22 October 3:15 odd 21:18 offhand 22:7 38:11 office 3:4 24:15

Index: interest..office

Index: oil..renewed

R

range 28:15 39:12 41:19 44:9

rate 3:14 14:19 42:2

rates 3:14 9:8

quorum 4:13

oil 15:10,15 one's 40:13 ongoing 20:24 27:16 28:1,21 29:2 operating 18:11,12,14 19:22 20:7 operation 8:3 opposed 15:11 order 25:3 **Ossining** 36:14,17,22 37:3,9 out-of-pocket 7:8 overcharge 31:22 32:9 owner 6:10,16,22 31:22,23 32:1 39:15 owners 6:11 12:6 17:13 20:8 24:16, 20,23 27:8 28:2,23 30:22 31:1 45:20 47:13,20 48:4 Ρ **P.D.F.** 8:17 **p.m.** 3:1 4:19 49:14 pages 23:10,21 40:24 paid 6:9 pandemic 15:16 17:4 panelist 5:5 part 36:22 48:14 participate 48:5,22 participated 37:24 39:15 past 44:5

• pay 16:18 46:10

penalized 31:23

pending 38:18

percent 5:23 6:19 7:9,15,20 11:24 12:2,3,9,10,14,16,19 13:17,20 14:15,17 15:2,3,5,6 16:11,22 17:7,9 18:19,21 19:1,9,10 21:13,15,19,21 24:7,13,21,22 33:2,3,4 34:7,9,10,23 35:2,13 36:5,6,7,9,11,23 39:7,8,9,10 44:8 45:8,9,12,16,17,18

percentage 26:12 33:1,7,14 41:3 42:10 43:22 44:5 45:14

period 12:1,5 14:16 18:14 19:6 32:22 35:14 permanently 29:18 30:8 photocopy 10:6 picture 5:22 place 15:23 Plains 3:3 4:19,20 36:6 49:11 point 6:12,13 7:12,15,19 12:14 13:5, 6,16 15:2,3,6 17:7,8,20,23 18:19,20, 22,23 20:18,19 33:4 34:7,9,10,13,14 35:2,3,5,8,9 45:1,15,17 population 21:20 24:3 39:21 40:1 portrait 22:24 23:14 possibly 48:2 pre 48:20 presence 49:10 present 3:21,23 4:11 presentation 3:6,12 5:6 46:17 pretty 23:19 37:9 previous 20:6 41:21,24 previously 3:18 41:11 42:20 44:14 prior 10:20 proactive 32:7 **problem** 30:21 problematic 24:16 proceeding 49:14 process 29:2 protection 40:15 provided 3:18 18:9 public 3:5,11 4:18 putting 47:20 Q

ratio 19:14,19,22,24 20:5 re- 40:19 42:13 re-rented 41:13 42:2,17,21 45:24 read 40:23 41:14 reading 41:5 real 6:10 9:5 11:17 12:22.23 13:2.4 14:10 realty 14:8 reason 15:23 reasons 8:6 rebounded 17:8 receive 3:5,11 received 23:3 recognize 4:22 record 3:1 4:13 49:13 reduction 13:2,4 29:16 30:13 refinance 17:14 reflect 27:10 reflected 6:18 register 27:10 28:2,23 29:1 30:22 32:13 48:18 registered 20:21 21:3,4 24:12,14 27:8 29:22 31:1,3,7,10,17,18 32:4,6 33:10 39:13 48:19

registration 20:24 26:24 27:1,16 28:22 39:2,16 40:10 48:15,16

- registrations 28:2
- regulated 32:20
- related 3:19
- remember 38:2
- reminder 4:17
 - renewed 3:15

question 6:14 11:16 12:21 20:20

questions 14:23 40:7 43:21 46:9,14

quarters 17:20

25:15 46:18

quick 9:5

Index: renovations..taxes

renovations 44:17	set 11:20,21 16:5,14 22:24 31:1 46:7		
rent 3:3,4,9,20 27:21 32:20,21 40:14 41:21,22,24 43:7 44:16	seventeen 18:22 29:17 30:4,5,15 36:5 38:8		
rental 5:16 32:2 39:19	shading 23:16		
rented 33:12,13 40:20 41:11 42:14,	share 48:18		
18,20 45:6,7,23	sharing 48:16		
rents 35:14 39:2,3	show 4:13 6:22 30:12 32:19 42:10		
repairs 6:12 16:19 17:3,6,9	showing 18:8 23:4 36:19 42:12		
report 38:22	shows 12:2,3 15:9 20:6 36:3 43:22		
reported 27:2,8 28:19 38:2	side 5:17 18:4 23:24 24:1 36:1		
reports 3:18 38:23	similar 16:6,15		
represented 37:5	single 19:13,17,18		
requested 47:5	sixteen 6:12 27:24 28:8 29:20 30:9		
requirement 25:8	sixty 20:18		
research 3:5,12	sixty-four 39:9,10		
respond 3:21 31:12	sixty-one 32:24		
responded 38:5,13	size 26:13,14,15 39:22,23		
response 9:8 40:2,5 48:2	sizes 21:21		
rest 5:1	skew 25:5,17		
return 24:15	slide 41:8		
returned 26:12	Slow 34:11		
Rochelle 36:6	slowing 29:11		
roll 3:7,21	small 21:24 42:5 43:2 44:19 46:4		
row 18:18 32:18	smaller 10:15 21:23 37:21		
Rubin 3:8,9,24 4:2,4,6,8,12,21 5:4,9	snapshot 20:17		
13:13 26:7 33:7 36:13,24 37:10,14, 18,22 38:1,10,16,19 46:13,22 47:1,	sorts 28:5		
10 48:11,23 49:7,9	speak 38:20		
S	SPEAKER 10:4,6,8 13:14 14:4 16:7,21 17:1,12,17,21 23:15,18,22,		
Sal 5:2	23 27:14,21 29:13 32:11 37:8 40:16 44:2 46:12 49:4		
Santiago 4:9	spot 24:5		
schedule 8:10	squared 26:4		
schedules 6:1 7:6 8:19 9:11 10:17 24:23	stabilized 27:21 28:17		
send 8:9,11,21 40:7 46:19,20 47:24	staff 4:22		
48:5	start 5:11 29:11		
September 3:16	starting 32:22 47:21		
	stated 44:14		

states 36:1 statistical 25:7 statisticians 12:22 statistics 25:8 stayed 41:19 Stecker 3:2 4:14,16 47:3 Stewart 4:10,11 10:2 37:12,16,20 47:8 **Street** 4:20 strictly 27:1 stuff 44:15 subject 6:5 40:14 substantially 45:20 supposed 28:24 survey 8:7 23:1 27:1 31:13 36:2,18, 21 37:5,24 38:13 39:15,23 40:3,5 surveys 24:2 26:12 sworn 11:6 Sylvia 4:8 system 27:9 30:24 38:15 Т

tab 5:12

table 9:5 11:19,20,21,22 12:1,2,3 13:13,14 14:24 15:24 16:20 18:3,5,7 19:20 20:15 21:16 22:23 32:16 36:1 39:1 40:13,23 41:14 43:17,21 46:4

tables 16:6,15 21:17 23:20 25:6,17 40:12 46:3,7

tabs 9:23

tabulated 9:13 24:6 25:3 36:2,10 37:3 38:13 39:21 46:5

tabulation 36:4

takes 20:13,16

taking 6:23

talking 10:12 17:19

Tamara 4:10

taxes 11:17 12:22,23 13:2,4 14:8,10

Index: team..zeros

team 5:1

Technically 12:17

telling 14:3,6 27:11 47:20

ten 17:6 18:24 19:10 34:22 35:13

tenant 31:22 32:7 40:15 42:1

tenants 16:18 46:10

terminology 18:13

thing 31:21 38:20

things 22:10

thirds 25:20,21 26:4

thirteen 6:13 7:15,19 36:23 38:3,7

thirty 9:1 21:19

Thirty- 20:18

thirty-eight 6:3

thirty-seven 10:20

thirty-six 10:19 24:4,7 39:7 40:5

thirty-two 42:13 45:5,11

thought 9:17,18 24:24

thousand 6:3,4 21:4,5,9,11 24:10, 11 27:18 39:6,11 41:11 43:14

thousands 41:6

time 3:2 5:19 12:4,5 19:5,6 20:23 21:3 28:12

times 17:13

title 9:6

titled 9:10,11 10:16

today 5:1

told 22:10

tomorrow 4:18 49:11

tonight 3:11 46:18

top 16:17 23:5 42:4

total 5:16 24:7,13 29:16 33:6 39:21, 24 40:6 42:19 45:10,11

totally 25:5

totals 5:15,20 12:2 42:11,12

trend 29:5,6,7,24

true 20:17

twelve 6:4 21:5,9,11 24:10 28:13 33:21 twenty 13:1 19:8,23 37:13,17 twenty- 6:4 21:9 41:15 twenty-eight 39:8 twenty-five 18:20 19:23 21:4,7,8 24:11,22 27:12 28:4 29:3 twenty-nine 21:4 24:11 twenty-one 27:19 41:18 twenty-seven 18:19 24:6 27:18 twenty-three 21:6,12 24:10 36:5

U

- **U.S.** 48:3
- unbelievable 32:12

understand 30:11,20 43:16

Understood 30:14

UNIDENTIFIED 10:4,6,8 13:14 14:4 16:7,21 17:1,12,17,21 23:15,18,22, 23 27:14,21 29:13 32:11 37:8 40:16 44:2 46:12 49:4

unit 3:13 21:23,24 39:20

units 6:3 20:21 21:3 24:11,12,13 27:13,24 28:17 29:17 30:9 36:2,4 37:13,17 41:18 48:21

universe 21:19

vacancies 43:4,5 vacancy 40:13 46:1 vacant 40:20 42:1,13,17 varies 42:19 Velene 3:21 Vernon 36:5 versus 18:7 visitors 48:24 W

Wait 21:7 34:11

water 16:5,13,18 46:4,6,11

Westchester 3:3,4,9 9:10 10:16 12:24 15:10 20:1 32:21 39:4 40:1 47:6 48:21 White 3:3 4:19,20 36:6 49:11 wide 39:12 wise 21:20 word 11:13 words 30:10 work 4:23 17:5 48:14

works 28:1 43:17 48:10

world 17:21

wrong 15:23

year 5:24 9:2,4,13,16,19 10:21 11:4 12:1 13:19 14:9,10,16,20 15:1,14 17:12,15,16 18:14 19:5,9,24 20:5,23 24:19 25:4,5,16 26:1,5 27:17,24 28:3,19 32:22 33:3 37:4 38:2 41:1,2, 3 42:14 44:4 45:6,13,14,15

Υ

year's 3:20 9:7,8

years 7:24 11:10,12 13:1 16:1 20:6 25:3,4,13,18,22 28:3 33:6 34:1,23 35:13,19,20 42:18

Yonkers 36:7

York 22:2,7 35:11

Ζ

zeros 25:5

eScribers, LLC (800) 257-0885 Ext 7 | reporting@escribers.net | www.escribers.net

V